

<b>Institution: University of Surrey</b>
<b>Unit of Assessment: 18 Law</b>
<p><b>1. Unit context and structure, research and impact strategy</b></p> <p><b>1.1 Context and Structure</b></p> <p><b>Context</b> In 2015 Surrey Law School embarked on a radical and ambitious programme of growth. Our overriding objectives were to build a distinctive, world-leading capacity in legal philosophy, and to energise long-standing strengths in international and environmental law. These objectives reflected the University's strategic commitment to 'excellence at scale' and 'growth in research concentrations'. A unique and vibrant school has resulted, well-placed to address vital social challenges from a legal philosophical perspective, while making globally important, impactful contributions to environmental and international law. The School is now home to 20 FTE researchers, more than double the number returned to REF2014. PhD numbers further reflect our rapid development, with 19 completions this cycle compared to 8 in REF2014, reflecting an increase in average annual awards from 1.6 to 2.7.</p> <p><b>Structure</b> Fourteen of our staff are fellows of the Surrey Centre for Legal Philosophy (SCLP), making this one of the largest dedicated centres for legal philosophy in the world. Six belong to the Surrey Centre for International and Environmental Law (SCIEL), which brings together law school members of the esteemed interdisciplinary Environmental Regulatory Research Group (ERRG), led by Malcolm, and a body of researchers working on international law. Informal groups in criminal law, private law, and legal history work with and alongside the core centres. In 2019, the School launched its Law &amp; Technology Hub where academics, business leaders, and legal practitioners forge close links across a range of tech-focused projects. There is a welcome exchange of ideas among the two broad-based centres, informal groups, and hub, assisting the School's mission to be a collegiate home for all researchers. Giglio, the School's Director of Research, has a supervisory role, encouraging an inclusive research culture, promoting School synergies, and facilitating the dissemination of research within the University and beyond. The Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences (FASS) supports the School's research initiatives, facilitates collaborations, and oversees all REF processes. FASS also provides dedicated funding for impactful research, bidding activities, and PhD scholarships, supplementing School contributions.</p> <p><b>1.2 Research Strategy</b></p> <p><i>a) Meeting assessment period objectives</i></p> <p>By pursuing our ambitious strategy, we have transformed our ability to produce excellent research and achieve meaningful impact in key areas. Two objectives during this REF period have been crucial:</p> <p><b>Our first core objective, to develop distinctive strength in legal philosophy</b>, was met by targeted appointments: first of theory-oriented ECRs with outstanding potential (Barcentewicz, Bero, Lee, Taggart); second of established legal philosophers from within the UK (Rodriguez-Blanco, Donnelly-Lazarov); and third of distinguished researchers from prominent international institutions (Abbott (UCLA/Southwestern), Andresen (Yale/US Treasury), Asgeirsson (University of Iceland), Ehrenberg (Alabama), Lindsay (Dartmouth), Newhouse (Harvard), Patterson (Rutgers/EUI), Sarch (University of Southern California). This successful strategy has built a vibrant community of legal philosophers willing to challenge revered ideas and able to respond to emerging priorities, including AI, pandemic regulation, constitutional crises, and neuroethics. Publications indicate the School's resulting strength in depth, including monographs by Ehrenberg and Sarch (OUP), Abbott and Donnelly-Lazarov (CUP), and Rodriguez-Blanco and Asgeirsson (Hart). Articles in prestigious journals include: <i>UCLA Law Review</i> (Abbott), <i>Ethics</i> (Asgeirsson),</p>

*Legal Theory* (Asgeirsson, Newhouse, Sarch, Lindsay), *Law Quarterly Review* (Barcentewicz), *Law & Philosophy* (Lee, Sarch, Bero), *Oxford Journal of Legal Studies* (Lee, Barcentewicz), *Ratio Juris* (Donnelly-Lazarov, Patterson, Rodriguez-Blanco), *Jurisprudence* (Ehrenberg, Patterson, Rodriguez-Blanco), *Philosophical Studies* (Bero), *Yale Journal of International Law* (Andresen), *UC Davis Law Review* (Sarch and Abbott) and *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* (Ehrenberg). The SCLP has made a significant mark in legal philosophy internationally both through this wealth of publications and in hosting well over 100 research events in the first 5 years of its existence – continuing remotely during the pandemic - while developing an extensive research network with numerous respected international collaborators (outlined in section 4.).

**The second core objective, to augment existing excellence in international and environmental law**, led to the formation of SCIEL, reflecting a critical mass of funded and impactful activities in these globally important fields. Five significant impact projects are ongoing in SCIEL, led by Malcolm and Sarvarian, while these fields have contributed the large majority of the School's £240,000 funding in the cycle. Among funded projects are several important interdisciplinary collaborations, including: a GCRF Global Engagement Network on plastics governance (with the University of Nairobi); a water safety planning project (with Surrey Department of Civil Engineering); and an EU funded project on 'reduction of disease risks' health claims on food and drinks (with EU partners and the Department of Psychology). Other collaborations include O'Meara's work on environmental law with scholars from University College Dublin, supported by two (of eleven in total) British Academy awards on 'natures, cultures and communities'. The development of these areas is further evidenced in impressive publications, some emerging from the noted projects, including: Malcolm's "Richard Macrory" prize-winning *Journal of Environmental Law* article; and her co-authorship of book chapters in the prestigious *Proceedings of the British Academy*; Sarvarian's *European Journal of International Law* paper on codifying the law of state succession; Andresen's innovative papers on drones and space war in the *Harvard National Security Journal*; Du's (now at Durham) papers in the *International and Comparative Law Quarterly*, and *Legal Issues of Economic Integration*; Wang's monograph with Law Press, China, and, within the legal history cluster, Giglio's two articles, with comparative international perspectives, in the *Savigny Zeitschrift für Rechtsgeschichte*.

#### b) Relationship to 2014 objectives

The ambitious goal to make Surrey a leading centre for legal philosophy emerged post-2014 and has been achieved in a remarkably short period of time. It augmented the REF2014 ambition to strengthen the areas of environmental and international law. In 2014, the School submitted 8 staff to REF in what was described as a nascent research department. In the current submission, 21 researchers have been submitted surpassing the critical mass then sought. Research outputs have the high impact then proposed and this impact has been achieved across a wider field of activities than those imagined, extending beyond the 2014 concentration on environmental and international law to intellectual property, AI, use of algorithms, criminology, the ICC, and professional ethics. The stated ambition for our research to appear in highly-regarded outlets has comfortably been met, with seven monographs, and a wealth of publications in internationally significant journals (see 1.2(a) above). Publication success across the School, is further evidenced by a balanced REF submission with almost all researchers returning more than the minimum of one output. The School's cohort of ECRs has grown substantially, as envisioned, and their work has had the significance then aimed for (see (2.1(c) below). At the same time postgraduate research is flourishing, with thirteen funded projects among the 19 completions during the census period. Overseeing these activities, Giglio has been serving as Director of Research for four years, reflecting the organisational stability aimed for in the last cycle.

