

Institution: University of Hertfordshire

Unit of Assessment: 30 Philosophy

1. Unit context and structure, research and impact strategy

Context and Structure

The Philosophy Unit at the University of Hertfordshire (UH) is in the School of Humanities and comprises 11.2 FTE (12 staff); 3 Professors, 3 Readers, 1 Senior Lecturer, 4 Lecturers, and 1 Research Fellow. There are 5 early career researchers (ECRs), all appointed in this cycle.

Notable improvements and successes for the Unit in comparison with REF 2014 are:

- 18% increase in staff FTE with100% staff submission.
- 400% increase in ECR staff FTE
- 45% women FTE compared to 5% in 2014
- 87.5% increase in overall number of doctoral awards from 4 to 7
- Positive 2019 Postgraduate Research Experience Survey response with 95% satisfaction for supervision, 88% for research skills and progression and 86% overall satisfaction.

Strategy

The Unit strategy has been to recruit staff who help develop its well-established expertise in Wittgenstein and ethics (Balaska, Sandis and Tejedor), Philosophy of Mind (Egerton and Liu), and religion (Kirkpatrick, Malcolm and Plunkett), as well as emerging strengths in Philosophy of Fiction (Caddick Bourne, Moyal-Sharrock, Plunkett); Philosophy of Religion (Coleman, Kirkpatrick, Larvor, Lippitt, Malcolm, Plunkett, Tejedor) and philosophy through its history (Balaska, Kirkpatrick, Larvor, Lippitt, Moyal-Sharrock, Plunkett, Sandis, Tejedor). In addition, 11 new Visiting Research Fellows were appointed between 2016 and 2020 to further to enhance the research vitality of the Unit and allow for productive exchanges on shared research interests with Unit members: Beale, Caddick Bourne, Cohen, Dolby, Giombini, Ground, Grenberg, Mihalik, Rathgeb (at UH on a Swiss Government funded post-doc, 2019-2021), Robjant, and Rudd).

As a result of the above strategy, with guided support from the School of Humanities' Dean and Associate Dean for Research, the Unit has succeeded in building up emerging areas of shared interest into areas of expertise. This approach has enabled it to combine grant bids focused on individual projects (often monographs) with explorative collaborations both inside and outside the Unit. An example of the latter is the *Forum for Virtue and Understanding* (FVU), launched in 2019). Another is *Mind Readings*, a recently established reading group in the Philosophy of Mind.

The School of Humanities (which is responsible for staff development and much of the institutional infrastructure) receives QR in proportion to the earnings of its Units and makes this funding available to those Units for strategic investment based on their centrally approved research plans and priorities. Philosophy also participates in several of the six University level cross-cutting Research Themes which provide a framework for inter- and cross-disciplinary research. For example: FVU research (e.g. Larvor on Mathematical Cultures) largely falls under the theme of *Heritage, Cultures, and Communities* (HCC); Sandis' research with Microsoft under *Information & Security* (I&S), much of Coleman's research on mind falls under *Health and Wellbeing* (H&W), and Moyal-Sharrock and Sandis' Alphawood project under both HCC and H&W.

Four main strategic aims identified in the REF 2014 submission were pursued by the Unit over this period:

Develop its contribution to the discipline in its areas of expertise refreshed by the addition of new permanent staff: This objective has been achieved through the 17.9%



increase of staff FTE, accompanied by the strategic appointment of Visiting Researchers, in ways which ensure that the Unit strengthens and develops its research as efficiently as possible.

Continue an ambitious grant-seeking strategy: This objective has been achieved through the Unit being awarded two Leverhulme Trust Major Research Fellowships (Lippitt, Coleman), a Mind Association Research Fellowship (Caddick Bourne), a Microsoft Collaborative Studentship Award (Sandis), a funded Visiting Professorship from Vrije Universiteit Brussel (VUB) (Larvor), and a research grant from the Alphawood Foundation (Moyal-Sharrock, Sandis).

Continue with the programme of fortnightly research seminars, British Wittgenstein Society events and Francis Bacon Lectures and increase the level of its public engagement: This regular programme of research activities is a well-established part of the Unit's culture. In this cycle, Francis Bacon Lecturers have included such high-profile philosophers as Raimond Gaita, Angie Hobbs, Onora O'Neill, and Jonathan Wolff. The Unit continues to host the British Wittgenstein Society (BWS), which organises an annual conference (that merges with the 'Hinge Epistemology' Conference in alternate years) and biannual public talks. A new series of public engagement events has also been introduced, *Why Philosophy Matters* (WPM) (see section 3).

Continue links with non-stipendiary visiting researchers: Long-term collaborations continue with other existing non-stipendiary overseas-based Research Fellows submitted to REF2014 (Rudd, Stokes).

Interdisciplinary Research

The University's **six key research themes** (Health and Well-being; Global Economy; Heritage, Cultures and Communities; Information and Security; Food; Space) provide structured support for interdisciplinary research. The research themes have facilitated collaborations between members of the Philosophy Unit and researchers in Classics, Computer Science, Drama, Education, English Literature, Film, Law, Mathematics, Medieval Studies, Neuroscience, Psychology, Psychotherapy, Politics, Theology and Religious Studies. Interdisciplinary collaborations and research initiatives in this cycle have included:

Literature: through Caddick Bourne's co-editing the *Routledge Companion to Shakespeare and Philosophy* and organising two international 'Shakespeare and Philosophy' conferences (2014, 2016), an international network has been created of those working on Philosophy and Shakespeare in Classics, Politics, Drama and Theatre Studies, as well as different traditions of Philosophy. The network includes academics from Belgium, Canada, Cyprus, Denmark, Hungary, Israel, Italy, Poland, Slovenia, South Africa, Switzerland, UK, and USA. Moyal-Sharrock edited a symposium of essays on *F. R. Leavis* in the journal Philosophy and Literature and organised a public debate on 'Why Literature Matters' (New College of Humanities, 2017). Speakers included high-profile public intellectuals such as Howard Jacobson.

