

Institution:
University of Leeds
Unit of Assessment:
UoA 30 Philosophy
1. Unit context and structure, research and impact strategy

### (a) Unit context and structure

In the University of Leeds, UoA30 (Philosophy) is within the School of Philosophy, Religion and History of Science (PRHS) and the School within the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Cultures (AHC). UoA30 is one unit of assessment within the School, the other being UoA31 (Theology and Religious Studies). UoA30 research is overseen and managed by a School Research (and Innovation) Committee, whose ex-officio members are: a Director of Research (and Innovation) (here, DoR); a Director of Impact; a Director of Postgraduate Studies; the Directors of the Research Centres and the REF UoA leads. The intellectual culture of UoA30 is broadly analytic and it has particular strengths in: theoretical philosophy; history and philosophy of science; value theory and applied ethics.

The 58 staff members who contribute to the UoA30 research environment are distributed, as follows, across the categories *A* and *other*. The 36 A-staff (33.3 fte) are: 5 independent postdoctoral researchers (S.Bradley, Gamester, Gillin, Golub and Hewitt); 10 Lecturers on continuing teaching-and-research contracts (Clarke, Dow, Elliott, Fox, Isserow, Keiser, Lawlor, McKeever, Rowland and Salje); 2 University Academic Fellows (Woods and Müller); 7 Associate Professors (D.Bradley, Lang, Logue, Saatsi, Shalkowski, Topham and Wilson) and 12 Professors (Divers, Dodd, French, Gooday, Kieran, LePoidevin, Megone, Radick, Stark, Steward, Väyrynen and Williams). A further 22 current staff (18 fte) contribute actively to the research environment, but do not meet the criteria for inclusion in category A – thus: 4 Postdoctoral Fellows (Baldissera, Dang, Peet and Kittle); 16 Lecturers/Teaching Fellows, on continuing teaching-and-scholarship contracts (Arrell, Bex-Priestley, Carter-Walshaw, Dura-Vila, Ellis, Elstein, Finn, Hancocks, Hobbs, Jones, Kirton, Nick, Sinclair and Testa); 2 temporary lecturers (Duguid and Rawling); 1 research development assistant (Brouwer) and 1 impact officer (0.5) (Philip). There are 51 postgraduate research students (PhD) currently under the supervision of the above, making our research community (at census date) over 100 strong.

The recent former contributors to the research environment (Category B staff) are 10: with the unit until 2014, Barnes (metaphysics, ethics of disability), Cameron (metaphysics, philosophical logic) and Turner (metaphysics, philosophical logic), until 2017, Heuer (ethics, metaethics), Santorio



(philosophy of language) and Smith (political philosophy, philosophy of action); until 2018, McNish (applied ethics) and until 2019, Meskin (aesthetics, experimental philosophy).

UoA30 research activity is structured around 4 specialist centres, each having a Director and a School-allocated budget. The Centre for Aesthetic, Moral and Political Philosophy (CAMP) is the research home of 7 A-staff and 10 PhD students; the Centre for History and Philosophy of Science (HPS), of 9 A-staff and 25 PhD students; the Centre for Metaphysics and Mind (CMM), of 14 A-staff and 9 PhD students and the Centre for Inter-disciplinary and Applied Ethics (IDEA) of 6 A-staff and 10 PhD students. For various intellectual and practical reasons, each researcher has a primary affiliation to one centre: but many researchers regularly participate in the activities of more than one centre and all are encouraged to do so.

[Note. Within the School there is also a Centre for Philosophy of Religion (CPR) which is the research home of 2 A-staff listed above - LePoidevin and Shalkowski – whose research outputs are accounted for in UoA30 REF2. However, the majority of the researchers affiliated to CPR are from our sister unit within the School, UoA31 (Theology and Religious Studies). For reporting purposes, the activities of CPR are accounted for in UoA31 5b, while the individual contributions of those researchers are accounted for here.]

The rationale for the centre-focused structure is that it provides the optimal balance of provision for the general needs of researchers with their needs as specialists. The nexus of communication, into and out of research centres, is the Research Committee and the crucial figures are the centre Directors. In top-down communication, the Committee conveys, through centre Directors, the general strategic objectives and priorities of the University (via Faculty and School) to researchers on the ground. In bottom-up communication, researchers convey, through centre Directors, input to higher level strategic planning, and account for delivery of research aims and objectives: each centre has an annual general meeting at which a record of activities is reviewed in light of those aims and objectives, plans are formulated and shifts of aims and objectives are mooted. To achieve lateral communication, information, good practice and challenges originating in any one centre is shared with the Committee by the centre Directors: this input is analysed, filtered and then shared with researchers on the ground through the Directors of the centres to which they are affiliated. It is in that cycle of communication that the general needs of researchers within the unit are addressed. It is within the centres themselves, that the specialist needs of researchers are addressed through focus on the finer-grained and localised aspects of research sub-disciplines - that is: substantive research content, publication strategies, funding sources and niche opportunities.

Research that falls naturally within the scope of UoA30 but outwith any of the centres is supported at the School level by generic funding for early research (Pump-Priming fund) and for established



projects (General Research, Impact and Engagement) fund. Allocation is made by the general School Management Group under the advice of the DoR.

## (b) Research strategy

In REF2014, UoA 30 (Philosophy) University of Leeds, was assessed as follows: outputs, 70% world-leading or internationally excellent; impact, 90% world-leading or internationally excellent and environment 60% world-leading and 40% internationally excellent. Our over-arching research aim was to secure and support a vital and sustainable research environment for the years ahead and the future strategy for achieving that aim was to maintain and enhance the international leadership of the unit in its areas of strength. This aim stood throughout the current period of assessment but, predictably, with strategy modified in response to external changes in research climate and internal changes of personnel. Our modified strategy has been to maintain the international excellence of the unit through supporting the research centres that sustain its broad areas of strength. This strategy has been implemented through pursuit of the following objectives:

(R1) To maintain and enhance our research strengths by means of recruitment, retention and career development of world-class academic staff; (R2) To develop new research strengths in central areas of the subject; (R3) To increase researchers' exposure to new ideas, perspectives, and methods emanating from worldwide developments in our subject and other disciplines; (R4) To disseminate our research to the widest possible audience; (R5) To engage researchers in other disciplines and non-academic audiences with our research; (R6) To attract research income at a level which supports and enhances research, and (R7) To improve research facilities, infrastructure, and working environment. These objectives have been addressed as follows.