#### c) Research objectives over the next five years

Current objectives, outlined below, will enhance a flourishing research community, focused on common interests with the ability to create innovative work in priority fields for a long time to come.

- **Step Change: From Development to Sustainability and Leadership:** We have successfully developed two well-respected, thriving research centres. Our aim now is to progress the centres to a stage where they are recognised as established, mature, leading, international research institutes. Among our ambitions for disciplinary leadership in legal philosophy and environmental/international law are: setting research agendas; establishing and directing research consortia; continued promotion of our own, still relatively young research staff; becoming a national resource for PhD students in our areas of expertise to embed an early culture of collaboration; and regular placement of our PhD students in jobs at research universities.
- **Nurturing Staff and PGRs:** In moving to the next stage in our development, we will continue to prioritise and preserve collegiality and morale and to prize quality over quantity in research publications. Specifically, to advance our ambition, we aim to maintain the current levels of teaching allocation, including our one-term teaching policy ((2.1(b))), enabling substantial research projects, including monographs, to take shape. Continued development of our PhD programme, and growth in our cohort of ECRs, will further deepen and broaden our strategic areas of specialisation ((2.1(a))).
- **Developing the Law and Technology Hub:** A priority, in line with institutional strategy, is to grow the School's Law and Technology Hub so it has a status equivalent to the two core centres. A number of factors make this both a natural and viable strategy: the recent appointment to a visiting Professorship in Law and AI of Giovanni Sartor (Professor of Legal Informatics and Legal Theory at EUI); flourishing research projects across a variety of subject-matter; existing sustainable impact; and our capacity to combine practical with philosophical perspectives. Specific ongoing research projects extend to AI-created innovation (Abbott); algorithmic fairness (Hamilton); law and military technology (Andresen); technology in financial regulation (Lindsay and Andresen); predicting court case-outcomes with machine learning (Barczentewicz); agency in artificial intelligence (Sarch, Donnelly-Lazarov, Taggart); brain-based lie-detection and neuroenhancement (Donnelly-Lazarov and Patterson); and teaching legal-technology (Barczentewicz). We aim to use this considerable high-level research capacity to achieve growing funding in the area while Abbott's submitted Impact Case Study (see 1.3) and the professional links established thereunder typify the nature of the collaborative projects we aim to pursue. The Hub's confirmed industry partners for this next development stage include: D2LT; Just: Access; SPOTDRAFT; and Stevens & Bolton. Institutional support for growth in this field is evidenced by investment of £100k through the [UKRI World-Class Laboratories programme](#) to upgrade the Moot Room into a Court of the Future, (one of the most technologically advanced Moot facilities in the UK) funding expressly provided for research into the impact of video-links and other technology on judicial proceedings in support of the HMCTS digital reform programme.
- **Expanding Research Income Across the School to Grow Collaborative Projects:** Significant funded research projects in Environmental and International law emerge from a mature grant culture and a strategic emphasis on building successful collaborations within the University and beyond. We aim to foster this culture across the School, setting targets appropriate to the Centres and Hub. Initial success, indicative of the projects we will pursue into the next cycle, includes membership in a legal philosophy research network supported by a €200k grant together with the Jagiellonian University of Krakow, with further collaborative bids planned. 2020 Conflux Techné funding (from an application led by Rodriguez-Blanco) on "Blame and Black Lives Matter: Responsibility for Historical Wrongs, New Perspectives from the Humanities and Arts". A collaboration with the University of Bergen was initiated by Bergen in 2019 and a multi-year joint bid to the Norwegian Research Council was submitted. Further joint projects are being explored on the defence of insanity in criminal law, and on the rule of law.

### 1.3 Impact Strategy

#### *Facilitation of Impact*

In 2014, impact was evidenced in the areas of environmental law, and international corruption. Impact is now a feature of research throughout the School, a goal emphasised post-2014, when impact-driven research was identified as a priority. Our staffing strategy has been particularly successful in enabling this broader reach with the appointments of Abbott and Hamilton proving significant: a multi-disciplinary international team led by Abbott has filed the first ever patent applications for two inventions created autonomously by artificial intelligence, while Hamilton's work on algorithmic bias has had multiple impacts, extending to influencing sentencing updates for the Model Penal Code. Supported by the School, researchers across our areas of expertise are achieving sustainable, promising impact in areas likely to dominate legal, societal, theoretical, and political discourse for the foreseeable future. In addition to Abbott and Hamilton's work, notable examples are in fields such as: land mine clear-up (Malcolm); post-Brexit constitutional arrangements (Barcentewicz and O'Meara); international defence (Sarvarian and Andresen); regulation of risks to small drinking water supplies (Malcolm); the effect of EU regulation on reduction of disease risks in food and drinks (Malcolm); and 4 funded projects on governance of plastic pollution (Malcolm).

#### *Sustainability and Future Direction*

The ethos underpinning this existing support, and our current impact strategy, is one of enablement. Future-directed initiatives, to aid new impact projects and develop others, include the establishment of School impact-based research assistantships. The School has also created the post of Director of Partnerships, to lead in establishing bridges between staff and key potential partners (including trusts, foundations, legal firms, think-tanks, and industry). Our provision of dedicated impact funding for travel, networking, and engagement allows for the building of relationships through which impact is felt and sustained. To illustrate, Sarvarian has been one beneficiary whose work has already been impactful in the context of Armenia's international relations, and on codes of practice for legal ethics in international courts. The potential for ongoing impact is evident and our support for building relationships has been key: Sarvarian was recently appointed as a judge ad hoc of the ECtHR for an advisory opinion on questions asked by the Constitutional Court of Armenia, and he is also co-Rapporteur on the International Law Association Committee on the Procedure of International Courts and Tribunals. He is an expert Legal Adviser for the Republic of Armenia to the UN General Assembly Sixth Committee, and participated in the Commission on Constitutional Reform of the Republic of Armenia, developing the 'Memorandum on Ratification of the International Criminal Court Statute by the Republic of Armenia.'

