

<b>Institution:</b> City, University of London		
<b>Unit of Assessment:</b> Business & Management		
<b>Title of case study:</b> Global Advances in the Application of 'Expert Leadership'		
<b>Period when the underpinning research was undertaken:</b> 2007 - ongoing		
<b>Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:</b>		
<b>Name(s):</b>	<b>Role(s) (e.g. job title):</b>	<b>Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:</b>
Dr Amanda Goodall	Reader in Leadership	2012 - present
<b>Period when the claimed impact occurred:</b> 2013 - ongoing		
<b>Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014?</b> N		
<p><b>1. Summary of the impact</b></p> <p>Michael Gove famously claimed that the country has had enough of experts. Dr Goodall's work shows this is wrong. Organisations led and managed by core business experts outperform those that are not. Her 'expert leader' research has received global media exposure and she has given dozens of keynotes, such as Ontario Hospital Association, British Medical Association and Organization of Danish Medical Societies. It has generated public discussion, influenced leadership development and is changing attitudes about the importance of expertise in healthcare, schools, universities, politics and engineering where policies are changing as a result in US, Australia, India, UK and Denmark.</p>		
<p><b>2. Underpinning research</b></p> <p>Over the last thirty years two organisational shifts have occurred: first, although good management is recognised as important to performance, the pendulum has swung too far towards managerialism. Second, there has been a rise in the appointment of general managers, over technical experts, into key leadership positions. The case for 'expert leadership' suggests this move away from technical expertise is a mistake. Evidence supporting this premise comes from many different sectors and at different tiers of leadership, from CEO-to line managers and department heads. <b>[3.1-3.5]</b></p> <p>Dr Goodall was the first to show that the ranked position of a US hospital was higher when it was led by a medical doctor instead of a non-medically trained manager. The analysis found that hospital quality scores were approximately 25% higher in physician-run systems compared with those led by general managers <b>[3.3]</b>. The first evidence demonstrating a relationship between core business experts and organisational performance came from higher education. In US cross-sectional and UK longitudinal data, research-intensive universities were shown to improve in their performance (in the RAE) when led by Presidents who were themselves highly competent scholars <b>[3.1]</b>. The finding was replicated among Deans of business schools and academic Department Chairs.</p> <p>Goodall et al. also studied leadership in professional sports: in longitudinal data from 15,000 basketball games, those leaders who had been top players were associated with better team performance once becoming a coach, demonstrated by winning percentage and playoffs success <b>[3.4]</b>. Similarly, in Formula 1, Goodall et al. examined the performance of every team over six decades and showed that team principals with extensive racing experience were associated with better team performance as measured by obtaining podium positions <b>[3.5]</b>.</p> <p>The next step was to understand <i>why</i> and <i>how</i> core business experts seem to influence performance. Recent work uncovered a significant relationship between the prevalence of expert leaders and the job satisfaction and 'quit' intentions of followers. (Job</p>		

satisfaction is known to effect individual and organisational performance.) Within HE, faculty were more satisfied with their job and less likely to leave their university [3.2] when they reported that their Department Chair was a distinguished researcher. This finding has been discovered across a wide range of industries. In a random sample of 35,000 UK and US employees matched to their firms, the single strongest predictor of job satisfaction was the competence of the immediate supervisor. This was measured in three ways: if the supervisor could do the employees' job; if s/he worked their way up through the organisation or started it, and if employees perceived their supervisor to be competent [3.6]. In new research this finding has been replicated in four studies in four countries of medical doctors reporting on their line manager (also a doctor), including in one analysis using objective data to validate supervisors' clinical expertise.

Dr Goodall's research suggests that expert leaders have this influence on employees through their management practices and the work environment they create [3.2]. An offered explanation is that leaders who are technical experts share with their subordinates' the same values and belief systems, skills, preferences and strategies which informs their behaviour.

### 3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

[3.1] Goodall, A.H. 2009 Highly cited leaders and the performance of research universities. Research Policy 38, 1079-1092.

[3.2] Bäker, A. & Goodall, A.H. 2020. Feline followers and "umbrella carriers": Department Chairs' influence on faculty job satisfaction and quit intentions. Research Policy, 49 (4): 103955.

