

Institution: The University of Leeds		
Unit of Assessment: 19 Politics and International Studies		
Title of case study: Shaping policy to improve education inclusion for mobile pastoralists at international and national levels		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2014-2020		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
Caroline Dyer	Professor of Education and International Development	2004 - current
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2014-2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N		
1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)		
<p>Professor Dyer's research on the systemic under-representation of mobile pastoralists in education systems has directly influenced international and national stakeholders, and national sectoral policies. At global level, her evidence and policy recommendations have shaped strategic advice and programming issued by UNESCO, UNICEF, the British Council, Save the Children, and UN Global Education Monitoring Reports (2015, 2018). In Ethiopia, Dyer's research called for improved government delivery capacity for the national <i>2017 Pastoralist Education Strategy</i>, which she subsequently co-wrote. In Mongolia, Dyer's research-led recommendations for UNESCO's <i>2019 Education Policy Review</i> on sustainable pastoralist livelihoods, rural futures and closer sectoral engagement with lifelong learning, were incorporated directly into Mongolia's national <i>2020-2030 Education Master Plan</i>.</p>		
2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)		
<p>Addressing the dynamics of education exclusion in the global drylands, which cover 41% of the world's land surface and where pastoralism is the dominant livelihood, is of crucial importance to achieving UN Sustainable Development Goal 4 (quality education and lifelong learning) and other SDGs. Drylands have suffered decades of policy inattention in resourcing social services and infrastructural development. They need specialist responses to the complex challenges of providing education without undermining mobile pastoralist livelihoods, and have benefited least from the expansion of formal schooling using delivery models suited to sedentary populations. Pastoralists' widespread marginalisation in formal education is a global problem that reflects misunderstandings of their livelihood, a weak evidence base to inform policy choices, and limited technical capacities among education system actors.</p> <p>Dyer's career-long research applies knowledge of pastoralist livelihoods and dryland variability to research on how pastoralists' education exclusion is produced and could be mitigated. Her field and desk-based empirical research, spanning India, Afghanistan, Kenya, Ethiopia and Mongolia, provides case studies and evidence relevant for all drylands. Dyer has evidenced how the global <i>Education For All</i> movement, led by UNESCO, marginalised mobile pastoralists [5,4], because most delivery models create an oppositional relationship between education provision and the situated learning and mobility intrinsic to a sustainable pastoralist livelihood [5,3,4]. Her international comparative perspective focuses on how education services could avoid antagonistic terms of inclusion, reinforce pastoralists' traditional livelihood and cultural values, and thus better respond to pastoralist livelihood imperatives [3,4] and the SDG4 lifelong learning pledge.</p> <p>In Ethiopia in 2016, the inter-ministerial Quality Education Strategic Support Programme (QESSP) commissioned Dyer to research promoting pastoralists' inclusion as part of the Ministry of Education's policy commitment to universal education. Dyer designed and led a situation analysis of education provision in four pastoralist regions. Her analysis showed that the already limited policy options of the <i>2008 Pastoralist Education Strategy</i> were further constrained by weak governance and delivery that gave rise to marginalising effects [2]. There was strong reliance on Alternative Basic Education Centres, which the research found deficient in staffing, material provisions, relevance, and capacity to ensure learner progression, while mobile provision remained absent and inclusion in mainstream schooling was neglected.</p>		

In Mongolia in 2019, Dyer was the lead international researcher for UNESCO's 2019 Education Policy Review (EPR) process. The EPR initially drew on the Institute for Education Research's draft [Country Report](#), which Dyer provided technical inputs to ensure that pastoralists' educational status was directly evidenced. Dyer's research inputs for the EPR's *Preliminary Report* included a literature review and three field visits. The first (March 2019) included 30 stakeholder interviews and eight classroom observations in Xinti and Domod Districts, and Ulaanbaatar. Dyer authored key sections of the *Preliminary Report*, using research inputs to shape policy recommendations to improve access, educator competences, and education quality at all levels of the system. She identified an urgent need to improve the status of provision for pastoralists, specifically by improving residential schools and early childhood provision, and adopting e-learning, and better integrating education as a development strategy to ensure a sustainable future for pastoralists in the rapidly changing rural landscape. She interviewed high-level stakeholders in September 2019 to deepen the *Preliminary Report's* analysis; led the writing of UNESCO's final [Education Policy Review](#); co-led a participatory validation process (Ulaanbaatar, December 2019); and presented key recommendations on pastoralists at the official *EPR* launch (September 2020) attended by the Education Minister. As outlined in Section 4, the policy priorities of the completed 2020 UNESCO *Mongolia EPR* incorporate Dyer's research on aligning approaches to education delivery with transforming drylands contexts and the need to ensure dignified, sustainable, pastoralist livelihoods [b].

