

Institution: 10007140 Birmingham City University (BCU)		
Unit of Assessment: 23 – Education		
Title of case study: Removing barriers to musical participation in schools – a social justice issue.		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2010 - 2019		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
Professor Martin Fautley	Professor of Education	2004 – present
Dr. Victoria Kinsella	Senior Research Fellow	2014 – present
Dr. Adam Whittaker	Lecturer in Music	2015 – present
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2010 - 2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> N		
<p>1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)</p> <p>The work of Birmingham Music Education Research Group (BMERG) has made a vital contribution to removing barriers to accessing music education for children and young people from all socio-economic backgrounds and abilities. This is a significant issue for social justice in music education. BMERG's research has contributed to the reform of music curricula in schools, including the introduction of modern genres such as grime and hip-hop, and has influenced the government's decision to continue to fund Whole Class Ensemble Tuition (WCET), which in 2018/19 provided £75 million for Music Education Hubs to help fund music lessons for 700,000 children, many of whom would not otherwise have had access to musical teaching and learning.</p>		
<p>2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)</p> <p>In the UK the numbers of children taking music GCSE has declined by 25% since 2008, and music education is no longer taught across all of Key Stage 3 in more than 50% of state-funded secondary schools. BMERG's music education research facilitates better understanding of musical thinking and making, to enable enriched educational experiences for young people and to broaden access and inclusion to all styles of music, for all children and young people. This case study focuses on 5 examples of research that has transformed outcomes for children and young people countrywide. These research studies address aspects of deficit and are concerned with the removal of barriers for groups of children and young people in differing circumstances. The 5 examples are: Exchanging Notes (ExNo), Whole Class Ensemble Tuition (WCET), Listen Imagine Compose (LIC), the One-Handed Musical Instrument (OHMI) trust, and assessment in classroom music teaching and learning.</p> <p>Exchanging Notes was a four-year project, 2014-18, funded by Youth Music, the largest Arts Council National Portfolio Organisation. This research [R01] explored whether young people at risk of low attainment, disengagement or educational exclusion could achieve better musical, educational and wider outcomes through participation in a 4-year longitudinal music education project. The research involved teachers and professional musicians, but also included voices of the marginalised young people. The research showed that breaking down the traditional hierarchies between music leaders and students and focusing on collaboration, participation and enjoyment yielded positive results: the young musicians maintained attendance consistently higher than the average for the secondary school population, two thirds maintained or improved their attainment in English, and behaviour and motivation improved overall across the settings.</p> <p>More than 700,000 children a year learn a musical instrument through the government's WCET programme. BMERG is a data analyst for Arts Council England (ACE) – who manage the grant – and Department for Education (DfE) for the production of an annual report on music education hubs [R04]. Our research found that access was not equal across the country: nationally 36,830 children accessed musical tuition for less than a term in 2017/18, whereas 430,708 children received tuition for 3 terms. Our findings also revealed how in music education the terms <i>progression</i> and <i>progression routes</i> have been incorrectly used, as though they were interchangeable. BMERG research also identified and labelled the previously unrecognised models of music pedagogy in which WCET</p>		

occurs, which we labelled *music education starts with the instrument* and *Music education takes place via the instrument*. These distinctions are useful to describe differences between programmes and are essential to the design of teaching and learning. BMERG has been in receipt of six funded research contracts, leading to the publication of eight papers and reports concerning WCET to date, and is the only research organisation investigating this currently [R03].

Since 2010 BMERG has conducted research under the **Listen, Imagine, Compose (LIC)** banner [R02] funded by The Esmée Fairbairn foundation and the Paul Hamlyn foundation to develop effective teaching methods to encourage and support composing in secondary school music lessons. LIC has built incrementally from its origins as research with classroom teachers and professional composers working alongside and learning from each other, to expanding its reach and scope to include a fully accredited Masters qualification, and an internationally attended Summer School. The LIC composing project is designed to be of benefit to all young people, whatever their socio-economic background; approaching composing as a democratic activity, amenable to learning, from the first steps of the faltering singer-songwriter, to the crafted outputs of A-level learners. Teachers from state schools keen to develop this aspect of their provision have been undertaking the Master's programme, as well as even larger numbers attending the summer school, and regular 'TeachMeets', which are held up and down the country.