Mathematics and Education: through an award from the International Council for Science, and working on behalf of the International Mathematics Union, the International Commission on Mathematical Instruction and the International Union for the History and Philosophy of Science, Larvor and Löwe (Amsterdam/Hamburg), coordinated research into the cultures of mathematical research training. This project identified cultural opportunities and barriers to new mathematicians, especially those from populations that are at present poorly represented among mathematicians. Larvor also co-authored papers with mathematics educationalists from VUB and Toronto and is preparing a grant application to develop cultural approaches to mathematics education with an educationalist at Middlesex University.

Psychology, Neuroscience and Psychotherapy: Ongoing collaborations arising from Coleman's AHRC-funded Phenomenal Qualities Project which completed in 2015 have expanded to incorporate work with computer scientists and physicists. Through his membership



of the Sussex Cognitive Science Institute, Coleman collaborates with cognitive scientists, neuroscientists and psychologists.

Theology and Religious Studies: Collaborations in this area have included Lippitt's co-editing an interdisciplinary collection, *Narrative, Identity and the Kierkegaardian Self* (2015); participation in WPM 'Why Forgiveness Matters', a day conference organised in association with St Albans Cathedral Study Centre, featuring contributions from Philosophy, Theology and Psychology (2017); and co-organising 'Screening the Virtues', a workshop on representations of virtue and vice in film, featuring participants from Film Studies as well as Philosophy, Theology & Religious Studies (2017).

Other interdisciplinary collaborations: Malcolm is working with Kirkpatrick on establishing a cross-disciplinary network of researchers with interests in the experiences of students with religious commitments. The BWS bi-annual Conferences always have interdisciplinary focus. For example, the 10th anniversary conference in 2017 included sessions with invited keynote speakers from Primatology, Psychology, Communications Technology and Education as well as Philosophy. Sandis organised the 2017 interdisciplinary European Society for Philosophy and Psychology conference. He also has an ongoing research collaboration with risk analyst Nassim Taleb, associate attorney Aryeh Younger, and investment manager Elias Korosis.

Impact Strategy

The Unit's approach to impact has been to increase the significance and reach of its research through:

- engagement with practitioners leading to an impact on policy (e.g. advice to senior police officers on ethical issues in policing; cultural heritage practitioners)
- engagement with industry (e.g. Microsoft)
- engagement with schools (e.g. teaching of philosophical approaches to Shakespeare in schools; the role of mathematical cultures in the training of mathematics teachers)
- public engagement (e.g. media appearances, public lectures and debates, talks and festivals).

The Unit's approach is to use institutional contacts often facilitated by the University's Enterprise and Business Development team to seek possible research users and to respond enthusiastically to approaches from potential partner organisations who have recognised the value of the Unit's research. For example, the Unit's local and national profiles in ethics and the philosophy of action/understanding led to approaches from Hertfordshire Constabulary and Microsoft Research respectively that were the catalyst for its two impact case studies. These describe how Unit research has made a difference to the ways in which Microsoft researchers are thinking of how to design artificial intelligence (AI) so that its behaviour is made more intelligible to humans and also how the national police Code of Ethics has been understood and implemented within Hertfordshire Constabulary and nationally.

Impact potential has also been a key factor in new appointments, such as that of Sandis in 2015. Relationships with relevant organisations have then been developed, for example by supporting Sandis' Visiting Professorship at Microsoft Research in Cambridge both financially and through teaching relief.

QR funding has been targeted towards developing specific areas of impact for this REF cycle. Staff have also been encouraged to apply for internal University funds and several (Caddick Bourne, Larvor, Lippitt & Sandis) have succeeded in securing competitive funding from the University's Small Grants for Impact (typically £4k-£8k) initiative. Most staff have also participated in either School or University-wide workshops (or both) on impact development. A workshop was organised for all Unit members which provided useful feedback to impact case study authors and served as a staff development opportunity for junior colleagues new to the impact agenda. Through a combination of QR and central University funding the Unit has



supported Sandis' visiting professorship, Lippitt's development of ethics training for police officers and staff, and the preparation of materials for Caddick Bourne's Schools Shakespeare Adaptation Project. Impact is a standing item at research meetings: colleagues are encouraged to discuss plans and projects concerning the potential impact of their research to share good practice and monitor developments.

Open Research Environment and Integrity

All staff showcase their research via their online profiles through the University's Research Information System (RIS) and Research Archive (UHRA) and platforms such as *Philpapers* and academia.edu. Staff publish their work in open access journals where possible (e.g. *Nordic Wittgenstein Review, Parrhesia, Enrahonar*), and use University OA funds to enable gold open access publishing. To enable Unit public engagement activities to reach a wider audience, most talks from BWS, WPM, and the Francis Bacon Lecture events have been made available online since 2014.

The University is a signatory to the Concordat on Research Integrity and there is centrally provided mandatory training on research integrity for all researchers, including workshops and an annual seminar, in addition to bespoke training on the Doctoral College's Researcher Development Programme. Lippitt (2010-18) and Sandis (2018-) have served on the Ethics Committee for Studies Involving Human Participants (ECSHP); Larvor on the Ethics Committees with Delegated Authority for the Social Sciences, Arts and Humanities (ECDA) (since 2012; vice-chair since 2017).

Future Strategy

The Unit aims to grow research and impact momentum through the following strategies:

Research Network Development: Time and resource will be invested into developing infrastructure, research networks and professional activities that nurture collaborative research within and beyond the Unit.

