

<b>Institution:</b> University of Glasgow (UofG)		
<b>Unit of Assessment:</b> UoA 19 Politics and International Studies		
<b>Title of case study:</b> Brokering the post-Cotonou Agreement between the European Union and the Organisation of African, Caribbean and Pacific States		
<b>Period when the underpinning research was undertaken:</b> September 2005–2020		
<b>Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:</b>		
<b>Name(s):</b> Maurizio Carbone	<b>Role(s) (e.g. job title):</b> Professor of International Relations and Development	<b>Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:</b> September 2005–present
<b>Period when the claimed impact occurred:</b> 2013–2020		
<b>Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014?</b> No		
<p><b>1. Summary of the impact</b></p> <p>The longstanding partnership agreement between the European Union (EU) and the Organisation of 79 states in Africa, the Caribbean and the Pacific (OACPS) covers a wide array of policies (e.g. economic development, environmental sustainability, security and migration). The renewal of the agreement was impeded by the conflicting preferences of EU Member States and the differentiated needs and priorities of the three OACP regions. Carbone's research contributed to brokering EU-OACP relations by: (1) setting the parameters for an unprecedented multi-level cooperation framework to enhance policy coherence and coordination; (2) supporting the negotiating positions of both the EU and the OACPS, leading to a political deal on the agreement in December 2020.</p>		
<p><b>2. Underpinning research</b></p> <p>This Impact Case Study is underpinned by research carried out by Maurizio Carbone, Professor of International Relations and Development and Jean Monnet Chair of EU External Policies, at the UofG since September 2005. Carbone's research on the relations between the EU and ACP states has been externally funded by three grants awarded by the Jean Monnet Programme of the European Commission [G1, G2, G3].</p> <p><b>2.1. Exposing the structural limitations of the Cotonou Agreement</b></p> <p>The Cotonou Agreement, which succeeded the Lomé Convention (1975–2000), has been governing relations between the European Union and the ACP States (renamed the Organisation of ACP States in April 2020) since June 2000. Considered the most comprehensive framework for North-South relations, the EU-OACPS partnership encompasses numerous policy areas—most notably development, trade, migration and mobility, peace and security, democracy and human rights, environment and climate change—affecting the lives of more than a billion people, whose annual per-capita income ranges from USD261 (Burundi) to USD32,993 (Bahamas).</p> <p>Carbone's research over more than a decade has revealed how the existing format for cooperation between the two blocs, consisting of a single model applicable indistinctly to all ACP states, has failed to take account of diverse needs and priorities across the three ACP regions [3.5]. The limitations of the EU-OACPS institutional architecture, Carbone's research has demonstrated, have been further exposed by the adoption of other frameworks for cooperation between the EU and different clusters of ACP states, for instance the EU and the African Union, or the EU and other regional and sub-regional organisations [3.4, 3.5, 3.6]. Carbone's research has also revealed how the EU and ACP states have largely failed to join forces in the international arena to support shared values, such as multilateralism and sustainable development, with the notable exception of the Paris Agreement on climate change [3.1, 3.5]. Furthermore, through different strands of his research portfolio, Carbone has unravelled various forces underpinning the enduring asymmetrical relations between the EU and ACP states and has called for a profound rethinking of the donor-recipient dynamics that have permeated the EU-OACPS partnership over the past decades [3.1, 3.2, 3.4, 3.5, 3.6].</p> <p><b>2.2. Showing the need for enhanced policy coherence</b></p> <p>While dismantling the EU-OACPS partnership in its entirety has been advocated by various EU Member States (e.g. Germany, the Netherlands, and the Nordic countries) and even several divisions within the EU institutions [3.1, 3.5], Carbone's research has highlighted the necessity</p>		

and benefit of preserving some aspects of it, particularly to ensure coherence with decisions taken in policy areas other than development—notably trade, environment and foreign and security policy [3.1]. The analysis of interlinkages between different policy areas, often not in a very synergetic fashion, has been at the heart of Carbone’s research since he pioneered the notion of policy coherence for development (PCD) in the late 2000s [3.3].

Over the past two decades, Professor Carbone has unveiled various problems related to lack of policy coherence in the EU’s external action, particularly with regard to the security-development nexus [3.4], the link between development cooperation and agriculture and fisheries policies [3.3], or the promotion of human rights and democracy [3.6]. Furthermore, he has identified specific mechanisms to advance PCD, including in EU-ACP relations [3.3, 3.5]. Finally, based on research trips to around 20 ACP countries, he has pointed to the negative effects of the increased securitisation of EU foreign aid for the promotion of human and social development and has singled out the costs and benefits of improved EU aid coordination and joint programming in developing countries, particularly in Africa and the Pacific [3.2, 3.4, 3.6].

