Unit-level environment template (REF5b)

REF2021



Institution: Royal Conservatoire of Scotland

Unit of Assessment: 33 – Music, Drama, Dance, Performing Arts, Film and Screen Studies

1. Unit context and structure, research and impact strategy

The Royal Conservatoire of Scotland is a small specialist institution that has an impact and reputation which belies its size.

Our research resides squarely within Unit of Assessment 33, and the unit and the institution are, therefore, one and the same for the purposes of this submission. REF5a introduces our research environment and addresses strategic considerations, including a review of the plans we described in REF2014: it should be read first. REF5b describes our environment for research and our approach in practice.

As noted in REF5a, impact and interdisciplinarity are central at the Conservatoire, part of a creative ethos that seeks change in the world. A range of practices and policies manifest and support this ethos in practice, from recruitment, to training and support for academic staff, to strategic planning for research and knowledge exchange, to our Outcome and Impact Framework with the Scottish Funding Council, and the outward-facing strategic vision and mission for the future of the institution.

Impact

We believe that, in the performing arts, profound impacts can be achieved at a range of scales, from the individual to the systemic; the impact case studies (ICS) in REF3 are chosen to reflect



that full range. ICS 1 (*What's Going On?...*) reports impacts on policies affecting very large numbers of young people and effecting change at a national level. ICS 2 (Challenging Creativity) centres on creative work that has unlocked new possibilities for disabled musicians and changed understandings around what those musicians can achieve. ICS 3 (Coorie Doon) explores an artistic research practice that has a profound impact on the lives of a small number of families experiencing life-changing events.



1: 'What's hidden in the ice?' MacRae's Anthropocene (image: Scottish Opera)

The ICSs reflect our profoundly felt social conscience and demonstrate, in practical terms, our commitment to equality, diversity and inclusion. They also reflect our wider ambitions for impact: to shape public policy for the arts and education, to push the boundaries of creative practice; and to achieve a deep impact on the lives of individuals.

These ambitions are manifest throughout the submission, in outputs that impact on audiences, the professions, policy and wider societal discourse. Examples include MacRae's opera *Anthropocene* (impact on specialist and non-specialist audiences), which received six performances in Glasgow, Edinburgh and London, reaching a live audience of 4800, and was streamed by Operavision.eu, reaching at least a further 6700 online. The desire to make a difference is reflected in the critical stance of outputs such as ECR Hopfinger's article *Children, Ecology and Performance* and in the project that culminated in Irvine's CD *Songs and Lullabies*, from which all profits go to UNICEF.

When recruiting researchers, we consider the impact (track record and potential) alongside the raw 'quality' of candidates' research and teaching, an approach that feels natural because it grows from

Sunday Mail June 18, 2017

wab @ www.sundaymail.co.uk

COMPOSER SEALS DEAL IN AMERICA



Niall Older women are not my type

Niall Horan says he doesn't have a thing for older women – unlike his ex-One Direction bandmate Harry Styles.

bandmate Harry Styles. Niall – who famously flirted with 57-year-old TV host Lorraine Kelly – has insisted her prefers women closer to his own age. When asked his opinion ofmore mature women, the singer said: "Not for me." He added "Too old, Im 23. Ive been so busy I havent" noticed if there has been any more attention from the ladies. I've been really boring."

Niall says he wants to reunite with One Direction. He said: 'It would be stupid not to get back together. But right now it's so fun. It's so different and it's anew way of challenging ourselves ourselves.

"People are freaking out over the split but it's been a year-and-a-half. "If I live to 80, which I'm

planning on doing, a year out of that is nothing. It's not along time. "There are two ways of

"There are two ways of looking at the break up. "You can either embrace it or dwell on the past." Enjoying the single life, Niall regularly shuns A-list glamour. The singer says a typical day involves cycling around London. Niall,23, added: "Everyone thinks we are these crazy

Niall, 23, added: Everyone thinks we are these crazy lunatic weirdos who do music but really we are just normal people. "I love going out on the

"I love going out on the Boris bike and having an ice cream in Battersea Park. I



WAVE OF SUCCESS The San Francisco Girls Chorus

sing Emma's Songs of Seals

sings with them too. The composer is a real-life Doctor Dolittle who sings to seals and then turns their howls into music. Emily's composition based on the songs of the grey seals, which live in the waters round the sile of Bute, has just had its US debut US debut.

Critics might think she's barking. But the mum of two, a research fellow at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, is now writing a new piece based on the songs of the grey seals off Tentsmuir Sands in Fife.

off Tentsmuir Sands in Fife. Emily 44, who communicates with the sea creatures by singing to them and playing the fiddle, will have her latest a Andrews New Music Ensemble in February next

in February next year The musician. who has also WILD TIME studied the

Rex Harrison sounds of whales, as Dr Dolittle dolphins and birds, says she has the best job in the world as she it combines her love of wildlife with her passion for music. Emily, who was born in Halifaxin Nova Scotia, Canada, said: Tam one of the world's few zoomusicologists. My job is to study the relationship between human music and animal songs. "It has taken me all round the it combines her love of wildlife



imals. And n OW hey can sing to Mum turns sea creature sounds into music

Emily composed a piece for a narrator, children's choir and seven instrumentalists based on their barks. She also includes Gaelic

at Tentsmuir Sands in Fife. The piece I write on the back of this research will replicate the sounds of the seals more than myfirst composition. Hopefully will allow audiences to get a

2: Article on Doolittle's research in The Sunday Mail (18 June 2017)

the particular relationship we have with the wider professional world in which we participate: the arts and cultural sectors, and the creative industries. We do the same with doctoral applicants.

Impact is integral to our support for researchers, whatever their stage of development – for example, it is a key consideration in the Research Clinics that are open to all staff and may be a practitioner's first steps in research. Support for impact continues through our project and sabbatical schemes for staff, the Athenaeum Awards, in which activity designed to maximise the reach and significance of the work's impact is as well supported and recognised as the research itself. Considerations of impact inform every decision of the awarding committee and an indication of the range of impacts achieved is given in the review that we published to promote the awards and inspire further work from colleagues: Practising Research: The New Athenaeum. (More detail on these awards is provided below.)



