

## Impact case study (REF3)

<b>Institution:</b> Glasgow Caledonian University		
<b>Unit of Assessment:</b> 20 - Social Work and Social Policy		
<b>Title of case study:</b> Transforming Public Policy Through Equality Budgeting		
<b>Period when the underpinning research was undertaken:</b> 2000-2019		
<b>Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:</b>		
<b>Name(s):</b>	<b>Role(s) (e.g. job title):</b>	<b>Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:</b>
Dr Angela O'Hagan	Reader in Equalities and Public Policy	2010 - ongoing
Dr Paul Teedon	Senior Research Fellow in Community Engagement	2006 - ongoing
Dr Claire MacRae	Senior Lecturer in Risk	2003 - ongoing
<b>Period when the claimed impact occurred:</b> 2000-2019		
<b>Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014?</b> No		
<b>1. Summary of the impact</b>		
<p>Gender Budgeting is the analysis of public resource allocation and revenue raising from a gender perspective. Gender budgeting activates gender mainstreaming by bringing together policy and resource decision making (O'Hagan, [C10]). Since 2000, researchers at GCU have produced research on the adoption and implementation of gender and equalities budget analysis. From an initial focus on the Scottish Government as an early pioneer among devolved governments, this research has directly impacted on the Equality Budget Statement (EBS), budgetary processes in Scotland, recommendations by international bodies and at sub/national level across the UK and beyond, and on civil society advocacy.</p>		
<b>2. Underpinning research</b>		
<p>Gender budgeting research and policy analysis began at GCU in 2000, enhancing international policy transfer and learning in the newly formed government institutions in Scotland. Early academic research and pressure from civil society resulted in the introduction of the Equality Budgets Advisory Group (EBAG) and the UK's first 'Equality Budget Statement' in 2009. O'Hagan's initial research of these institutional arrangements alongside the Scottish budget process and comparative analysis of other sub-national governments (Basque Country and Andalucía) produced an institutional "Framework of Favourable Conditions" (FFC) for the adoption and implementation of gender budgeting.[R1] O'Hagan's findings from interviews with officials, politicians, civil society activists, process tracing and documentary analysis of the budget processes and parliamentary engagement (2000-2010) in the three territories were analysed from a feminist institutionalist perspective. The FFC has been further explored as a diagnostic of current practice [R2] and its application in distinct governmental contexts has been reviewed and refined [C4-C10].</p> <p>O'Hagan's gendered policy analysis and application of feminist economics within budget processes informed the documentary analysis of social security proposals [R3], highlighting</p>		

implications for the new Social Security powers for Scotland and further implications for gender assessment of fiscal policy.

The research processes and findings – disseminated through multiple policy channels including parliamentary committees and membership of EBAG – mutually reinforced the research and its impact via O'Hagan's role as an academic activist involved in the policy process. This has given her a unique vantage position to conduct feminist analyses of policy developments in Scotland. The research [R1, R2] led to O'Hagan's appointment to the Commission on Local Tax Reform (2015) and Budget Review Group (2016-2017), and [R3] on social security led to O'Hagan's appointment on the Expert Advisory Group on Disability and Carers' Benefits providing advice and guidance to government and the Social Security Agency for the first round of devolved benefits (2017-2021) following the Social Security (Scotland) Act 2016.

Consistent with principles of community engagement and co-production of policy, all research outputs have also been disseminated in more accessible formats such as on-line blogs and reflection pieces (Wales Centre for Public Policy), and on-line videos and training animations (Health and Social Care Academy, Scotland, and Marginal Eyes by Engender Scotland). Extending equalities analysis into the evaluation of Participatory Budgeting (PB) in Scotland 2016-2018 applied a wider equalities lens to participatory governance in practice. Commissioned by the Scottish Government, O'Hagan led a three-year evaluation project comprising participatory action research, multiple observations of PB events and focus groups in 6 case study areas and 60+ interviews with officials, community members, and politicians across Scotland. Proposing a new typology for formulating and evaluating PB activities, O'Hagan et al.'s 3Ts of 'Transaction, Transference, and Transformation' recommended alternative approaches for PB to incorporate equalities analysis and outcomes. [R4, R5]

As section 4 makes clear, O'Hagan's research has contributed to changes in equalities monitoring and equality impact assessment. In recognition of her work on equality analysis in public finance, O'Hagan was awarded the Political Studies Association Jo Cox Award for Active Citizenship and Public Service 2019.