The recently launched *Forum for Virtue & Understanding* (FVU) provides a research community for staff and Visiting Research Fellows in Philosophy working on related projects. For example, Manifest Virtue (Larvor, Lippitt), Why the Virtues Matter (Plunkett, Lippitt), and the Philosophy of Understanding (Sandis' book *How to Understand Others* is under contract with Yale University Press.) The Forum sits with the University's Heritage, Culture and Communities research theme, but also relates to certain aspects of the Health and Well-being theme. Initially supported by Unit QR funds, FVU provides a vehicle for larger, collaborative, grant applications (e.g. from the Templeton Foundation) and leveraging the range of the Unit's national, international and interdisciplinary collaborations. FVU will develop new international partnerships with the Institute for Ethics & Society at Notre Dame (Sydney) as well as with identified universities in Japan.

The University will host the 2021 *Joint Session of the Aristotelian Society and the Mind Association* (16-18 July). This is the outcome of a competitive process that reflects the Unit's reputation within the UK and beyond. It is expected that the event will strengthen the Unit's ties to various UK institutes, generate multiple opportunities for future international research collaborations, and provide a platform for showcasing the Unit's research. Sandis will deliver a keynote presentation.

Coleman and Sandis joined the Royal Institute of Philosophy Council in December 2020. Sandis was also appointed to the Executive Committee and the editorial boards of the Institute's journals, *Philosophy* and *Think*, all of which will provide opportunities for network development.

People: The staffing strategy for the next cycle is two-fold: (i) to use the FVU and the Unit's networks more generally to secure funding for PhD and Post-doctoral positions relating to its research strengths and (ii) to ensure that future growth advances equality and diversity within the Unit.[TEXT REMOVED FOR PUBLICATION]. A fully funded BAME PhD scholarship,



supported by the School of Humanities, has also been created in the Unit. The successful applicant, who began their doctoral programme in 2021, will be working on issues in the Philosophy of Religion relating to FVU's research remit. Both (i) and (ii) are indicative of approaches that the Unit plans to extend throughout the course of the new REF cycle.

Research Income: the Unit will make further funding applications for monograph-related research grants to major grant-awarding bodies such as Leverhulme and the British Academy. In addition, specific grant clinics will be organised supported by the University Research Office to facilitate bids for larger awards from Horizon Europe, ERC, AHRC and ESRC and new sustainable partnerships will be forged with business, industry, enterprise, and charitable foundations e.g. Microsoft, Hermes PGE, We & AI, and the Alphawood Foundation.

Public Engagement: the Unit's already extensive range of public engagement activities will be enhanced and further developed. For example, the BWS, which already has an event planned for May 2021 to celebrate the centenary of his Tractatus, will emphasise Wittgenstein's importance to 21st century concerns, with potentially large interdisciplinary conferences on Wittgenstein and Artificial Intelligence (2022) and Law (2024). Themed events will also be hosted by WPM that will be free and open to all (held locally, as well as online). Future themes will include glass ceilings, mathematical cultures, and consciousness together with the related book series with volumes on Indian Philosophy, Chinese Philosophy, Camus, Darwin, Data and Delusions. Unit members will continue to make their research accessible in publications such as *The Conversation* and *The Philosophers' Magazine*.

Research Impact: future QR and central funds will be used to develop engagement activity which will support research impact, especially work related to the University Research Themes. This will include growing the Unit's activity with Hertfordshire Constabulary and its extension to Cambridgeshire and Bedfordshire constabularies; extending Sandis' work on Intelligible AI both within and beyond Microsoft; and further developing Caddick Bourne's Schools Shakespeare Adaptation Project. In addition, the following areas will be explored:

- Coleman's research on the possible existence of unconscious pain and suffering in a medical context
- Malcolm's research on faith, developing resources for use by religious groups to enhance their self-understanding
- Sandis' research on action and intention under uncertainty, following initial development
 in collaboration with (a) risk analyst Nassim Taleb and (b) the Head of Strategy and
 Environmental Investing at Hermes GPE (Elias Korosis) to create an ethical framework
 for financial organisations investing in companies that intend to generate social and
 environmental impact
- Moyal and Sandis' research with transgender communities and LGBT+ groups.

Many of the above activities will be integrated within the newly approved University-wide Centre for Future Societies Research (CFSR) which links to all research themes with the aim of carrying out interdisciplinary investigations into complex ways of making the future world a better place.

2. People

The Unit's staff FTE is a balance of senior academics (19.6% Professors), mid-career academics (26.8% Readers; 8.9 % senior lecturers), and ECRs (35.7% Lecturers; 8.9 % Research Fellows). The overall ECR staff FTE has increased by 400% since 2014.

Every opportunity is taken to help all staff progress their careers, with development needs ascertained through mentoring and twice-yearly appraisal monitoring. Promotions are based exclusively on quality criteria evaluated by extensive external peer review. After such review Caddick Bourne, Coleman and Moyal-Sharrock were all promoted from Senior Lecturer to Reader during this cycle, with Moyal-Sharrock being further promoted to Professor. These



promotions brought the Unit membership with the rank of Reader or Professor to 5.2 FTE (46.4%), a reflection of the Unit's research standing.

The Unit recruitment policy is to ensure building research capacity is central to every new appointment, with evidence of stakeholder engagement and the ability to translate research into impact also important for the senior appointments. The vitality and sustainability of the Unit is developed and maintained through such strategic staff renewal. In cases where members of the team have transferred to other institutions, collaborations with Unit members continue. For instance, Lippitt and Stokes have co-edited a book and spoken together at one of the Unit's WPM events and Tejedor actively collaborates with Moyal-Sharrock and Sandis in research on Wittgenstein.

Staff Development

Mentoring of new staff is formally the responsibility of the Subject Leader, who in practice shares it with other senior colleagues. All academic staff in the Unit have significant responsibility for research and full-time staff receive at least a 0.2 FTE research workload allocation (0.3 FTE and 0.5 FTE for Readers and Professors respectively). ECRs typically have a reduced teaching load and/or are exempt from significant administrative duties. ECRs are also supported through internal funding to present their research at conferences. Malcolm was appointed to a University-supported Vice Chancellor's ECR Fellowship and has a research workload allocation of 0.8 FTE.