BMERG's commitment to working with disadvantaged children and young people is evidenced in its longstanding work with the **OHMI** trust [R05], whose aim is to remove barriers to music-making faced by the physically disabled. BMERG Research into teaching and learning funded by OHMI has found that although there were barriers to musical learning faced by young people with a disability, when teachers were afforded time to work with these children via longer instrumental music lessons, resilience was enhanced.

Assessment is a key aspect of educational provision in schools, and BMERG has a long history of work in this area, including, notably, Fautley's key 2010 book [R06]. Assessment research has been presented by invitation 56 times to date, in the UK, Australia, Chile, Germany, Norway, and Singapore, to groups of teachers, who have then put this work into practice in their own professional teaching and learning contexts. BMERG's research on assessment has focussed on teaching and learning in classrooms, with assessment guidance for teachers published by the Incorporated Society of Musicians [R07] in 2015 (revised 2019). We have been researching and reporting on the downward trend in A-level music entries. This research has proved that the most deprived areas in the UK are unlikely to have any A-level provision at all across their schools, whilst at the other end of the entry spectrum, over 20% of A-level music entries are to be found in fewer than 50 schools nationwide.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

R01: Kinsella, V., Fautley, M. & Whittaker, A. (2019). *Exchanging Notes Research Report*. Youth Music. Birmingham & London: Birmingham City University & Youth Music.

<https://network.youthmusic.org.uk/file/39214/download?token=l9ixqiPx>

R02: Kinsella, V. & Fautley, M. (2016). *The use of Activity Theory as an analytical tool for the music learning process*. IN Bugos, J. (Ed.) *Contemporary Research in Music Education*. pp. 26-38. New York: Routledge. <http://www.open-access.bcu.ac.uk/5249/>

R03: Fautley M, Kinsella V, & Whittaker A. (2019). Models of teaching and learning identified in Whole Class Ensemble Tuition. *British Journal of Music Education* 36(3), pp. 243–252
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051719000354>

R04: Fautley, M. & Whittaker, A. (2017). *Key Data on Music Education Hubs 2017*. Birmingham: Birmingham City University.

www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/KeyDataOnMusicEducationHubs2017_0.pdf

R05: Kinsella, V., & Fautley, M. (2019). Partnership work in music education for children with disabilities – an English case study. IN Grüneis, Lisa (Ed) *European Perspectives on Music Education - Joint (AD)venture music*, Innsbruck, Austria: Helbling Verlag. pp. 69-81.

<http://www.open-access.bcu.ac.uk/7128/>

R06: Fautley, M. (2010). *Assessment in Music Education*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
ISBN: 9780193362895 <https://global.oup.com/academic/product/assessment-in-music-education-9780193362895?cc=gb&lang=en&>

R07: Fautley, M. & Daubney, A. (2019). *An assessment and progression framework for music - secondary*. London: Incorporated Society of Musicians.
www.ism.org/images/images/ISM_The-National-Curriculum-for-Music-booklet_KS3_2019_digital.pdf

Grants awarded to fund research

The research outlined above was funded by grants totalling **£462,595** between 2010-2020: Exchanging Notes: £206,980; Listen, Imagine, compose: £109,073; One Handed Musical Instrument Trust: £24,862; Whole Class Ensemble Tuition: £91,680; Assessment: £30,000.

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

BMERG research has helped remove barriers of disability, class, income, and cultural capital to enable musical participation beyond the classical tradition, encompassing all styles and genres of music. It has influenced the teaching of music to 100,000s of pupils from primary to A-level across the UK and informed music education policy at Arts Council England and the Department for Education. BMERG assessment techniques are used around the world.