Public Engagement as a priority

In addition, the Exchange team (see REF5a) models, for researchers across the institution, highquality public engagement and other activities designed to maximise the impact of their work. Examples include the series of *Creative Conversations* organised in conjunction with the Royal Society of Edinburgh in August 2019 and 2020, and the specially curated series of blogposts exploring the experience of the performing arts in the global pandemic, *The Green Room*, in 2020. Our Exchange Talks series is an important aspect of our public engagement work; there are normally 18-20 of these weekly public talks on contemporary issues in the performing arts each academic session, with a typical weekly attendance of 30-50 people. The priority that we place on these is indicated by the fact that when the first coronavirus lockdown was announced in March 2020, the talks moved seamlessly online on the first operational day of the lockdown. It is normally a condition of funding that Athenaeum awardees contribute a public talk in this series, ensuring that it is richly informed by the current work of staff.

We promote diverse public engagement, supporting work that ranges from the examples above to Whiteside's contribution on dance health for BBC Two's *Trust Me I'm A Doctor*, to MacAulay's feature on 'Forgotten Women Composers' for *The People's Friend*, and Broad's work as presenter on the BBC's *Classics Unwrapped* programme.

Partnerships for impact

All three ICSs in this submission are built upon partnership: as a small institution, the significance of partnership working, across our operation, cannot be overstated. Such partnerships, whether formal and operating at the institutional level, or informal and driven by the researcher, are central to maximising the reach and significance of our impact. The partnerships that underpin the ICSs – with the Music Education Partnership Group and Creative Scotland, with Drake Music Scotland, and Chamber Music Scotland – are indicative of a wider web of relationships that reflects our small-institution attitude to partnership and uniquely networked position in Scotland.

There are further examples of partnerships that enhance impact right across this submission. Some relationships provide unique creative challenges that would not otherwise present themselves, such as ECR Robertson's work with Glyndebourne Opera as Composer in Residence. The relationship with Glyndebourne has enabled her to explore the questions that arise from collaborative composition, and a tightly drawn commission; the result is the output *Pay the Piper*, co-authored with other composers who are part of the company's *Balancing the Score* initiative. Then there are those relationships that permit a researcher to enlarge radically the impact of an insight. An example of this is the partnership with Glasgow Women's Library fostered by former member of staff Birch that resulted in a promenade performance of Cicely Hamilton's suffragette pageant *The March of Great Women*. With the decisive contribution of the GWL, the performance became a significant and striking event in the city involving over 100 participants, resulting in an excellent film and compelling imagery that has been re-used in many contexts (including accompanying an article by Scotland's First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon).



3 March, a project in partnership with Glasgow Women's Library

Interdisciplinary research

As noted in REF5a, we are distinctive internationally for the range of performing arts education we offer and we consider interdisciplinarity to be integral to our identity as an institution.

In research terms, our commitment to interdisciplinarity is fused with our commitment to impact and stems from the way we see our work in its wider artistic, intellectual and societal context. The (sometimes messy) complexity that arises from that commitment can be seen right across the submission, from overtly interdisciplinary work (such as Doolittle's '*Hearken to the Hermit-Thrush*'..., MacDonald's *Le Sirenuse* and Broom's *The Imperfection of Memory*), to work at the intersections of disciplines (such as Gonzalez's *Make Me Yours*, Myers's *The Science of Brass Instruments* and Gilmore's *Organising Music*), to work in which the researchers themselves take multiple roles (numerous examples). Interdisciplinarity contributes directly to the sustainability and vitality of research at the Conservatoire because it demands a constant critical dialogue between research practices.

The Exchange team includes those with backgrounds in performance, composition, dance, musicology, organology, management theory and theatre practice: our small team has wide interests. The range of disciplines represented in the Exchange, the close working of the team, and its extensive networks, help to ensure that interdisciplinary working is strongly supported.

Our wider institutional practice is at its core collaborative. For our outputs to be delivered, a variety of skills and approaches are needed in a process mirroring wider artistic practice. For example, composers work intimately with performers and technicians; theatre-makers work closely with sound, costume, and set designers; and dancers develop their work together with musicians. In a research context, interdisciplinary collaboration has a direct impact on the types of work undertaken, the tools used and developed, the processes that unfold, and the outputs that are produced. We provide support (through mentoring, training and funding) so that researchers can



produce outputs in multiple formats (e.g. performance, composition, journal article), within a single overarching project.



4 Broom's The Imperfection of Memory, a collaboration with artist Heather Lander

As with impact, support for interdisciplinary research is embedded in our processes: Athenaeum Awards, for example, are considered by an interdisciplinary panel. When recruiting researchers and doctoral students, we prioritise interdisciplinary work. The strategic appointment of our two Athenaeum Fellows is a case in point: we sought excellent researchers who could also support colleagues across the institution. From a strong field, we appointed one Fellow with a music background and established networks in the natural sciences, and another with a performance background and strong connections to fine art and critical theory. That the Fellows could support interdisciplinarity in complementary ways only increased the strategic value of these appointments.

It is important to note that many of our researchers have multiple intellectual identities that are manifest in their work. In our submission, there are examples of composer-performers (e.g., Buckley, MacDonald, van der Walt), composer-scholars (e.g., Doolittle, Fitch, Searle), performer-scholars (e.g., Bissell, Gonzalez, Hopfinger, Howat, Watkin), scholar-practitioners (e.g., Drury, Whiteside) and performer-curators (e.g., Irvine), among many other configurations. A significant proportion of our researchers, therefore, embody interdisciplinarity as they enact multiple roles.

That all this can happen in a relatively small community only adds to the sense of energy and vitality.

Beyond the UoA boundaries



5 Image from Gonzalez Make Me Yours: How Art Seduces. The author encounters a shoe by Manolo Blahnik.

As with impact, a range of partnerships support our interdisciplinary work. We have used transinstitutional supervision to support interdisciplinary doctoral projects since the inception of our doctoral programme; this was recently supplemented by our membership of the AHRC Doctoral Training Partnership (DTP) Scottish Graduate School for Arts and Humanities (SGSAH), which has helped us foster further key relationships. Unusually, we always appoint two external examiners for each doctoral project, meaning that interdisciplinary work at this level can be interrogated from different disciplinary perspectives.

In 2017, Athenaeum Fellow Doolittle established SHARE (Science, Humanities, and Arts Research Exchange) to facilitate wider interdisciplinary collaborations between researchers and PGR students at the Conservatoire and the University of St Andrews. SHARE supports interdisciplinarity at various levels: from initial match-making, introduction and networking, and developing scholarship through themed discussions like the RASCAL (Research on Animal Songs in Culture, Art and Literature) group, which has 59 members from 11 countries, to supporting collaborative funding applications and disseminating the outcomes of projects through symposia. SHARE has been instrumental in securing three interdisciplinary doctoral scholarships in music, dance and science, and presents collaborative events for PGRs and academic staff.