All staff benefit from twice-yearly appraisals incorporating a 6-month review. New staff participate in central and local induction and can access the University's centrally provided Researcher Development programme (see Institutional Statement). ECRs also receive career development advice, consistent with the Concordat to Support the Career Development of Researchers. New staff are encouraged to take advantage of the University's 'Skill Up!' programme, a Research Skills Development Fund available to ECRs. Kirkpatrick and Malcolm successfully secured funding from this source for their project investigating the experiences of students of faith in a secular university culture.

Over the REF cycle the Unit has invested the QR funding returned to the Unit in those elements that will best sustain and enhance its research environment, i.e. staffing and support for research sabbaticals; conference attendance; public engagement events; and impact development. Early in the cycle a rolling programme of semester-long sabbaticals, ordered strategically in time to enable permanent staff to focus on their research and complete high-quality outputs, was introduced. This policy allowed each permanent member of staff to have at least one semester of research sabbatical time in this REF cycle in addition to any research leave arising from external grant funding. Several of the outputs submitted are the result of this policy. The Unit has also used QR funding to provide additional, strategically timed impact leave for projects in development: for instance, Sandis was freed from all teaching for a semester to take up his visiting fellowship at Microsoft Research (Oct-Dec 2018).

Staff are encouraged to apply for internal University competitive research grants, several different schemes being available to staff with different levels of experience. For example, Caddick Bourne (2016, 2017), Lippitt (2015, 2017, 2018) and Sandis (2018) received support from the University's Small Grants for Impact scheme, which has enabled them to develop their respective impact case studies. In addition, ECR staff have also benefited from pump-prime funding to further develop specific research projects.

Research Students

The number of PhD awards has increased by 87.5%, from 4 to 7 (37.5% women, 6.5% above the national average in the discipline). This both reflects the rising reputation of the Unit and the individual philosophers within it, and the result of concentrated efforts including funding from research grants and the Unit's MA by Research pathway. PhD students have been funded by various means, including small bursaries and five full-support scholarships: four from the *Phenomenal Qualities Project* and the *Towards an Embodied Science of Intersubjectivity*



projects (see section 3), and a further one from a collaborative Microsoft studentship award obtained by Sandis.

The mandatory research methods course for MA students is offered to all postgraduate research (PGR) students, ensuring that they receive an introduction to philosophical research which complements the Researcher Development Programme (RDP) provided by the Doctoral College and focusses studies on their individual projects. The Unit is strongly committed to widening participation to research students from a variety of backgrounds. Full-time or part-time study options are available: several of the Unit's PhD students have been mature students and studying part-time. A distance-based option is also available. All the Unit's PGR activities are scheduled to fit the needs of part-time students, while campus facilities such as the Learning Resources Centre are open 24/7. If a student declares a disability, they are put in touch with Student Wellbeing at the point of enrolment. If a student needs to suspend their studies, they are invited to meet with the School Research Tutor on their return, to ensure a smooth transition back into their programme of research.

Each PGR student is supervised by a team of 2 or 3 supervisors who must have two successful doctoral completions between them. Supervisory training is mandatory for all inexperienced supervisors. As well as regular meetings with their principal supervisor, a full-time student meets with the full supervisory team at least three times per year. Progress is subject to both regular and annual monitoring, with Registration and Progression conducted under the auspices of an experienced assessor outside the supervision team, to ensure that the programme of research is properly supported. The Unit encourages all supervisors regularly to refresh their training, and to follow the Good Practice Guide produced by the Doctoral College. All students can obtain additional support from a dedicated School Research Tutor. Communication between students and supervisors, and overall progress reports together with progression and final assessments, are recorded by all parties on the Doctoral College online Research Student Management System implemented in this REF cycle.

Each PGR student, advised by their supervisors, selects appropriate sessions from the Doctoral College RDP, which extensively covers areas highlighted by the Researcher Development Framework in all four complementary categories: knowledge and intellectual abilities; personal effectiveness; research governance and organisation; engagement, influence, and impact. The RDP includes mandatory online courses and offers a spring and summer school. Unit staff regularly contribute to this programme.

In addition to participating in University Doctoral College networking and social events, such as its annual PGR student conference, students also present work-in-progress at a dedicated annual School of Humanities PGR conference, at which career talks are also provided. Events of interest to Philosophy PGR students are advertised regularly on the dedicated Humanities Postgraduate Forum. They are further supported by the School of Humanities social programme, whose events are open to both taught postgraduate and research students, to facilitate a wider postgraduate community. The Philosophy Unit also runs a series of seminars at which PGR students present their work-in-progress in a supportive atmosphere.

The Unit's team supervisions, plus this range of regular research activities, afford fruitful interaction between PGR students and staff, inculcating professional norms and standards. The Unit fosters a collegial research culture that brings academic staff, postgraduates and interested undergraduates into regular contact. Examples include fortnightly Philosophy research seminars and Philosophy Society talks, an annual residential Philosophy Weekend at Cumberland Lodge (providing opportunities for PGR students to present their work), postgraduate work-in-progress meetings; staff/postgraduate reading groups, and research events enabling PGRs to network with both PGRs and staff from other institutions.

All PhD students are given opportunities to teach, capped at a maximum of four hours per week to avoid interfering with their research. All students who wish to teach are required to attend the University's nationally accredited CPAD teacher-training programme, which leads to Fellowship



of the Higher Education Academy status. Research students are also coached and supported practically and financially to take their first steps into professional research careers. For example, each research student is allotted funds to attend external conferences to network and present their work.