(R1) The funding of: (a) 12 new permanent appointments (increasing the number of research active permanent academic staff submissible for REF from 31 to 36) and (b) 9 promotions [see §2a]. (R2). The appointment of 4 early career specialists in the sub-disciplines of philosophy of language and mind to replace 3 departing mid-career specialists in metaphysics [§2a]. (R1), (R2), (R3), and (R5) The permanent appointment of 3 University (of Leeds) Academic Fellows, thus capitalizing on central University funding for the recruitment of "world-class staff to research-intensive positions with interdisciplinary dimensions" [§2a]. (R4) The publication by A-staff of 12 monographs, 24 edited volumes and 256 refereed articles, and their presentation of research at over 700 events (361 UK and 341 International) [§4]. (R3), (R4) and (R5) The organization and delivery of an extensive programme of research events, funded from a mixture of School, University and external sources. The central unit venue is a fortnightly Philosophy research seminar in which all unit researchers participate. Research centres also hold their own regular seminars and have hosted over 100 workshops or conferences [§4a] (R6) The capture of over £5.9M in research income [§3a]. (R7)



The move to improved office accommodation for more than 1/3 of researchers and the opening of dedicated communal research spaces [§3b].

#### (c) Impact strategy

REF2014 evaluated the Unit impact profile as: 30% 4\*; 60% 3\* and 10% 2\*. In that submission our over-arching strategic aim was to expand the provision of impact support and increase the proportion of researchers for whom engagement and impact-focused research is a core activity. This aim has been maintained in the current period of assessment but strategically modified in response to external changes in research and impact climate and internal changes of personnel – in particular, to boost collaborations and public engagement activities which respond to issues of local, national and global importance. The Impact Case Studies (REF 5c) reflect a tradition of strong impact through research projects that: (i) engage cultural institutions (especially those within the heritage sector) and professional bodies as partners, and (ii) enhance informed public and professional involvement with the history and philosophy and history of science. Case studies witness enhanced strategic relationships with the financial services sector (IDEA) and with the museums sector (HPS). At the leadership level the School reconfigured the role of Director of Impact (held by Stark since 2015) in Autumn 2016, giving impetus to systematic re-articulation of impact strategic objectives as follows:

(IM1) To develop a balanced academic environment in which research excellence is consistently linked to engagement, impact and innovation. (IM2) To produce research-derived impact which excels in quality, significance and (national and international) reach. (IM3) To establish impact-focused and sector-based funding as a major component of income. (IM4) To share more widely academic responsibility for engagement and collaboration with the public and our partner organisations. (IM5) To enhance our reputation as a national leader in impact and innovation in relevant subject areas. (IM6) To enable established areas of impact strength to flourish, whilst supporting the development of impact strength in further subject areas. (IM7) To collaborate with public and third-sector partners in order to influence positively society, public policy and culture both nationally and internationally. These strategic objectives have been addressed by the following means.

(IM1, IM2, IM3, IM6) The recruitment of a University Academic Fellow (Stark) with impact-focused leadership responsibilities. (IM1, IM3, IM4, IM5, IM6) The employment of a (School) Impact Support Officer (Phillip, 0.5fte). (IM1, IM4) The creation of a series of PGR Impact Fellowships (2014-17). (IM2, IM3, IM6) The creation of: (i) a strategic investment fund that supports exploratory projects, and (ii) a dedicated research and impact expense fund which supports the development of established impactful activity. (IM3) The undertaking of consultancies with partners including: *the Banking Standards Board, Chartered Banker, the Institute of Engineering and Technology, the In-*



stitute and Faculty of Actuaries, the Archives and Records Association, the Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors and the Porticus Charitable Trust (annual income generated, £100-160K). (IM3) The full integration into internal peer review of research projects, assessment of potential for impact, public engagement and consultancy. The dissemination of impact expertise and good practice established in the impact-leading IDEA. (IM4; IM5; IM6) The expansion of the leadership role of Director of Impact to include ex officio membership of the core School Management Group. (IM5; IM7) The development of a Consulting and Training Unit to ensure concern with impact at the earliest stages of research project planning. (IM6) The strategic placement of research students and early career researchers into research projects and mentoring structures that promote awareness of the role of communication to wider audiences of academic research.

#### (d) Interdisciplinarity

The unit is, intrinsically multi-disciplinary in including both philosophers, applied ethicists and historians (HPS). The organizational entity (School), within which the unit is located, includes representatives of further disciplines within Theology and Religious Studies (from UoA31, TRS). The intellectual rationale for so configuring the School was precisely to promote an inter-disciplinary to research (and teaching). This inter-disciplinarity suffuses activity and is most obviously manifest in the existence of inter-disciplinary research Centres (HPS and the Centre for Philosophy of Religion) (R4-R5).

Unit research reaches outward within the University as follows. CAMP is linked to the School of Politics and International Studies by its regular joint seminars with the Centre for Contemporary Political Theory. CMM is linked to the School of Mathematics by: (i) a joint appointment (UAF Woods in Mathematical Philosophy); (ii) collaborative research-led teaching (undergraduate and postgraduate) and (iii) joint seminars and workshops with world-leading Mathematical Logic group. CMM is also linked to the School of Earth and Environment (Priestley Centre) by participation (S.Bradley) in the Responsible Evidence and Advice for Climate and Technology group. HPS is linked to the (institution-wide) Centre for Medical Humanities by seminar participation and the appointment of a University Academic Fellow in that field (UAF Stark). IDEA is linked to the School of Computing by a joint appointment in the Ethics of Data Analytics of UAF Müller, who co-manages with colleagues in the Leeds Institute for Data Analytics the EU H2020 projects: A European AI On-Demand Platform and Ecosystem and Inclusive Robotics for a Better Society. IDEA is also linked to the School of Medicine by Megone's NIHR-funded work in empirical medical ethics. The Faculty of AHC's Sadler scheme has funded several year-long interdisciplinary seminars co-convened by members of the unit: A New Politics of the City - Philosophy of Action meets Urban Studies (Smith with Geography); *Touch – Sensing, Feeling, Knowing* (Steward with English and Psychology); What to Eat? Values and Food Choice (Meskin with Psychology and the Business School's Centre for Decision Research, sponsored by N8 Agrifood) and Can Professional Institutions Save the



World? Climate Change, Ethical Transformation and the Lessons of History (Lawlor with Earth and Environment, Engineering and History).