Through Athenaeum Fellow Gonzalez, the Conservatoire is part of the Wellcome-funded Glasgow Medical Humanities Research Network, an interdisciplinary group that brings together HEIs and civic collections around the city. Its broad themes cover Objects, Place and Time in a variety of



disciplines including medicine, literature, performance, and music. The network of 139 academics and artists supports a discussion group from which collaborations emerge, offers seed awards to ECRs, disseminates research through events and supports Conservatoire projects around mental health, wellbeing and performance.

In these partnerships, we cultivate an ethos of open sharing and mutual respect. In some so-called interdisciplinary work, the 'art' is used only to increase the impact of an insight developed in another discipline, rather than the methods and theories of each discipline challenging and expanding the other. We know that we can learn from other academic fields – but equally, they can learn from us. Our work through SHARE has paid dividends in this regard, as has our key strategic partnership with Scottish Ballet, which is described in more detail below. Such genuine interdisciplinary partnerships bring us back to the fundamental artistic impetus to make a difference in the world.

Open Research

REF5a sets out our strategic approach to an open research environment and the 'open access' attitude that we seek to cultivate among researchers. The emphasis we place on public engagement is another part of this ethos, and the 'open access attitude' was further evidenced in the move online of our Exchange Talks series and full performance programme during the global pandemic. More details of this are provided in our Covid Annexe.

Our CRIS (a specially-adapted instance of Elsevier's Pure) includes performances, scores for download, and films that either report on research undertaken or are a direct outcome of that research – all available beyond the campus, for free, by anyone (see, for example, De Simone's work *Geek*: the score, accompanying notes and a high quality recording are available).

Finally, we have participated in discussions and sectoral development of OA arrangements through groups like Conservatoires UK (CUK) Research Forum, and more widely through the OA Scotland Group and the Scottish REF Managers Group.

Research Integrity

REF5a sets out our strategic approach to research integrity. In practical terms, a culture of integrity is assured by our Ethics Committee and supported through training for programme teams, doctoral students and supervisors, and the provision of exemplar materials and mentoring to support good ethical practice. The Academic Board has determined that taught students engaging in research should also undergo an ethical training and approval process, further reinforcing that culture: staff from The Exchange often contribute to that training. The Ethics Committee is active: in AY 2019-20, it considered 62 applications (45 from students, 11 from staff and 6 external applications) and investigated 3 breaches of research integrity.

Our mechanisms for supporting staff research offer further opportunities to ensure strong integrity across our work. The Research and KE Committee (RKEC) ensures that no Athenaeum Awards are made for work that will require ethical approval without that being specifically noted in the process; where the researcher might require additional support to achieve approval (for example, in the case of an ECR, or for more complex cases), a mentor is appointed from the Committee. RKEC also reviews the progress of work that results from internal awards and requires regular progress reports from Principal Investigators (PIs) on all externally funded research and consultancy, providing researchers with additional support and/or mentoring whenever required and further assuring the integrity of our work.

The Conservatoire participates in the CUK Research Ethics Committee: three of our Ethics Committee members also serve on the trans-institutional Committee. One of our Ethics Committee members (Jaap) is President-elect of the Scottish Educational Research Association (SERA) and co-authored the Association's guide to good research practice *Starting Points for Educational Research in Scotland*. Like the CUK Research Ethics Committee, this is both a contribution to



good ethical practice beyond the institution, and a way of benchmarking our processes to ensure that they remain robust.



6 From Wild Life by ECR Sarah Hopfinger

Our Research Ethics Policy draws on the frameworks of the British Education Research Association and the British Psychological Society to ensure that we meet the normal expectations of ethical research, and the sectoral requirements of the Concordat to Support Research Integrity. Our Performance Ethics Policy goes 'beyond compliance' and draws on an independent international review of such policies that we commissioned in 2012. Through it, we ensure that performance work at the Conservatoire is undertaken within an ethical framework that takes accounts of the needs of all those involved in performance – performers and audiences, but also members of the creative and production teams, and venue staff. The Policy does not require that all performances are reviewed by the Ethics Committee, but the Committee is on hand to offer advice and make judgements in challenging cases.

2. People

REF5a describes our wider staffing strategy: the impact of that strategy may be seen in the increased size of this submission, compared to 2014. In the AP, systematic consideration of research profile in the appointments process has resulted in a greater number of senior and ECR researchers being recruited to posts across the institution. ECRs Robertson-Kirkland, Hopfinger, Whiteside, Robertson and Broom in this submission are witness to this approach, as are senior researchers Halfyard, Buckley, Fennessy and Watkin. The continuing development of researchers at all career stages is evidenced by the award of six professorships to researchers with SRR during the AP.

Staff development strategy

Our support for researchers proceeds from the principle of a 'single ecosystem' that supports both established and emerging researchers: this is central to both the vitality and sustainability of our environment.

It is important to note again the distinctive nature of the Exchange, which bears the main responsibility for staff research support. Researchers across the institution refer collegially to the Fellows and Research Lecturers in the Exchange for advice in matters such as project development and management, methodology, internal and external funding, and maximising impact. They also seek out disciplinary (and interdisciplinary) support across the fields represented in the team. The number of staff and range of expertise in the Exchange is sufficiently high to ensure that support can be meaningful and tailored to individual need, and its networks ensure that external specialist support can be easily sourced when needed.

