

Institution: University of Warwick		
Unit of Assessment: D26 – Modern Languages and Linguistics		
Title of case study: Exhibiting Multilingualism in Renaissance Philosophy		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2010-2019		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
David Lines	Professor of Renaissance Philosophy and Intellectual History	September 2006 – present
Cecilia Muratori	Research Fellow Honorary Research Fellow	May 2015 – July 2019 August 2019 - present
Eugenio Refini	Research Fellow	October 2010 - September 2013
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2016-2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N		
1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words) <p>Exhibitions in Venice, Dresden, and Coventry have disseminated new research on the linguistic richness of Renaissance philosophy and its resonance for contemporary publics. Attracting broad, international audiences of over 60,000 people, these initiatives have highlighted the international nature and linguistic mobility of Renaissance thought, moving across Greek, Latin, and vernaculars, particularly with translations of and commentaries on Aristotle and the 17C German philosopher Jacob Böhme. Lines' and Muratori's research has given host venues, lending libraries, and electronic meta-catalogues a clearer understanding of the nature and importance of their collections and records, and the broader public a novel insight into the multilingualism of Renaissance thought.</p>		
2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words) <p>Scholars have usually seen an engagement with the vernacular as one of the chief aspects of early modern philosophy (e.g., Descartes in the 17C) as it supposedly turned away from scholastic Latin. However, Professor David Lines and Dr Cecilia Muratori have shown that, in the 15C and 16C, philosophy was already in various languages and reaching different publics (including merchants, soldiers, nobles, women and others who were intellectually curious and linguistically flexible). Translations from Greek or Latin to the vernacular (but also among vernaculars) played a decisive but understudied role in the dissemination of philosophical ideas, as did commentaries and original works written in a variety of languages (3.3).</p> <p>With the support of several external grants, Lines and Muratori have been studying this phenomenon both within Italy and across Europe, where the study of classical philosophers (Aristotle and Plato) was as important as (and was often coupled with) the influence of new ones such as Jacob Böhme (1575-1624), one of the most important German thinkers. Until recently, most scholars thought that 'serious' Renaissance philosophy was nearly always written in Latin, and philosophy was therefore considered an exclusive interest of the intellectual elites. Warwick researchers, however, have challenged this idea by emphasising the multilingual dimension of Renaissance philosophy, where both writers and readers easily crossed supposedly fixed borders between languages. Lines and his team used an AHRC project (2010-13), an ERC</p>		

Starting Grant (2014-19), and two Marie Curie fellowships (2012-13; 2014-16) to study vernacular commentaries and translations of Aristotle in Italy and beyond (1400-1650). Over 300 manuscripts and 250 printed editions, collected in an online catalogue of works (3.1), testify to the unexpectedly large scale of this unstudied phenomenon for Italian alone. Muratori has applied her experience as part of the Aristotle project to her research (funded by the Staatliche Kunstsammlungen Dresden) on Böhme, stressing the latter's significance as a self-educated philosopher and the reception of his German writings in other languages, such as Latin, English, French and Dutch (3.4-3.5).

In the case of **Aristotle**, this research gauges, for the first time, the quantity, nature, and significance of vernacular interpretations (commentaries, translations, paraphrases, lectures, etc.) through which Italian Renaissance readers engaged with these classical authors (3.1-3.3). Taking into account both manuscripts and printed works, it points to the philosophical effects of the 16C debate about language ('questione della lingua'), which elevated the vernacular to a status equal to that of Latin, promoted interlinguistic operations, and strongly diversified the reading publics of Renaissance philosophical works, as well as providing a model for the language of early modern philosophy. The research on **Böhme** shows the complexity and sophistication of this thinker, until recently little known, as well as the considerable influence he exercised on contemporary and later movements in philosophy and religion (including in North America). Muratori's research findings demonstrated that from the 17C to the mid-19C Böhme had a significant influence in shaping philosophical thought on a fully European scale (3.4-3.5). The (mis)translations that Böhme's works underwent, particularly into English, point to the importance of studying the interlinguistic aspect of his philosophy, which has been almost wholly ignored until recently (3.3).