Unit research reaches beyond the University of Leeds (R4 and R5) as follows. CMM is linked to Statistics and Behavioural Science (LSE) by the participation of S.Bradley in the projects: Challenging Radical Uncertainty in Science, Society and the Environment; Evaluating Probability Scores for the Insurance Sector and Formulating the Lorenz Principles (for communicating scientific findings and their assessment to policy-makers). HPS is linked to Psychology (Cornell) and to Biology (Cornell) by Radick's NSF funded project, Honoring the Complexity of Genetics. HPS is linked to Business Ethics and Law (Max Planck Institute) by Radick's UKRC funded International Development and Intellectual Property project. HPS is linked to Psychology (University of Oxford). to Microbiology (University of Oxford), to Ecology (University of Florida) and to Evolutionary Biology (the European Society) by the participation of Clarke. HPS is linked to Midwifery (University of Brighton) by the participation of Wilson in the AHRC Research Network, The Risks of Childbirth in Historical Perspective. HPS is linked to Museum Studies (University of Oxford) by the participation of Topham in the AHRC project, Constructing Scientific Communities. IDEA is linked to the Sustainability Research Institute and the Royal Academy of Engineering by their involvement in Lawlor's AHRC project, Climate Change Ethics and Responsibility. IDEA is linked to Classical Studies, Organisational Psychology and Leadership Studies in the Czech Academy of the Sciences by its participation in Dow's Leading Minds project. IDEA is linked to the Banking Standards Board by the commissioning of the research report, Exploring the Role of Professional Bodies and Professional Qualifications in the UK Banking Sector, co-authors Baxter and Megone. IDEA is linked to Law and to Media Studies (University of Sheffield) by their participation in Fox's AHRC project, Defining Freedom of the Press: A Cross National Examination of Press Ethics and Regulation in Ten European Countries.

#### (e) Internationalisation

(Note. Here we cross-refer extensively to avoid repetition.) It is a principal policy objective of the University of Leeds that internationalization should be embedded and developed in all aspects of activity (*International Leeds: Developing an International Strategy and its Delivery Plan*). This is absorbed in the research and impact objectives of the unit ((R1), (R3), R4), (IM2), (IM7) and the salient areas in which this objective has been achieved are: [§1g, h] open access and future strategy (underway); [§2a,b] the educational and career backgrounds of researchers; [§3a] grant capture and [§4a (i), (ii), (iii), (iv), (v),(vi)] collaboration and contribution to the research base and discipline.

#### (f) Research ethics



The unit is committed to maintaining best practice in research ethics, and those considerations are integral to the internal peer review process for all research grant applications. Megone has been a member of the University Research Ethics Committee since its inception (thus throughout the assessment period) and of the Animal Welfare and Ethics Review Board). McNish was Chair of the Faculty Research Ethics Committee (2014-18). IDEA delivers research ethics teaching across the University and has recently developed a Massive Open Online Course on Research Ethics (several thousand users to date).

# (g) Open research environment

In pursuit of the dissemination objective (R4) the unit fully embraces and advances open environment research. The University provides the unit with infrastructure and systems that ensure: access to research that is open as required by REF and funding bodies, and the effective management of research data (planning for which is an element of every research funding application). S.Bradley has compiled for internal use a list of open access policies for philosophy journals (journal embargoes). Several researchers have contributed to development of open access policy in executive committee discussions at: the Analysis Trust (Williams); the Aristotelian Society (Logue); the Mind Association (Divers and Dodd) and the Society for Applied Philosophy (Megone). In Presidential roles Steward (Aristotelian Society) has led discussions with OUP on the issues concerning Arts and Humanities journals in the Proceedings format and Radick (British Society for the History of Science) led the creation of a new open-access journal, BJHS Themes (CUP). At Ergo: An Open Access Journal of Philosophy Meskin operated as a Subject Editor in the area of aesthetics, Väyrynen in ethics and Williams in philosophy of language. As executive Editors negotiating with publishers to secure open access agreements for journals (Divers at Thought, with DeGruyter and Wiley, and French at The British Journal for Philosophy of Science with OUP Chicago, producing guaranteed OA publication in the Editors' Choice section of each number). Williams has initiated discussions with several journals about reducing their embargo period from the standard 24 months to 12 months required by the European Commission funding bodies and negotiated successfully to this effect, notably, with Mind (OUP).

## (h) Future strategy

As with the transition from REF 2014 to REF 2021 our intention is to renew the application, in light of change, of basic principles: to maintain and enhance the international leadership of the unit in its areas of research strength and to expand the range of researchers for whom strongly impactful research is an element of core activity. The primary needs for adaptation have been identified as those occasioned by operating in a post-EU context [§3a]. In that regard, plans have been set to raise research income (funding projects, doctoral students and postdoctoral researchers) from bodies that are not represented (widely or extensively) in our present (2014-20) profile – thus, for ex-



ample: the China Scholarships Council; the Mangoletsi Trust (with whom we have a strong relationship and are discussing an expansion of provision into research funding); those whose base is increasingly within the reach of the growing inter-disciplinary research involving Philosophy at Leeds (the APEX awards, the British Academy Knowledge Frontiers scheme, the British Council, the Wellcome Trust, Dan David (Wolfpack) Research; those whose base is increasingly within the reach of the growing impact-generating research involving Philosophy at Leeds (the shifting AHRC environment) and non-HESA organizations, principally, public and third-sector organisations within the UK, expanding outreach on the successful model of the IDEA Consulting and Training Unit. On the front of non-European internationalization, a major theme will be the bringing to fruition, the recently established research and teaching partnerships that the University of Leeds has with the University of Wuhan (China) and with Nanyang Technical University (Singapore). Development work undertaken include the Leeds-Wuhan Normativity Workshop (June 2019) and the Wuhan-Leeds Lecture Series in Thinking about Theory choice (October 2019). The other major need for adaptation has been identified as that of diversifying our research community, beginning with the centrality of the requirement in the first approved appointment of the post-REF-2021 era (Lectureship in Philosophy, concluded March 2021).