Complementing this ad-hoc support is a structured offer, which includes:

- <u>Research and KE inductions</u> for all new academic staff whether currently research active or not from the Exchange team, setting out the support we offer, routes to professional development in research, and opportunities for interdisciplinary working that arise at the Conservatoire: our aim is to welcome people to research.
- <u>an annual staff development conference</u>, which is central to staff development more generally: compulsory for all full time and pro-rata staff, doctoral students are also invited to attend. The Exchange team leads specific sessions dedicated to research and KE.
- <u>staff Research Clinics</u>, led by Gonzalez, offered regularly on a walk-up basis. The Clinics have supported colleagues from ECRs to the professoriate, from hourly-paid teaching staff to full time colleagues with SRR. Clinics offer advice on all matters relating to research and impact, signpost staff to further support opportunities, and are a particularly important aspect of our support for colleagues without SRR. Topics raised range from assistance with book proposals and dissemination of research to the development of personal archives and setting up exhibitions. During the pandemic, the research clinics moved online and, perhaps because of the expectations established by the in-person clinic, there was no drop in uptake from staff.
- so-called <u>CAKE Sessions</u>, informal roundtable discussions with tea and cake, convened around particular issues in research or KE and led by a member of the Exchange. CAKE Sessions in the AP have included advice on achieving external funding; publishing; supervision of Practice Research; and ethics, as well as individual discussions on colleagues' research. CAKE Sessions respond to needs revealed by the Research Clinics and consider issues in all four quadrants of the Research Development Framework (RDF). These sessions inspire collaboration and dialogue, and signpost colleagues to further opportunities.



- a <u>Journal Club</u>, led by Doolittle, which convenes regularly to discuss a chosen text. The Club is open to all staff and doctoral students and is strongly interdisciplinary in feel. Members lead discussions on new and/or key texts in their fields for colleagues across the Conservatoire's disciplines.
- a range of activities to stimulate and facilitate exchange between the Conservatoire and wider society (described below).

The most significant aspect of structured support is our internal awards scheme for research and KE – the <u>Athenaeum Awards</u>. In addition to supporting colleagues with SRR, these awards are open to other staff, whether full time, part time or hourly paid, where this will demonstrably support their professional development and enhance the Conservatoire's research environment – a further example of how we seek to cultivate a 'single ecosystem' for research. Although they are competitive, we offer all applicants mentoring from a member of the Exchange as they make their application, which may include support in framing their proposal, public engagement and routes to impact, and budgeting. We see all applications – successful or not – as professional development opportunities for colleagues, and where applications are unsuccessful, colleagues are directed to the Clinic for further support.

There are three competitions in the scheme: the 'Athenaeum Small Project Awards', which offer project funding (or part-funding); 'Athenaeum Sabbatical Awards', which offer a 3-month mini-sabbatical to pursue more significant outcomes, and the 'Athenaeum Global Challenges Awards', which offer funds for projects that support Official Development Assistant (ODA) objectives. Each competition is available for research or KE and the turnaround between deadline and announcement is typically two weeks, meaning that these awards can respond quickly to need. As noted above, it is usually a condition of funding that successful applicants undertake some public engagement.

All competitions, including the Sabbatical Awards, are open to all academic staff, regardless of contractual status, and we do not require staff to have completed a fixed period of employment before applying. There is no limit to the number of applications a colleague may make. Many awards contribute part funding to projects that are also supported by industry, charities or government, and several have led to further externally funded projects

Teaching loads across the institution are such that it is not usually possible for other staff to absorb the teaching of a colleague who is on sabbatical so, in arranging teaching cover for staff on sabbatical leave, we aim to provide new teaching opportunities for ECRs where appropriate.

The Awards are central to our open, inspiring, egalitarian and truly vital research environment. In 2019, we published a retrospective of Athenaeum Awards entitled *Practising Research: The New Athenaeum*, which highlighted the range of activity that these awards have supported since their inception in 2010, with the aim of encouraging more staff to get involved in research. https://www.rcs.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/3682-RCS-The-New-Athenaeum-FINAL-PROOF.pdf

Athenaeum Awards (Research and KE)	2014-2020
Awards	102
Total value	£190,376

In time, our workload model will permit more strategic and targeted support for staff with SRR: working with their manager and colleagues from the Exchange, those with SRR will complete an <u>annual research plan</u> that reviews their research activity over the previous twelve months and sets goals for the coming year – for projects and outputs, and their continuing professional development as researchers. This will allow us to further systematise our support for SRR researchers –

particularly for those whose research careers are more developed – and achieve greater alignment between individual staff development and our wider strategic ambitions.

Doctoral students

The Conservatoire's doctoral cohort comprises MPhil, PhD and DPerf (Doctor of Performing Arts) students, and is integral to our current vitality and future sustainability. We keep our support for doctoral students under continuous review through the Research Degrees Committee (RDC), and use additional quality-checks, such as a recent international benchmarking exercise with the Orpheus Instituut, Ghent, the Kunst Universitaat, Graz and the Queensland Conservatorium, to ensure our programmes meet the highest expectations.

Recruitment to the doctoral programmes is of course rooted in supervisory capacity and expertise: the growth in doctoral completions in the AP is linked to a significant expansion of the doctoral community, which is itself built on a supervisory base that has grown in size and quality since 2014.

Recognising that in the performing arts there are many routes to a successful doctorate, we assess doctoral applicants in accordance with the Conservatoire's Contextualised Admissions Policy and take specific account of relevant professional experience alongside qualifications. We offer all applicants mentoring and advice before they make a formal application, and applications are reviewed by a panel remitted by RDC which considers the applicant's readiness for research, the quality of proposal, and 'fit' with institutional expertise, along with any other relevant information, to inform a decision to interview.

Interviews and, where relevant, auditions are carried out by a panel that will always include at least one researcher with expertise in the candidate's proposed field of study and at least one academic member of the Exchange team.

We take pride in our robust monitoring and support mechanisms for doctoral students. These are overseen by RDC, which has responsibility for all matters relating to research degrees and includes membership from the University of St Andrews. All students undergo annual monitoring, which includes formal reports from students and internal members of their supervisory teams, the submission of a current plan for completion, and an interview with a Progress Review panel. In addition, at the end of the first year FTE, students undertake a comprehensive review, comprising of the annual reports and plans (as above), plus a submission of work which is reviewed by two 'readers' (one of whom will normally be external to the institution), and a presentation or lecture-recital. Outcomes for each progress review are expressed by means of a traffic light system, with clear criteria and (where necessary) remedial expectations for each outcome.

As noted above, doctoral examinations at the Conservatoire always include two external examiners. Partly this reflects our small scale (and the challenge in identifying internal examiners that have not been involved with the project), but it also supports the interdisciplinary work that we prize, as well as ensuring that the final submission is scrutinised to the highest standards of rigour.

Completions during the AP include our first PhD in dance (ECR Whiteside); our first Doctor of Performing Arts completion; and the successful conclusion of an institutionally funded studentship to edit a critical edition of Prokofiev's *War and Peace*. This doctorate completed work begun by former Vice Principal McAllister (submitted to REF2014) and underpinned a new production of the opera by Welsh National Opera in their 2018 season (also performed at the Royal Opera House Covent Garden in 2019).