[3.3] Goodall, A.H. 2011. Physician-leaders and hospital performance: Is there an association? Social Science and Medicine 73 (4), 535-539. Highly cited: 335 Google Scholar Citations, 170 citing articles (SCOPUS)

[3.4] Goodall, A.H., Kahn, L. & Oswald, A.J. 2011 Why Do Leaders Matter? A Study of Expert Knowledge in a Superstar Setting Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization 77 (2011) 265–284.

[3.5] Goodall, A.H. & Pogrebná, G. 2015 Expert Leaders in a Fast-Moving Environment, Leadership Quarterly 26 (2), 123-142.

[3.6] Artz, B., Goodall, A. H., & Oswald, A. J. 2017. Boss competence and worker well-being. Industrial and Labor Relations Review 70 (2), 419-450.

Research Research was published in journals that apply a stringent peer-review process prior to accepting articles for publication and have been consistently rated 4\* by the Chartered Association of Business Schools such as *Research Policy* (4\* AJG2018), *Social Science and Medicine* (4\* AJG2018), *Leadership Quarterly* (4\* AJG2018). Part of the research was supported by a research grant from the The Leverhulme Trust: Leadership, the work environment and scientific productivity, 2014. Grant Number: RPG-2014-020 Principal Investigator: Amanda Goodall. Funding value: GBP 65,000

### 4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Dr Goodall's focus is on leadership and organisational performance through her research, engagement and advocacy of the Theory of Expert Leadership. Her message – about the importance of experts in leadership and management – has achieved significant impact, particularly in the healthcare sector and across countries (US, Australia, Denmark, UK).

South Australia Mental Health Services used her work in 2014. The sector had worsening KPIs with acute psychiatric patients being denied access to hospital. The crisis climaxed with the suicide of a 15-year-old girl. Based on the Coroner's report, psychiatrists used Dr Goodall's research to change the debate and subsequent review of Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services [5.1]. The government recognised that renewed medical leadership was required to transform the sector. As a result, psychiatrists were returned to leadership positions in SA Mental Health [5.2], replacing non-clinical managers. The team responsible applied Dr Goodall's Theory of Expert Leadership to the £200 million mental health sector. As a result, waiting times for acute mental health patients were halved [5.2] and overcrowding in Emergency Departments reduced [5.3].

The body representing all doctors in Denmark, the Organisation of Danish Medical Societies (LSV), approached Dr Goodall when the government threatened changes to doctors' contracts because it believed they were unwilling to go into leadership. She was asked to give a keynote at LSV's Centenary conference, targeting medics, policy makers and politicians, to use her research to *"motivate doctors into becoming leaders"*. Prior to the event she and LSV surveyed the country's doctors: she found that doctors reported higher job satisfaction and lower quit intention when their line manager was perceived to be a strong clinician (the expert leader result). Second, the survey revealed that among respondents (#4,500), 70% said they were willing to lead, and importantly, they outlined their incentives and disincentives associated with a move into management [5.4]. Dr Goodall's contribution was hailed as influential and has been mentioned repeatedly in Scandinavian political and medical debates [5.5]. As a result, the LSV's Board of Directors formulated proposals such as *"the active recruitment and training of medical professionals to develop leadership talent for the Danish health care system"* [5.4]. Their policy changes came into effect in April 2019, recognising Dr Goodall's contribution [5.5].

In North America, CEO of The American Association for Physician Leadership, representing 10,000 doctors in 40 countries, said *"Dr Goodall's work is seminal and foundational as the industry attempts to better absorb and leverage the advantages of physician leadership. Health care is better as a result of the insights Dr. Goodall and her team provide"* [5.6]. This is mirrored in Canada where she has given several keynotes. The Executive Medical Director of Canadian Society of Physician Leaders said Dr Goodall has influenced the Canadian health system in two areas: through learning and education and in the application of her research leading to organisational change [5.7]. The Chairman of the Education Institute and senior pulmonary surgeon at the highly ranked Cleveland Clinic - with 220 outpatient locations, 18 hospitals, and 70,000 caregivers worldwide - stated *"[Dr Goodall's] work has been highly impactful in influencing thinking and enhancing the growing appetite to train physicians in leadership competencies."* [5.8].