# 2. People

All UoA30 objectives for research (R1-R7) and impact (Im1-Im5) are pursued within University policy (disseminated via Faculty and School) which is designed to promote: the health and well-being of all staff and students (*The Health and Safety Policy and Protocols*) and diversity within the institution (*Equality and Inclusion Framework*). Line management and leadership of the UoA 30 staff group is provided by the Head of School and a Deputy Head of School (Philosophy and HPS) whose designated area of responsibility is UoA30 staff. The HoS (Dodd, formerly Gooday) and DHoS (Shalkowski, formerly Steward and Divers) are responsible for the management of recruitment, mentoring, probation and appraisal processes: those office-holders officers are informed of priorities in research strategy and objectives by consultation with the DoR and the UoA lead(s). The objectives that are most directly people-focused are: (R1) recruitment, retention and career development; (R2) developing new areas of strength; (R3) widening intellectual exposure and (R7) improvement of working environment. Other researcher-focused objectives have been pursued in the policy context as follows.

#### (a) Staffing strategy and staff development

In seeking to maintain and enhance our research strengths by means of recruitment, retention and career development of world-class academic staff, (R1), there has been strategic emphasis and focus on early career researchers. In recruitment of 12 new researchers to continuing posts only



Dodd (Professor) was appointed at a grade higher than Lecturer, the post in question being a senior academic leadership role (Head of School). The 11 appointments at Lecturer level fall into two categories. Firstly, 8 appointments to Lectureships were conceived, advertised and named to reflect specific research requirements - thus, for example D. Bradley (Lectureship in Theoretical Philosophy) and similarly for the appointments of Clarke, Elliott, Fox, Isserow, Keiser, McKeever, Salje and Rowland. Of strategic note, (R2) and (R3), are the appointments of the 4 early career specialists in the sub-disciplines of epistemology, philosophy of mind and philosophy of language. This enabled a shift away from metaphysics, following the departure of 3 mid-career specialists in that field (Barnes, Cameron and Turner), promoting better balance of specialisms within theoretical philosophy (CMM) and the collaborative needs of researchers already on staff. Secondly, 3 appointments were to University Academic Fellowships: Müller (Ethics of Data Analytics) Stark (Medical Humanities) and Woods (Mathematical Philosophy). These (and that of Dodd) were extraordinary and enhancing appointments in the sense that unit objectives were significantly advanced through capitalisation on University resources that were not dedicated to strengthening research in UoA30. Of strategic note, (R2), (R3), and (R5), are the terms of UAF posts: in advertisement ("to recruit world-class staff to research-intensive positions with interdisciplinary dimensions" and on appointment (promotion to Associate Professor within 5 years is presumed following satisfaction of bespoke criteria concerning research outputs; impact, funding capture and research-led teaching). Across the 11 Lecturer level appointments the standard of international excellence is evidenced by: 6 incumbents arriving from outside the UK (Bradley, Elliott, Isserow, Keiser, Müller, Rowland and Woods); 1 following tenure of an Oxford Junior Research Fellowship (Clarke) and the cohort including PhD's from ANU (Elliott and Isserow), Princeton (Woods), Stanford (D.Bradley) and Yale (Keiser)..

Contributing substantially towards retention of high-performing staff within the unit there have been 9 promotions of research staff: 4 within the Lecturer scale from grade 7 to grade 8 (Elliott, Isserow, Keiser and Salje); 4 to Associate Professor (D.Bradley, Lang, Logue and Saatsi) and 1 to Professor (Stark).

Career development on the research front for A-staff is mounted on a baseline of workload allocation that allows 550 hours (33%) of research time for all. To ensure that research time is not squeezed out by the special demands brought by teaching and administration in a new institutional setting, new early career staff are awarded further research time of 200 hours in year 1 (to 45% research time) and 150 hours in year 2 (to 42.5% research time). All staff participate in either the University's annual confidential Staff Review and Development Scheme (SRDS), or the Probation Mentoring scheme: both centring on the review and updating of a personal career and development plan. Early career staff, however, benefit from significant further support: those on continuing contracts have regular meetings with a Probation Mentor (University Code of Practice) while those



on fixed-term contracts may opt to enter Probation in order to avail themselves of similar support and to put on formal record, significant performance and achievement. All unit staff have access to a range of modules offered by the University's Organisational Development and Professional Learning unit and we provide, within the School, a regular series of ECR (early career researcher) Support and Development workshops. In UoA30, early career staff on continuing contracts outnumber those on fixed-term contracts by 9 to 5, and 7 of the staff who contribute to our research environment have obtained continuing contracts following successful fixed-term appointments within the School.

All researchers who contribute to UoA30 research environment, are able to benefit from financial provision, from various sources, of their research development. All have a statutory research/scholarship allowance of £750 p.a. rising to £1500 p.a. by application that is subject to light-touch review by the DoR. Faculty funding offers further support for international conference travel and research mobility to facilitate international collaboration with co-authors of outputs. The School invests further in a general research and impact expense fund (GRIEF) which provides small-scale support for such activities as empirical work in experimental philosophy, archival research, impact-focused development and editorial assistance. To maximize width of access to resources and participation in research activity, we construe the scope of expenditure within our control widely and inclusively so that it reaches well beyond traditional conference attendance expenses to include: visits by research collaborators; editorial assistance and care for dependents [§ 2(c)].

All UoA 30 staff on continuing contracts are further supported in their research development by presumptive entitlement to one semester of research leave (or scholarship leave) for every six semester of normal duties. The only condition is that a satisfactory plan for research and/or impact activity during leave will be submitted and approved by a panel chaired by the DoR (which also functions as a point of advice on how to maximize benefits within the leave period). During the assessment period, all plans have been approved (and leave granted). Externally funded leave "pauses the clock" on routine research leave, but the service accumulated by that point since previous leave is retained. Parental leave and sick leave do not pause the clock. The Faculty also runs a matching faculty study leave award scheme. Members of the unit have been exceptionally successful in this scheme, securing on average 2-3 awards each year, out of 13 open to competition across 9 Schools (of which UoA30 is less than 1) in the Faculty. All staff are actively encouraged to apply for external research funding and our support for the development of competitive funding bids and the management of awards is detailed below [§3]

The employment of further researchers on fixed-term research contracts has been extensive – thus: 21 Postdoctoral Researchers (21), currently 9, and 8 in Teaching and Research roles. These Postdoctoral researchers have been funded from sources such as AHRC, British Academy, EC