Recently graduating PhD students have enjoyed various kinds of success that help sustain the discipline. Within academia, Rittberg has been hired as a postdoctoral researcher at the Centre for Logic and Philosophy of Science at Vrije Universiteit Brussel. Ruzinska has taught at Leiden and Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam and been hired as a postdoctoral researcher at the Polish Academy of Sciences on a project in Cognitive Science and Philosophy. O'Hara published a book based on his PhD with Palgrave Macmillan (*Moral Certainty and the Foundations of Morality*) and Zardai runs philosophyofaction.com, a website which collects tools and information for anyone interested in the philosophy of action and related topics.

In the 2019 Postgraduate Research Experience Survey (PRES) the University was ranked 4th for research culture, 15th for research supervision and 21st for overall student satisfaction out of 103 UK HEIs (UH response rate 62%). Locally, PGR students in History and Philosophical Studies were similarly positive concerning the research environment expressing 95% satisfaction with their supervision, 88% with the development of their research skills and their progression, and with 86% overall satisfaction.

Equality and Diversity

It is widely recognised that there is a discipline-wide problem in the under-representation of women in Philosophy. The Unit as submitted to REF2014 was no exception; indeed, only one staff member was a woman (5% by FTE, well below the national average). The Unit sought to correct this imbalance by seeking a gender-balanced shortlist for all new posts advertised in the current cycle. Typically, at least equal representation of women on the shortlist has been achieved from an overall field of applicants heavily dominated by men. Five of the seven appointments made in the current cycle were women, including the recent appoint of Liu, who also identifies as BAME. Currently 5.0 FTE staff are women; 45% of the Unit which is 21% above the national average.

The Unit has signed up to the 'Good Practice Scheme' launched jointly by the British Philosophical Association and the Society for Women in Philosophy. The scheme 'assists UK philosophy departments in ensuring that they have policies and procedures to encourage the representation of women in philosophy'. It includes policy documents on a range of issues including conferences and seminar series concerning gender bias and sexual harassment.

The Unit is also committed to supporting Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) students who are currently underrepresented at postgraduate research level. Across the sector, BAME individuals account for only 5.5% of academics in Philosophy. To encourage BAME students to consider academic research careers in philosophy, the Unit has advertised, and successfully recruited to, a BAME-only 3-year, centrally funded PhD studentship in Philosophy, which commenced in March 2021.

The School of Humanities secured the Athena Swan bronze award in 2017. The Unit made a significant contribution to this success, especially through the involvement of Tejedor and Larvor on the School of Humanities Athena Swan Self-Assessment Team (SAT), which reviewed the gender, equality and diversity strategies of the School. Tejedor's responsibilities included designing the staff consultation survey on gender equality and diversity in the School; reviewing the support given by the School to academic staff for career promotion and career development; and its support to students for academic career progression. Following the Bronze Award, the SAT was reconstituted as the School's Equality and Diversity Improvement Team (EDIT). Larvor serves on the EDIT and since 2019 has been the School's Athena Swan champion, which involves leading preparation for and writing future submissions, as well as membership of the University-level Athena Swan SAT. Moyal-Sharrock is a member



of the University Women and Professors+ Network, which aims to provide a community for discussion, information-sharing and mutual support.

Unit research and impact activity focuses on equality and diversity issues. Noting the religious diversity of the University community, and of the importance of Religion and Belief as a protected characteristic, the Unit made a successful bid for one of University's competitively awarded five-year Vice-Chancellor's Research Fellowships, leading to the appointment of Malcolm as Research Fellow in Religious Cultures and Diverse Identities. Part of this post's brief is to develop a philosophical account of the challenge of integrating diverse dimensions of identity: gender, class, religious faith or background, and participation in critical academic culture. Malcolm's project explores free speech, and conflicts of identities, particularly those of religious and sexual orientation, and the role and influence of policy on these conflicts. These concerns arose from one of the aims of the Manifest Virtue project (Larvor, Lippitt), which has been to consider the impact of forms of philosophical discussion on different participating groups, and to attempt to ensure that the Unit does not engage in practices that are off-putting to under-represented groups.

Moyal-Sharrock and Sandis' grant from the Alphawood Foundation supports research for a monograph elucidating the concept of being trans and arguing for the default authenticity and reliability of gender self-identification. They are collaborating with University LGBT+ groups and LGBT+ communities in France, the UK and the USA. Lippitt's work with police officers includes sitting on Bedfordshire, Cambridgeshire and Hertfordshire Constabulary's Professional Standards Department Scrutiny Panel, giving advice on ethical issues arising from the investigation of whether BAME officers, staff and members of the public are disproportionately represented in complaints registered, investigated or upheld.

The Unit has an increasing international staff mix: its members originally hail from China, Germany, Greece, Morocco, the USA and the UK. Since adopting the BPA/SWIP guidelines the Unit has ensured an equal gender balance in invited research seminar speakers and Francis Bacon Lecturers. Relatedly, the time period between the research seminar and the undergraduate-run Philosophy Society has been devoted to the Philosophy Tea, a staff-student networking and intellectual community-building event held in an alcohol-free environment, which is designed to promote inclusivity and diversity. Caddick Bourne's recent Cast and Casting conference also took a strategic decision to have an equal male-female balance and 25% BAME speakers on its schedule, as well as incorporating papers on gender and race casting. The Unit also participates in a School-wide reading group on contemporary racial injustice.

3. Income, infrastructure and facilities

Income

The Unit received £591,000 in external research income over the course of the REF2021 cycle, equivalent to £52,768 per FTE and an annual average of £84,429. It has also increased the diversity of its funding sources with significantly larger proportions of income coming from EU and UK-based charities than in REF2014.

The strategy for improving the quality of the Unit's research grant applications has been to supplement the long-standing 'second reader' system of bids in development, where bids can be submitted only after having been subject to critical appraisal by at least one experienced colleague, with Unit-specific workshops critiquing such bids in a group. This approach accepts that a large grant application is a significant piece of intellectual work. Staff with extensive experience of grant application peer review, such as those with AHRC Peer Review College experience (Caddick Bourne, Coleman, Larvor, Lippitt), routinely provide additional advice on bids in development.