At the global level, the UN's Global Education Monitoring (GEM) team commissioned Dyer to research approaches to pastoralists' inclusion for its 2014 report [4]. In 2016, GIZ – the service provider funded by the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) - and Educate A Child - a global program of the Qatari Education Above All Foundation - commissioned Dyer to lead a new desk study, supported by key stakeholder interviews, to identify promising models of school inclusion for mobile children [6]. In 2017, Dyer held a University of Leeds ESRC/Impact Acceleration Account Knowledge Exchange Fellowship investigating Save the Children (UK)'s 'networked schooling' model in 371 primary schools in Ethiopia's Somali region [a], which evidenced how networked schooling embedded in pastoralists' drought management strategies enables continuous inclusion across the migratory cycle, and avoids antagonistic terms of inclusion. Her research evidence shows that providers need to continue to focus on making schooling more accessible and relevant, but also focus more closely on retaining learners and ensuring their progression [1].

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

- [1] Dyer, C. and E. Echessa. 2019. Sustaining learner participation and progression through networked schooling: A systemic approach for Mobile Out of School Children. *International Journal of Educational Development*. 64, 8-16. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2018.11.002>.
- [2] Dyer, C. 2018. Education inclusion as a border regime: implications for mobile pastoralists in Ethiopia's Afar region. *International Studies in the Sociology of Education*. 27 (2-3), 145-165. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09620214.2018.1426998>.
- [3] Dyer, C. 2016. The Future of Pastoralism: Approaches to education provision for mobile pastoralists. *OIE Scientific and Technical Review* 35 (2), 631-638. <http://boutique.oie.int/extrait/24dyer631638.pdf>
- [4] Dyer, C. 2016. Evolving approaches to educating children from nomadic communities. *Prospects* 46(1), 39-54. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11225-016-9381-6>. (Invited SI paper drawing on background paper commissioned for the UNESCO 2014 Global Monitoring Report on Education For All).
- [5] Dyer, C. 2014. *Livelihoods and Learning. Education for All and the marginalisation of mobile pastoralists*. London: Routledge. ISBN: 978-0-415-58590-3 (hardback); 2017 paperback 9781138556300. Copy supplied on request.
- [6] Bengtsson, S. and C. Dyer. 2017. *Ensuring high quality primary education for children from mobile populations*. EAC/GIZ. 112-page report. https://educateachild.org/sites/default/files/docs/2017/EAC_Mobile%20population_FINAL.pdf

Associated funding:

- [a] ESRC/IAA Knowledge Exchange Fellowship (Outgoing, 2017-2018) with Save the Children (GBP12,000). C. Dyer (PI).
- [b] British Academy (2018-2020) 'Sustainable Development for Pastoralist Women in India: Heritage, dignity and adaptations in times of rapid change' (SDP2\100053, GBP299,799). C. Dyer (PI).

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Dyer's career-long research has: (i) helped set the international agenda by raising global awareness of pastoralist's education needs, providing an evidence base to inform and shape global policy effort, and; instituting livelihood-sensitive approaches to pastoralists' education inclusion within national policy strategies in (ii) Ethiopia and (iii) Mongolia.

(i) Raising awareness and providing an evidence-base for global education policy and practice for international organisations and NGOs

Dyer's research has played a crucial role in helping key global and national education actors to understand pastoralists' educational needs for global advocacy and national policies. Global efforts to raise awareness and inform an educational agenda for change widely use her research, and international organisations regularly commission her technical expertise to generate research evidence and policy advice. For example, several UN Global Education Monitoring Reports (GEMRs) have drawn upon her evidence and analyses. Established in 2002, the GEMR is an annual agenda-setting report with thematic foci, used by state and non-state decision makers seeking evidence to inform their actions on inclusive and equitable quality education at national, regional and global levels. These Reports play a crucial role in informing educational stakeholders on policy 'best practice' and presenting evidence that supports educational policy reforms aiming to achieve SDG4. The 2019 GEMR, which argues that 'nomad and pastoralist education needs are not addressed' ([A] p. 22), for example, makes six citations of Dyer's Educate A Child (EAC)/German International Cooperation Institute (GIZ) commissioned, co-authored study [6] and presents her evidence on networked schooling [1] in its reporting on global efforts to adjust education to livelihood-related mobility [A]. Dyer's 2014 Background Paper (which became [4]), commissioned for the 2000-2015 global overview of Education for All in the 2015 GEMR, is cited as key evidence seven times within the four paragraphs devoted to nomadic pastoralists [B]. The 2019 GEMR's use of Dyer's updated evidence [6] to argue that nomads' needs are not addressed, that education should be adjusted to seasonality and mobility, and its relevance to their livelihoods improved, shows how her research has raised issue awareness and sharpened understanding ([A] pp. 21-22).