Horizon 2020, Leverhulme Trust and the Templeton Foundation. In seeking to boost recruitment of Postdoctoral researchers, the School has supported the development of applications for longer, larger project grants that embed these posts. These applications are reviewed and developed through the School's research and innovation committee, thereby ensuring both cross-disciplinary and subject-specialist input and feedback. Postdoctoral researchers are given workspace and plentiful opportunity to run research seminars, workshops, and conferences, present their work-inprogress, and enhance their teaching and supervision experience. All early career staff in the unit are assigned a mentor who is not their line manager and whose role is to advise and support them on their professional development and career plans and prospects. The time required for mentoring postdoctoral researchers is recognised in the School's workload model. Mindful of the specific difficulties facing postdoctoral researchers and staff on short-term contracts, the school management team instituted start-of-year (and occasional thereafter) meetings for postdoctoral researchers in PRHS. The meeting of our aim to enhance career development value for colleagues on fixed-term research contracts is evidenced by subsequent placement in academic positions – thus: Carr (Assistant Professor, U San Diego); Dura-Vila (Lecturer, Leeds); Elliott (Lecturer, Leeds) Elstein (Teaching Fellow, Leeds), Gerver (Lecturer, Essex), Goodman (Assistant Professor, Illinois Chicago) Jones (Lecturer, Bristol), Kidd (Lecturer, Nottingham), Knowles (Teaching Fellow, Leeds) Leckie (Stipendiary Lecturer, Oxford), Liao (Associate Professor, Puget Sound), Monk (Lecturer, Nottingham), O'Conaill (Postdoc, Fribourg), Salje (Lecturer, Leeds), Siriwardena (Lecturer, Trinity College Leeds), Thompson (Lecturer, Southampton), Williams (Roehampton) and Willows (Senior Lecturer, University of Winchester).

#### (b) Research students

The unit has currently 51 PhD students, a further 73 having completed in the period (124). Supervision in the earlier part of the assessment period tended towards the historical norm of a single supervisor supported by a mentor: latterly – and partly motivated by career development for early career researchers – policy has been to implement team supervision (typically, two cosupervisors). Many PhD students have benefitted from cross-disciplinary supervision from (e.g.) Computing Science, the Sustainability Research Institute, the Institute for Health Sciences and Clinical and Population Science. All research students at Leeds are supported through the Leeds Doctoral College and follow a standard process of monitoring and support, including: the allocation of a Personal Tutor (outwith the supervision team); reporting and review at 6-months 12-months and annually thereafter and a formal process of approved Transfer to full PhD status at 12 months. New research students complete a training needs analysis and training plan, which is reviewed and updated as part of the regular reporting process. Research students benefit both from a suite of training specific to postgraduates offered by the University's Organisational Development and Professional Learning team. We offer an extensive programme of in-house training, ranging from



auditing courses in research methods to bespoke sessions focusing on: preparing for the transfer meeting, gaining qualifications in HE teaching, publishing, applying for funding, and preparing for the academic job market, applying for academic jobs. We also run "mock" job talks and interviews. Each PhD student is guaranteed a minimum £900 allowance (over the course of the programme) for research expenses and further support is available by application to the Faculty (AHC) in which the unit is located.

The unit strongly encourages all postgraduate students to participate in its research seminars and discussions. Several regular seminars take place during term time: each research centre runs at least a fortnightly seminar and the general philosophy seminar also is fortnightly. Most centre seminars feature talks also by PhD students several times a year. The unit also runs ad hoc talks by visiting speakers, and larger projects have organised weekly seminars of reading groups involving PhD students and/or postdocs funded by or affiliated with the project. Reading groups primarily organised by PhD students, include those on: *Decision Theory* (Pettigrew et al); *the Philosophy of Explanation*; *Agency and Metanormativity*; *The Moral Nexus* (Wallace); *Reasons and Persons* (Parfitt); *Human Understanding* (Toulmin); *The Structure of Evolutionary Theory* (Gould); *Idealisation and the Aims of Science* (Potochnik) and *Minorities and Philosophy*. The students themselves organize a dedicated weekly PG seminar, offering exposure to a wide range of developing PhD projects across the unit.

The diverse sources of PGR include: (a) international (*CONCOYIT* Chile, *CONAcYT* Mexico, the *Onassis Foundation* Greece, *Commonwealth Studentships* and the government of Taiwan); (b) 11 AHRC Collaborative Doctoral awards (in partnership with Boots, the British Library, the British Museum BT, Action on Hearing Loss, the History of Advertising Trust, the National Institute of Agricultural Botany, Oxford University Museum of Natural History, the Science Museum Group, Thackray Medical Museum and The National Archives; (c) the White Rose College of Arts and Humanities (8); (d) University of Leeds competitions (Faculty and University-wide) and (e) School funds. The remit of our Research Development Assistant includes support of application for extended (4<sup>th</sup> year) funding and this has been obtained from sources including: the *American Philosophical Society, the Analysis Trust*, the *Gunvor och Josef Anérs Foundation*, the *Society for Applied Philosophy*, the *Aristotelian Society*, the *Linda Hall Library*, the *Jacobsen Foundation* and the *Mind Association*.

The achievement of our aim to enhance career development value for our PhD students is evidenced by subsequent placement in over 40 academic positions. Subsequent teaching positions (17) are/were held by: Baldari (Stratford University, VA); Chinnalong (Chulalongkorn University, Thailand); Cole (Shenyang Transformation International School, China); Covaci (Bristol and Warwick); Crosilla (Birminghham); Duguid (Philosophy Leeds); Fletcher (Glasgow, Edinburgh and the New College for Humanities); Hancocks (IDEA Leeds); Leffler (Durham); Merrivale (Hertford and



Lincoln Colleges, Oxford); Nick (IDEA, Leeds); Sinclair (IDEA, Leeds); Tasker (Hertford College, Oxford) and Toop (Philosophy Leeds). Subsequent postdoctoral research positions (24) are/were held by: Bellis (Bristol and St.Andrews); Berry (Edinburgh, LSE and Birmingham); Crosilla (Oslo); Fraser (Max Planck Institute, University of Pittsburgh, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem and Durham); Gamester (Leeds); Heering, D. (Centre for Advanced Studies in Humanities, Berlin); Heering, E. (Ghent); Holmes (Cambridge); MacDonald (Greenwich Observatory); McGuire (Bristol); Murphy (Munich); Piel (Deutsches Museum, Munich); Plato (Magdeburg); Rodriguez Caso (Philosophy of Science Program, Department of Open and Continuing Education and the Faculty of Philosophy and Letters all at UNAM, Mexico); Shi (Peking University) and Sznajderhaus (Galway).

