

<b>Institution:</b> University of Oxford		
<b>Unit of Assessment:</b> 21 Sociology		
<b>Title of case study:</b> Influencing government policy and social initiatives to promote social integration of ethnic minorities in England		
<b>Period when the underpinning research was undertaken:</b> 2000-2019		
<b>Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:</b>		
<b>Name(s):</b>	<b>Role(s) (e.g. job title):</b>	<b>Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:</b>
Anthony Heath	Professor of Sociology Director of the Centre for Social Investigation, Nuffield College Senior Research Fellow, CSI	1 Sept 1999 – 30 April 2014 1 Oct 2014 – 31 Aug 2019
Lindsay Richards	Researcher	1 Sept 2019 – Present
Stephen Fisher	Associate Professor	1 Nov 2018 – Present
Valentina Di Stasio	Researcher	01 Oct 2002 - Present Sept 2016 - Sept 2018
<b>Period when the claimed impact occurred:</b> 2014-30 September 2020		
<b>Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014?</b> N		
<b>1. Summary of the impact</b> (indicative maximum 100 words)		
<p>Research into different dimensions of the social integration of ethnic minorities in Britain undertaken by the University of Oxford's Centre for Social Investigation (CSI), based in Nuffield College, has been a major influence on the government's Social Integration Strategy, as laid out in its <i>Integrated Communities Strategy Paper</i> (2018) and its subsequent Action Plan. The <i>Integrated Communities Action Plan</i>, published in 2019, outlined 70 actions it will deliver to promote integration and is funded by GBP50,000,000 provided by the Ministry for Housing, Communities and Local Government (MHCLG). This has the potential to improve the social and economic opportunities for people of all ethnic minorities living in England.</p>		
<b>2. Underpinning research</b> (indicative maximum 500 words)		
<p>The work of the Centre for Social Investigation (CSI), established in 2014 under the leadership of Professor Anthony Heath, takes a multidimensional approach to the study of structural, social and political aspects of social integration and explores the drivers of integration (or its lack).</p>		
<b>Cross-National Studies on Structural Integration</b>		
<p>Professor Heath has led two major cross-national studies of ethnic disadvantages in education and the labour market [R1, R2]. The contributions to these two studies were based on standardized and harmonised multivariate analyses, investigating whether minorities experienced 'ethnic penalties' (a concept originally introduced by Heath and now standard currency in academic and policy research). These cross-national studies showed that minorities, especially the children of non-white immigrants, experience a range of disadvantages, both in education and in the labour market. Key insights were that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ethnic disadvantage persists among the children of migrants and cannot be attributed solely to migration-related processes, such as lack of fluency in the language of the destination country, lack of destination-country qualifications or work experience</li> <li>- A particular field of disadvantage is unemployment, with minorities being unable to translate educational successes into success in finding work</li> </ul> <p>Follow-up research explored the drivers of this ethnic disadvantage. Particular foci of Heath's research have been on processes of selective migration from origin countries [R2], on the interplay between religion and ethnicity [R3], and on the extent and implications of discrimination in the labour market against ethno-religious groups.</p>		
<b>Field experiments on discrimination</b>		
<p>A major strand of Heath's work has been to investigate the role of employer discrimination [R4]. As part of a Horizon2020 cross-national project, Heath and Di Stasio undertook a new set of field experiments, sending matched applications from white British, white minority and a range of non-white minorities to advertised vacancies. The results showed persistent discrimination with a</p>		

strong racial character, discrimination against white minorities being relatively modest whilst that against minorities of Black Caribbean, Black African or Pakistani background was much more substantial and of broadly similar magnitude to that found in a series of previous British field experiments going back to 1969.

### **EMBES Study on Political and Social Integration (2009-2013)**

The foundation of this Oxford-led study [R5] was a major survey of ethnic minority political attitudes and behaviour in Britain (the Ethnic Minority British Election Survey 2010, hereafter EMBES). Funded by the ESRC, and rated as 'outstanding' in the ESRC's evaluation, Heath was PI, with co-investigators Steve Fisher (Oxford), Maria Sobolewska (Manchester), David Sanders (Essex) and Gemma Rosenblatt (Electoral Commission).

