

Section A		
Institution: The University of Manchester		
Unit of Assessment: 19 (Politics and International Studies)		
Title of case study: Getting Gender on the Devolution Agenda in Greater Manchester		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2010 – 2020		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name:	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
Francesca Gains	Professor of Public Policy	1999 – present
Clare Annesley	Professor of Politics	2000 – 2015
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2015 – 2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? No		
Section B		
1. Summary of the impact		
<p>Professor Francesca Gains' research into gender and policymaking has informed governance arrangements and influenced public policy in Greater Manchester (GM) since the devolution deal was signed by 11 white men in November 2014. It has:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Set the policy agenda on the under-representation of women in GM's policymaking processes and city-region cabinet. 2. Informed and influenced arrangements to amplify women's voices in policymaking in GM through engagement with policymakers and campaigners. 3. Shaped the Equalities Strategy in GM pre- and post-COVID and the terms of reference for a new Women and Girls' Equality Panel in GM by bringing together an evidence base. 		
2. Underpinning research		
<p>These impacts are underpinned by research conducted at the University of Manchester (UoM) since 2010, led by Professor Francesca Gains. Key research findings demonstrate the need to stimulate policy debate and campaign on the under-representation of women in the GM devolution arrangements.</p> <p>Award-winning research conducted by Gains between 2010 to 2013 with Claire Annesley (UoM until 2014) and Isabelle Engeli (Ottawa) examines what happened when gender equality measures reached Government policy agendas in five European countries. It demonstrates that policy measures to improve gender equality are difficult to get on government agendas [1]. This research (drawing on the Comparative Agendas Project (www.comparativeagendas.net) international data set) shows that the key determinants which led to gender equality measures getting space on the agenda are women's representation in legislatures and their presence in executive roles (in Government).</p> <p>As well as the need to have diversity in political leadership, earlier research into policymaking on gender equality in the UK core executive (with Annesley) also finds that the ability of female politicians to bring forward government measures improves once they have developed internal networks and equalities processes [2]. The improved representation of women in the New Labour governments led to greater attention to gender equality. Furthermore, the ability of female politicians in the executive to bring forward government measures improved once they develop an equalities cabinet committee and are supported by a policy machinery to gather evidence on equalities to inform policymaking.</p> <p>Later research conducted by Gains with Vivien Lowndes (University of Birmingham) provides further support that for the finding that having women in decision-making</p>		

positions is key to securing policy action [3, 4]. In a research project that formed part of the European Research Council (ERC)-funded project 'Understanding Institutional Change: A Gender Perspective, 2012-2017' (i) led by Professor Georgina Waylen at UoM, Gains and Lowndes examined how Police and Crime Commissioners (PCCs) prioritised (or not) the problem of violence against women and girls (VAWG). PCCs, like metro mayors, are directly elected and operate at the sub-national level with delegated powers and budgets, similar to the governance arrangements that were then developing under metro mayors. Indeed, in GM the Mayor took over the powers of the PCC on taking office in 2017.

The research finds that female PCCs were twice as likely as their male counterparts to ensure VAWG was prioritised in PCC police and crime plans (which set local priorities). The **importance of an equalities policymaking, evidence gathering, and reporting process** is also seen in this research. Those PCCs – men and women – who took equalities duties seriously were nearly two and half times more likely to prioritise the problem of VAWG [3, 4, 5].

3. References to the research

- [1] **Annesley, C.**, Engeli, I, and **Gains, F.** (2015). 'The Profile of Gender Equality Issue Attention in Western Europe', *European Journal of Political Research*, 54(3), 525-542. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-6765.12095>
- [2] **Annesley, C.** and **Gains, F.** (2010). 'The Core Executive Gender, Power and Policy Change', *Political Studies*, 58(5), 909-929. <https://doi.org/10.1111%2Fj.1467-9248.2010.00824.x>
- [3] **Gains, F.** and Lowndes, V. (2014). 'How is Institutional Formation Gendered, and Does it Make a Difference? A New Conceptual Framework and a Case Study of Police and Crime Commissioners in England and Wales', *Politics and Gender*, 10(4), 524-548. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S1743923X14000403>
- [4] **Gains, F.** and Lowndes, V. (2017). 'Gender, Actors and Institutions at the Local Level: Explaining Variation in Policies to Address Violence against Women and Girls', *Governance*, 31(4), 683-699. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gove.12329>
- [5] **Gains, F.** and Lowndes, V. (2021) 'Identifying the Institutional Micro-Foundations of Gender Policy Change: A Case Study of Policing Governance in England', *Politics and Gender* <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1743923X20000586> (first published online 31 July 2020 at <https://bit.ly/3dN3ROi>)

Related grant awards:

- (i) Georgina Waylen (PI), Francesca Gains (Co-I), 'Understanding Institutional Change: A Gender Perspective', 2012 – 2017, European Research Council, EUR2,166,090, ERC-2011-ADG_20110406

Evidence of research quality: All research outputs cited above are published in peer-reviewed journals. Output [1] was awarded the Best Comparative Policy Paper by the American Political Science Organisation (APSA) in 2012.