Two large funded projects awarded in the previous REF cycle were completed: the Phenomenal Qualities Project (PQP) (AHRC, £296,588) and Towards an Embodied Science of Intersubjectivity (Marie Curie Actions ITN, £463k to the Unit, £3.0M total to network). Two key PQP outputs appeared during this cycle. First, Coleman and Coates' edited book *Phenomenal Qualities: Sense, Perception and Cognition* (Oxford University Press, 2015). Both had chapters in this interdisciplinary study of consciousness by philosophers, cognitive scientists, and neuroscientists. Second, Philip Goff (a PQP postdoctoral researcher) published a highly praised monograph *Consciousness and Fundamental Reality* (OUP, 2017) then a bestseller *Galileo's Error: Foundations for a New Science of Consciousness* (Penguin 2019). Goff featured on BBC Radio 4's *Today* programme and appeared on Russell Brand's *Under the Skin* podcast.

The long-term value of the Unit's strategy has been demonstrated by its successes in winning several prestigious new grants during the current cycle. While the previous cycle grants predominantly focused on networking collaborations and edited volumes, in this cycle the Unit used the resulting infrastructure as a basis from which to focus on grants that would facilitate the publication of authored monographs and articles that are indicative of its research strengths. Hence the grant capture success for individual monographs underlining this approach includes:

- Two Leverhulme Trust Major Research Fellowships (Love's Forgiveness, £92k, 2018-20, Lippitt; Consciousness as Bystander: Exploring the Mostly Unconscious Mind, £86k, 2019-21, Coleman). These grants enabled Lippitt and Coleman to develop monographs. Lippitt's Oxford University Press book, Love's Forgiveness (2020) proposes novel answers to key questions about interpersonal forgiveness centred on the image of forgiveness as a work of 'care-agapic' love. Coleman's project (also for OUP) aims to develop an original model of the mind inspired by Freud's twin suggestions that most mentation occurs unconsciously, and that the unconscious mind is just like the conscious mind except for the absence of consciousness.
- A Mind Association Research Fellowship (Truth in Fiction: A Contextualist Account, £21,115, 2019-20, Caddick Bourne). Caddick Bourne is developing three journal articles on an account of truth in fiction which utilises a contextualist account of knowledgeascriptions. He argues that what is true in a fiction depends on which possibilities for fictional worlds and characters have been ruled out, and which have been properly ignored, something that can vary across different contexts.
- A **Microsoft Collaborative Studentship Award** (Microsoft, £72k [£48k to Unit], 2014-17, Sandis). Sandis' project involved co-supervision (with Sandis as principal supervisor) of a PhD student on the topic of 'Why do we communicate?' Its focus was to question the ICT assumption that information-conveying is the purpose of all communication, with the aim of influencing future ICT design. The student (Behrens) received her PhD in 2018, having undertaken a three-month internship at Microsoft Research, Cambridge.
- A Funded Visiting Professorship (Vrije Universiteit Brussel, £25k, 2015-16, Larvor). As a strategic research initiative, Larvor was invited to spend a year within the logic and mathematical practices research group at VUB.
- An **Alphawood Foundation** grant ('Lived Gender', £77k, 2019-22, Moyal-Sharrock, Sandis) on gender identities (see Section 2).
- Further awards of up to £10,000 each have been received from the Templeton Foundation (for Coleman's Russellian Monism Project New Directions in the Philosophy of Mind, 2016-17 [£10,000], and Pantheism and Pantheism Project [£1,000]), the Mind Association and the British Society of Aesthetics (both Caddick Bourne).

Infrastructure and Facilities

The Unit uses the research support offered at School and University level from the Research Office and the Doctoral College such as attending events on impact development and public engagement organised with external expert speakers. The Research Grants Team in the Research Office provides other vital infrastructural support: major award winners receive training in project management and support with budgetary accounting.



Research infrastructure – library and IT resources and support – is provided centrally and locally through School budgets. The University Library's Philosophy holdings include an estimated 11,412 books and e-books and 799 journals. All staff and research students are provided with office space, up-to-date laptop/ desktop computer and School social and bookable meetings space.

As part of its scholarly infrastructure supporting research the Unit's Philosophy research seminar meets fortnightly during term, and is usually attended by all staff, research students and some undergraduates. Among the regular conferences, workshops and colloquia is the European Society for Philosophy and Psychology (ESPP) organised by Sandis in 2017 and attended by over 150 delegates. Other significant international conferences the Unit has organised with staff/research student attendance include:

- Living in Uncertainty: Kierkegaard and Possibility, London, 2019 (Plunkett).
- Casts and Casting: perspectives from aesthetics and philosophy of art, UH, 2018 (Caddick Bourne).
- Russellian Monism: Time for the Details (keynote: David Chalmers), Budapest, 2017 (Coleman).
- Shakespeare the Philosopher I and II, UH (2014, 2016) (Caddick Bourne)
- Two conferences on Leavis, Cambridge 2015, 2016 (Moyal-Sharrock)
- Two meetings funded by the International Council for Science, Brussels, Hamburg, 2015 (Larvor).
- The Third Mathematical Cultures conference, London, 2014 (Larvor).
- Forum for Virtue and Understanding Launch event (Keynote by Quassim Cassam), UH 2019 (Sandis).
- Virtues in the Classroom, FVU/Eton (Larvor & Beale, Zoom 2020).

The Unit's senior staff also provide support for colleagues making promotion applications in the University annual round, advising on the process and critiquing draft applications, as in the case of the four successful applications for Readerships/Professorships in this cycle.

