

<b>Institution:</b> University of Edinburgh		
<b>Unit of Assessment:</b> Education (23)		
<b>Title of case study:</b> Enhancing racial and linguistic equality in education – Scotland and wider UK		
<b>Period when the underpinning research was undertaken:</b> 2012 – 2018		
<b>Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:</b>		
<b>Name(s):</b>	<b>Role(s) (e.g. job title):</b>	<b>Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:</b>
Professor Rowena Arshad CBE	Chair in Multicultural and Anti-Racist Education including role as Head of Moray House School of Education (2013-2019)	1991 – 2020 (Chair); October 2020 – present (Professor Emerita)
Dr Yvonne Foley	Senior Lecturer	2008 – present
<b>Period when the claimed impact occurred:</b> 1 January 2014 – 31 December 2020		
<b>Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014?</b> No		
<b>1. Summary of the impact</b>  <p>While the total number of Scottish pupils has remained relatively constant, the diversity of the pupil population has changed. In 2010, there were 33,929 pupils recorded as not white and this rose to 57,859 in 2019. The number of languages spoken in Scotland in 2010 was 136 and this rose to 154 languages in 2019. The number of pupils whose main home language is not English also increased from 28,610 in 2010 to 61,818 in 2019.</p> <p>The University of Edinburgh's Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland (CERES) has analysed the effects of Scotland's predominantly white, monolingual teaching workforce being out of step with these changes. Research led by CERES Co-Directors Arshad and Foley informed and shaped Scottish educational policy through the Race Equality Framework for Scotland by providing a rationale for increasing ethnic diversity in the teaching profession. By working to strengthen both policy and practice, Arshad and Foley have enhanced the capacity of teachers across Scotland and the wider UK to promote racial and linguistic understanding in their teaching.</p>		
<b>2. Underpinning research</b>  <p>Research from CERES indicates that race equality is a marginalised concept within school education in Scotland and the wider UK, and that much more needs to be done to support racially and linguistically diverse learners (3.1).</p> <p>Foley's work found that the needs of English as an additional language (EAL) learners across Scotland are not being met sufficiently, and it evidenced some teachers' assumptions that those who do not speak English as a first language are less able, since these teachers erroneously conflate EAL and additional support needs (3.2). Subsequent collaborative research (in which Arshad led on interviewing young people and other stakeholders) reveals high levels of misrecognition of brown-skinned pupils who are mistaken as Muslims (3.3). This misunderstanding negatively impacts on pupils' experiences of support and participation, which also affects their sense of belonging within school communities. The research also showed that teachers often do not recognise BME pupils as experiencing racist and exclusionary social practices both inside and outside of school (3.3).</p>		

CERES research demonstrates teachers' perceptions of race equality differ from those of parents and pupils from BME and EAL backgrounds. Teachers are mostly unaware of the lived experiences of such pupils, parents and communities since they view themselves as fair, inclusive and doing well in the area of race equality (3.2, 3.3, 3.4). Resulting from these different perspectives, the research calls for increasing teacher awareness of linguistic, ethnic and religious diversity.

Despite the existence of national, local authority and school-level policies in Scotland and England to combat discrimination and promote inclusion, Arshad and Foley suggest that teachers are inadequately prepared with the vocabulary and strategies to meet the needs of increasingly racially and linguistically diverse pupil cohorts (3.2, 3.3, 3.5, 3.6). In particular, the research (3.2, 3.5, 3.6) calls for more consistent practices across Scottish schools to support and include children with varying English language abilities, and to move away from deficit models to instead value pupils' diversity while integrating their cultural and linguistic resources into educational experiences.

CERES' work also demonstrates that young people would like to see far more explicit recognition and discussion of issues of race and a greater understanding of how this impacts on their security and experiences in school and in the community (3.3, 3.4). This again suggests the need for more effective initial teacher education programmes and continuing professional development opportunities to improve teachers' literacy, skills, and ability to meet the needs of racially and linguistically diverse learners.