Complementing School initiatives, University and Faculty level support for our growing impact includes 'pump priming' funds, while the ESRC Impact Acceleration Account (available 2019-2023) supports our researchers and PGRs in developing effective collaborations with businesses, policy-makers, third-sector organisations, and other industry sector groups. The fund will promote University-level strategic themes overlapping with our interests, including the regulation of AI, sustainability, and urban living.

*Rationale for Case Studies Selection* In our REF submission we have selected cases that are: built on mature collaborations, distinguished by their reach and significance, at an advanced stage of development, and likely to be enhanced beyond 2021. Further, the three cases engage pressing social challenges, reflecting sustainable impact: bias in criminal justice algorithmic risk assessment (Hamilton); the potential for AI to perform previously exclusively human tasks, here patenting (Abbott); and managing post-conflict unexploded ordinances (Malcolm).

### 1.4 Interdisciplinary Research Enhancing the Environment

We explore the important subjects that interest us using the methods and expertise that can best illuminate them, expanding our own fields of competence or co-operating with researchers in other

fields. For example, SCLP researchers seek a philosophical as well as doctrinal understanding of law while incorporating insights from science, engineering, sociology, psychology, neuroscience, public policy, politics, or economics. Similarly, SCIEL researchers work on multidisciplinary projects with academics from engineering, biosciences, space science, psychology, sociology, business studies. SCIEL also has ongoing non-academic interdisciplinary projects, working alongside industry contacts in recycling, laser technology, gene-editing and space technology and with international organisations such as WHO and NGOs in ODA countries

Other particular exemplars of interdisciplinary research are found in the areas of immersive technologies, where Giglio heads a large cross-faculty group focusing on the original contribution of the Humanities and Social Sciences to these technologies; in the Law and Technology Hub which directs cross-faculty initiatives on court technologies and AI; in Hamilton's criminological work which uses forensic, mental health, and computational methodologies alongside psychological and statistical analysis; and in Ribary's unique use of programming to analyse Roman Law. Appointments to interdisciplinary bodies include Hamilton's leadership role on the Research Committee of the American Psychology-Law Society for a three-year term. Illustrative publications that demonstrate interdisciplinary approaches include: Patterson and Donnelly-Lazarov's edited collections on neurolaw (for OUP and CUP) with contributions from neuroscientists, and psychologists; Malcolm's environmental law publications, and Rodriguez-Blanco's co-edited 'Reasons and Intentions in Law and Practical Agency' (CUP) with two thirds of contributions from philosophers. Also notable is Rodriguez-Blanco's 2017 Roundtable on 'Rethinking Moral and Legal Responsibility' with Philosophy contributors including Pink (KCL); Hyman (Oxford); and Stout (UCD). Rodriguez-Blanco was also awarded a 2020 supplement to her Humboldt/Siemens Fellowship, to collaborate with Betzler, a Ludwig-Maximillian University of Munich philosopher.

Reaching out beyond the strict confines of law is both a natural feature of our research, and central to its sustainability. Through further such engagements we will continue to promote the holistic understanding that some of society's key challenges require.

### **1.5 Open Research Environment**

We consider the public availability of research to be critical to the wider good of academic practice. Open Access practices reflecting funders' open access policies as well as the Concordat on Open Data have been implemented. Compliance is monitored by a specialised University library team that also hosts Open Access events, attended by School of Law staff. We are preparing to meet the standards of 'Plan S', remaining attentive to initiatives that may assist monographs to have the same reach as other outputs, and aiming more widely to adopt ORCID identifiers. The School was an active participant in the UKRI Open Access consultation early in 2020, and this sparked a wider conversation around open licensing and open practices in law, reflecting wide-spread engagement across our research body.

### **1.6 Research Integrity**

The School applies the University's 'Code on Good Research Practice', which endorses the Universities UK Concordat to support research integrity. The University Ethics Committee (on which sit two School researchers), collaborating with the Faculty Ethics Committee, oversees staff and PGRs' research projects while ethical considerations, and the core elements of honesty, rigour, transparency, care, and respect are considered in formal (external) and informal (internal) reviews of all grant applications. Discussions around research integrity are a feature of research away-days and the Director of Research is available to researchers to discuss ethical dimensions of their work from the very early stages of planning.

## 2. People

### 2.1 Staffing Strategy and Development

#### a) *Staffing / recruitment policy and its effectiveness*

**Staffing Strategy** During the cycle, strategic appointments have established a community of outstanding researchers. We have appointed distinguished researchers at all levels; four ECRs, four senior lecturers, two readers, and five professors.

The University's President and Vice-Chancellor, Professor G Q Max Lu, has emphasised Surrey's aim to establish itself as an excellent place to take the first steps into academia, a goal outlined in the institution's R&I strategy. Mirroring this institutional commitment, our strategy, given increased ability to provide mature mentorship, is to grow our cohort of ECRs. These ECRs will have the capacity to become research leaders in our areas of expertise, be productive in their outputs, contribute to research-led teaching in more engaged and innovative ways, and slot into an existing friendly culture. As part of this ambition current, and new, ECRs will be supported to advance their research ambitions within Surrey Law School. With the sustainability of our research environment to the fore, our aim will be to encourage this body of ECRs to develop critical, foundational skills, explore new research questions, and to begin to direct scholarship in their fields (see 2.1(c) below for illustrations of current ECR- leadership).

**Demographic and succession planning** The significant turnover of staff in the early part of the cycle, before new strategies were in place, has reversed, with only one researcher departing since 2017. Evidencing further stability, we have consistently remained the first choice for our own researchers when they are offered attractive opportunities elsewhere. To draw replacements when people do leave, we will continue to make the School an extremely attractive place to work, with an outstanding sense of collegiality, a supportive culture, an intellectually stimulating community of openminded scholars, low teaching and administration loads compared to other institutions, and competitive salaries.

**Physical infrastructure** Staff are all co-located in a single building and benefit from generous office space, shared only in the case of fractional researchers. A staff room, a "Court of the Future" (see 1.2.(c)), and The Toulson Law Library all form part of our premises in the School of Law. The Library is the heart of our activities, holding over 150 research events in the cycle.