Modernising music curricula in secondary schools

Exchanging Notes challenged existing conceptualisations of music curricula in secondary schools by questioning the hegemonic dominance of Western Classical Music. Working with 46 music leaders, 23 music teachers, and 974 children and young people, it reimagined curricula to encompass youth voice as an integral component. A high profile example of this was the suggestion that the grime artist Stormzy should be part of the curriculum. This gave rise to the controversial *Stormzy vs. Mozart* debate resulting in extensive coverage in the national press. This research directed public perceptions of the possibilities of music education. Media coverage included: ITV's *Good Morning Britain*, with viewing figures of 1.5 Million, and 85 different newspapers, including the Daily Mail and the Guardian [S01]. The research showed improved median attendance for this at-risk group, raised to 97% by the end of the project, compared with a national median of 95.8%. Likewise above average attainers in this cohort rose from 14.79% at the outset to 24.65% by the end, a rise of nearly 10%; both of these statistics represent a significant result for this cohort.

The CEO of Youth Music [S02] which funded Exchanging Notes said the programme “demonstrated that music in schools has the potential to re-engage young people in education, develop their confidence, resilience and self-belief, and create a more positive attitude to learning”. It illustrated what a reimagined, innovative music curriculum in secondary schools could look like”. Youth Music are using the results of BMERG’s research to work with schools and music organisations [S02] to address curriculum opportunities across the country.

Enhancing music teaching skills

Listen, Imagine, Compose is now a nationwide CPD programme working with over 300 practitioners and teachers, who have returned to their schools to effect curriculum change, reaching over 9,000 secondary aged students each academic year. LIC provides a direct pathway of BMERG research into the everyday composing experience of young people across the UK, facilitating their educational musical development. The separate LIC Masters degree run by BCU with the organisation *Sound and Music* (SaM) [S07], has worked with 21 teachers to improve and expand their skills and knowledge within this highly specialised field of music education. LIC is the only research-led Masters programme in composing in schools in the country, and is world-leading. One of the students, a Head of Music in a London school explained how the course has changed their practice: “...it has revitalised my teaching and understanding of composing in the classroom. It has challenged me to think about my own practice and develop a varied range of strategies to use in the classroom in light of current research” [S07]. As the chief Ofsted HMI for music observed: “Listen Imagine Compose has played a significant part in improving the musical and educational understanding of professional musicians, teachers and academics” [S08].

Influencing practice in music education pedagogy

WCET is a £75 million per annum national programme of music tuition that is central to the government's National Plan for Music Education. The principal providers of WCET are 120 nationwide Music Education Hubs (MEHs). They draw heavily on BMERG research to inform their effectiveness and delivery, and, importantly, to provide a common language for discussion and debate. In 2017/18 the music education hubs worked with 91.4% of primary schools delivering WCET to 706,873 pupils, representing 9.08% of the entire pupil population at the time. The distinct models of teaching and learning within WCET identified by BMERG (*music education starts with the instrument* and *Music education takes place via the instrument*) [R03] have significantly affected both the conceptualisations of how this programme is taught, and, importantly, provide a language for it to be talked about. For example, our research was used to create success criteria for a new WCET progression strategy by Leicestershire MEH. In addition to these performance measures, our research impacted perceptions of musical progression in this MEH, as a result of which, new WCET targets were developed. This led to strategic operations to reach 39,907 children, almost doubling the number of pupils in comparison with the previous year. The Head of Leicester-Shire Schools Music Service [S03] said, "Music educational research (BMERG) at BCU has influenced key milestones of the music service for its future work, including prioritising and resourcing of WCET interactions with schools and children's musical development."

Informing national policy for music education [S04]

The Department for Education has consulted BMERG research and the research team directly with regards to provision and future developments. Nationally, the annual Key Data on Music Education Hubs reports produced by BMERG [R04] have been used by the DfE and by government ministers in formulating school music policy. For example, the Minister of State (Education) cited material from the report when replying to a query in 2019 on the take up of music GCSE [S04] and it has also featured in a House of Lords debate on music education in 2018 [S04].

The *Music Commission* was a panel of experts tasked in 2017 with overseeing a national inquiry into how to better sustain and support progress in making and learning music. It drew heavily on the BMERG definition of progress, citing the research directly in its report [S03]. Our foundational definition, separating the concepts of progression in learning, (in other words developmental attainment from progression routes), was important in the Music Commission report and is contributing significantly to national debates and new understandings in this arena.