### 3. References to the research

3.1 Arshad, R., Wrigley, T. and Pratt, L. (2012). *Social Justice Re-examined: Dilemmas and Solutions for the Classroom Teacher*. London: Trentham Books Ltd (Can be supplied by HEI on request).

3.2 Foley, Y., Sangster, P. and Anderson, C. (2013). Examining EAL Policy and Practice in Mainstream Schools. *Language and Education*, 27(3), pp. 191-206.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2012.687747>

3.3 Hopkins, P., Botterill, K., Sanghera, G. & Arshad, R. (2017). Encountering misrecognition: Being mistaken for being Muslim. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*. 107(4), pp. 934-948. <https://doi.org/10.1080/24694452.2016.1270192>

3.4 Botterill, K., Hopkins, P., Sanghera, G and Arshad, R. (2016). Securing disunion: Young people's nationalism, identities and (in)securities in the campaign for an independent Scotland. *Political Geography*, 55, pp. 124-134. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2016.09.002>

3.5 Anderson, C., Sangster, P., Foley, Y. and Crichton, H. (2017). How effectively are mainstream teachers prepared to meet the needs of learners for whom English is an additional language? In: Florian, L., and Pantić, N. (Eds.) *Teacher education for the changing demographics of schooling*. Dordrecht: Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-54389-5\\_8](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-54389-5_8)

3.6 Foley, Y., Anderson, C., Conteh, J. and Hancock, J. (2018). *Initial Teacher Education and EAL*. Cambridge: The Bell Foundation Commissioned Report (Can be supplied by HEI on request).

### 4. Details of the impact

Arshad and Foley have championed racial and linguistic understanding among teachers and promoted diversity in the UK teaching profession, which enhances the educational experiences of all learners and especially racially and linguistically diverse pupils. Their

research has had impact on Scottish educational policy and improved the capacity of the profession in the UK and the US to enact more inclusive teaching practices.

### 1. Advanced race and linguistic equality in Scottish education policy

Scotland's independent Race Equality Framework Adviser, Kaliani Lyle, drew on Arshad's work (3.1, 3.4) in the 2017 report *Addressing Race Inequality in Scotland: The Way Forward* [5.1]. Lyle said: "[Arshad's] advice gave the education section... an authority that was essential in... getting heard by the Scottish Government" [5.2]. In particular, Arshad's research (3.1) highlighted the low levels of awareness of teacher educators and teachers on race matters as a lack of diversity in the teaching workforce is a persistent issue needing coordinated action. This research contributed to informing recommendations of the Race Equality Action Plan 2017-2021 (particularly recommendations related to staff and staffing) and influenced the Scottish Government's Strategic Board for Teacher Education to set up a "Teaching for a Diverse Scotland" working group. Scotland's Deputy First Minister then asked Arshad to chair that independent group to explore how to increase the number of BME teachers in Scotland. The group's 2018 report, *Teaching in a Diverse Scotland: Increasing and Retaining Minority Ethnic Teachers*, included 17 vital proposals to:

- raise awareness of everyday racism and bias in education,
- make teaching careers more attractive to BME students, and
- improve support for teachers who experience discrimination or harassment [5.3A].

The Scottish Government has committed to implement all of the report's recommendations [5.4]. In June 2019, the Deputy First Minister asked Arshad to continue to chair the working group to take the recommendations forward, stating: *"These recommendations will undoubtedly create a greater awareness of race equality across the education sector, and ensure greater impact of the Race Equality Framework for Scotland"* [5.5A].