Another important aspect of the scholarly infrastructure is the BWS, which has been hosted by the Unit since its foundation in 2007. It now has over 900 registered members worldwide, 2700 registered Facebook friends, and an average of 3000 unique website visitors per month. BWS activities include an annual conference at a UK university, each with ten speakers of international renown and whose proceedings have historically been published as special issues in international journals (but will now be part of Anthem Studies in Wittgenstein); a twice-yearly Wittgenstein Lecture Series; financial aid to graduate student conferences and other Wittgenstein-related conferences in UK universities; and the creation and maintenance of the BWS Comprehensive Annotated Wittgenstein Bibliography wiki. The four members of its Executive Committee have Unit affiliations: Moyal-Sharrock (President), Ground (Vice-President), Sandis (Secretary), & Jonathan Beale (Treasurer), BWS conferences during this cycle have focussed on Wittgenstein and: Epistemology (2014); the Social Sciences (2015); Ethics and Religion (2016); and Education (2018). The 2017 tenth-anniversary conference - Wittgenstein in the 21st Century - was hosted by UH and featured Professors Louise Barrett. Peter Hacker. Peter Hobson and Ray Monk. The BWS has become a world-wide hub promoting interaction between students, academics and a broad public interested in Wittgenstein's life and philosophy. It was an invited nominating body for REF2021.

4. Collaboration and contribution to the research base, economy and society

Research networks have been built by the Unit through a wide range of **international collaborations**. Philosophy staff collaborate with partners in Australasia, North America, and throughout Europe. Notable examples (also see Section 1 'impact strategy') include:



- Moyal-Sharrock co-created the burgeoning field of hinge epistemology through her scholarship on Wittgenstein's On Certainty and its application to contemporary epistemology. This has led to international biennial hinge epistemology conferences (Paris 2019; Lisbon 2021; Toronto 2023) and related volumes of essays including scholars such as Duncan Pritchard, Annalisa Coliva, Pascal Engel, John Greco, and Martin Kusch;
- Lippitt gave workshops at Deakin (2016, 2020) and continues to collaborate with Stokes, whose primary appointment is at Deakin (e.g. the co-edited book they published together in 2015);
- Coleman's collaboration with a postdoc funded for two years by the Czech Institute of Sciences (2019-21):
- Plunkett's collaborations with Czech colleagues on a Collected Edition of new translations of the work of Jan Patočka into English (funded by the Czech Ministry of Culture, the Secure SEKYRA Foundation and Jan Michalski Foundation);
- Malcolm's collaboration on a large Templeton Foundation project hosted at Boston College (The Philosophy, Theology, and Psychology of Christian Trust in God);
- Sandis was a Senior Member of the Spanish Research Council project: Hegel's Philosophy of Action: Logical and Ontological Aspects (2014-2017, £30k), Moyal-Sharrock and Sandis are currently members of the Research Working Plan Group for Intercultural Understanding, Belonging and Value: Wittgensteinian Approaches, Spanish ministry for Science, Innovation, & Universities (PI Tejedor: 2019-2022, £23k);
- Sandis' essays on action & ethics have been translated into French as Raisons et responsabilité Essais de philosophie de l'action by Rémi Clot-Goudard (Grenoble) and are being published in paperback by Ithaque in March 2021 (2020 publication was delayed due to COVID-19), with a Preface by Bruno Gnassounou (Nantes);
- Lippitt collaborates with psychotherapists and has organised workshops for trainee therapists on forgiveness (2015) and is co-conducting a series of Inner Circle seminars for therapists on Kierkegaard's *Fear and Trembling* (2018-present);
- Balaska has written (with Ben Ware) on the existential impact of the pandemic in our daily lives, for the Los Angeles Times.

Staff in the Unit have co-authored with colleagues in Australia, Belgium, Canada, the Czech Republic, Finland, Germany, Hungary, Spain, and the USA.

Contributions to Economy and Society

Public engagement and research impact both feature as natural elements in the Unit's overall research strategy. Its industry and policy partnerships include Sandis' collaboration with Microsoft Research on AI intelligibility and the right to explanation and Lippitt's collaboration with Bedfordshire, Cambridgeshire and Hertfordshire Constabularies on the ethics of policing. Other external organisations with whom the Unit engages include cultural heritage bodies and numerous schools and colleges. Activities with non-academic audiences also include developing CPD for groups of professionals including mathematics teachers (Larvor) and schools' outreach, including judging school essay and performance competitions (Caddick Bourne). Sandis served as a member of the British Committee for the Restitution of the Parthenon Marbles for a decade (2009-19) working with distinguished Hellenists and public figures such as Paul Cartledge, Edith Hall and Victoria Hislop.

Public engagement activities include:

- The annual Sir Francis Bacon Lecture, sponsored by the Royal Institute of Philosophy, delivered at UH by a prominent philosopher of international standing which regularly attracts audiences in treble figures. This series has been running for over a decade and spotlights the valuable contribution philosophy makes beyond the academy.
- Why Philosophy Matters (WPM), a regular series of public talks, run by the Unit since 2015, by prominent philosophers featuring debates, and head to head discussions at venues in London (in association with Bloomsbury Academic) and St Albans (in



association with the Cathedral Study Centre). Topics have ranged across literature, journalism, desire, Europe, forgiveness, humility, Kierkegaard, and painting. WPM also has a large social media presence (e.g. +5k Twitter followers and +3.8k Facebook followers).