# (c) Equality and diversity

The unit is strongly committed to equal and inclusive opportunities in its staffing policy – albeit in face of a very poor baseline in our discipline at large and in our own unit. While inequalities of social (class) background are not well-recognized as pressing in philosophy and HPS as a whole we are anecdotally aware of these. Inequalities of ethnic origin are so recognized and while we have no general data on ethnic representation across the discipline, we regretfully report that (locally) we have 0/35 researchers identifying in any "non-white" group. It is known that there is noticeable decline nationally and internationally in the proportion of women who proceed from undergraduate to graduate level study and from early career to senior posts. This situation is reflected in our present staffing situation with women comprising 19% (7/36) of A-staff. Available resources have, however, been deployed to strive for balance within the assessment period to the following effects: 50% of new appointees being women; 56% of women being promoted and 14% of women remaining unpromoted (grade 7). Our emerging practices of data collection for equality and diversity monitoring showed that no review of output submission was required: in particular, mean-REF2-outputs per researcher is higher for women (2.33) than for men, (2.13) (*University of Leeds REF Equality Impact Analysis, UoA30 Output Summaries*).

Our commitment to, and local expertise in, equality and diversity issues is reflected in the fact that the School of PRHS piloted approaches to equality and diversity that have now been taken up more widely in the University, most notably by introducing implicit bias training workshops, aimed at improving practice in recruitment and promotion/reward and recognition. The School has endorsed the *BPA/SWIP* good practice scheme for gender equality in philosophy, which includes ensuring (and monitoring) adequate representation of women speakers and chairs in seminar series and conferences and equity in work-loading, promotion, and rewards. The School has also provided financial support to the Leeds chapter of the Minorities and Philosophy network run by re-



search students, and PRHS and IDEA helped fund the Diversity Reading List aimed at helping philosophy instructors to increase the diversity of their syllabi. Our efforts are helped by the University's approach to equality and diversity. Its scheme for maternity, paternity, and adoption leave is more generous than required by law. Staff returning from periods of leave, including parental leave or ill health, are supported through the ordinary management and mentoring structure with additional support from the occupational health team, and have access to a graduated return-to-work plan. Promotion and recruitment processes are designed to allow factors affecting research "productivity", ability to travel for research purposes, and the like, to be taken into account. Members of promotion and recruitment panels undertake mandatory training with attention to equality and diversity issues (in addition to the mandatory Introduction to Equality and Diversity unit taken by all University staff).

The unit currently has four members of staff with significant responsibility for research who are on long-term part-time contracts to accommodate caring responsibilities. In each case, non-research workload has been reduced *pro rata* to ensure that the proportion of research time is preserved. Research leave entitlement is the same as for full-time members of staff. Work on staff well-being in PRHS within the REF period has included the development of a "buddy" network with the explicit aim of providing informal peer support and a major review of workload including attention to worklife balance and good practice in relation to working hours (for example, a policy against out-of-hours emails). Staff have access to the University's counselling and psychological support services, and to a wide range of well-being projects and programmes.

We proceed towards our aim of being an academic community which is fully inclusive of graduate student researchers by ensuring representation of that cohort in the construction and organization of seminar programmes, reading groups, workshops and conferences [§4].

## 3. Income, infrastructure and facilities

#### (a) Income

The unit has aimed to maximise research income in order both to support a vibrant research culture and to fund investment in the future health of the unit (R6). The success of those efforts is evidenced in the headline figure of £5.9M awarded to A-staff as principal investigators in grants that began during the assessment period.

There are 15 major awards (£100k+), as detailed below.

[EU] (a) ERC Starting Researcher Award, Williams *The Nature of Representation* (£1.29M); (b) ERC Consolidator Award, Williams *Group Thinking: New Foundations* (£1.54M); (c) Marie Curie



Reintegration Fellowship, Bradley, D. Carnap and the Limits of Metaphysics (£127k) and (d) 6 Marie Curie Incoming Fellowships: Williams/S.Bradley, Imprecise Probability Models of Rational Belief (£145k); Radick/Dyde, Making Biological Minds (£111k); Williams/Elliott, The Nature of Degrees of Belief (£115k); Woods/Golub, Expressivism and Normative Realism (£180k); Williams/Keiser, Languages and Language Use (£166k) and (B-staff) Meskin/Liao X-Phi Aesthetics (£169k) [UK] (a) AHRC: (Research Grant) French & Saatsi, Scientific Realism and the Quantum (£224k); (Leadership) Stark Endless Possibilities of Rejuvenation (£199k) and Steward, Persons as Animals (£183k); (b) Leverhulme Trust (Research Project Grant) Divers Thinking Counterfactually (166); and (c) British Academy (Mid-Career Fellowship) D.Bradley Bayesianism and Self-Doubt (£120k). [USA] John Templeton Foundation, LePoidevin God and The Book of Nature (£191k).

A further 6 significant awards (£75k+) are detailed below.

[EU] Muller, Inclusive Robotics (£86k) and (B-staff) Santorio, The Probabilistic Construal of Modality (£75k). [UK] AHRC: Gooday, Electrifying the Country House (£79k) and Electrifying Women (£76k) and Radick, International Development, Intellectual Property and Seed Exchange (£81k); Leverhulme Trust: Radick, Disputed Inheritance (£95k).

Further substantive awards have been obtained from: the *Royal Academy of Engineering*, the *Mind Association* and the (Oxford Research Centre in the Humanities) *Alan Turing Institute*.

Beyond HESA funding sources, the IDEA business plan includes the raising of income from sources in the private, public and third sectors through its Consulting and Training Unit. Consultancies during the assessment period have included work for partners including the *Banking Standards Board, Chartered Banker*, the *Institute of Chartered Accountants for England and Wales*, and the *Porticus Charitable Trust* (average income £100+k p.a.).