The EMBES study was based on a large representative probability sample of the five main ethnic minority groups in Britain and was designed in tandem with the concurrent main British Election Survey of which Prof Sanders was also PI, thus enabling rigorous comparison between minorities and white British. Key insights were:

- The diversity between ethnic minorities in Britain and their varying levels of integration on different dimensions of integration.
- That all the main minorities demonstrate generational progress with respect to integration, albeit from very different starting points.
- The links between different dimensions of integration such as labour market integration, social mixing, political participation and national identification.
- That perceptions of how one is treated by mainstream institutions are major drivers of integration.

Insights from this study, which were elucidated and expanded further in Heath's work on Muslim integration, also explored perceptions of discrimination, both against the individual and against the groups to which he/she belongs [R5, R6]:

- Perceptions of individual discrimination are even more frequent among 'second generation' children of migrants than they are among 'first generation' migrants.
- Feeling that one's group is a victim of discriminatory treatment is a more powerful driver of non-electoral political action, and of the retention of an ethnic identity, than is the perception that one has been a victim individually.

### **3. References to the research** (indicative maximum of six references)

- R1.** Heath, Anthony F and Sin-Yi Cheung (eds) (2007) *Unequal Chances: Ethnic Minorities in Western Labour Markets*. Proceedings of the British Academy. Oxford: OUP for the British Academy. <http://doi.org/10.5871/bacad/9780197263860.001.0001> [output type: B]
- R2.** Heath, Anthony F and Yael Brinbaum (eds) (2014) *Unequal Attainments: Ethnic Educational Inequalities in Ten Western Countries*. Proceedings of the British Academy 196. Oxford: OUP for the British Academy. <http://doi.org/10.5871/bacad/9780197265741.001.0001> [output type: B]
- R3.** Heath, Anthony and Jean Martin (2013) Can religious affiliation explain 'ethnic' inequalities in the labour market? *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 36 (6): 1005-1027. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2012.657660> [output type: D]
- R4.** Heath, Anthony F and Valentina Di Stasio (2019) Racial Discrimination in the British Labour Market, *British Journal of Sociology*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-4446.12676> [output type: D]
- R5.** Heath, A F, Stephen Fisher, Gemma Rosenblatt, David Sanders and Maria Sobolewska (2013) *The Political Integration of Ethnic Minorities in Britain*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. [output type: A – available on request]
- R6.** Heath, A.F (2013), 'Muslim integration and disadvantage', in David Feldman and Ben Gidley (eds) *Integration, Disadvantage and Extremism: Essays arising from a symposium held at the House of Commons*. Oxford: Compas. <https://esrc.ukri.org/files/news-events-and-publications/evidence-briefings/integration-disadvantage-and-extremism/> [output type: C]

Two major grants contributed to this body of research:

'British Election Study Ethnic Minority Survey' [R5, R6], ESRC grant, June 2009-Sept 2010, GBP1,039,470 (PI: Anthony Heath).

'Ethno-Religious Diversity & Social Trust' [R3, R6], Leverhulme, Feb 2009 – May 2016, GBP1,008,234 (PI: Anthony Heath).

#### 4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

The academic research of Professor Heath and his team contributed to government policy-making on social integration and was instrumental to shaping the Integrated Communities Action Plan announced February 2019.

##### **Influencing Government Policy: The Integrated Communities Strategy Green Paper (2018)**

The 2018 Integrated Strategies Green Paper and its subsequent consultation, which was underpinned by the Casey Review, All Party Parliamentary Group (APPG) report and the British Academy publications, all drew heavily on Heath's research and fed into the government's Integrated Communities Action Plan.

Based on Heath's body of work on Social Inequality and Integration [R1-6], Professor Heath and his doctoral student, Magda Borkowska, were commissioned in early 2016 to draft a report for DCLG (now MHCLG) entitled 'Integration Gaps and their Socio-Economic Consequences' [C1]. This report reviewed existing academic and government research, including Heath's own research, and was particularly important for highlighting the different nature of the integration gaps faced by different ethnic and gender groups (especially the different but severe problems faced by Muslim women and by young black men [R3]). The report was circulated within DCLG and Heath also had meetings to discuss the research with the DCLG team and the responsible Minister (Lord Bourne). The report, together with Heath's personal input, according to the Director for Analysis and Data within the MHCLG, *'helped policy and analyst teams working on the Government's Integrated Communities Strategy Green Paper [2018, C3], the subsequent Action Plan and the Community Strategy paper [C8]... His analysis also supported Dame Louise Casey's review [C4] of integration and opportunity in Britain' [C2]*.