#### b) *Staff development*

Our PhD students, teaching fellows, ECRs, and experienced researchers constitute a single community. Staff are supported across these stages and the school has implemented the *Concordat to Support the Career Development of Researchers*. Teaching and research activities are mutually supportive, with **research-led teaching being the norm**. Staff may perform (and almost all do) their **teaching duties in one term only**, allowing for dedicated research projects to be pursued during the remainder of the academic year. **Sabbaticals** complement the one-term teaching policy, with nine researchers benefiting during the census period. **Individual research funds amount to £1,250** annually and can be used for a wide range of purposes including book purchases, conference attendance, profile enhancement, and networking. All staff have an **annual appraisal** with the Head of School where research development is reviewed, and targets identified for the year ahead. **Administrative roles are discussed and allocated** fairly to spread career advancement opportunities. **Appraisals are typically moderated** by a second senior academic to ensure fairness and consistency.

**Specific Support for Impact** Dedicated University, FASS, and School funds are available to support new and developing impact activities, Sarvarian, Abbott, Malcolm and Hamilton among the beneficiaries of FASS seed funding. The School Research Committee undertakes annual assessments of impact, identifying and providing development support for two to three projects that demonstrate high impact-potential. Other support for impact includes: guidance in staff

inductions; sponsorship of external impact scholars to address staff at faculty luncheons; in-house brainstorming sessions on creative approaches to impact; a University Technology Transfer Team (Abbott benefiting from advice during the cycle); and the identification of inter-group collaborations for public engagement. Impact generation is also now included as a topic in annual trainings with PGR students, while additional training is provided by FASS, including workshops on impact-creation, developing broader impacts, and identifying evidence of impact.

**Ethos** Our character and ethos are as important to our research environment as formal mechanisms. Exciting leadership has emerged within the School, both Rodriguez-Blanco and Sarch taking on the role of Headship during the cycle, assisting the collegial research setting to flourish while facilitating continuity. We remain a small School with an atmosphere conducive to close collaboration and respectful scrutiny. Researchers have been enthusiastic in presenting drafts of their work at frequent, well attended staff seminars that subject papers to friendly enquiry. All staff have presented papers (many more than one) during the cycle with feedback focussed on the strength and cohesiveness of reasoning. We support the deep engagement required for significant research projects and host dedicated events to this end. For two examples, the School invited external guests to work-in-progress seminars for Sarch's 'Criminally Ignorant', and Abbott's 'The Reasonable Robot' (monographs subsequently published by OUP and CUP respectively).

*c) Support for staff at the beginning of their research careers*

ECRs are supported in their research, teaching and career development by the School and institutionally. Lectureships and post-doctoral teaching fellowships allow teaching skills to develop while ECRs are integrated within our research culture. ECRs benefit from a period of probation during which non-research duties are reduced by approximately 30%, and all staff on probation have been offered a mentor who is a senior colleague rather than a line manager (with 100% uptake). Anonymous feedback has been positive, with one ECR reporting, "I found my Senior Colleague very supportive through my probation...She also gave me a wider perspective on my job and she has encouraged me throughout the years. She has always been positive." The School has an ECR Champion, Lee, who supports the well-being of ECRs, and their research initiatives. University level support is particularly strong on research bid development, with workshops, seed funding and bid peer-review assisting portfolios to develop.

The effectiveness of School support is visible in several ways. Notably, ECRs are assuming important research leadership roles: Lee (with Edwards, Oxford) co-convening the New Directions in Legal Philosophy series bringing to Surrey young talented researchers from Britain, Israel and the US; Barczentewicz convening the Oxford Symposium on the Polish Constitutional Crisis; and Bero bringing to Surrey the 2019 Legal Philosophy Workshop, hosted annually at different institutions in the US, UK and Canada for nearly a decade. ECRs have also published their work in prestigious journals, such as Oxford Journal of Legal Studies (Lee and Barczentewicz), Law and Philosophy (Lee and Bero), Law Quarterly Review (Barczentewicz), and Philosophical Studies (Bero).

*d) Exchanges between academia and end-users*

The School's centres and hub share an ambition to make their research relevant to users beyond academia (and over 90% of our researchers have experience in legal practice). Our annual SCLP public-facing keynote Lectures, "Connecting Theory to Practice," stimulate exchanges with the profession and engage the local community, two vital research users. Sponsored by Allen and Overy, these bring together a leading legal philosopher and practitioner to discuss philosophical questions of practical import. Former US Solicitor General Charles Fried gave the Inaugural Lecture with comments by former UKSC Justice and (then) Distinguished Visiting Professor, Lord Toulson. Other notable keynotes were given by Anna Stilz of Princeton, with comments by Allison Harvey of No. 5 Chambers; by Sylvie Delacroix with a response from Philip Wood, QC, CBE; and by Fred Schauer (Virginia, and formerly Dean of Harvard Kennedy School of Government) with comments by Manuelides, partner in Allen & Overy's Global Intelligence Unit. Lectures have drawn practitioners from firms including White & Case, Linklaters, and Baker McKenzie. We further

engage the local community via the annual Lord Toulson Lecture series, given in 2019 by Lord Neuberger, and in 2020 by Lady Hale. Publications reflect this ethos of engagement: For example, Rodriguez-Blanco's co-edited collection, 'Dignity in Dworkin's Legal and Moral Philosophy' (OUP, 2018) contains contributions from High Court Judges in India and an MP in the Indian National Congress.

Exchanges involving the SCLP are by nature inclined to be end-user focused, engaging a range of industry, governmental, and environmental end-users. These are outlined at 4.1(b) below.

*e) Recognition and Reward*

Promotion opportunities and career development are part of annual appraisal conversations with the Head of School. Opportunities for career advancement are also discussed less formally with mentors and colleagues with experience of the process. Promotion rounds take place annually and there is an opportunity to meet one-on-one with the Head of School to review applications. Staff surveys confirm that promotion procedures are considered fair and transparent. Surveys also confirm the positive atmosphere in the School and the trust researchers have in School management. The Executive Dean announces notable staff publications, impact success, funding awards, and other achievements at well-attended Faculty-wide meetings.

## 2.2 Research Students

The following table shows the number of doctoral degrees awarded for each year in the assessment period.