External examiner comments indicate that doctoral work at the Conservatoire is reaching sectoral expectations for work at this level: 'An outstanding amount of primary source research that has never been undertaken before... remarkable in its comprehensiveness' (EE report 2017); 'An outstanding, original, rigorous and meticulously crafted thesis that makes a significant contribution to several fields.' (EE report 2021). In the next few years, we will see further completions in dance and our first in production.

Completions in AP	15		
Without corrections	2	13%	
Minor corrections	9	60%	
Major corrections	4	27%	
On time	9	60%	
Within an approved extension	5	33%	
Outwith an approved extension	1	7%	

Skills development for doctoral students

We aim to treat doctoral students as academic colleagues and believe that a strong sense of community assists students academically, professionally and personally. In this secure environment, ideas can be tested and challenged without fear; networks for professional life within and beyond academia are strengthened; and the wellbeing of students is supported. We have worked hard to sustain a close-knit cohort as the number of students has grown. Before the pandemic, the students' physical space in the Conservatoire was an important enabler of this community, with many students choosing to work in it, and the space being shared by senior researchers. During the pandemic, we have made concrete efforts to sustain that community remotely, through training events, online 'writing retreats', study days, fortnightly catch-ups with the Exchange team, and social events. These online events have typically achieved attendances of around 80%.

We are members of the Universities Scotland Researcher Development and Training Committee, and students benefit from a range of research skills training that belies our size as an institution. Following an induction, students receive sessions on navigating the academic landscape, methodology, ethics, supervisor management, and the philosophy of Practice Research. They are then folded into a whole-cohort approach, which sees all students come together three times each year for compulsory study days that cut across their research skills needs and offer opportunities for peer-learning. Supplementing this, further opportunities for individually tailored research skills training are available within the Conservatoire, through the substantial offerings of SGSAH (which are available to DTP and non-DTP students alike), and through the Centre for Educational Enhancement and Development (CEED) at the University of St Andrews. In addition, students are expected to attend our public Exchange Talks series each week.

Students make a research skills plan with their supervisors, and the agendas for study days are responsive to need, being shaped by a formal feedback process and planned with reference to the RDF, which guides the balance of activities and ensures that sufficient weight is given to the personal skills and capacities that underpin an effective research career.

We recognise that our doctoral students are the future of research and contribute hugely to the vigour of our intellectual environment. We support their integration by helping them find appropriate teaching within the institution, celebrating their research (through, for example, institutional social media), ensuring that they are well represented on the roster of Exchange Talks, facilitating events like 'Research on Display' (an exhibition of doctoral research curated by students in 2018-19), and supporting other initiatives, which, in the AP, include:

• The student-led *Scottish Journal of Performance*, which has published eight issues in the AP. The special issue on 'The Art of Care' (Vol. 5 No. 1) (included in this submission) offers



an example of practical support we offer: the issue was co-edited by two PGRs (Bozdog and Watson) working with two senior researchers (Bissell and Gonzalez);

 Conferences such as 'Shared Narratives' (a conference for performing arts researchers of colour, 2020, co-led by PGR Arockiam) and 'Spheres of Singing' (conference on singing research, 2020, co-led by ECR Robertson-Kirkland and PGR Slimings, supported by SGSAH and leading to a RSE grant for Robertson-Kirkland).

Studentship support for doctoral students

Growing the number of doctoral students was a strategic priority at the time of REF2014 and, as noted in REF5a, the headcount of students has more than doubled since then. A dramatically changed landscape for studentships has supported this growth.

2017-18	2018-19	2019-20	2020-21
6.5	6.5	6	8.5
1	1	0.5	0.5
0	0	1	1
0	0	2	3
0	0	1	2
7.5	7.5	10.5	15
	6.5 1 0 0 0	6.5 6.5 1 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	6.56.56110.5001002001

Our membership of SGSAH has been transformative. We joined in 2014 as a non-DTP member, which opened up new possibilities for collaborative doctoral student training and led, in 2018, to our becoming a full member of the AHRC-funded DTP, based on a review of the quality of our research and supervisory capacities. This represented a significant commitment in time and co-funding to the continued development of the doctoral programmes on the part of the Conservatoire but our time as a non-DTP member had demonstrated the value added by SGSAH and gave us confidence to make the case for DTP membership. Alongside this, we successfully negotiated membership of the Carnegie Trust for the Universities of Scotland, opening a further route to externally funded studentships.

Our strategy in both competitions has been to identify a small number of high-quality applicants and give them comprehensive support in their nominations. This approach has paid dividends: in the first two years of our participation in the SGSAH DTP and Carnegie competitions, we submitted six nominations and received five studentships.

In addition to externally funded studentships, the Conservatoire has: co-funded two interdisciplinary studentships through a competition led by our validating partner, the University of St Andrews (so-called St Leonard's Studentships); supported three strategic studentships in areas important to the institution; and increased the amount of institutional studentship allocated to research degrees from c.£43k in 2014 to c.£86k in 2020.



Equality and Diversity

In the context of research and research students, we seek to ensure that all arrangements for researcher and PGR recruitment robustly support our wider objectives for equality.

Specifically, we work hard to build a diverse and balanced PGR student cohort of individuals with diverse life-experiences. The interview is designed around the specific needs of the candidate, such as relevant access requirements (with more time given, for example, to interviews in which a BSL interpreter is required), and we have assessed the cumulative equalities impact of our decisions. This assessment demonstrates that the gender and age profiles of students, for example, is similar at shortlisting, interview and offer stages, indicating that that process works equitably to facilitate applications from each group. Numbers of applications remain relatively small, however, so further analysis of this kind (for example with respect to race or other protected characteristics) is not yet meaningful. We have, however, identified the clear lack of representation of black and global majority researchers in our PGR cohort as a particular issue, as it is in our wider community. Our support of the 'Shared Narratives' conference is a small contribution to addressing this; two of the three strategic institutional studentships mentioned above concern issues of fair access to conservatoire education.



7 PGR Catherine King performs integrated BSL interpretation in a production of Henry V



3. Income, infrastructure and facilities

Organisational infrastructure

REF5a introduces our strategic approach to income, infrastructure and facilities, recognising our particular context.

