

Impact case study (REF3)

Institution: Swansea University		
Unit of Assessment: 28		
Title of case study: Learning from the Past to Protect the Past: Safeguarding Cultural Heritage in Conflict.		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2004-2020		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
Nigel Pollard	Associate Professor	1/10/2002 - present
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2014-2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? No		
1. Summary of the impact		
<p>Historical research on cultural property protection (CPP) in the Second World War and archaeological expertise changed UK and international approaches to CPP in current and potential conflicts. Impact was achieved primarily by presenting historical lessons relevant to practitioners including military personnel, heritage professionals, representatives of government and NGOs, and the public. Pollard's research has raised awareness and understanding of cultural property protection issues among UK and NATO military planners; UK legislators and civil servants seeking to formulate and implement the Cultural Property (Armed Conflicts) Act (2017); and UK museum professionals and the general public. Pollard's research has also had an effect on the specialist training activity of the new UK armed forces' Cultural Property Protection Unit, and on US/Coalition forces' military planning activity in drawing up no-strike lists during the Syrian civil war. In all of these ways, his research has had the benefit of enhancing the capacity of UK/NATO military forces to preserve cultural property of historic significance in their overseas military operations.</p>		
2. Underpinning research		
<p>Until recently, there was little scholarly or military awareness of Allied wartime CPP policy and practice, and therefore little continuity between historical and contemporary practice. Pollard's historical research (and on-going engagement with contemporary practitioners) examines damage and protection of heritage in the Second World War in its wider CPP context to establish that missing continuity. His monograph <i>Bombing Pompeii</i> [R1] and other outputs [R2, R3] emphasise study of archival documentation to examine the motives, successes and failures of Allied wartime protection of heritage sites and cultural institutions from war damage, particularly in Italy. These outputs are the culmination of research started in 2011 that in turn benefited greatly from interaction with practitioners before publication.</p> <p>The monograph assesses bomb damage to the archaeological site of Pompeii and the subsequent British military requisition of the National Museum of Naples. Both are examined in their military context and in the context of the development of Allied CPP policies and practice including the establishment of the Monuments, Fine Arts and Archives Sub-Commission (the 'Monuments Men' of the recent film). A key feature of this and other outputs is explicit reflection on wartime experience as a source of lessons for contemporary cultural property protection in conflict zones. This has had significant impact, particularly among military audiences. Key issues in wartime CPP assessed in Pollard's research are still important and debated today, and wartime experience provides a body of experience and reflection on themes of contemporary relevance. These include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • creation, prioritisation and distribution of documentation and information on sites as 'cultural intelligence' for 'no-strike' lists and national inventories; • rationales for, and responses to different causes of cultural property damage, including deliberate ideological destruction, collateral damage and looting; • interpretation and application of international law relating to CPP; 		

- relationships between armed forces, academics, heritage professionals and other stakeholders;
- CPP in proactive preparation for conflict and operational planning during it;
- locating military CPP specialists within military structures and in the theatre of operations;
- the importance of education, training and discipline in promoting CPP among military personnel.

Other aspects of Pollard's research take a similar approach but speak to the concerns of modern civilian heritage professionals and administrators. For example, British Academy-funded research that led to output [R2] also draws on Second World War experience but relates to the safeguarding and shelter of evacuated museum and gallery collections.

Pollard's earlier research output as an archaeologist working in the MENA (Middle East-North Africa) region underpins other dimensions of the impact. In particular his research (including fieldwork) relating to sites such as Palmyra and Dura-Europos [R4, R5] and others in the central and eastern steppe of Syria enabled him to contribute as a specialist to military 'no-strike' lists as well as to serve as an appropriate mentor to refugee Syrian academics investigating damage to cultural sites in their home country.

3. References to the research

The underpinning research is based on peer-reviewed funding, a peer-reviewed university press monograph, a peer-reviewed journal article and substantial book chapters.