Her work is also changing policies in the UK. Dr Steve Powis, National Medical Director of NHS England, on our TV screens throughout the pandemic, and the CEO & Medical Director of Faculty of Medical Leadership & Management, have acknowledged that her research has changed their thinking about medical leadership [5.19]. Dr Goodall was the only management scholar invited to a roundtable established by Dr Powis (for senior NHS leaders). As a result, the issue of expert leadership was raised at ministerial level with further action forthcoming in the NHS People Plan (ex. Clinical leadership by March 2021 p.29) [5.19]. Dr Powis said: *"[TEL] greatly influenced my thinking on medical leadership and my ongoing work to develop and strengthen this with partners such as the FMLM and NHS Leadership Academy"* [5.9]. The CEO of University College London Hospital concurs: *"As a result of Dr Goodall's research the thinking around appointing professional leaders in hospitals has dramatically changed and many centres have implemented these ideas... an example, the ... Shelford group of hospitals (10 leading UK academic medical institutions) have now appointed a (medical) consultant as their Chief Executive."* [5.10]. The strength of the Dr Goodall's work

is such that other experts have relied on it when providing evidence in parliament [5.11].

The research has also influenced third party policy work and it continues to spread to new sectors. For example: In education, the Executive Director of the government created Ambition Institute said: *"We provide training and development for school leaders, working with around 7,000 educators each year in some of England's most challenging schools. Over the last year (2019), we have revised our organisation's theory of change and subsequently redesigned our development programmes based around a model of expertise. Amanda Goodall's work and proposition of 'Expert Leadership' has been a significant influence throughout this process."* [5.12].

## 5. Sources to corroborate the impact

[5.1] Letter from Senior Industrial Officer of SASMOA advocating the leadership changes & accompanying article citing the research that led to the drafting of the letter.

[5.2] Review of South Australian Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services, Women's and Children's Health Network, Final Report, November 2014. Accompanied by medicSA MAY 2016 - SA turnaround Expert leadership improves ED flow for mental health patients.

[5.3] Formal letter from Assoc. Professor, Discipline of Psychiatry of Flinders University & Executive Strategic Director of SA Mental Health, May 2016: *"RE: The positive impact of a Cass Business School management theory on the South Australian public mental health sector: implications for medical teaching, research and quality improvement in the health sector"*

[5.4] Baker, A., Bech, M., Geerts, J., Axelsen, S.M., Ullum, H., Krabbe, M.P. and Goodall, A.H., 2020. Motivating doctors into leadership and management: a cross-sectional survey. BMJ Leader. Accompanied by LSV recap of the original study & announcement of proposals (In Danish) (2019)

[5.5] Impact Statement from Prince Frederick Centre for Healthcare Leadership, Aarhus University co-signed by a) Head of Department of Surgery and Transplantation; Copenhagen University Hospital, b) Consultant, Department of Gynaecology & Obstetrics; Aarhus University Hospital, c) Chief Physician, Copenhagen Hospital Biotank Unit, Section of Virology, Department of Clinical Immunology, Copenhagen University Hospital d) Head of Secretariat, LVS – Organisation of Danish Medical Societies. Accompanied by relevant policy page & document (In Danish) (2019)

[5.6] Testimonial, President & Chief Executive Officer, American Association for Physician Leadership.

[5.7] Testimonial, Executive Medical Director Canadian Society of Physician Leaders.

[5.8] Testimonial, Chairman, Education Institute; Jean Wall Bennett Prof of Medicine; Samson Global Leadership Chair

[5.9] Letters of Support by the National Medical Director, NHS England and NHS Improvement & the Chief Executive and Medical Director of Faculty of Medical Leadership & Management. Accompanied by the NHS People Plan (2020).

[5.10] Testimonial, Chief Executive, University College London Hospital; Professor of

Medicine UCL; Consultant in General & Acute Medicine and Haematology

**[5.11]** Testimonial, SOAS Professor of Social Anthropology; Director, GRNPP. Accompanied by the relevant Report to the House of Commons Governance Committee (17 December 2014)

**[5.12]** Testimonial, Executive Director, School Leadership Programmes, Ambition Institute.