Year	PhDs awarded	Professional Doctorates awarded
2013-14	4	0
2014-15	2	0
2015-16	2	0
2016-17	2	0
2017-18	4	0
2018-19	3	0
2019-20	2	0

*a) Support mechanisms, training, and supervision*

Doctoral students are an integral part of our tight-knit environment; they are fellows of the appropriate research centre, invited to all research events, and supported to organise their own research seminars and conferences. The School provides dedicated training seminars for students as well as collaborative events with the Departments of Sociology and Politics. Notably, in semester one, compulsory research methods seminars are delivered in an intimate, small group format, for candidates yet to undertake confirmation *vivas*. In semester two, the School stages multidisciplinary seminars with other departments on career development themes including 'Obtaining Research Funding', 'Getting Published', 'Rejection and Resilience', and 'Applying for Academic Jobs'. Complementing our training, Surrey Doctoral College, founded in 2016, runs a Researcher Development Programme of workshops, mentoring and coaching, containing a combination of optional and compulsory courses. PhD candidates have been supported to attend research workshops offered by the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, and multiple seminars have been held at the School of Law under their 'Roadshow' initiative. PGR 'work in progress' seminars are also organised in the second term, giving all PGRs the opportunity to present work to the School and to benefit from our depth of research expertise. Students have a supervisory team of two (either co-supervisors, or first and second supervisors) and are encouraged to access a range of perspectives and expertise beyond that team, this facilitated by a formal cross-school open-door policy for PhD students.

*b) recruitment of doctoral students, including those with protected characteristics*

We admit students who can flourish in our unique and stimulating research environment. Ongoing PhD projects (on AI, Environmental Law, Neurolaw, Criminal Law, and Legal Philosophy) thus reflect an excellent fit with our research. This strategy, based on well-defined research themes, and supported by the annual award of two full FASS studentships, has been critical in establishing a very competent and diverse PhD body. We appoint students based on rigorous application of the same principles evidenced in our commitment to equality and diversity outlined below.

*c) monitoring and support mechanisms facilitating progress and successful completions*

Doctoral candidates progress through the pathway outlined in the University's Code of Practice for Research Degrees: Monthly supervisory meetings are the primary mechanism for monitoring progress and for feedback between supervisors and students. Where research is conducted at distance a method of regular contact is agreed between the student and supervisors, this became particularly important in 2020/21 when additional supports, including the identification of specific needs, for PhD students were put in place. Formal reviews take place at six and twelve-month intervals. At the end of year one, all doctoral students produce a 10,000-word paper for a confirmation *viva* led by two researchers outside the supervisory team. Aside from the conversational approach of the *viva*, detailed written feedback is provided. All potential supervisors are required to complete a two-day Supervisor Training Workshop run by the Doctoral College, while potential internal examiners are required to take a one-day Internal Examiner Training Workshop. The Doctoral College provides additional supports for the benefit of students with specific needs. These include a Disability and Neurodiversity service, and a Mental Health First Aid training service. In compliance with Doctoral College policies, the School Director of Postgraduate Research leads supervisors and candidates to intervene at an early stage in identifying and promptly addressing welfare issues.

*d) skills development and preparation for future careers*

In addition to supporting research skills, the School supports the development of PGRs' leadership and organisational skills. The success of this ethos is reflected in the organisation by PhD students of a weekend research conference (September 2020) on 'The Role of Law in Challenging Times'. Through a peer review process, students selected ten papers, with Surrey research staff providing commentary on each. Visiting PhD speakers came from Glasgow, Zagreb, St Andrews, KCL, UCL, Southampton, Warsaw and City University. Two other examples include student organisation of a 2018 Roundtable on Law and Neuroscience and a Conference (for Surrey PGRs) in May 2020. PhD students considering careers in academia are significantly assisted by a dedicated PGR Academic Careers Advisor (Rodriguez-Blanco), who supervises PhD students applying to academic posts. The aim of this initiative is to improve further the development route from PGR to ECR. Additional support in this regard is provided by Doctoral College Career Development Services. The School also recognises that teaching is an important skill for aspiring academics. Teaching opportunities are available for PhD students and all teaching duties are compliant with the University's Code of Practice for Postgraduate Researchers who Support Teaching. The School's interest in PhD students does not end on graduation. Notably, many of our former students have ongoing links with the School. The ERRG (1.1 structure) group within SCIEL, for example, has an internal and external membership including 10 of its PhD graduates who now work internationally as well as in the UK.

**2.3 Equality and diversity***a) Commitment to equality and diversity in staff recruitment and support*

The School is a recent recipient of an **Athena SWAN Bronze Award**. We ensure compliance with all equality and employment legislation in appointing and supporting staff, and in securing opportunities for those with protected characteristics. We share the University's commitment to equality and diversity, evidenced by its participation in national schemes including Disability

Confident, and the Race Equality Charter Mark and through its own “Rainbow Allies” scheme enabling staff to show their support for LBGTQI+ colleagues. Our own research interests extend to matters of inclusion and diversity, particularly in the context of the ECtHR, environmental law, and algorithmic justice.

**Flexible / remote working** The University has expanded its policy on remote working, offering flexibility to staff to work from home where possible and desirable. Responding to the pandemic the University’s Wellbeing Centre has specifically been tasked to assist staff with fears related to Covid-19. Training on remote working has been provided to the School, and Bero, the School’s dedicated wellbeing champion, offers a further point of assistance. The School holds regular remote coffee events, assisting to maintain our collegial environment in challenging times. During the pandemic, we have continued to host and participate in successful and well-attended remote research events while a dedicated philosophy of action reading group has flourished over the same time. A wide range of options enable full participation at in-person research activities. These extend to sourcing local carers on request while The Vice-Chancellor’s Inclusion and Career Investment Awards help those with caring responsibilities overcome the financial barriers associated with some career development opportunities. Researchers returning from periods of leave are offered reduced teaching loads and given lighter administrative duties where required.

#### *b) Promotion*

Our University-compliant promotion procedures reinforce commitment to equal opportunities, diversity and inclusion. Part-time and fixed-term staff are treated equitably with permanent staff in the School ethos, in the career pathways available, and in promotion opportunities. Support is provided to transition to full-time roles where desired. Online Unconscious Bias training is mandatory for all staff, and face to face Unconscious Bias training (providing it can safely be provided) is mandatory for all staff involved in recruiting/promotions/disciplinarys.

### **2.4 Equality and diversity in the REF submission**

In accordance with University policies all staff involved in selecting the School’s REF submission underwent both on-line and group-based training in equality and diversity, giving dedicated attention to each protected characteristic. Selection meetings were attended and overseen by the University’s Head of Research Performance who monitored compliance with the Institutional REF Code of Practice. The Code paid due regard to the importance of making a submission to REF that is cognisant of equality and diversity issues across the range of protected characteristics.