### 3. References to the research

- 3.1. Carbone, M. (2019). [Purposefully triggering unintended consequences: the European Commission and the uncertain future of the EU-ACP partnership](#). *International Spectator*, 54 (1), 45-59. (doi: [10.1080/03932729.2019.1559563](#))
- 3.2. Carbone, M. (2017). [Make Europe happen on the ground? Enabling and constraining factors for European Union aid coordination in Africa](#). *Development Policy Review*, 35 (4), pp. 531–548. (doi: [10.1111/dpr.12194](#))
- 3.3. Carbone, M. and Keijzer, N. (2016). [The European Union and policy coherence for development: reforms, results, resistance](#). *European Journal of Development Research*, 28 (1), 30-43. (doi: [10.1057/ejdr.2015.72](#))
- 3.4. Carbone, M. (2013). [An uneasy nexus: development, security and the EU’s African Peace Facility](#). *European Foreign Affairs Review*, 18 (4), pp. 103-124.
- 3.5. Carbone, M. (2013). [Rethinking ACP-EU Relations after Cotonou: Tensions, Contradictions, Prospects](#). *Journal of International Development*, 25 (4), pp. 742-756. (doi: [10.1002/jid.2929](#))
- 3.6. Carbone, M. (2011). [Trapped in regionalism: the EU and democracy promotion in the South Pacific](#). *European Foreign Affairs Review*, 16 (5), 673-687. ISSN 1384-6299.

The research underpinning this Impact Case Study [3.1–3.6] is published in international double-blind peer reviewed journals and should therefore satisfy or exceed the 2\* threshold. The quality of the research is further demonstrated by the award of three grants over a ten-year period:

- G1.** Jean Monnet Programme of the European Commission: Grant, ‘European integration and the EU’s relations with the developing world’, EUR43,859; September 2010-August 2013.
- G2.** Jean Monnet Programme of the European Commission: Grant, ‘Re-crafting EU-ACP relations’, EUR50,000; September 2017-August 2020.
- G3.** Jean Monnet Programme of the European Commission: Grant, ‘Project on Europe-Africa relations’, EUR60,000; September 2019-August 2021.

### 4. Details of the impact

From 2013 onwards, Carbone’s research on the EU’s external action and the evolution of EU-OACPS relations has had a significant impact on the negotiations for the successor to the Cotonou Agreement. This impact has been generated through publications, stakeholder presentations, and formal and informal advice to policymakers, with different actors in the EU and the OACPS as the direct beneficiaries, and people across 117 countries as indirect beneficiaries.

#### 4.1. Setting the agenda on the post-Cotonou Agreement

The impact of Carbone’s research on the EU-OACPS negotiations can be traced back to a special section of the *Journal of International Development* (JID), which he guest-edited in 2013 with contributions from the then heads of the taskforces on future EU-ACP relations of both the

EU and the OACPS. In his introduction to the JID special section, Carbone drew on his research to highlight strengths and weaknesses of the Cotonou Agreement and identified different scenarios for future EU-ACP relations. Carbone's research findings, widely circulated in EU-ACP policy circles in Brussels, *"played an important role in setting the agenda on ACP-EU relations after the expiration of the Cotonou Agreement"*, as confirmed by the OACPS Secretary General (statement [5A]).

#### **4.2. Developing an unprecedented multi-level format for EU-ACP relations**

In December 2015, Carbone was invited to serve as a policy advisor to the EU Taskforce on the Post-Cotonou. Drawing on the findings of his research, an impact assessment was designed to ascertain the feasibility of different scenarios. The proposed legal framework, in the form of an unprecedented model in the history of the EU's engagement with third countries, retained a general part applicable to all ACP countries, including a novel section on international cooperation. Most importantly, it introduced the idea of three separate regional pillars, which allowed for the targeting of specific policy actions to different countries in Africa, the Caribbean and the Pacific. This innovative multi-level framework was endorsed and incorporated into the proposal for the EU's negotiating directives adopted by the European Commission (EC) in December 2017. The EU Chief Negotiator acknowledged the impact of Carbone's *"research and specific inputs on the institutional framework and other important aspects of the EU-ACP partnership related to development cooperation, and the links between development, trade and security [which] have played an important role in all phases leading the EU Negotiating Directives"* (confirmed by statement [5B]).

#### **4.3. Supporting the new approach with the EU and with the ACP Group**

Carbone's research contributed to and affected the EU negotiating directives, which must be approved by the EU Council of Ministers before the EC can engage in negotiations with third parties (confirmed by statement [5C]). In September 2017, Carbone presented his research findings in a restricted meeting with senior officials of EU Member States, leading to the eventual acceptance of the new approach resting on two-interlinked components, with some provisions applying to the whole ACP Group and other targeted to countries in the three ACP regions, and a stronger emphasis on coherence between different policy areas beyond development cooperation only. In the first semester of 2018, working closely with the Bulgarian Presidency of the EU, he provided substantial inputs and, *"made a tangible impact on some of the provisions covered in the EU Negotiating Directives"*, particularly on issues related to policy coherence for development and aid effectiveness, as acknowledged by the Chair of the ACP Working Party of the EU Council [5C].