Dyer's research has highlighted evidence gaps and this has led to collaborations aiming to close them, including with UNESCO, Save the Children [C], the British Council, the UN's GEMR team, EAC and GIZ [D]. Dyer engaged with non-academic stakeholders via events in Doha (2017), Berlin (2016), Atlanta (2017), and the University of Leeds (2018 and 2019 conferences w/ Save the Children, ca. 60 participants). The Executive Director at EAC commends Dyer's innovative suggestion of adding interviews to supplement the desk research it commissioned, which '*increased our reach*' as a '*wide range of actors wanted the opportunity to discuss issues and contribute*' and enabled EAC to '*share through our global network the practical and policy challenges faced when providing quality education for children from mobile populations*' [D]. The research highlighted for EAC and '*implementing partners*' the '*need to programme in specific ways to provide education to some of the hardest to reach children*', with '*clear examples of how policy and programmatic approaches can be implemented to meet the educational needs of children who find themselves "on the move"*' [D].

A Senior Education Advisor at Save the Children describes Dyer as a '*thought leader*' who is '*internationally recognised as an authoritative source on pastoralist education research*' [C]. Her research is understood as '*critical for policy and practice as it highlights the urgent need to intervene in a unique, pastoralist centred approach if we are to reach those children who are left behind, and contribute to the realisation of SDGs*'. The charity uses Dyer's research as a '*great resource and addition to our knowledge bank*' and '*point of reference when designing new projects*' to '*inform our education programming and advocacy in various pastoralist contexts we work*' [C]. In particular, Dyer's work on 'networked schooling' [1], which Save innovated and Dyer sharpened, resulted in '*an impact in Ethiopia by providing a model enabling hard to reach communities to gain*

education access' [see below] with 'very good potential for other international applications with mobile populations', and will also 'inform [...] our future programming' [C].

In Mongolia (2019), the collaborative research methodology Dyer shaped to fit the 'distinctive education and development context', outlined below in (iii), has inspired UNESCO to revise its internal guidelines for best practice on how to carry out further Education Policy Reviews [E]. Her applied research 'contributed to UNESCO's Major Programme I (Education) and the specific expected result "improved national education policies and plans to advance access to equitable and quality [early childhood care and education], primary and secondary education through a system-wide lifelong learning approach"'. Dyer's expertise contributed to 'strengthening UNESCO's esteem as a respected knowledge organization providing policy analysis and advice', whilst some of the EPR's conclusions 'are relevant far beyond Mongolia to the global debate on education and learning' [E].

(ii) Changing education policy in Ethiopia to better include marginalised pastoralists

Ethiopia's pastoralist population comprises ca. 12-15 million people and rates of education participation among pastoralist children fall far below national averages [F]. Dyer was appointed as the international expert to conduct research and co-author Ethiopia's *Pastoralist Education Strategy 2017* (PES 2017) by the government's Quality Education Strategic Support Programme (QESSP). A former educational consultant for UNICEF Ethiopia explains that Dyer's 'expertise greatly assisted in formulating a policy that was more focused, and progressive in terms of intent and language' [G]. Her review of international evidence on delivery modalities and empirical analysis of implementation of the *Pastoralist Education Strategy 2008* changed the strategic emphasis of the new 2017 Strategy to focus on a wider range of delivery approaches, and embedded lessons from her long-standing research by including details of modalities and extensive guidance on stakeholder roles and responsibilities for implementation [1,4]. Dyer led stakeholder workshops with field teams of UNICEF and Save the Children, and with three government Regional Education Bureaux, which evidenced high dependence for pastoralists' education inclusion on under-resourced, poorly managed Alternative Basic Education Centres. This evidence, and its equity implications, was discussed at a national consultation meeting (Addis Ababa, April 2016) for 20 key ministerial, inter-agency and civil-society stakeholders. The discussion 'greatly supported development partners to identify best practices and highlight the great needs within this nomadic/semi nomadic setting' [G]. For UNICEF, the situation analysis was a 'strong independent piece of empirical research' which prompted UNICEF to commission its own external evaluation of Alternative Basic Education to 'determine the pitfalls' [G]. In July 2017, Dyer was an expert respondent for the evaluation, which makes 16 references to the situation analysis findings [H]. In combination, both bodies of research 'showed a gap in understanding the considerable investment needed to deliver quality pastoralist education' [G]. UNICEF subsequently 'decided to shift its focus to improving the quality of education in these settings and creating a more equitable standard, instead of supporting large scale ABE [Alternative Basic Education Centres] construction, without adequate follow through' [G]. UNICEF affirms that under Dyer's guidance and co-authorship, PES 2017 departed from 'a litany of different approaches borrowed from other countries that were often not implemented, and/or not adequately supported or monitored' and 'instead allowed the Government to reflect more internally on the shortcomings in pastoral settings and narrow the focus based on lessons learned from the situational analysis' [G]. The PES 2017 and revised ABE guidelines, along with the system strengthening focus that Dyer emphasised, are reported as outputs of the now completed QESSP ([I], p. 12), setting the policy agenda of the government and development actors' support for the years ahead [F].