- The British Wittgenstein Society (BWS) which celebrated its 10th anniversary in 2017 and holds numerous public lectures in Bloomsbury (and, since 2020 on Zoom). It has a large public profile and social media presence (e.g. over 2.8k Facebook group members).
- The Friends of Patočka Network (Plunkett) brings the Czech thinker's ideas to a broad audience through international conferences and public engagement workshops in the Czech Republic and beyond.
- Engagement with schools including running an annual mini-conference at UH for sixth formers from local schools. More distinctively, Caddick Bourne's Schools Shakespeare Adaptation Project aims to provide an innovative way of getting secondary-school students to engage with both philosophy and Shakespeare, through thinking creatively about ways to adapt Shakespeare, in order to explore philosophical ideas. Secondary-school students are invited to create their own adaptations of Shakespeare's works, by using a bespoke activity pack and by attending a workshop run at their schools to engage them in thinking about the philosophical questions raised by their adaptations. Prizes are awarded for the best submissions.
- Broadcast media; print and online magazines. Unit staff have made a range of radio appearances on subjects such as cultural heritage and cultural appropriation on various radio stations (Radio 3, Radio 4, Radio Oxford, Radio Scotland, LBC, Herts Radio, and Sveriges radio) stations. Sandis is a consultant for Radio 3's Free Thinking programme and has also appeared on The Moral Maze. The Unit contributes to online and print magazines, including Los Angeles Times, The Church Times, The Conversation, The Monocle Weekly, Four by Three, Optima, Times Literary Supplement, The Oxford Philosopher, Forum For Philosophy Essays, Philosophy Now, Police Professional, Reform Magazine, Times Higher Education, The Vegan Society, Medium, and The Socrates Almanac. Since 2017, Sandis has written a quarterly opinion column for The Philosophers' Magazine and took part in Philosophy by Postcard, while Coleman is one of the philosophers on the American AskPhilosophers website, which fields and replies to questions posted by the public. Kirkpatrick's 2017 article on de Beauvoir on love on the Institute of Art and Ideas blog received over 7500 shares on social media.
- Unit members have also participated in various public debates, such as the Battle of Ideas at the Barbican and Oxford Fashion Week (Sandis) and given various invited talks to church and community groups (Kirkpatrick, Larvor, Lippitt). Sandis has given public talks and published article on AI Intelligibility and veganism.

Unit public engagement events are advertised on the UH website, as well as UH-related Philosophy's Facebook, Twitter, & Instagram accounts, and often publicized via the UH Research Blog and by the UH Marketing & Communications and Media teams. For instance, Larvor, Lippitt and Sandis have all written about aspects of their work for the UH Research Blog; Lippitt's work with Hertfordshire Constabulary was one of the areas chosen for publicity in the research videos produced for the UH website.

Contributions to Sustainability of Discipline

Unit staff are active contributors to the discipline and the wider research base:

Journal Editorships: Members of the Unit are on various editorial and advisory boards including Hegel Bulletin, Philosophical Explorations, InterAction, International Journal for the Study of Skepticism, Forum for Philosophy Essays, Philosophy Now, the Rowman and Littlefield New Kierkegaard Research book series, Philosophical Investigations, Nordic Wittgenstein Review, Philosophers, Oxford Handbooks Online, Revista de Filosofia, and Wittgenstein Studien. Sandis is the series editor for Philosophers in Depth (Palgrave), Why Philosophy Matters (Bloomsbury), and Anthem Studies in Wittgenstein (Anthem).



Participation on grants committees: Unit staff have conducted promotion and tenure reviews for universities in Australia, Denmark, Finland, and the USA, as well as peer review for research councils in Canada, Israel, Norway, Poland, and the ERC, as well as in the UK.

Fellowships and Prizes: Larvor's Visiting Professorship at Vrije Universiteit Brussels (2015-16). Lippitt's resident fellowships at the Hong Kierkegaard Library, St Olaf College (2018, 2019) and Intensive Seminar at the Centre for Ethics as a Study in Human Value at Pardubice University (2019), as well as his Honorary Professorship at Deakin University (since 2014). Sandis' Centre for Ethics and Public Affairs [CEPA] Faculty Fellowship at the Murphy Institute, Tulane University (2017-18) and his permanent Research Associate status at *Le Centre de recherche en éthique* (CRE), University of Montreal (since 2015, invited researcher in residence, 2018-19) and Waterloo Institute for Hellenic Studies (Canada).

Membership of Research Council or similar national and international committees: Professional activity includes memberships of the AHRC Peer Review College during the cycle (Caddick Bourne, Coleman, Larvor, Lippitt), the British Philosophical Association Executive Committee (Larvor), the Academic Committee of the Forum for Philosophy (Sandis), the Directive Committee of the Association for the Philosophy of Mathematical Practice (Larvor), The Royal Society of Arts (Sandis), and the Royal Institute of Philosophy Council (Lippitt).

Invited keynotes, talks, or conference chair roles: Unit staff have contributed to over one hundred keynotes or invited talks at venues around the world including Athens, Austin, Basle, Bergen, Boston, Brussels, Cambridge, Grenoble, Heidelberg, Helsinki, Hiroshima, Konstanz, Lisbon, Melbourne, Montreal, Nancy, New Orleans, New York, Nuremburg, Oslo, Oxford, Pardubice, Paris, Prague, Sao Paulo, Singapore, Taipei, Toronto, Valencia, Vancouver, Yale, Zagreb and Zurich. See section 3, Infrastructure and Facilities for conference chair roles.

Refereeing activities: Unit staff have refereed for dozens of journals including American Philosophical Quarterly, Analysis, Australasian Journal of Philosophy, British Journal for Philosophy of Science, Erkenntnis, Ethical Theory and Moral Practice, European Journal of Philosophy, Faith and Philosophy, Mind, Mind and Language, Minds and Machines, Philosophical Studies, Philosophy and Phenomenological Research, and Philosophical Quarterly and numerous presses including OUP, CUP, Routledge, Palgrave, Anthem Press, MIT Press, and Open Book Publishers.

Co-operation and collaborative arrangements for PGR training: as part of his VUB award Larvor organised research and training activities for VUB research students, writing two papers jointly authored with VUB staff. Sandis and Behrens are collaborating with a researcher at Microsoft X-Box on the agency of non-player characters and have published a shorter piece together for *The Philosopher's Magazine* (Nov 2020). A collaboration has been established with the Aristotelian Society for PGR student research training at the 2021 Joint Session of the MIND and Aristotelian Society.