In November 2020, the Deputy First Minister described how diversifying the teaching profession to include more minority ethnic teachers has been included as an important area of the Programme for Government (PfG), noting: *"The working group are currently offering their advice to Scottish Government on what the PfG commitment might potentially look like in terms of tangible and meaningful action"* [5.5B]. He described the *"notable progress of the working group"*. The progress in 2019 and 2020 included teacher recruitment, development, and leadership [5.3B]:

- The General Teaching Council for Scotland (GTCS) updated its professional standards for teachers to include explicit reference to equality – including race – issues (section 3.3). The Council Chief Executive said this change *"...will impact directly on the lives and practice of almost 76000 registrants... on the GTC Scotland register and all future students and teachers..."* [5.6].
- The role of monitoring for ethnic diversity of the teaching workforce is now embedded into the Scottish Government's Teacher Workforce Planning Advisory Group, whose key remit is to ensure sufficient teachers within the overall workforce.
- City of Glasgow Council have engaged in positive action in meeting new recruitment targets for BME individuals to take on early childcare positions. They recruited 40 BME staff who were appointed in August 2020 to join the early years workforce.
- A national mentoring network for BME teachers has been established by the Scottish Association of Minority Ethnic Educators, in partnership with Education. Scotland.
- The West of Scotland Teaching Education Partnership (covering 8 local authorities) offered a secondment to a BME teacher to develop online resources for teachers to raise awareness of how everyday racism occurs in the education sector.
- All local authority probationer handbooks will, from August 2021, include references on how probationer teachers can report bullying and harassment, including racial harassment. The working group discovered that not all handbooks included this.
- All Teacher Leadership programmes in Scotland offered via Education Scotland and initial teacher education (ITE) providers are, from August 2020, including explicit

information about how everyday racism occurs within school and education settings. This directly relates to Arshad's research findings indicating that improved racial literacy of teachers and teacher managers was required (3.1, 3.3, 3.4) and affects approximately 700 school leaders each year starting programmes from 2020/21.

Furthermore, the Deputy First Minister stated: *"Professor Arshad has also engaged with Directors of Education and University Principals and Heads of School to galvanise action"* [5.5B] including setting out concrete approaches and strategies to diversify and enhance the impact of ITE programmes that should reflect Scotland's diverse population. Examples include the following [5.3B]:

- For the first time in Scotland, baseline data is being collected about BME applications and completion rates for ITE programmes. In 2020, each ITE provider was asked to identify clear action areas it will take to help meet the target of 4% of the overall Scottish teacher workforce being BME by 2030.
- The Scottish Council of Deans of Education (SCDE) approved a new entry Memorandum in 2019 that clearly states that all ITE providers should mitigate against institutional barriers and conscious and unconscious bias throughout the recruitment and selection procedures. The SCDE facilitates consistent approaches to support ITE providers' work in this area.
- The GTCS issued guidance in 2020 for use in ITE programme and placement handbooks, providing clear advice to student teachers on the support they can access if they experience racial and other forms of discrimination and harassment. This commitment will apply to all handbooks published from 2020/21.
- The GTCS agreed in 2020 to ask each Scottish ITE provider at accreditation and re-accreditation events how the provider is enabling students to acknowledge and consider how their positionality and identity shapes their thinking and practice. They have also committed to ensuring that the next iteration of ITE accreditation documentation will explicitly address positionality. Scotland is the first country that we are aware of in Europe to require this of their teacher education providers.

The Deputy First Minister noted this work: *"While numbers of minority ethnic teachers in schools are increasing, there is still much to be done and I am grateful to Professor Arshad for her leadership in driving forward actions which will help us achieve this aim"* [5.5B].

## **2. Action on race and linguistic equality in teaching practice in Scotland and the wider UK**

Research on EAL learners' experience in Scottish education (3.2) led the National Association for Language Development in the Curriculum (NALDIC) to invite Foley to chair the organisation between 2013 and 2015 [5.7]. As the UK's only national subject association for EAL teaching and learning, NALDIC produces resources and organises practice-based development opportunities for teachers. Current NALDIC Chair Dr Victoria Murphy stated: *"The impact of her [Foley's] work as Chair of NALDIC was evidenced as she worked in partnership as a resources specialist with the British Council to design a website for English as an additional language which provides teachers with updated information and practical teaching strategies for supporting EAL learners (EAL Nexus, 2014)"* [5.7]. Furthermore, Foley secured an agreement whereby *"NALDIC would be part of the training of Ofsted [English school] Inspectors in order to better support the evaluation process of schools and teachers. This has a key role to play as schools, inspectors and teachers seek to provide inclusive teaching and learning environments for multilingual pupils"* [5.7].