## **3. Income, infrastructure and facilities**

### **3.1 Strategies for Generating Research Income**

The School’s funding strategy has two key components: **first, to continue to build and support existing strengths** in International and Environmental Law (via SCIEL); and **second, to develop funding ambitions across the range of our sub-disciplines**. In implementing the strategy, senior researchers are encouraged to apply for major grants with junior staff as co-investigators or participants. Junior researchers are supported to apply for seed funding, and smaller awards, to build momentum and expertise. This approach has FASS support with grants available to free up time for one semester to produce a major application. The School further benefits from the expertise of a FASS Research Facilitation Officer who informs staff of relevant funding opportunities, advises on bidding strategy and comments on applications. The University also offers centralised support for drawing up research budgets and a dedicated bid development team for larger bids. All bids undergo Faculty peer review for quality assurance, while additional oversight is provided by the FASS research coordinator. Other University support is provided to start new projects, the ERRG winning an “SME Innovation Voucher” and a University of Surrey Sustainability Theme award to support its project on plastic waste governance.

**Aim 1: Building on Existing Strengths** The strategy has had significant success in the cycle and will develop further post-2020. Projects with Malcolm as PI (some outlined below) provide the impetus for further work, while her leadership gives SCIEL the experience and mentorship more widely to enable and sustain its funding activities (O'Meara succeeding in smaller bids during the cycle – 2.2(a) above). Malcom's recent funding successes as PI include:

- £135,000 EPSRC / GCRF funding for a *Global Engagement Network on Plastics Governance*, run jointly with the University of Nairobi and ERRG external member, Professor Nicholas Oguge which has established the [Governing Plastics Network](https://www.surrey.ac.uk/surrey-centre-international-and-environmental-law/governing-plastics-network) (<https://www.surrey.ac.uk/surrey-centre-international-and-environmental-law/governing-plastics-network>) (2019-21)
- £95,000 QR GCRF funding for a joint project with the Department of Civil Engineering at Surrey on *Water Safety Planning in Rural Communities using Groundwater Sources in Uganda and Malawi* (2019–2020)
- An FP7 project with the Department of Psychology and other EU partners: REDICLAIM, *Understanding the Impact of Legislation on "REduction of Disease risk" CLAIMs on food and drinks* (2013-2017)
- £60,000 AHRC/GCRF funding for, *The Wicked Problem of Plastics & the Discourse Surrounding its Governance* (AH/T008423/1) (PI: Prof Rosalind Malcolm, Surrey; Co-Is: Dr Itziar Castello-Molina, Surrey; Prof Nicholas Oguge, CASELAP, University of Nairobi, Kenya) (2020-2022).

**Aim 2: Increasing funding across the range of our research** The appointment of Giglio as Professor of Civil and Private law and to the role of Director of Research has been significant for broadening the scope of research funding in the School. Notably, Giglio's support for Ribary's Leverhulme application led to his appointment as the School's first Leverhulme Early Career Fellow. This strand of our funding strategy is attentive to the fact that legal philosophical research does not traditionally attract extensive funding, particularly in a demanding environment. However, we are also responsive to growing opportunities arising from the role of philosophy in addressing current societal challenges like pandemic regulations, AI, and neuroscience. In addressing the limitations and promise of our position, the school's strategy is:

- a) to collaborate with international partners including on an interdisciplinary basis
- b) to apply for grants related to the more practical applications of legal philosophy, and
- c) to benefit from our fit with University priority initiatives, including the Environment and AI.

Collaboration has begun to show results, the SCLP being a corner-stone member of the 'Law-Language-Philosophy' network, a Euro 200,000 project funded by the Polish National Agency for Academic Exchange and led by the Jagiellonian University of Krakow (2.2(c)). We have also been responsive to emerging priorities, submitting a timely ERC bid on the legal philosophical implications of Covid-19. Other ongoing bidding activities include applications submitted or soon to be submitted to the AHRC (with a German institution), and a number to the UKRI and Leverhulme. University initiatives supporting our efforts include a FASS AI and Ethics sandpit, and institutional commitment to a new Technology and Society theme.

### 3.2 Organisational Infrastructure / Benefits-in-Kind

A key measure that enabled our objectives to be met was the investment, during the cycle, of 85-90% of the School's annual non-staff budget in research activities. Continued support and investment will sustain an effective balance of activities and sub-disciplines in the School with the more doctrinal, law-in-action, focus of the SCIEL complemented by the theory and principles driven approach of the SCLP.

The School and University's very significant investment in the SCLP, in particular, has significantly enhanced both our publications portfolio and our capacity for impactful research. The SCLP has

also been generously supported both by Hart Publishing, which substantially contributes to the costs of the Hart Seminar Series, and Allen & Overy LLP which has financially helped with the Allen & Overy lecture series. The ERRG (within SCIEL) obtained funding under the 2018 Society for Legal Scholars Small Projects Fund for a conference on '*Rethinking Property Approaches in Resources for the Circular Economy*'. Our Law Library was dedicated in 2018 to the late Lord Toulson, who had donated his personal library to the School, adding to its existing collections.

#### 4. Collaboration and contribution to the research base, economy and society

##### 4.1 Collaborations, Networks and Partnerships

During the census period, prominent external scholars, and ECRs finding their feet, have come to recognise our research community as a place to test ideas and build partnerships. We nurture research development, identify new research directions, and, through the considerable outward-looking effort of our Centres, make a significant contribution to the discipline's research base.

##### a) *Collaborations, networks, and partnerships in legal philosophy*

Crucial to our continued success is the provision of an open, friendly, and welcoming place for the discipline of legal philosophy to thrive. Our prospering environment is evidenced in the SCLP Hart Seminar Series, hosting over 50 speakers in the 4 years ending summer 2020, including Kessler Ferzan (Virginia), Marmor (Cornell), Bix (Minnesota), Husak (Rutgers), Pavlakos (Glasgow), Hurd (Illinois), Moore (Illinois) Wolff (Oxford), List (LSE), Baude (Chicago), Sachs (Duke), and Berman (Penn). Research co-operations have followed: after presentations by Hurd and Moore, the University of Illinois offered to co-sponsor a Surrey Roundtable on Threshold Deontology (guests to include Waldron (NYU), Frick (Princeton), and Alexander (San Diego)). Ehrenberg and Pavlakos (Glasgow) now edit a series of monographs for CUP, while the SCLP's distinguished Advisory Board now comprises Berman, Hurd, Kessler Ferzan, Marmor, Moore, Endicott, Schauer, Penner, Macklem, and Chang.