(iii) Re-focusing education policy in Mongolia to emphasise lifelong learning and education's role in sustainable pastoralism and rural futures

The official with responsibility for managing the 2019 UNESCO *Education Policy Review (EPR)*, commissioned by the government of Mongolia (where some 30% of the 3.2 million population is involved in mobile pastoralism), explains that Dyer's globally recognised promotion of pastoralists' education inclusion, underpinned by her 'deep intellectual enquiry and sustained commitment to the well-being of these communities', led directly to UNESCO commissioning her as international lead for the EPR [E,J]. Dyer 'brought research findings from Kenya, Ethiopia and India to bear on the policy debates in Mongolia on 'productivity', access to quality and relevant education, and the

long-term national vision for sustainable development [E]. Her grasp of global evidence and Mongolia-specific research findings brought *'new perspectives to counterparts and national education stakeholders'* and enabled the UN team to integrate into the *EPR* recommendations to re-orient education to support pastoralism, rural development, and national Green Economy pledges; and to challenge the narrow focus on industrial employability in the technical and vocational (TVET) sector [E]. At the beginning of the *EPR* process, Dyer advised the Mongolian Institute of Education Research (MIER) to include a new, separate section to highlight pastoralists' education status in the Country Report that MIER authored, which the UN then used as the foundation document for the *EPR*. As a result of Dyer's input, the UN's *EPR* [J], which focuses on lifelong learning for all, included a specific, separate Policy Domain for pastoralists' education (Policy Domain 3, pp. 103-118). Furthermore, the UN's *EPR* team leader found that Dyer's expertise on pastoralism *'significantly enhanced the credibility and standing of the EPR team, in the eyes of national officials and stakeholders, and international development partners, such as UNICEF, the World Bank, the Global Partnership for Education, and the Asian Development Bank'* [E]. The *EPR* provides a range of prioritised policy recommendations, including improved and equitable provision for pastoralists [J]. Many of Dyer's recommendations have been included subsequently in Mongolia's forthcoming *2020-30 Education Master Plan*, which is the policy framework for all education sector activity for the next ten years and directly draws on the *EPR*. As a result, in the UN *EPR* team leader's view, Dyer's work *'will undoubtedly impact on the future governance and strategic directions of education in Mongolia as well as the character of development cooperation'* [E].

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

[A] UN Global Education Monitoring Report, in relation to 4(i). *Migration, Displacement and Education: Building Bridges, not Walls* (2019) (pp. 20, 24):

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000265866>;

[B] UN Global Education Monitoring Report, in relation to 4(i). *Education for All 2000-2015: Achievements and Challenges* (2015) (pp. 98-99):

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000232205>.

[C] Senior Education Adviser, Save the Children, in relation to 4(i). Letter of corroboration dated 4 March 2020.

[D] Executive Director, Educate A Child, Doha, in relation to 4(i). Letter of corroboration dated 3 March 2020.

[E] Programme Specialist, Education Sector, UNESCO HQ, Paris, in relation to 4(i) and (iii). Letter of corroboration dated 13 February 2020.

[F] UNICEF Ethiopia (March 2019), in relation to 4(ii). Briefing document - *Education for Pastoralist Children* (cites the 2017 *Pastoral Education Strategy* as a programming source):

<https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/media/1151/file/Pastoralist%20Education%20Advocacy%20brief%20.pdf>.

[G] Former Educational Consultant at UNICEF Ethiopia, in relation to 4(ii). Letter of corroboration dated 30 July 2020

[H] UNICEF/Center for Evaluation and Development (2017), in relation to 4(ii). *An Impact Evaluation of Alternative Basic Education in Ethiopia* (pp. 8, 12, 14, 29, 42, 41,42, 57,59, 63-65, 68): <https://www.unicef.org/evaluation/reports#/detail/401/an-impact-evaluation-of-alternative-basic-education-in-ethiopia>.

[I] British Council (March 2019), in relation to 4(ii). *Lessons from a Technical Assistance Programme. QESSP: Ethiopia Quality Education Strategic Support Programme* (pp. 12, 22):

<https://ethiopia.britishcouncil.org/sites/default/files/qessp-achievements-web.pdf>.

[J] UNESCO (2020), in relation to 4(iii). *Mongolia Education Policy Review*:

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000373687>.