Extensive support for research income generation has contributed significantly towards our achievement of income objectives R6 during the assessment period. The PRHS research and innovation committee regularly reviews colleagues' longer-term plans for research grant applications. The process of putting together applications and running winning bids is strongly supported on multiple fronts. The Faculty Research Office employs pre-award administrators who help draw up budgets for research bids and post-award administrators who help with the management of successful bids. The Faculty's Pro-Dean for Research holds periodic "health-check" meetings with holders of multi-year awards. PRHS employs a part-time specialist Research Development Assistant (Dr Brouwer) whose role is to help colleagues identify suitable funding schemes for their projects and then help them develop those applications, particularly in relation to large awards. Our research centres often hire a research student or a post-doctoral fellow to provide further help with



finalising larger funding applications. PRHS operates a peer review panel providing cross-disciplinary and subject-specialist feedback on applications, the Director of impact advises on impact plans, and especially larger applications are given feedback also by peer reviewers from the broader Faculty. A wide range of seed-corn funding and "pump-priming" opportunities, advice sessions, and information-sharing opportunities are facilitated by the Leeds Arts and Humanities Research Institute (LAHRI) especially in relation to collaborative and interdisciplinary work. During the REF period these opportunities have also included several visits from senior management team members from the relevant research councils.

## (b) Infrastructure and facilities

The School and/or Faculty maintains the following dedicated research facilities: one multi-purpose room which is used for seminars, reading groups and ad hoc research meetings, and is not bookable for teaching; for postgraduate researchers – common rooms, computing workspaces and lockers (accessible seven days a week) and for academic visitors and postdoctoral researchers – open-plan offices. Over 1/3 of our researchers have moved to improved office accommodation in the renovated site, Botany House.

Research income has been reinvested widely in non-material infrastructure including: enhanced annual budgets for research centres; enhanced research allowances [§1a]; a DoR annual budget to help underwrite workshops and conferences while external conference funding applications are pending; the Museum of Science, Technology, and Medicine through the appointment of a Director (Finn).

Other significant research facilities include the outstanding resources of the Leeds University Library, including access to e-journals and a variety of subject databases in addition to research data management support, copyright advice, and open access support. The Special Collections held at the Brotherton Library have internationally significant holdings in the history of science, technology, and medicine, and these have supported major research endeavours in HPS including projects on William Hey's eighteenth-century casebooks, nineteenth-century manuscript recipes, and the twentieth-century papers of Max Isserlin.

## 4. Collaboration and contribution to the research base, economy and society

The unit aims to play a major role in the development of the research base of the discipline at the highest levels of collaboration and contribution nationally and internationally, and to make wider contributions to economy and society through public engagement and impactful collaborations with



a wide range of academic and non-academic partners (IM1-IM7). The most significant contributions are as follows.

## (a) Collaboration and contribution to the research base and discipline

(i) Collaboration and networks. Local collaboration with Sheffield and York is afforded by the White Rose College of Arts and Humanities (e.g. the Al and Wrongdoing network) and by sub-disciplinary networks such as Yorkshire Ancient Philosophy, Sense Perception in the North and Quanticode (ethics). Wider national collaboration is evidenced in the leading of networks such as, Risks in Childbirth - Historical Perspectives (Wilson) and Rethinking Patent Cultures (Gooday). Among the international networks lead from Leeds are the European Non-Categorical Thinking Project (Divers). International collaboration in publication projects is manifest in examples such as Shalkowski (with Bueno, US) and Woods (with Maguire, US). The non-stipendiary research fellowships program through which (an annual average of 8) scholars visit (for 1-12 months) in order to: join in the activities of at least one (host) research centre, present their work to seminars, and interact informally with staff and research students. International fellows have included visitors from countries in which our disciplines are well-established (Australia, Italy, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland and the USA) and others in which these are developing (China, Czechia, India, Iran, Singapore and Turkey).

(ii) Advisory and consultancy work and learned societies. The Presidential post in the two most eminent learned societies in UK Philosophy have been held within the unit: Divers (Mind Association 2017-18) and Steward (Aristotelian Society 2019-20). Similar Presidential roles have been held nationally (British Society for the History of Science) and internationally (Society for the History, Philosophy and Social Studies of Biology) by Radick, while LePoidevin has been vice-President of the British Society for Philosophy of Religion. Among the major advisory positions held by members of the unit are: membership of the AHRC's Peer Review College (Kieran); Chair of the European Association for Robotics and co-Chair of the IEEE's, Robots and Automation in Society (Müller) and Chair of the Outreach and Education Committee for the British Society for the History of Science (Stark).

(iii) Editorial roles. Members of the unit have held a primary or executive editorial role at various journals: Divers (Thought); French (British Journal for Philosophy of Science) and Radick (Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences). Associate or specialist editorial roles have also been held by: Clarke (British Journal for Philosophy of Science); Lang (Journal of Applied Philosophy); Stark (British Journal for the History of Science); Väyrynen (Ethics, Ergo and Philosophy Compass) and Williams (Ergo). Membership of Editorial boards at large have been held at Thought by Logue and Väyrynen.



- (iv) PhDs examined. Members of the unit acted as External Examiners for Doctoral theses within the UK on 33 occasions (e.g. in the Universities of Cambridge, Edinburgh, Oxford and St.Andrews, LSE, KCL and UCL) and outwith the UK on a further 12 occasions (e.g. in the Australian National University, the Scuola Normale Superiore and the Universities Fribourg, Gronigen, Guelph, Tilburg, Turin and Uppsala).
- (v) Conferences organized. The number of conferences or workshops organized or co-organized by members of the unit is over 100. Among the 70 events that took place in Leeds are: (CMM) Fundamentality and Grounding; Degrees of Belief; Propositions; Singular Thought and Perception; Conditional Thought; Contradictions and Persons as Animals (HPS) Composition in Physics; Underdetermination; Aesthetics meets Philosophy of Science and Ageing and the Life Course; (IDEA) Climate Change, Policy and Responsibility and The History and Future of Rationing, and (CAMP) New Approaches to Moral Error Theory; Metasemantics for Normative Discourse and Free Speech and the Requirements of Democracy. Among the 15 events that took place elsewhere in the UK are: Inheritance and Co-operation (University of Oxford); The Risks of Childbirth in Historical Perspective (OU, London); Should Society be Afraid of Robots?; Do we need New Laws to handle Robots? and Are Robots a Risk to our Jobs? (University of Edinburgh). Among the 16 that took place outwith the UK are: Imprecise Probabilities in Statistics and Philosophy (MCMP Munich) Naturalistic Approaches to Ethics and Metaethics (New York University); Non-Propositional Attitudes (ANU); Symposium on Skills and Practices (Yale); Beyond Deep Learning (Zurich), Sustainable Seeds Innovation 1.0 and 2.0 (Bangalore). Among the workshops organized by graduate students are: Love Etc. and Revisiting Rationality and Morality (2018)
- (vi) Lectures and keynote addresses. The two most eminent learned societies in UK Philosophy heard a Presidential address from Divers (Mind Association 2018) and Steward (Aristotelian Society 2019). Keynote addresses to conferences were given by Stark (The Digital Past, Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales 2018); Väyrynen (Philosophical Society of Finland) and Williams (Arché Graduate Conference, St Andrews 2017). Members of the unit have presented their research at over 700 events (UK 361, International 341).