SCLP Research Workshops, held over one or two days, allow for more intensive work, testing ideas that will form the future research base. Attracting well over 100 scholars to date, (including from Edinburgh, Oxford, KCL, NYU, Yale, Duke, and Chicago), workshops have succeeded to the extent that almost all are now co-organised. Partners include the Oxford Legal Philosophy Research Group, the Jagiellonian Centre for Law, Language and Philosophy, and Cardiff University Political Theory Research Group.

External recognition is further evidenced in the Centre's contribution to established academic events, hosting the 6th Annual Legal Philosophy Workshop, (previously hosted by Oxford, Edinburgh, Penn, and LSE), the 2020 meeting of the British Section of the International Association for the Philosophy of Law and Social Philosophy. The Centre also hosted, in 2019, a symposium on Gardner's (Oxford) *From Personal Life to Private Law* with comments by Holton (Cambridge).

Our membership of the 'Law-Language-Philosophy' project (above) connects to partners in Krakow, Paris, Zagreb, and Milan. Planned collaborative events include PhD summer schools; conferences in partner institutions; and workshops. The University of Bergen partnership (above) has commenced with joint research workshops on insanity in criminal law. The developing relationship will focus on the rule of law and on comparative, empirical and theoretical aspects of criminal law, enhancing our capacity for empirical research in this field.

##### b) *Collaborations, networks and partnerships in international and environmental law*

The School has a long-standing role in developing international and environmental law networks. Malcolm's partnerships, as Director of the ERRG, extend to diverse fields including water and sanitation, property rights in natural resources, waste and circular economy, and plastics, and sustainability. Examples of collaborations in the field include: Malcolm's leadership of the Ethics

Committee for the D-BOX FP7 project which comprised 20 industrial partners and was headed by Airbus; and the ERRG co-directorship of a Global Network on the Governance of Plastics (ESPRC / GCRF) with the Centre for the Advancement of Environmental Law at the University of Nairobi. This partnership, tasked with building a worldwide network on designing regulatory systems for sustainable management of plastics, demonstrates the sustainability and growth of our collaborative efforts in this field and our effective engagement with end-users: It emerged from an initial network established at a 2018 workshop co-run by ERRG, Essex Law School, and SOAS on 'Designing Law and Policy Towards Managing Plastics in a Circular Economy' and includes the extensive industrial network led by RECOUP (RECYcling of Used Plastics Limited), a leading authority providing guidance across the plastics recycling value chain. The network, substantially developed by Malcolm and O'Meara, engages with 20 countries across Africa, the Caribbean, Australia, Brazil, India, a number of EU member states, and the USA. Other ERRG networking activities involve project work on water and sanitation, engaging with universities, institutes, and government bodies in Uganda and Malawi together with the World Health Organisation. The ERRG held a series of workshops during the cycle, on 'Rethinking Property Approaches in Resources for the Circular Economy' (funded by the Society of Legal Scholars); 'Designing Law and Policy Towards Managing Plastics in a Circular Economy' (with SOAS and Essex Law Schools); 'Designing Law for Nutrition-Related Health'; and 'Greening Economics, Greening Society: What is the Role of the EU?'

International law collaborations include Du's 2017 conference, with the British Institute of International and Comparative Law, on 'Brexit, China and Other New Challenges to International Trade Law'. Collaborations in the field have also resulted in international events, Du hosting a Beijing conference on 'China's Belt & Road Initiative: Ideas, Law and Policy' in partnership with the China University of Political Science and Law (2018) and Giglio organising two international conferences on legal method and reasoning (Moscow, 2016; Groningen, 2014). Other notable partnerships include Giglio's chairing of the Groningen Circle, an international group of legal historians from Germany, Italy, Russia and the UK who meet every other year at a different university.

#### **4.2 Engagement with research users**

Proactive engagement with research users has improved our capacity for impactful research and enhanced our ability to identify future impact projects. For example, supported by £15,000 institutional funding, for three years we have hosted an annual cross-disciplinary Regulation of Artificial Intelligence Workshop for professionals from the fields of law, computer science, policy and technology. Abbott has presented his research in related areas to leading intellectual property institutes including European Union Intellectual Property Office, World Intellectual Property Organisation, WTO, American Chemical Society, and the Czech Parliament Committee on Health. Industry connections have also been developed by Giglio, leading a 2019 cross-faculty group on 'The Social Machine - Ethics, Empathy and Human Emotions in the Immersive Experience' to showcase the University's potential in this field. The group has established contracts with the flourishing Guildford gaming sector, Watts Gallery, RHS Garden Wisley, and immersive theatre companies such as Blast Theory and fanSHEN.

Hamilton's work has had significant and varied impact, some deriving from user engagement. She is an invited subject matter expert on the Task Force on Risk Assessment of the National Association of Criminal Defence Lawyers in the US and her 2018 video interview, 'Traumatized Victims in the Criminal Justice System', is included in the Compendium of Resources for Sexual Assault offered as educational materials to prosecutors, police, and counsellors, in Austin, Texas.

#### **4.3 Wider contributions to economy and society**

##### *a) Legal*

Members of the School from across its sub-disciplines have made important contributions to society, including at the highest courts nationally and internationally. Sarvarian was cited by the

ICJ, Sarch and Hamilton have written Amicus briefs submitted to the US Supreme Court, and both have had their research cited by US State Courts, with Hamilton also being cited by US Federal Courts. Giglio's research was cited by the Russian Supreme Court, Barczentewicz's research was used by counsel in *'Miller 1'* and Donnelly-Lazarov assisted Senior Counsel in Gallagher (UKSC). Hamilton appeared as an expert witness in *Grendell v Maine* (on excessive force by police in the US) and Sarvarian was expert witness in two confidential commercial arbitrations on professional ethics and international law.

Our work has also been influential for government, particularly on constitutional law matters. Sarvarian's research was cited in a Scottish Parliament Committee Report on *Proposals for an Independent Scotland*. Barczentewicz contributed expert evidence to Brexit inquiries in both Houses of Parliament and was referenced in the House of Commons Library Briefings. O'Meara has presented research to the House of Lords (on the implications of Brexit for Devolution), and to Swedish parliamentary officials in Stockholm (on the UK Parliament).