### 3. References to the research

- [R1] O'Hagan, A. (2015) 'Favourable Conditions for the Adoption and Implementation of Gender Budgeting: Insights from Comparative Analysis', *Politica Economica/Journal of Economic Policy (PEJEP)*. XXXI (2) p. 233-252.
- [R2] O'Hagan, A. (2017) 'Gender Budgeting in Scotland: A Work in Progress', *Administration: Journal of the Institute of Public Administration of Ireland*. 65 (3) p. 17-39.
- [R3] O'Hagan, A. (2016) 'Redefining Welfare in Scotland - With or Without Women?' *Critical Social Policy*. 36 (4) p. 649-671. (double blind peer reviewed paper; IF 2.857)
- [R4] O'Hagan, A., Hill O'Connor, C., MacRae, C. & Teedon, P. (2019) 'Evaluation of Participatory Budgeting in Scotland 2016-2018', Scottish Government. <https://www.gov.scot/publications/evaluation-participatory-budgeting-activity-scotland-2016-2018/>
- [R5] O'Hagan, A., MacRae, C., Hill O'Connor, C. & Teedon, P. (2020) 'Participatory budgeting, community engagement and impact on public services in Scotland', *Public Money and Management*. 40 (6) p. 446-456. (double blind peer reviewed paper; IF 1.32)

### 4. Details of the impact

O'Hagan's research has secured policy impact within Scotland, amplified through pressure from civil society groups (including Scottish Women's Budget Group [SWBG] of which O'Hagan was

Convenor from 2006-2018) to adopt feminist approaches to policy analysis in budgeting processes.

Equalities budgeting impacts from O'Hagan's research and her position as a policy insider manifest in three inter-related ways:

(i) Re-conceptualising economic and fiscal issues [R1, R2, R3]

Feminist economics and policy analysis underpin gender budgeting, operationalising gender analysis at all stages of the policy process. The inception of the Scottish Parliament (1999) and the Beijing Platform for Action (1995) which included the global direction to include gender analysis in government budget processes [R1] were the impetus for civil society action in Scotland through the SWBG [R1, C1, C2]. International comparisons and analysis of the Scottish budget process led directly to the creation in 2009 of the Equality Budget Statement [C1]. Its iterations have been directly informed by [R1, R2, C1, C2] and O'Hagan's sustained interventions as a member of the Equality Budgets Advisory Group (EBAG) and since 2018 as independent Chair. The revised budget process includes recommendations from O'Hagan's membership of the Budget Review Group [C2] whose "influence meant that the scrutiny of equality issues was a core consideration" (Group member, former Auditor General), acknowledged by the Finance and Constitution Committee as having "directly contributed to recommendations that were accepted by the Scottish Government."

(ii) Informing policy analysis, debates and discourse [R1-R5]

International interest and impact [see C4, C10], [C4] and the Pan Islands Conference (2017) organised by O'Hagan at GCU with civil society and government participants from UK and Ireland. O'Hagan's Framework directly contributed to subsequent changes in budgetary processes in Wales [C5], Ireland [R2, C4], Scotland [C2] and internationally as attested in the WBG Casebook [C9] and the creation of a 2020 toolkit on gender budgeting in European Structural Funds for the European Institute for Gender Equality (EIGE) [C6, C7]. O'Hagan's framework has been applied to budget process reviews in Wales [C4, C5], Barcelona, the Basque Country, Andalucía, Iceland, and Ireland [C3, C6-10]. The framework also structured civil society approaches to budget scrutiny in Spain, where the Platform for Gender Impact Assessment Now! applied "learning from O'Hagan's research to create the campaigning platform of feminist organisations in 2008, and the later practical application by various feminist organisations in Spain of her research on gender budgeting in Spain, UK and Europe." [R1]

"Gender budgeting has been an area of strategic importance for CIPFA. [O'Hagan] was identified as one of the UK experts and was the author for a formal CIPFA briefing document which remains CIPFA's formal commentary in this important area." (Chartered Institute of Public Finance Accounting (CIPFA), Director).