[R1] Pollard, Nigel. (2020). *Bombing Pompeii: World Heritage and Military Necessity*. The University of Michigan Press.

[R2] Pollard, Nigel. (2020). 'Refuges for Movable Cultural Property in Wartime: Lessons for Contemporary Practice from Second World War Italy', *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 26, 667-83. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13527258.2019.1678052>.

[R3] Pollard, Nigel. (2018). British Academy Small Research Grant. 'Protecting and Reconstituting Museums in Times of Conflict. An Historical Case Study from Wartime Naples.' Nigel Pollard [PI]. (2018-2020). British Academy SRG-102175#?. GBP5102.82

[R4] Pollard, N. (2007). "Colonial and Cultural Identities in Parthian and Roman Dura-Europos" in R. Alston & S.N.C. Lieu (Eds.), *Aspects of the Roman East: Papers in Honour of Professor Fergus Millar FBA*. *Studia Antiqua Australiensia* 3 (2007), 81-102.

[R5] Pollard, N. (2004). "Roman Material Culture across Imperial Frontiers? Three Case Studies from Parthian Dura-Europos", in Stephen Colvin (ed.), *The Greco-Roman East: Politics, Culture, Society*. *Yale Classical Studies* 31, 119-144.

4. Details of the impact

In the aftermath of the 2003 invasion of Iraq, limited recognition of the issue of CPP in conflict zones among UK and Western armed forces, government, and public meant CPP policy was under-developed. Even as awareness grew, crucial historical evidence from 1943-45 remained largely unknown to military personnel and academic engagement with military CPP was lacking. Pollard set out to improve understanding among these groups by sharing key relevant findings from his historical and archaeological research. In doing so he was able to impact a range of audiences and stakeholders by:

- (a) **Acting as expert advisor for the creation and training of UK military Cultural Property Protection Unit (CPPU).**

In 2015 Pollard was invited to join British Army Headquarters' Cultural Property Protection Working

Group of approximately 30 individuals (military personnel, civil servants and heritage specialists) to investigate, advocate and plan creation of a new specialist CPP unit. The CPPU was established in 2017 by the Cultural Property (Armed Conflicts) Act, commanded by CPPWG chair Lt. Col.

Drawing on his research, Pollard taught on the unit's first specialist training course in October 2019 to an audience including the 8 current officers of the unit, military officers from 6 other nations, and representatives of UNESCO, Italian Carabinieri, Interpol and the Metropolitan Police. Military trainers present [C10] reported that: *'Nigel's contribution activated the need to think dynamically about the realisation of operational CPP initiatives...it spoke compellingly to the training audience's concerns...'* It subsequently [C2] was **incorporated into the CPPU's Concept of Employment (the Army's formal statement of what the unit is intended to do), putting evidence-based historical analysis at the heart of the unit's mission** through Pollard's influence.

Subsequently Pollard was invited to join the CPPU as a reservist 'Group B' officer, a status used by UK armed forces for senior civilian advisors with specialist skills and expertise.

(b) Raising the profile of CPP among the wider military and security community.

Pollard's engagement with military audiences has contributed to a **growing military awareness of CPP issues**, and changed the way the value of historical evidence is valued in establishing policy and practice. Events at which this took place range from a 2011 NATO workshop to more recent events at the UK Defence Academy at Shrivenham. The audiences typically were middle-ranking officers (Captains, Majors and Lieutenant-Colonels) tasked with creating and developing the detail of doctrine in areas such as Civil-Military Cooperation (CIMIC). They were inter-service and **international**, including individuals from the USA, Italy, France, the Netherlands, Germany, Australia, Austria, Norway as well as the UK. Security and policing organisations (US Defence Intelligence Agency [DIA], Interpol, Metropolitan Police) often were present too.