Music and disabled children

BMERG's research with OHMI has raised awareness of the issue of disability and inclusion in schools with regards to teaching and learning. As a direct result of our OHMI research, ACE is now working to embed provision for disabled youngsters across all aspects of WCET and beyond. For example, BMERG research is cited in the ACE *Midlands Music Research Consultation* (2019) [S03], which addresses challenges to Midlands music-making, including the creative case for diversity. The Minister of State (Education), when discussing OHMI in a speech at the Music and Drama Expo in London (2017), said to teachers, "I urge you to find out more about their [BMERG's] work and how it could help your pupils" [S08]. BMERG's OHMI research has been critical in raising awareness and leading discourse within the field. For example, OHMI has advocated using BMERG research in a wide variety of contexts. The Assistant Manager for OHMI [S08] commented that, "We have used your report in representations to Government to influence changes in thinking...80–90% of MEHs are aware of the findings of the report...and significant percentages of schools across the country are now aware of the scope of our work because of our presentations of the findings of your report."

Improving access to music assessment equality in the classroom

BMERG has a long history of researching assessment of musical learning for all pupils in school classrooms. Fautley's research into assessment, which presents a new way of grading attainment and tracking progress in school music lessons, combined with significant manageability aspects, is the first tool of practical utility for secondary school music teachers [S05]; by enabling assessment of musical work by all pupils in schools, the social justice element of recognising attainment across the board is recognised. Fautley's 2010 book

[R06] on the subject, which forms part of the underpinning research for this case study has been sold all over the world throughout the REF period, has been cited 179 times, but more importantly has impacted pedagogy and assessment throughout the globe. For example, in Singapore [S05], the ministry of education purchased a copy for *all* classroom teachers attending compulsory CPD on the topic in 2018. In Chile, where Fautley advised the government ministry of education in a consultancy capacity, there is ongoing work using his assessment materials for music education. Assessment guidance documents designed for teachers [R07] have been downloaded and viewed 1,151 times, and are used in schools nationally and internationally, as well as by music hubs and in ITE. BMERG's work researching A-level music provision has had considerable impact upon public awareness, and has been widely cited in mainstream media [S06]. This work has shown that dwindling numbers of pupils taking A-level music could have a significantly detrimental effect on the pipeline for music professionals. In terms of social justice it shows a marked inequality in the availability of provision, with middle class and more affluent areas far more likely to be offering the subject than schools located in postcode areas of deprivation.

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

S01: Corroboration of impact on public awareness and debate of Exchanging Notes

Guardian newspaper article
Daily Mail newspaper article
CBBC Newsround coverage
ITV Good Morning coverage
Russia Today coverage

S02: Corroboration of impact on Music Education sector of Exchanging Notes

Schools week article with Youth Music, arts NPO
Testimonial from Managing director, Drum works [Named Corroborator 001]
Documentary film from Kinetika Bloco, arts organisation

S03: Corroboration of impact on Music Education Sector of WCET

Report from Arts Council England
Report from Music Commission
Testimonial from Head of Leicester-shire Schools Music Service [Named Corroborator 002]

S04: Corroboration of impact on parliamentary debate of WCET

Answer to written question by Minister of State (Education)
House of Lords library briefing paper and debate

S05: Corroboration of impact of Assessment research on Music Education sector

Singapore Teachers' Academy for the Arts magazine article
Interview for Teacher and Musician blog

S06: Corroboration of impact on public awareness and debate of Assessment research

Guardian newspaper article
Telegraph newspaper article
Arts Professional online article
Rhinegold online article

S07: Testimonial regarding LIC

Testimonial from Head of Education, Sound and Music [Named Corroborator 003]
Comment from Music teacher

S08: Corroboration of impact for Listen Imagine Compose

Statement from Ofsted's Chief HMI for Music, Sound and Music website
Speech by Minister of State (Education)
Statement from Assistant General Manager, One Handed Musical Instrument (OHMI) [Named Corroborator 004]