As will be clear from previous sections, the Exchange unit is a major feature of our infrastructure for research, performing a wide range of strategic and operational functions to support excellent and developing research, achieve impact, and grow interdisciplinary work. Institutional investment over the AP has seen the unit grow in scope, capacity, creativity and effectiveness. In addition to the new academic expertise, the team has been supplemented in the AP by a KE Manager who leads on all aspects of KE and innovation, and further supports staff impact activities. Strengthened links with the Conservatoire's well-networked Communications team have also enhanced impact and public engagement activities and, recognising the diversity in our Conservatoire community and our obligation to welcome the widest possible audiences to research, we have invested strongly in BSL interpretation and closed captioning services, which are normally provided as standard for all public research events: around 29 events organised by the Exchange in the current AY have been BSL interpreted and closed captioned.

New resources include our CRIS, which has professionalised a range of functions from output management to grant tracking, as well as developing our 'shop window' for research and professional practice.

Operational infrastructure and facilities

8 Production of Bacchae in the New Athenaeum Theatre

The excellent resources of the Conservatoire, as a specialist performing arts institution, are a vital part of our infrastructure for research. These include five public venues: the Stevenson Hall (capacity 355, live streaming capability, full lighting rig, sound system, organ); New Athenaeum Theatre (capacity 344, stage size of the London Palladium, full lighting, sound and stage automation rigs); Ledger Recital Room (capacity 108, livestreaming capability, minstrels gallery); Alexander Gibson Opera Studio (capacity 147, black box, lighting rig, sound system); Chandler Studio Theatre (capacity 125, black box, lighting rig, sound system). Researchers regularly use



these venues, and our high-specification electroacoustic and recording studios, rehearsal spaces and practice facilities, all of which have seen significant investment in the AP (see REF5a).



9 Student-led production in Alexander Gibson Opera Studio

The scholarly infrastructure at the Royal Conservatoire naturally reflects our focus on practicebased work. The Whittaker Library is performance-oriented with strong printed music and eresource collections and takes a pro-active approach to engaging staff and students with new research materials and external research events through its multiple social media channels and high engagement levels. In the AP, the library has increased the range and depth of e-resources available to over 60 databases, alongside thousands of e-book and e-journal collections available online via a new Discovery Service. Research students and supervisors also have direct access to the very significant online research resources of St Andrews University Library.

In 2014, we reported significant investment in Archives and Collections, including the appointment of a full-time archivist. Continued investment has seen the relocation of the collections and search room to a custom facility in a decommissioned whisky bond warehouse. Co-located with the Glasgow School of Art Archive and creative endeavours like Glasgow Sculpture Studios, our historic collections are well sited to take advantage of collaborative projects, and this has led to site-specific performances using archival engagement. The archive continues to attract high-profile donations, including most recently the personal archives of the conductors Raymond Leppard and James Loughran, jazz singer and actress Annie Ross, Baroque trumpet authority Edward Tarr, and an important collection from the inventor of Braille musical notation, Edward Watson. These add richness and depth to the many other historic archives and collections which support our research community and historically informed performances. According to data shared across CUK members, our archive is regularly the busiest of any UK conservatoire.



10 RCS Symphony Orchestra perform in the Stevenson Hall

Research funding

External research income has grown considerably over the AP, representing a significant boost to the sustainability of our work, but even in our context as a monotechnic institution with fewer sources of external funding, it remains modest and is a high priority for future growth. Our approach, in practice, has been to seek a balance in the time we invest in bids for small and easier-to-reach grants for specific projects that will quickly bear fruit in tangible outputs and larger, more strategic but also more speculative bids for significant funds that will boost our long-term sustainability. In pursuing larger bids, we have sought institutional partnerships (such as with Glasgow University for an AHRC Creative Industries Cluster bid) and used our excellent networks to increase the credibility of our proposals. We have not yet secured a game-changing large investment but believe that developments during the current AP provide the foundations for that to happen in the next. Consultancy has contributed financially and will continue to do so.

Funding received by our researchers to pursue artistic research and professional projects from sources that are not reported to HESA has been significant in the AP. While this does not contribute to the sustainability of research at the Conservatoire, it does give an indication of the esteem in which their work is held.

	Total
UK Government and Arts Funding Agencies	£91,075
UK Charities, Trusts and Foundations	£142,912
International Government and Arts Funding Agencies	£119,806
International Charities, Trusts and Foundations	£60,643
Private donors	£9,800
Total	£424,236

4. Collaboration and contribution to the research base, economy and society

Networks and partnerships

As noted earlier, the significance of partnerships and networks cannot be overstated for a small specialist institution, and we support them at the highest level. Our Principal is a Council Member of the European Association of Conservatoires (AEC); our Deputy Principal (Lois Fitch, researcher in this submission) is Council Member in the Royal Musical Association; our KE Manager is a Board Member of the European League of Institute of the Arts (ELIA); and our Director of Research (Broad, this submission) is chair of the European Platform for Artistic Research in Music, and a member of the ELIA Working Group on Artistic Research. We are resolutely focussed on playing an active part in the networks to which we belong.

We benefit considerably from strong networks across Scotland: SGSAH has already been mentioned, as has our relationship with the University of St Andrews; we are also founding members of the Scottish Arts and Humanities Alliance (SAHA) and the Scottish Research Integrity Network. The scale and ethos of the Scottish sector means that we benefit from being equal partners in Universities Scotland (US), helping to shape research policy in a way that is sensitive to the contingencies of the performing arts and small institutions, and participating in wider sectoral initiatives (such as Broad's chairing of a US steering group on the commercial promotion of specialist research facilities, through Interface).

Beyond Scotland, networks such as CUK Research Forum are significant, not only as a locus for sharing good practice, but also to meet specific practical needs (for example, supporting cooperation on good ethical practice through the CUK Ethics Committee).

Our systemic use of networks extends to efforts to shape discourse internationally, for example through Broad's membership of the drafting group for the Vienna Declaration on Artistic Research, which seeks to extend the definitions of research given in the OECD's Frascati Manual to embrace, unambiguously, Artistic Research. This work will be especially significant in countries that ally their policies for research closely to the Manual; following the launch of the declaration, Broad is now a member of the 6-person working group developing definitions for the next edition of the Manual.

Contribution to the disciplines

We aim to make a strong contribution to the vitality and sustainability of our wider disciplines, and the cause of research in specialist performing arts institutions. In the first three years of the AP, we welcomed more than two thousand delegates to the Conservatoire, hosting the ELIA Biennial with Glasgow School of Art, 2014 (c.300 delegates from across Europe); the Congress of the AEC,



2015 (c.275 delegates from across Europe); and the Congress of the International Society for Music Education (ISME), 2016 (c.1800 delegates from around the world).