#### b) Advice and Consultancy

We have made notable advisory contributions across our areas of expertise. Our former China Law Centre, now part of the SCIEL, has organised training sessions for government officials from China including, in 2017, for more than 20 officers of the Legislative Affairs Commission of the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress of China. It also ran a 2018 seminar with the Chinese Ministry of Commerce partly based on Du's paper 'China's State Capitalism and World Trade Law' ICLQ 2014. During the census period, Du has also been advisor to the Chinese Ministry of Commerce on the Chinese-US trade war and provided consultancy services to PWC, Linklaters, and Oxford Analytica. Other notable advisory roles include: Abbott's membership of the European Commission Expert Working Group on New Technologies Formation; Sarvarian's service on the International Bar Association Task Force on Counsel Ethics in International Arbitration; Hamilton's reporting to the UK Sentencing Council on algorithmic risk in sentencing for domestic violence and sexual assault; Ehrenberg's sitting on the Board of Directors of TrueBit; O'Meara's academic observership at closed sessions of the European Network of Councils for the Judiciary; and, in partnership with grass-roots organisation JENGBA, O'Meara's collaboration on the Joint Enterprise Appeals Project, a live case-review of prisoners convicted under the joint enterprise doctrine. Aside from the initiatives outlined previously, other principal governmental users of our research include the World Trade Organization; European Commission; Czech Parliament Committee on Health; U.S. Federal Public and Community Defenders; Polish National Science Centre; Hong Kong Trade Development Council; individual Members of Parliament; individual members of the Swedish Parliament; and the Israel Patent Office. Non-governmental stakeholders include Astrium Aerospace; American Chemical Society; Interpat; National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers; Howard League for Penal Reform; CBRNE Ltd; and Novartis Media.

#### 4.4 Engagement with Diverse Communities

Researchers in the School are supported to bring their work to new communities. During the cycle, Rodriguez-Blanco obtained Institutional funding for a video on legal philosophy for children while Sarch and Abbott presented at the AI Surrey Summer School, a novel 3-day primer for people considering moving into the AI field, either professionally or via a PhD. Lindsay spoke in Hong Kong at a 2019 British Council Festival of Ideas on 'Resolving Disputes Over Space'.

Increasingly, we bring our work to public audiences too. Barczentewicz provided live commentary from the Supreme Court Article 50 hearings for the BBC. Newhouse has contributed to BBC Breakfast, BBC News, and BBC World News, discussing 'travel ban' litigation in the US. Sarvarian was interviewed on BBC News, BBC Radio 5 Live, and Eagle Radio about airstrikes in Syria. Du was interviewed by *The Globe and Mail* (Canada) on US Sanctions against Huawei; by *CKGSB Knowledge* (Shanghai) on WTO reform; and by *Global Times* (Beijing) on US withdrawal from the TPP. Hamilton has contributed to *NY Times*, *Texas Tribune*, and the *National Enquirer* on sentencing policy in the US. Malcolm has written for the *Guardian* on sanitation. Abbott's AI work

has been covered by the *Wall Street Journal*, *New York Times* and *Financial Times*. Several of our researchers contribute to research blogs, Ehrenberg, for example, participating in an 'ask me anything' online forum of reddit.com/r/philosophy, a section of the webpage that at the time had eight million subscribers.

#### 4.5 Indicators of Wider Influence

##### a) *Journal editorship grants committees and peer review*

Important editorial roles include Ehrenberg's co-editorship of the CUP *Elements* book series in the Philosophy of Law and Rodriguez-Blanco's co-editorship of the journal *Jurisprudence*. During the census period members of the School have also served on the editorial board of over 10 journals including *Jus Civile*, *Legal Theory*, *Ratio Juris*, *European Economic Law and Regulation*, *International Journal of Law in the Built Environment*, and *Chinese Journal of International Law*. Malcolm was guest editor for editions of the *Journal for Cleaner Production* and for the *Journal of Property Planning and Environmental Law*. School researchers have been evaluators for 8 grant bodies including Leverhulme, ESRC, AHRC, Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, and the Czech Republic Science Foundation. Sarvarian is an AHRC College Member and Malcolm is a member of the ESRC College. Giglio is a member of the prestigious Doctoral College of The Universita' Cattolica di Milano and a Member of the Scientific Committee of the *Milan Law Review*.

Members of the School have been referees for Routledge, CUP, OUP, Hart-Bloomsbury, Edward Elgar, NYU Press and for over 90 academic journals across our sub-disciplines: including *OJLS*, *CLJ*, *ICLQ*, *Ratio Juris*; *Mind*; *Criminal Law and Philosophy*; *Theoretical Criminology*; *Legal Theory*, *International Journal of Psychiatry*; *Journal of Women, Law & Philosophy*, *Politics and Police*; *Big Data*; *Journal of Consciousness Studies*; *Archiwum Filozofii Prawa i Filozofii Społecznej*; *Law and Economics*; *World Trade Review*; *Leiden Journal of International Law*.

##### b) *Fellowships and prizes*

Recognition of our research includes significant fellowships and prizes. There are two Humboldt Fellows in the School; Giglio, and Rodriguez-Blanco (joint with Siemens). Andresen was awarded the Yale Law School Edward D. Robbins Memorial Prize in 2016 for an article on due process in the age of drones. Malcolm was joint recipient of the 2014 Richard Macrory prize for best paper in *Journal of Environmental Law* and Malcolm was a member of the Surrey University research community awarded the Queen's Anniversary Prize for Food and Nutrition in 2018. Sarvarian, O'Meara, and Asgeirsson have been Visiting Fellows at the Max Planck Institute for Procedural Law (Luxembourg), UCD, and Oxford Centre for Ethics and Philosophy of Law respectively.

##### c) *Keynotes, conference chairs*

Notable keynotes during the census period include Rodriguez-Blanco's lecture to the Cambridge Doctoral Workshop in Legal theory; Newhouse on 'Kant and Global Justice' at Bayreuth University (2018); Patterson on 'Rechtsdurchsetzung ohne Staat: Paradigms of Enforcement – Justice vs. Efficiency', German Comparative Law Association, Basel, 2017 and Abbott at events hosted by MIT, World IP Organisation, and the Israeli Patent Office.

##### d) *Collaborative PGR training*

Commencing in 2020, and under our partnership with that institution, Law PhD students from the University of Bergen are incorporated into our Research Methods seminars, with 15 PhDs attending (remotely) from Bergen in the first year. The collaboration is also enabling PhD students from both institutions to present draft chapters to the group. These initial steps are the pathway for further collaborative efforts between the two Law Schools' PhD cohorts.