The written and oral evidence Heath and his team submitted to the Casey review, an independent review on integration, was highlighted in its subsequent report [2016, C4, pp.55-6, 99; R4-6], particularly his insights into the variations in socio-economic integration between different ethnic and faith groups, and by age and gender, and these themes were picked up in the subsequent Green Paper [C3].

In August 2017 the APPG for Social Integration published a report, entitled 'Integration not Demonisation', which concluded the cross-party group's inquiry into the integration of immigrants. Professor Heath and Lindsay Richards provided both written and oral evidence to the APPG in October 2016 and their research on diversity and integration [R5-6] was discussed in both the APPG interim and final reports [C5]. Recommendations made in the reports reflected CSI research findings, particularly regarding the importance of economically empowering immigrants [R1, R2; C5, p.45]. Consequently, the report encouraged the government to *'examine how well existing mainstream employment and skills provision serves the needs of different immigrant communities'* and suggested that employers be incentivised to promote integration in the workplace [C5a, p.9]. It was also recommended that a *'new national immigrant integration strategy should differentiate between, and include, policies shaped to reflect the needs and circumstances of different categories of immigrants'* [R2, R3, R5; C5a, pp.10-11]. Lastly, Heath's emphasis on the importance of language fluency [R1, R2; C5a, p.10] fed into the report's call for compulsory English classes as *'language can be the greatest barrier to accessing all levels of society, including the job market and contact with local community groups, citing that as many as 800,000 immigrants have poor or no proficiency of English language'* [C5a, p.65].

Sajid Javid MP, the then Secretary of State for Housing, Communities and Local Government, confirmed in Parliament that the APPG's report had *'helped me and my team in the development of the (social integration) strategy'* laid out in the Green Paper on social integration which, as Chuka Umunna observed during a House of Commons debate, *'incorporates many of the recommendations of the APPG report'* [C6].

The Greater London Authority's 2018 strategy for social integration document, entitled 'All of Us' [C7] drew heavily on the APPG report. In applying the APPG's recommendations to specific

projects, plans were made for the funding of a range of initiatives which directly relate to some of the key themes emphasised by Heath's research, including:

- The launch of an English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) Plus programme, which has resulted in over GBP200,000 allotted to fund pilot projects in and around the City of London which seek to overcome barriers to Londoners learning English [R1, R2; C7, p.64].
- The Workforce Integration Network (WIN – launched May 2018) aimed at improving pathways into employment for under-represented groups, especially young black men [C7, pp.50-1]. Across 2018-19/2019-2020 WIN was allocated a total budget of GBP330,000, and has an approved budget of GBP380,000 for 2020/21. From its inception until 17 September 2020 over 100 businesses have engaged with the programme on the issue of under-representation of young black men in the workplace, and over 1,000 under-represented young people have engaged with the programme [R4; C8].
- Recommendations regarding the effective use of anti-discrimination legislation in the final APPG report, which were built on Heath's research [R6, C5b p.45], were reflected in the establishment of an Online Hate Crime Hub, aimed at improving the investigative response to hate crime. Between its launch in March 2017 and November 2019 it dealt with over 1,600 cases [R4, C9].

The British Academy undertook a study of social integration and invited Professor Heath to be the academic lead. This work involved both local and national stakeholders, including the MHCLG [C2] and resulted in two main publications: an essay collection by academics and practitioners [C10] and a collection of case studies on 'The integration of migrants, refugees and asylum seekers', which had examples of successful locally-based initiatives [C10a]. Heath launched these publications in December 2017 on behalf of the Academy at Westminster, alongside Chuka Umunna MP (the chair of the APPG) and Lord Bourne. The reports received widespread media coverage and were extensively quoted in the government's Integrated Communities Strategy Green paper, stating: '*We welcome the British Academy's recent publication of a collection of case studies and examples of successful local integration initiatives, and we have highlighted some further examples in this strategy*' [C3, p.12]. MHCLG's Director for Analysis and Data further added that '*...this report has informed discussions with local authority areas developing tailored responses to specific social integration challenges*' [C2].

### **Policy Implementation - The Integrated Communities Action Plan (February 2019)**

The 2018 Integrated Strategies Green Paper established the government's vision for integrated communities, and the subsequent action plan outlined the plan for its implementation. Published by the MHCLG, the Action Plan outlined 70 actions, backed by GBP50,000,000 from the MHCLG for a range of initiatives across the UK to improve integration [C11]. These actions include increasing access to English language learning, strengthening local leadership and providing better support and information to people who are new to the UK. One of the main themes of the Action Plan is that integration is a two-way street – '*local residents share a responsibility to welcome newcomers to their communities, including migrants, and provide the environment and opportunities for them to take part in community life that will enable effective integration*' [C11, p.9], thus reflecting a key tenet of Heath's research [R5].