These three large events are indicative of our approach, which is to prioritise work that will contribute to our disciplines, enliven and refresh our own research environment, and allow us to influence disciplinary and institutional discourse beyond our walls. This approach is evidenced in events and initiatives such as NEXUS #1 IN/ACTION, an online symposium that was the inaugural meeting of the Contemporary Performance in Higher Education Network (2020, hosted RCS. Bissell, chair, 133 delegates from 7 countries); Pedagogies, Practices & the Future of Folk Music in Higher Education (2018, two conferences hosted RCS and Sibelius Academy, Helsinki. Dickson, founder and chair, 83 delegates from 11 countries), which has led to plans for a new AEC Platform for Tradition, Folk and World Music; and the interdisciplinary Art-making in the Anthropocene seminar series (co-funded by RSE and RCS, hosted RCS. Doolittle, Hopfinger and MacRae, cochairs, 202 participants from 14 countries), which was presented at the New European Bauhaus Conference in April 2021. We pay particular attention to supporting emergent ECR networks, such as Spheres of Singing and Shared Narratives noted above, and the Conservatoires UK Research Student Conference (2017, hosted RCS. Whiteside, chair, 40 PGR delegates from UK and Ireland). We also contribute to well-established events, such as the *Music in Nineteenth-Century* Britain conference (2015, RCS hosted. Broad, co-chair, 83 delegates from 10 countries).

Numerous collaborations and partnerships involving individual researchers, such as ECR Whiteside's work with Georgetown and Florida universities and Scottish Ballet on Dance for MS, are managed and supported by the Exchange team.

Contributions to wider society

Our researchers are well networked in the wider culture sector as the examples in *Practising Research: The New Athenaeum* demonstrate. Traditional patterns of employment in the Conservatoire, in which part time contracts are typical, both reflect and facilitate a close relationship with industry. The number of part time PGR students we support also mirrors this: many such students also have significant careers as professional freelance artists. We make full use of the levers available to support flexible working for staff and PGRs alike, including (for example) offering students Leave of Absence for periods of full-time professional work, and this supports a creative culture where the boundary between professional life within and outwith the Conservatoire is porous. Individual colleagues' external networks are amplified by sectoral organisations – an example being The Work Room, a Glasgow-based network that includes ECR Hopfinger, Gonzalez and PGRs Henry and Watson among a wider network of around 150 practitioners and small companies.

The Exchange team further stimulates and facilitates effective knowledge exchange with business, industry and charities by identifying potentially valuable opportunities for individual staff members (for example, through agencies such as Interface and mechanisms such as SFC's Innovation Vouchers); supporting researcher-led exchange through Athenaeum KE awards and tailored support for innovation; and ensuring effective partnerships (including IPR management) through contracts and memoranda of agreement. Since the organisations with which we have the closest links are often not-for-profit, or have tight margins, we often contribute to strategic partnerships by providing in-kind support in the form of additional staff time.



11 Visual minutes of the 2019 SHIFT summer school

Innovation support is closely integrated with research support and operates through a number of strands:

- Athenaeum Awards (including sabbatical awards) for KE;
- staff innovation support;
- our entrepreneurial education programme.

Support is tailored to need and includes advice and mentoring on business start-up and development, and issues such as IPR management. The KE Manager oversees this support and assists staff in pursuing external opportunities, such as the Converge Challenge competition for entrepreneurs or the RSE's Enterprise Fellowship. We worked with Converge to create a new strand of the competition that would support innovation in the creative industries, and colleagues have been shortlisted 5 times in this Scotland-wide competition. One of the academics shortlisted for a Converge award went on to win an RSE Fellowship and is now CEO of a new company Stageport, which offers innovative digital solutions to the theatre industry.

Recognising that the sectoral mechanisms for innovation support are not always sensitive to the requirements of the creative industries we have invested innovation funds in new partnerships with commercial potential. Our 'Make It Work' programme was designed to support creative industries applications for Innovation Vouchers, with partnership matching, development time and contributions to project costs. Outcomes so far include a trailer-length animation for part of Doolittle's opera *Jan Tait and the Bear*, designed to support the animator and composer to achieve substantial industry funding for a full-length animated film.

The Exchange also runs four interlinked strands of entrepreneurial education for students (including PGRs) and graduates: 'Make It Happen' (a programme of enterprise events throughout the year); the 'Make It Happen Fund' (ten awards of £1k for recent graduates, with mentoring and further support); 'The Road Ahead' (professional skills week run in conjunction with the Student Union) and SHIFT, an innovative entrepreneurial summer school developed in collaboration with the Glasgow School of Art and Queen Margaret University.

Unit-level environment template (REF5b)



Many of our contributions to wider society are based on long-term relationships. An example is our work with Creative Scotland, to shape policy around youth arts - the body of work that underpins one of the ICSs in this submission. Among the strongest examples of this approach, though, is ECR Whiteside's research partnership with Scottish Ballet, which has had a strong impact on the company's developing practice. Whiteside was initially involved in evaluating the company's Dancers' Education Group, an innovative scheme that seeks to enhance and extend the professional lives of dancers through a sustained programme of professional development in education. The success of this partnership led on to successive and ever-closer working with the company in its work in Dance Health – specifically its Dance for Parkinson's Scotland, Time To Dance (dance for dementia) and Elevate© (dance for multiple sclerosis) programmes. Whiteside's distinctive qualitative approach, which among other methods involves her building significant relationships with participants through the act of dancing with them, has generated a wide range of insights including how (for example) a movement with aesthetic intent can help a person with Parkinson's achieve control of their body that would otherwise prove challenging. The initial contact was made through the Exchange team while Whiteside was a PGR student, and the Exchange has continued to support her in contractual matters, IPR etc., as the relationship has grown from an essentially transactional one to a genuine partnership producing academic outputs alongside professional insights and substantial funding (£0.5m) for the company.