(iii) Directly influencing policy and practice by governments and civil society organisations [R2, R4, R6]

O'Hagan's framework [R1] was applied [C4] leading to the revision of gender budgeting in the Welsh Government, implementing the specific recommendations from [C5] the Gender Equality Roadmap, and pilots in discrete policy areas commencing in the 2019-2020 budget period.

UK Women's Budget Group confirmed O'Hagan's contribution [C9] as "significant and valuable" in changing policy gender responsive budgeting through the 2018 Casebook, used as the basis for training and workshop sessions with officials and civil society representatives in Australia, Columbia, France, Morocco, New Zealand, Turkey and Vietnam. Changes secured in government policy based on O'Hagan's research are echoed by institutional and civil society stakeholders.

The NI Women's Budget Group reported that, "O'Hagan's work has brought 'gender responsive budgeting' to the fore in the wider gender equality policy agenda. This has led to ongoing discussions with the Department for Communities, the Department of Agriculture, Environment and Rural Affairs and the Department of Finance and Belfast City Council." [C11]

A Scottish Government official attributed policy change in participatory budgeting guidance and the application of the 3T's model in the strategic approach to PB following the recommendations from [R4] and subsequent outputs [R5]: "Findings helped inform Scottish Government policy development...how to focus spending for the national support programme in 2018/19 to embed PB in an inclusive and transparent way. The final report's proposed 3Ts approach and implications for practice will inform the work plan for a national PB programme board to be established in Spring/Summer 2020." [C12]

The CEO of the Glasgow Disability Alliance described PB evaluation research [R5] led by O'Hagan as powerful, adding that "The Evaluation Report outlines new possibilities by shifting the balance of decisions through transferring resources to local communities. Laying out the transformative potential of PB, the Report suggests a possible world of radical change and new relationships and power dynamics between citizens and local authorities."

### 5. Sources to corroborate the impact

- C1. Scottish Government/Scottish Parliament selection of evidence (e.g. Scottish Parliament Equal Opportunities Committee/Equality and Human Rights Committee - 2000-2019 <https://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/110195.aspx>)
- C2. Scottish Parliament Budget Process Review Group Report (2017) [https://www.parliament.scot/S5\\_Finance/Reports/BPRG\\_-\\_Final\\_Report\\_30.06.17.pdf](https://www.parliament.scot/S5_Finance/Reports/BPRG_-_Final_Report_30.06.17.pdf)
- C3. National Women's Council of Ireland (2017) 'Toward Gender Responsive Budgeting in Ireland' [https://www.nwci.ie/learn/publication/toward\\_gender\\_responsive\\_budgeting\\_in\\_ireland](https://www.nwci.ie/learn/publication/toward_gender_responsive_budgeting_in_ireland)
- C4. O'Hagan, A., Christensen, E.L., Tilley, H. and Nesom, S. (2019) Tackling Inequality through Gender Budgeting, Wales Centre for Public Policy [https://www.nwci.ie/images/uploads/Gender\\_Budgeting\\_is\\_Good\\_Budgeting\\_NWCI.pdf](https://www.nwci.ie/images/uploads/Gender_Budgeting_is_Good_Budgeting_NWCI.pdf)
- C5. Chwarae Teg (2019) 'Gender Equality: A Roadmap for Wales' <https://chwaraeteg.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/Gender-Equality-a-roadmap-for-Wales.pdf>
- C6. European Institute for Gender Equality (EIGE), (2020), 'Gender Budgeting in European Structural and Investment Funds' <https://eige.europa.eu/gender-mainstreaming/toolkits/gender-budgeting>
- C7. 'Gendersense/Community of Practice on Gender Budgeting' <https://genbudget.act-on-gender.eu/>
- C8. Government of the Basque Country, Finance Department (2019) 'Fiscal Policy from a Gender Perspective' <https://www.euskadi.eus/gobierno-vasco/-/noticia/2019/politica-fiscal-desde-la-perspectiva-de-genero/> (in Spanish)
- C9. Women's Budget Group (2018) 'Women Count' <https://wbg.org.uk/resources/women-count-a-gender-responsive-budgeting-casebook/>
- C10. O'Hagan, A. and Klatzer, E. (eds.) (2018) Gender Budgeting in Europe: Developments and Challenges. Basingstoke Palgrave Macmillan

**Impact case study (REF3)**

- C11. Testimonial from NI Women's Budget Group
- C12. Testimonial from Scottish Government official