#### (b) Societal contribution: beneficiaries, partners and publics

Sustaining long-term relationships with research users and non-academic research partners – especially in the public sector and the third sector, broadly conceived – is embedded in both the strategy of the unit (IM1-IM7) and the day-to-day operation of many of its branches. The focus is on developing ongoing partnerships to secure lasting and significant impact on, and engagement with, relevant audiences and constituencies. Across the unit, public engagement is developed as a dis-



tinct aspect of impact. Our strategic investments have enabled a number of unit members to embed impact or public engagement into their research from its inception. Our impact, knowledge transfer, and public engagement activity accordingly reaches far beyond the activity reflected in the case studies. To this end researchers are supported in applications for both internal and external funding streams through internal peer review. This has yielded eight collaborative projects funded under the University's Ignite scheme, supported by the Cultural Institute, with core partners (e.g. Thackray Medical Museum, Leeds Museums and Galleries) and new collaborators (e.g. Yorkshire Dance, Opera North). The institutional ESRC Impact Acceleration Account has supported a new partnership with Taylor's of Harrogate led by Meskin, and AHRC Follow-on Funding awards have developed strong collaborations with the Science Museum Group through the work of Gooday, Radick and Stark.

The Museum of the History of Science, Technology and Medicine provides a focal point for engagement activities in HPS and facilitated a two-year programme of monthly public lectures, *The History of Science in 20 Objects*, which attracted a cumulative audience in excess of 1,500 in 2016-17. Following this model, three further lectures in November/December 2018 addressed the topic of scientific realism under the heading, *History and Philosophy of Science in Focus* (Saatsi, AHRC). The Museum also runs a regular programme of engagement activities for schools and public audiences, notably at the annual *Being Human* festival. The *Philosophy into Schools* programme has continued to enable philosophy undergraduate students to observe, plan, and lead philosophical learning in primary schools as part of their degree. The annual public *Mangoletsi Lectures* provide all research centres (in turn) with a high-profile forum for in-depth public engagement and have been presented by Professors: John Cottingham (Reading Emeritus, *Towards a More Humane Philosophy of Religion* 2014); Helen Beebee (Manchester, *Turf Wars: Science and Metaphysics*, 2015); Rae Langton (Cambridge, *Doing and Undoing Things with Words* 2016) Mohan Matthen (Toronto, *Art for Pleasure's Sake* 2017 Sally Haslanger: (MIT, *Ameliorating Social Practices* 2018) and Christina Van Dyke (Calvin College, *Philosophy as a Way of Life* 2019).

Broader public engagement activities have included three participatory philosophy events focused on philosophical issues raised by: Coffee; Cocktails; How Philosophy and Poetry can Respond to one another, and the relationship between Philosophy and Dance (Meskin). Two major temporary exhibitions were offered on the History of Rejuvenation (Stark) and Historical Risks in Childbirth (Wilson)) while a travelling exhibition on the History of Health (Finn and Stark in partnership with the Wellcome Trust and the Thackray Medical Museum) visited hospitals and libraries throughout Yorkshire. Unit members also offered public talks and participated in debates at: the Royal Institute of Philosophy, the Ilkley Literature Festival, the British Science Festival, the Cheltenham Science Festival, Leeds Central Library, the Nottingham Lakeside Arts Centre, the Barbican's Battle of



*Ideas* and the LSE *Forum for Philosophy*: these covered topics including anti-ageing, aesthetic taste, perceptions and experiences of risk, and black holes.

Research specialists in IDEA are supported by a dedicated Consulting and Training Unit which facilitates collaboration with non-academic partners and has fostered long-standing relationships with a large number of professional bodies, particularly in engineering and finance. Regular consultancy work, the provision of continuing professional development and pieces of commissioned research sustain ongoing collaborations with: the Royal Academy of Engineering. the Institute of Engineering and Technology, the Engineering Council, the Institute of Chartered Accountants for England and Wales, the Institute and Faculty of Actuaries, the Chartered Banker Institute, the Chartered Institute of Securities and Investments, the Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors, Marks and Spencer, and DLA Piper. Specific projects have included: the development of an ethics programme in collaboration with NHS England and Sainsbury's (Megone and Macnish, EPSRC Data Analytics project) and the development, and disseminated to the Royal College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists, of a solution to consent problems in the case of sick and premature neonates (funded by the National Institute of Health Research). This has been supplemented by a significant strand of impact activity in ethical issues in robotics; Müller drove this agenda for the European Commission's Robotics and Artificial Intelligence Unit through shaping the Framework Programme and Work Package for Robotics and AI (2016-20) and the public-private collaboration between the EC and the industry-led euRobotics group. Additional consultancy work commissioned from researchers in the unit has enabled Heritage Doncaster to carry out a major programme of youth engaging using their mining-related collections (Stark, HPS, Esmee Fairbairn Collections Development Award).

The strategic objective of expanding sources of impactful research (IM4) has been, in part, fulfilled by collaborative projects on: (i) philosophical perspectives on the relationship between humans and non-human animals (Salje and Steward, CMM, with *Chester Zoo* 2015-16); (ii) the impact of ethically relevant product information on consumer expectations and experience (Meskin, CAMP, with *Taylor's of Harrogate* (2018-19) and (iii) creativity – barriers and unlocking potential (Kieran, CAMP, with *Livity*).

Finally, A-staff have contributed to the shaping of public discourse and understanding in a wide range of media, the salient examples being as follows: (i) Rowland won the 2020 Australasian Association of Philosophy Media Prize for his Uncivil Disobedience podcast; (ii) online articles by D.Bradley (Disagreement) and Fox (Expertise) were published by The Conversation; (iii) Radick appeared on BBC television (Genius by Stephen Hawking) and BBC radio (In Our Time) and (iv) The Independent newspaper published an article by McKeever, on the relationship between apparently innocuous norms and sexual assaults on women.