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

Lines, Muratori and Refini's research includes a translated monograph and published articles in peer-reviewed journals and edited collections, in addition to an online database of vernacular Aristotelian works:

1) **Refini, Eugenio, Lines, David A.**, Gilson, Simon and Kraye, Jill (2012) *Vernacular Aristotelianism in Renaissance Italy (VARI): A Database of Works* (first published 1 May 2012 at <http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/arts/ren/projects/vernaculararistotelianism/database>); relaunched version (2016) at <https://vari.warwick.ac.uk>

2) **Lines, David A.** and Refini, Eugenio (2014) '*Aristotele fatto volgare*'. *Tradizione aristotelica e cultura volgare nel rinascimento*. Pisa: ETS. ISBN: 9788846741387

3) **Lines, David A.** and Puliafito, Anna Laura (eds.) (2019) '*In Other Words*': *Translating Philosophy in the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries*. Special issue of *Rivista di Storia della Filosofia*, 74.2. <http://digital.casalini.it/4526484>

4) **Muratori, Cecilia** (2017) 'Böhme's Philosophia'. In Brink, C. and Mann, L., (eds.) *Grund und Ungrund: Der Kosmos des mystischen Philosophen Jacob Böhme*. Dresden: Sandstein, pp. 36-49. ISBN: 3954983273

5) **Muratori, Cecilia** (2018) '*A Philosopher Does Not Stand Still*': *Legacies and Receptions of the Philosophus Teutonicus*. In Andersson, B., Martin, L., Penman, L. and Weeks, A. (eds) *Jacob Böhme and His World*. Leiden: Brill, pp. 286-312. doi: 10.1163/9789004385092

Grants:

AHRC Standard Research Grant (October 2010–January 2013) 'Vernacular Aristotelianism in Renaissance Italy, c.1400–c.1650'. **PI: Lines, David**; CI's: Gilson, Simon and Kraye, Jill (Warburg Institute). One research fellow at Warwick (**Refini, Eugenio**). Ref: AH/H034013/1 (**GBP500,324**).

ERC Starting Investigator Grant (May 2014– April 2019) ‘Aristotle in the Italian Vernacular: Rethinking Renaissance and Early-Modern Intellectual History (c. 1400–c.1650)’. PI: Sgarbi, Marco (Università Ca’ Foscari); CI’s: **Lines, David** and Gilson, Simon (until Dec. 2017). Five research fellows at Warwick (**Muratori, Cecilia**, Brazeau, Bryan, Cotugno, Alessio, Puliafito, Anna Laura and Lizzul, Giorgio). Ref: 335949 (**EUR1,483,180** (05-2014)).

Staatliche Kunstsammlungen Dresden (SKD): funding (**GBP31,674.84**) covered **Cecilia Muratori’s** salary and administrative costs for 9 months in 2016-17 to organise an exhibition and conference.

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Lines and Muratori’s research into the role of multilingualism in philosophy has been curated into a series of innovative exhibitions, disseminating its findings to a variety of stakeholders. These activities have rewritten the narrative of linguistic expression in Renaissance thought for both the general public and school pupils, and benefited host venues and libraries with a deeper understanding of their collections.

Venice and Aristotle (c. 1450–c. 1600): From Greek and Latin to the Vernacular (Venice: Museo Correr; 21 April–19 May 2016)

This exhibition, co-curated by Lines and Cotugno and praised as ‘a small miracle of communication’ (5.1), centred on Venice as a place of interlinguistic exchange as Aristotle’s works were translated into and read across multiple languages. It was the first Venetian exhibition on Aristotle since 1954 and brought together 41 manuscripts and printed works from two local collections that don’t often collaborate: the Biblioteca and the library of the Museo Correr. Over 28,238 people from across the world visited the exhibition (5.1), including those from North and South America, Europe, and Asia, who expressed their appreciation of the exhibition in the visitor’s book: ‘Finally I am able to view the works of Aristotle with my own eyes’. They described the exhibition as ‘very informative’, with an ‘excellent, clear approach to the story of Aristotle in Venice’ (5.2).