Carbone's research, furthermore, *'informed several discussions within the ACP Group on the institutional architecture of the new ACP-EU Agreement'*, as confirmed by the OACPS Secretary General [5A]. In March 2016, Carbone presented his research before the ACP Committee of Ambassadors and in May 2018 delivered a keynote address in the context of the ACP Council of Ministers in Togo (confirmed by letter of invitation [5D]). In both venues, he drew on his research findings to support the shift in decision-making and implementation of strategic priorities towards the regional level and indicated how to best involve regional organisations, including the African Union, into the future EU-OACP Agreement (as confirmed by letter [5E]). The OACPS Secretary General testifies to the importance of Carbone's research, whose *"insightful recommendations were included in the outcome document and ... had a significant impact on the preparatory process leading to the adoption of the ACP Negotiating Mandate by the ACP Council of Ministers"* [5A].

Carbone's research also had an impact on the position of the European Parliament (EP) and the Joint EU-ACP Parliamentary Assembly. In particular, in March 2018 he gave oral evidence before the EP Development Committee, and in December 2018, was keynote speaker before approximately 150 EU and ACP parliamentarians. In both settings, he documented the shortcomings of the legal framework governing the EU-ACP partnership and suggested concrete ways for 'how to partner with regional organisations and to develop a real multi-actor partnership' (confirmed by letter [5E] and programme [5F]). This adds to the workshop for EP Members, which Carbone organised and led in February 2016 on the promotion of policy coherence for development in EU external relations, particularly in ACP countries (confirmed by

EU workshop report [5G]). The resolution of the EP, recommending specific mechanisms to operationalise policy coherence for development, including on joint programming, shows that Carbone's recommendations were taken on board (confirmed by resolution report [5H]).

#### 4.4. A political deal for a new Partnership Agreement

On 3 December 2020, the chief negotiators from the EU and OACPS reached a political deal on the text for a new Partnership Agreement that will succeed the Cotonou Agreement (confirmed by press release [5I]). The EU Chief Negotiator said, *'[The] deal marks a step towards a new era for the EU, Africa, the Caribbean and the Pacific. People in all those four regions of the world will benefit from this ambitious Agreement.'* The OACPS Chief Negotiator confirmed that, *'The political agreement [...] paves the way for a modern and more committed partnership at the national, regional and international levels.'* [5I]. A senior EU official added, *'There is a real shift in the structure of the agreement,'* pointing to the '3+1' composition of the new deal, composed of a common foundation to all countries, which sets out shared values and priorities, along with three regional protocols for Africa, the Caribbean, and Pacific (confirmed by article [5J]).

Now that a political deal has been reached, the text will go through internal procedures before the finalisation of the agreement at a later stage in 2021.

#### 5. Sources to corroborate the impact

[5A] Statement from the Secretary General of the ACP Group of States (confirms the role of Carbone's research in setting the agenda on ACP-EU relations) **[PDF available]**.

[5B] Statement from the EU Commissioner for Development and Chief Negotiator for the EU-ACP post-Cotonou negotiations (confirms the contribution of the research and specific inputs on the institutional framework) **[PDF available]**.

[5C] Statement from the Chair of the ACP Working Party of the Council of the European Union (confirms Carbone's research-based contributions on some of the provisions covered in the EU Negotiating Directives) **[PDF available]**.

[5D] Letter of invitation to speak at the 'Inter-Agency Consultation with Regional and Continental Organisations on the ACP Group's Negotiating Framework for a post-Cotonou Agreement with the EU', Lomé (Togo), May 2018 **[PDF available]**.

[5E] Letter from Member of the European Parliament and Chair of EU-ACP Joint Parliamentary Assembly, invitation to speak at the EU-ACP Joint Parliamentary Assembly, Cotonou (Benin), December 2018 **[PDF available]**.

[5F] Public Hearing of the European Parliament, 'Negotiating change: the future of ACP-EU relations', Brussels, 20 March 2018 **[PDF available]**.

[5G] Workshop of the European Parliament, ['EU Policy Coherence for Development: The challenge of sustainability'](#), Brussels (16 February 2016) **[PDF available]**.

[5H] Resolution of the European Parliament on the EU 2015 [Report on Policy Coherence for Development](#) (2015/2317(INI)) **[PDF available]**.

[5I] European Commission Press Release (3 December 2020) [Post-Cotonou: Negotiators reach a political deal on a new EU/Africa-Caribbean-Pacific Partnership Agreement](#) (confirms the political deal and the quotes attributed to the Chief Negotiators from the EU and OACPS) **[PDF available]**.

[5J] EURACTIV News Article (4 December 2020) EU and ACP finalise post-Cotonou treaty, after two-year delay (confirms the quote attributed to a senior EU official) **[PDF available]**.