4. Details of the impact

GM has a population of 2,700,000 – similar to that of Wales – and is a leading exemplar of devolution for the rest of England's combined authorities. From the announcement of the GM Devolution Deal in November 2014 and throughout the Mayor's first term of office (election postponed to 2021 due to Covid-19), Gains strongly pushed for having women's voices in policymaking in GM both in political leadership roles and in the policymaking

process, and sought to embed research findings into the evidence base of equalities processes. This had three key impacts:

1. Set the policy agenda on the under-representation of women in GM's policymaking processes and city-region cabinet

Between November 2014 and April 2017, drawing on the key research findings, Gains set the policy debate on the under-representation of women in GM devolution. This resulted in **greater female representation**, including the appointment of **a female deputy and a gender-balanced cabinet**.

Gains argued in numerous contributions to public debate and in legislative consultations for three necessary developments in GM devolution arrangements:

- a) improvements in policymaking processes to ensure **under-represented groups have a voice in policy development**;
- b) the executive functions of the mayoral and combined authority cabinet should better reflect diversity, including the appointment of a **female deputy** and **expanded gender-balanced cabinet portfolio** roles; and
- c) equalities **evidence to be included in policy development** and evaluation.

Gains presented these arguments in public panel discussions with the Interim GM Mayor Tony Lloyd (2015) and Andy Burnham MP (then Mayoral candidate) (2016) [A]. Deputy Mayor, Bev Hughes, testifies that Gains' research has "*influenced and informed arrangements to get women's voices into policy making*" [B]. Amy Foots, Head of Implementation at Greater Manchester Combined Authority (GMCA) notes that "*Gains research has been instrumental in progressing the gender equality debate in Greater Manchester*" [C].

Gains also influenced the 'DivaManc' campaign to develop the mayor's manifesto commitment to a gender-balanced cabinet in 2016. According to DivaManc's co-founder and councillor Eve Holt, Gains research "*enabled us to build a strong case for change and put forward clear, meaningful and achievable asks of GM leaders. Her work and thinking has added academic rigor and clarity which has been able to cut through and deliver tangible progress*" such as "*the **appointment of a female Deputy***" [D].

Gains' research also influenced wider campaigns to ensure a gender-balanced cabinet in GM in collaboration with the Fawcett Society and Local Government Information Unit (LGIU) for their Local Government Commission – a year-long study which asked 'Does Local Government Work for Women?'. Sam Smethers, CEO of the Fawcett Society, states that Gains' research and contributions "*aided us in formulating the specific recommendations in our final report about increasing the number of women around the table when decisions are made, which were aimed at the combined authorities and Mayors*" [E]. Smethers also attests to the influence of Gains' research into **Police and Crime Commissioner (PCC)** arrangements [3] when making the case for the positive impact that women in positions of power in local government can have, such as on the prioritisation of tackling domestic violence. These findings were cited in the media in the lead up to the 2017 mayoral elections, evidencing the influence of Gains' research on the importance of equalities briefs in combined authorities [F].

2. Informed and influenced arrangements to amplify women's voices in policymaking in GM through engagement with policymakers and campaigners

Following the election of the new mayor, Andy Burnham, Gains continued engagement with policymakers and campaigners informed and influenced arrangements to amplify women's voices in policymaking in GM. This in turn helped shape the development of a

scorecard for equal participation and influenced campaigns for gender equality in Greater Manchester.

After meeting Helen Pankhurst, founder member of the Greater Manchester for Women 2028 group, in April 2018, Gains joined the steering committee for a campaign led by Pankhurst (GM4Women2028) to address continuing gender inequality in GM. Pankhurst writes that Gains helped to develop “a scorecard to track a range of equality indicators” [G] and “influenced the choice of the scorecard for participation in suggesting a gender balanced mayoral cabinet as a key equality measure in Greater Manchester’s devolution arrangements...[This] provide[d] a focus on a critical representation indicator **which her research shows will ‘unlock’ other policy outcomes through better and more diverse representation inside the combined authority**” [G]. Pankhurst states that Gains brought “together campaigners, policymakers and researchers to share knowledge of how to get all women’s voices into policymaking... [which] will **build capacity, knowledge and vital networks to support the policymaking process around equality in Greater Manchester**” [G].