12 ECR Bethany Whiteside dances with a participant in one of Scottish Ballet's dance health programmes

We seek to be changed by our relationships with business and industry. An example of this is our partnership with d/Deaf theatre company Solar Bear, which was kicked off in 2012 with an SFC Innovation Voucher exploring the training of d/Deaf actors. From that initial work has grown an undergraduate programme – our BA Performance in British Sign Language and English - which is innovative internationally and will soon produce its second cohort of conservatoire-trained d/Deaf actors. A strategic doctoral studentship is tracing the experience of students on the programme, and staff and students alike have contributed to significant cultural change at the Conservatoire. We expect, in future, that this will develop into new strands of research.



Selected indicators of wider recognition

Journal Editorship

- Theatre, Dance and Performance Training (Bissell, Associate Editor (-2018))
- *Music Performance Research* (Broad, Editor)
- Scottish Music Review (Broad, Ed Board)
- Journal of the Alamire Foundation (Fitch, F., Ed. Advisory Board)
- Scottish Journal of Performance (PGR Harvie, Editor) (Broad and Whiteside, Editorial Board)

Participation on grants committees

- KEAR Composer Residency, Bowling Green State 2014 (MacDonald)
- The Work Room Residencies 2018 (Gonzalez)
- Ivor Guest Grant, Society for Dance Research (Whiteside)
- COALESCE Research Fund (Irish Educational Research Council) (Jaap)

Fellowships

- 2014 Winston Churchill Travelling Fellowship (Thorpe)
- 2016 Civitella Ranieri Fellowship (Buckley)
- 2020 Fellowship of the Royal Society for the Encouragement of Arts, Manufactures and Commerce (Jaap)

Prizes

- 2014 Christopher Monk Award of the Historic Brass Society (Myers)
- 2014 Frances Densmore Prize of the American Musical Instrument Society (Myers)
- 2014 IAMLS Personal Achievement Award (McAulay)
- 2016 Fulbright Scholarship (Buckley)
- 2016 Whedon Studies Association: Short Mr Pointy for the best essay in Whedon Studies (Chapter in *Sounds of Fear and Wonder*, output in this submission)
- 2018 The Anthony Baines Memorial Prize of the Galpin Society (Myers)
- 2018 British Composer Award for Amateur or Young Performers (Searle, *Microscopic Dances*)
- 2019 Nation's Lifesavers award: Universities UK's MadeAtUni campaign (Thorpe)
- 2020 PRS Women Make Music Award (Buckley)
- 2020 Gold award at the New York Festivals Radio Awards (Buckley)
- 2020 Scottish Awards for New Music (MacRae, *Anthropocene*, Large-scale work)

Membership of Research Council or similar national and international committees

- European Platform for Artistic Research in Music (Broad, Chair)
- ELIA Working Group on Artistic Research (Broad)



- SGSAH Executive (Broad)
- AEC Working Group for Diversity, Identity and Inclusiveness 2018-21 (Dickson)
- Natural Environment Research Council (Doolittle)
- Canadian New Music Network (Doolittle, Board Member)
- Scottish Music Centre (Doolittle, Board Member)
- SGSAH Disciplinary+ Catalyst co-lead for Creative Arts and Design (Doolittle, Gonzalez, Whiteside)
- Sistema Scotland (Fitch, L., Board Member)
- Scottish Government Cross-Party Group for Music, Music Education and Music Business (Fitch, L.)
- Arts and Humanities Research Council Peer Review College (Gonzalez)
- Scottish Educational Research Association (Jaap, President Elect)
- Association Repertoire International d'Iconographie Musicale (Myers, Vice-President 2011-2019)
- New Music Scotland (Searle, Chair 2015-19)
- Justice and Arts Scotland (Thorpe)
- Society for Dance Research (Whiteside, Executive Committee Member)

Invited keynotes, lectures and/or performances, or conference chair roles

- World Music Conference (WOMEX) 2018 (Dickson, keynote)
- Pedagogies, Practices and the Future of Folk Music in Higher Education II, Helsinki (Dickson, keynote)
- Symposium, Universtät Wien, Neue Forschungen zur Isaac und Senfl: Musik und Wissenschaft zur Maximilian-Jahr 2019 (Fitch, F.)
- Third KISD Masterclass: Writing and Performance for Integrated Design Postgraduates, Köln International School of Design, 2019 (Gonzalez)
- 'How Art Seduces', Köln International School of Design, 2016 (Invited lecture, Gonzalez).
- Faure Tag, Hochschule fur Musik und Theater Leipzig/Peters Edition 2018 (Howat)
- Conference de Prestige, Universite de Montreal 2018 (Howat). Four guest public lectures.
- Lithuanian Academy of Music and Theatre, Vilnius 2018 (MacDonald)
- Escola Superior de Música Catalunya (ESMUC), Barcelona 2019 and 2020 (MacDonald)
- Icelandic Academy of the Arts 2016 (MacDonald)
- 4th International Conference on Romantic Brass: Presentation, Preservation, Interpretation, Basel and Bern, 2017 (Myers, invited keynote)
- Joint conference of the Galpin Society and the American Musical Instrument Society, 2017 (Myers, chair)
- British Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies Annual Conferences, 2020, 2019, 2018 (Robertson-Kirkland, chair)



- *"Dangers in the Music Room"* April 2020, University of Southern California (Robertson-Kirkland, invited lecture).
- Eighteenth-century Arts Education Research Network, Historical Performance Institute, May 2019, Indiana University (Robertson-Kirkland, Keynote)

Peer review

- 18th Century Studies (Robertson-Kirkland)
- Animal Behaviour (Doolittle)
- Arts and Humanities in Higher Education (Gonzalez)
- Communication and Critical/Cultural Studies (Gonzalez)
- Human Relations (Gilmore)
- Journal of Emerging Dance Scholarship (Whiteside)
- Journal of the American Musicological Society (Broad, Halfyard)
- Journal of Artistic Research (Searle, Gonzalez)
- Journal of the Royal Musical Association (Fitch, L.)
- Management Learning (Gilmore)
- *Music Analysis* (Fitch, L.)
- Music Education Research (Jaap)
- Music Performance Research (Fitch, L.)
- Music Sound and the Moving image (Halfyard)
- Nordic Journal for Dance (Whiteside)
- Parsejournal.com (Broad)
- Royal Music Association Research Chronicle (Robertson-Kirkland)
- Sage OPEN (Jaap)
- Slayage: The International Journal of Buffy+ (Halfyard)
- Scottish Journal of Performance (Silberschatz, Gonzalez)
- Street Art and Urban Creativity (Gilmore)
- Subjectivity (Gonzalez)
- Theatre, Dance and Performance Training (Silberschatz)