During Foley's leadership of NALDIC, the Bell Foundation charity asked her to develop training resources underpinning the "Language for Results" programme helping teachers across England better support EAL learners. Training sessions linked to this programme began in 2015 and *"continue to be delivered across the UK, where a large range of learners and teachers has been reached (130 training sessions, reaching approximately 10,200+ learners)"* [5.7]. The Bell Foundation's Head of Programme Quality explained, *"Foley was*



*instrumental in the development of the Foundation's Language for Results programme... Our courses continue to receive exceptional feedback from schools, with statistically significant evidence of impact on teacher practice" [5.8].*

Research findings and implications for practice were also disseminated at a series of professional development sessions offered from 2014-2020 in Scotland and attended by over 1,500 teachers, youth workers and education policy writers. In 2016, seminars based on Arshad's research (3.1, 3.4) benefitted Scottish teachers' practice by increasing their awareness of race. For example, findings on teachers' reluctance to discuss racism motivated one teacher to raise the issue with their students and *"I have already had some small discussions [about racism] with my group"* [5.9, p. 2 of the feedback]. Another participant said they were *"now more equipped to recognise the problems of misrecognition and act to fix them"* [5.9, p. 5].

In 2018, the Scottish Council of Deans of Education (SCDE) incorporated insights from Foley's research (3.5) into its National Languages Framework for all eight ITE university providers across Scotland. Foley transformed the framework from being one which focused only on the learning and teaching of foreign or modern languages into one that embraced the wider, multilingual, and multicultural world to include EAL and British Sign Language. SCDE's Co-Chair Dr Ingeborg Birnie stated: *"The transformative role Yvonne [Foley] plays impacts on all the ITE programmes across the eight university providers in Scotland and on the nearly 4000 entrants into the teaching profession every year in Scotland. The impact means that future teachers are guided in re-conceptualising multilingual learners in schools as valuable and precious rather than problematic"* [5.10]. This more inclusive conceptualisation of the role of language in education and society was underpinned by the values of equality and social justice.

## 5. Sources to corroborate the impact

5.1 *Addressing Race Inequality in Scotland: The Way Forward* (see p. 23 of the report, paragraph 54): <https://www.gov.scot/Publications/2017/12/9088/7>

5.2 Testimonial from Kaliani Lyle, Race Equality Framework Adviser

5.3 "Teaching for a Diverse Scotland" working group updates

A) *Teaching in a Diverse Scotland: Increasing and Retaining Minority Ethnic Teachers* (2018): <https://www.gov.scot/publications/teaching-diverse-scotland-increasing-retaining-minority-ethnic-teachers-scotlands-schools/pages/3/>

B) *Teaching in a Diverse Scotland: Increasing and Retaining Minority Ethnic Teachers* (Progress and Final Report 2021), evidencing progress made by 2020

5.4 Statement describing the Scottish Government Strategic Education Board's response to Arshad's Report, *Teaching in a Diverse Scotland*:

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/diversity-in-the-teaching-profession-minutes-index/>

5.5 Testimonials from John Swinney, Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, Scottish Government

A) June 2019 Testimonial

B) November 2020 Testimonial

5.6 Testimonial from Chief Executive, General Teaching Council for Scotland

5.7 Testimonial from Dr Victoria Murphy, Chair, NALDIC

5.8 Testimonial from Head of Programme Quality, The Bell Foundation

5.9 Feedback from professional development sessions on Racial Equality and Scottish School Education

5.10 Testimonial from Dr Ingeborg Birnie, Co-chair, Scottish Council of Deans of Education Languages Group