In addition to curating the exhibition, Lines also co-edited the bilingual exhibition catalogue (Venice and Aristotle), which framed the reading of Aristotle across languages; Marcianum Press printed 400 copies of the catalogue (5.3). The exhibition itself was introduced by section banners, individual descriptions and an introductory video, written and produced by Lines. Lines also offered a guided tour for 35 school pupils and their teachers (from the Liceo Linguistico Santa Caterina da Siena in Mestre, 22 April 2016), and reinforced its findings by revisiting this school in May 2017. Comments indicated increased awareness of the translation of philosophical ideas into the vernacular; one pupil stated ‘I did not think that there had been such a strong push to find a common language’ (5.4).

Lines’ work enabled the Library of the Museo Correr to better understand its collection of translated philosophical works. The director of the library stated that the exhibition ‘allowed our Library to reach noteworthy scientific results, with regard to our knowledge both of individual volumes and of their cultural relationship with the entire collection of early printed and manuscript books’ (5.5). In particular, she noted that preparations for the exhibition had allowed her staff to identify approximately 60 previously uncatalogued Aristotelian works in their collection, including an extremely rare 1557 edition of Antonio Brucioli’s translation of *On the Soul* and to more precisely date one manuscript. Lines’ research also informed the conservation status of items in the collection, and identified particular volumes for restoration. In particular, the library were able to reconstruct part of a missing title page of a 1535 translation of Aristotle’s *Nicomachean Ethics* (5.5).

QR codes steered visitors to the AHRC project’s database of Aristotelian works in the Italian vernacular (3.1). This database has been of considerable interest also to librarians and to

cataloguing projects internationally, and specifically to EDIT16, the standard metacatalogue of works printed in Italy in the sixteenth century: the concise EDIT16 records now include links (where relevant) to the team's *Vernacular Aristotelianism in Renaissance Italy* database, where more extended information about specific works or editions is supplied.

The exhibition offered audiences the opportunity to engage with research that has previously seemed difficult to access in innovative and engaging ways, deepening their understanding of the time period, vernacular philosophy, and how books and languages transmit the culture of the past. It has brought new visitors to the Museo Correr, increasing their audience, as well as providing them with the opportunity to better understand their collection and increase the knowledge and expertise of their staff.

All in All: The Conceptual World of the Mystical Philosophers Jacob Böhme / Alles in Allem: Die Gedankenwelt des mystischen Philosophen Jacob Böhme (25th August – 19th November 2017)

Following on from the exhibition work of Lines and Cotugno, Muratori, along with Lucinda Martin (University of Erfurt) and Claudia Brink (Staatliche Kunstsammlungen Dresden), curated an exhibition about the work of philosopher Jacob Böhme held in Chapel of the Castle at the Dresden State Art Collections (SKD). Muratori's scholarship on Böhme's legacy, and her emphasis on his philosophical (rather than mystical or religious) ideas, informed the exhibition's emphasis on Böhme's conceptual work and its articulation across languages. Approximately 30,000 visitors attended, large numbers of whom found the exhibition through extensive press coverage in national newspapers (including *Süddeutsche Zeitung* (readership: 1,240,000, circulation: 349,766) and *Die Zeit* (readership: 2,287,000, circulation: 498,439), magazines and radio programmes (5.6).

Like Lines' exhibition, this one welcomed visitors from all over the world, including Mongolia, Brazil, USA, and Europe (including the UK). Comments in the Visitors' Book demonstrated the contemporary resonance of Böhme's ideas: 'This is what the world needs: eternal truths. I particularly like: "You are what you live. Be an angel"; "Real Christians do not engage in war"—impressive insight' (5.7).

The exhibition was accompanied by a rich programme of outreach events, including: 20 free guided tours for the general public, special tours for schools (in German and in English), concerts, philosophical workshops with children and dance performances. Muratori co-wrote the text for the audio guide, as well as for the free app 'All in All. Jacob Böhme – SKD'. She led two guided tours and gave a public talk on Böhme's conception of evil. This was the first time that the Chapel of the Castle had been used as an exhibition space, and the striking floor designed for it featuring Böhme's 'Philosophical Sphere', has been retained even after closure.