Gains produced an **influential research-informed guide**, ‘Mind the Gap: Getting Women’s Voices into Policy Making’ [H]. As Amy Foots, Head of Implementation at Greater Manchester Combined Authority (GMCA) states, “The publication provides an important contribution to the debate on gender equality and is helping to drive our work forward on this agenda in GM” [C]. According to the Deputy Mayor, Bev Hughes, this publication established “a strong foundation upon which our priorities for turbo-charging women and girls’ equality can flourish” [B]. Pankhurst further notes that it “influenced the approach taken by the [GM4Women2028] campaign to working with the newly established Greater Manchester Women and Girls’ Equality Panel” [G].

3. Shaped the Equalities Strategy in GM and the terms of reference for a new Women and Girls’ Equality Panel in GM by bringing together an evidence base

Gains’ research finds that networks of campaigners and policymakers are needed to bring together the evidence base needed to drive changes in the policy infrastructure and equalities policymaking [3, 4, 5]. As the mayor and combined authority governance arrangements commenced in June 2017, interventions by Gains, including the publication of *On Gender*, brought **together an evidence base** on gender to support an equalities strategy and more **permanent governance arrangements** that support equality considerations in policymaking. Bev Hughes, Deputy Mayor, notes that Gains “research on gender equality has been instrumental in highlighting the need for a more permanent piece of infrastructure to accelerate gender equality in Greater Manchester” [B]. This led to **the establishment of a Women and Girls’ Equality Panel in the GMCA and the shaping of its terms of reference**. This panel **ensures that gender equality is actively considered in all GMCA decisions** and the wider Greater Manchester system. (Gains was also selected to be on this panel). Amy Foots, Head of Implementation, GMCA, further notes that “[t]he terms of reference developed for the Panel were also influenced by [her] research”, in addition to her research being key to the establishment of the panel [C].

Following the appointment of Bev Hughes as Deputy Mayor with responsibility for Policing and Crime in GM, Gains was invited to meet Hughes to discuss the underpinning research. In 2019, Gains was asked to join a new internal Greater Manchester Combined Authority **Women’s Voices Task and Finish Group**, that “helped to shape and inform the establishment of a permanent Women and Girls’ Equality Panel and work programme” [D]. For this Task Group, Gains brought together evidence based on her research with Vivien Lowndes [3, 4] and that of other relevant gender researchers at UoM to make the case that equalities policymaking was necessary across all policy areas. Of the resulting publication, ‘On Gender’ [I], Hughes testifies: “This research was an important contribution

to the evidence base on gender equality in Greater Manchester and highlighted the importance of understanding how gender inequalities affect our region. It also informed the Group's work programme, helping to target action and monitor progress" [B].

Gains' policy brief, 'Building Back a Gendered Better' [J], highlights the gendered impacts of the pandemic and delineates measures to ameliorate these. This has influenced GMCA's response to the pandemic. According to Fooks, Head of Implementation in GMCA, it "has influenced the **post-COVID-19 recovery planning** for the Combined Authority and will help inform the agenda strategy for the Women and Girls' Equality Panel as it develops its plans" [C].

Summing up, Holt states that the evidence base brought together by Gains "highlighted the importance of listening to women's voices in their full diversity throughout the policy making process" [D] and Deputy Mayor Hughes attests that Gains' work "set gender equality **firmly on the agenda** in Greater Manchester" [B].

5. Sources to corroborate the impact:

- [A] Francesca Gains panellist – Jean Monnet Roundtable 'Putting People before Place: Making Devolution work for Identity Communities (2015) – with Tony Lloyd Interim Mayor <https://youtu.be/EFGs-Q6g6Jl> at 29 minutes; and Centre for Cities event 'The first 100 days – what should be in the mayor's in-tray? (2016) Town Hall Manchester - with Andy Burnham MP <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LnSb2WtMcfE>
- [B] Testimonial from Deputy Mayor with responsibility for Policing and Crime, GMCA. Received 16 November 2020.
- [C] Testimonial from Head of Implementation, GMCA. Received 18 November 2020.
- [D] Testimonial from co-founder of the DivaManc campaign, member of GM4Women steering group, member of the Greater Manchester Women's Voices Task Group, and a councillor on Manchester City Council. Received November 2020.
- [E] Testimonial from CEO of the Fawcett Society. Received 12 March 2019.
- [F] *Why has devolution been a disaster for gender equality?* The Guardian, 3 May 2017 <https://www.theguardian.com/society/2017/may/03/devolution-disastrous-gender-equality-women-metro-mayor-election>
- [G] Testimonial from founder member of the Greater Manchester for Women campaign group (<https://www.gm4women2028.org/>). Received 5 November 2020.
- [H] *Mind the Gap: Getting Women's Voices into Policy Making* <https://www.socialsciences.manchester.ac.uk/research/impact/getting-womens-voices-into-policy-making/>. March 2020.
- [I] *On Gender* <https://www.policy.manchester.ac.uk/publications/on-gender/>. July 2019.
- [J] *Building back a 'gendered' better* – policy briefing note <http://documents.manchester.ac.uk/display.aspx?DocID=49659>. June 2020.