### **Local Impact – Integrated Communities**

The Action Plan also made provision for a GBP3,000,000 Integrated Communities Innovation Fund which has funded 16 projects across the country, '*from a 'community gardening project in south-west London that helps new migrants to practice their English language skills while learning how to cultivate land, to table tennis clubs to be run across 3 housing estates in Brighton*' [C13]. Delivered in partnership with Sport England, the fund was envisioned to engage 70,000 people with activities in schools, community and leisure centres.

Local integration plans are being rolled out in five pilot areas, identified in the Integrated Communities Green Paper [C3] - Blackburn with Darwen, Bradford, Peterborough [C12], Walsall and Waltham Forest. Walsall implemented the 'Walsall for All' programme, funding a number of initiatives, such as the 'Black Country Impact Project', designed to address high levels of youth unemployment, especially those at risk of social exclusion or from marginalised communities [C12a]. Blackburn with Darwen's 'Our Community, Our Future' programme has a number of

projects underway, including a Youth Ambassador's programme, 'to equip young people with the skills they need to become leaders in their local communities', and Community Voices and Youth Voices events to give people 'across the borough an opportunity to take part in discussions that will help break down any barriers between people from diverse backgrounds' [C12b]. In 2019, Peterborough created a GBP300,000 Communities Fund; a total of 24 awards (from 128 applications) were made to local initiatives aimed at bringing together communities. Projects supported included an eight month basketball programme for 6-9 year olds with mixed abilities, a community garden to grow food for the local community of Dogsthorpe and provide community space for the public and local groups, and the Gladstone Bilingual Community project – a community café and club designed to bring multilingual communities together [C12c].

*'Professor Heath's work on social integration has been important in looking at connections across different policy areas, such as English Language training, employment, social mixing and civic engagement. This has helped build and structure the evidence base which has gone on to inform policy decisions over the years on social integration.'* Director for Analysis and Data, MHCLG [C2].

#### 5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

C1 – 'Integration Gaps and their Socio-Economic Consequences' report (2016).

C2 – Letter – Director for Analysis and Data, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government (MHCLG)

C3 – Integrated Communities Strategy (2018) Green Paper

C4 – The Casey Review Report

C5 – 'Integration Not Demonisation' Final Report (Aug 2017) and [C5a] the APPG Interim Report (Jan 2017)

C6 – Chuka Umunna MP, HoC Debate (14 March 2018) vol. 637 col. 897. Available at <https://hansard.parliament.uk/commons/2018-03-14/debates/82A7B968-89D4-49F8-B5C8-552C4C4237E4/IntegratedCommunities#897>

C7 – Mayor of London, All of Us: The Mayor's Strategy for Social Integration

C8 – Questions to the Mayor of London, answered 17<sup>th</sup> September, 2020 -

<https://www.theyworkforyou.com/london/?id=2020-09-17.2795.h> and

<https://www.theyworkforyou.com/london/?id=2020-09-17.2796.h>

C9 – Questions to the Mayor of London, 1<sup>st</sup> November 2019 -

[www.theyworkforyou.com/london/?id=2019-11-01.14378.h&s=speaker%3A25761](http://www.theyworkforyou.com/london/?id=2019-11-01.14378.h&s=speaker%3A25761)

C10 – British Academy – "If You Could Do One Thing": 10 Local Actions to Promote Social Integration' Essays and (C10a) Case Studies

C11 – Integrated Communities Action Plan (Feb 2019)

C12 – 'Belonging Together' – Peterborough's Integration Plan (2019)

a) 'Walsall for All: Our Vision for integrated communities' (January 2019).

b) Peterborough Communities Fund website detailing awards made by the fund.

<https://www.peterborough.gov.uk/residents/communities-fund#communities-fund-----winning-bids-1-2>

c) 'Walsall for All: Our vision for integrated and welcoming communities' (January 2019)

C13 – HM Government Press Release (20 May 2019): 'Tens of thousands to benefit from Integrated Communities Innovation Fund' <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/tens-of-thousands-to-benefit-from-integrated-communities-innovation-fund>