The City Council in Görlitz (Böhme's home town) is debating whether to permanently house the Alles in Allem exhibition as the focal point of a potential heritage centre dedicated to Böhme in the city's Dreifaltigkeitskirche. The Council have voted to commission a draft plan, and will make a final decision once this has been produced. If it goes ahead, supporters hope that the heritage centre would attract and educate visitors to learn about Böhme and the city, as well as ensuring the conservation of the Church building (5.6).

'Light in Darkness: The Mystical Philosophy of Jacob Böhme' exhibition in Coventry (Coventry Cathedral, April-July 2019)

Muratori co-curated a further exhibition devoted to Böhme's ideas, their linguistic articulation, and their British reception, held in Coventry Cathedral. A key impact of the exhibition was the opportunity it provided to collaborate and celebrate 60 years of partnership between Dresden and Coventry (both devastated in World War II), and the broader need for reconciliation and connection, particularly, as one exhibition visitor commented, 'at a crucial time for European history' (5.8). Muratori's research emphasised Böhme's influence on British writers, highlighting

the shared heritage of Germany and Britain. The Dean of Coventry Cathedral described how the exhibition and partnership between the two cities has 'a real positive benefit in terms of people's awareness that differences and divisions can be overcome' (5.9).

This exhibition was innovative in its centring on ideas and the forms of their linguistic and figurative expression rather than objects. Muratori and her co-curators incorporated Böhme's ideas into the space itself, including the use of light and darkness, and using a drawing by Böhme's contemporary, Robert Fludd as a customised floor design in the circular chapel. The exhibition catalogue *Light in Darkness*, co-edited by Muratori, reflected the philosophical nature of the exhibition, and was likewise organised around themes rather than objects. The catalogue featured material in both English and German, underlining the international aspects of Böhme's legacy and the importance of (mis)translations as his work reached Britain. A review of the catalogue said that it was 'ideally suited to remember one of the most important German philosophers of the early modern period, who deserves to be granted a permanent place in the cultural memory of Germany and of all Europeans' (5.10).

Muratori's focus on Böhme's philosophical ideas and their expression across languages as the centre of the exhibition allowed visitors and the Cathedral to reflect on their own beliefs. The Dean stated that the ideas explored in Böhme's philosophy matched his own programme of embracing 'a wide variety of perspectives', with Böhme's work stretching 'the boundaries of orthodox Christianity' (5.9).

The exhibition offered 23 events, including a conference, several curators' talks, and 20 tours offered by student guides personally trained by Muratori. On feedback cards, visitors stated their enthusiasm for having learnt about Jacob Böhme, and expressed their interest in expanding their knowledge about him. Topics that visitors found particularly striking were the presence of male and female aspects in the Divine, religious tolerance, and the importance of nature for theology (5.8). The review by the Quaker magazine 'The Friend' (circulation: 10,000), commented that 'philosophical approaches that encompass opposing viewpoints may...be needed now more than ever' (5.10).

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

1. Factual statements by the Director of the Marciana Library (6 July 2016 and 14 July 2016) (in Italian)
2. Comments left by visitors on register of Aristotle exhibition in Venice (some comments in Italian)
3. Data on number of exhibition catalogues sold (in Italian)
4. Questionnaires from schoolchildren (in Italian)
5. Factual statement by Director of the Library, Museo Correr (September 2016) (in Italian)
6. Visitor Numbers and Media coverage of Böhme exhibition in Dresden (includes some articles in German)
7. Comments left by visitors on register of Böhme exhibition in Dresden (in German)
8. Feedback Cards (exhibition 'Light in Darkness')
9. Interview with the Dean of Coventry Cathedral (exhibition 'Light in Darkness')
10. Exhibition and Catalogue Reviews (IFB and The Friend) (includes one article in German)