Examples of feedback on these events attesting value and impact of Pollard's contributions include:

- [C6] A British Army Major: *'... very informative and of immediate use. I am drafting a manual for the Army on how it can support Human Security on operations. Your presentation provided a helpful insight into the tensions between the Army's warfighting role and its concurrent/ subsequent role in protecting the population and cultural property.'*
- [C3] US DIA, Chief, Asia/Africa Branch: *'...extraordinarily informative and very rewarding...the experience you contribute is invaluable to ensuring we have complete datasets to provide DoD [Department of Defense] planners. I intend to send [Pollard's presentation] to my colleagues at DIA who share the responsibility of identifying current facilities which merit protection.'*

In 2019, Pollard's CPP lessons from wartime Naples were relayed by a military colleague at a workshop for 'very senior officers' at NATO's Joint Theatre Command Naples, where it was deemed to have influenced [C1] 'those involved in formulating NATO policy at SHAPE [Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers Europe]'.

Pollard also **contributed to 'no-strike' lists of Syrian heritage sites** disseminated via the US Defense Intelligence Agency [C5] that remained in use by US/Coalition forces through the Syrian civil war. None of those sites were damaged by Coalition military activity.

(c) Informing government policies relating to CPP.

As one of the first UK board members of Blue Shield (the 'Red Cross' for cultural property), Pollard drew on his research to lobby government for UK ratification of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict. This was achieved as part of

the 2017 Cultural Property (Armed Conflicts) Act. Blue Shield's contribution was recognised in House of Lords debates, and Pollard's personal contribution in correspondence with politicians including an e-mail to Pollard from a participant in the January 2016 Lords' debate (and Former Government Minister: [C7] *'thank you for the important work you are doing'*).

Pollard played a key role in the 2017 **creation, form and implementation of the UK Cultural Protection Fund (CPF)** that supports efforts to protect cultural heritage at risk in countries including Syria through his contributions to a workshop attended by the Civil Service Director of DCMS (Department of Culture, Media and Sport) that produced recommendations for the government Heritage White Paper. This led to the creation of CPF. He was then invited to participate as an expert in the 2016 DCMS consultation that shaped the CPF: ([C8] February 2016 e-mail to Pollard from Senior Policy Adviser - Cultural Protection, DCMS: *'...Your presence was very helpful ... and your contributions were of value and will support our ongoing work.'*). Subsequently he served as an assessor for CPF applications based on criteria established at the consultation.

(d) Influencing and informing stakeholders and wider public audiences on CPP.

Presentations to a range of audiences, including national and international museum security directors and Metropolitan Police officers helped key stakeholders to *'understand the measures taken in the past to protect artwork in times of national emergency'* [C9]. 96.25% of 57 audience members at a National Army Museum public lecture reported that their understanding of the need for UK forces to protect heritage sites in conflict zones had changed thanks to Pollard's work [C9].

Through media outlets including the BBC News website, BBC Radio Wales (approximate listener numbers 50-100,000) and the *Western Mail* (avg. circulation 23,000, approximate readership 125,000) Pollard **contributed to the altering of public attitudes towards damage and destruction of heritage sites in Syria, advocating an international ban on trade in Syrian antiquities to reduce looting, implemented in UN Security Council Resolution 2199.** As an example of attested impact, in March 2015 on *Good Morning Wales* (BBC Radio Wales) Gary Brace [UNESCO representative, former Chief Executive of the General Teaching Council for Wales] explicitly stated [C10] he had been influenced by Pollard's views on this subject set out in a *Western Mail* news article.

5. Sources to corroborate the impact

Acting as expert advisor for the creation and training of the new UK military Cultural Property Protection Unit:

[C1] Testimonial 19/11/19 from [former Lt. Col., British Army Intelligence Corps] who directed the 2019 CPPU training course at Stanwick House.

[C2] Testimonials 04/11/19 from [Lt. Col.] Commander, Cultural Property Protection Unit, 77th Brigade, British Army.

Raising the profile of CPP among the wider military and security community:

[C3] Feedback from US DIA, Chief, Asia/Africa Branch on presentation 25/05/2016 at Spatial Sociocultural Knowledge Workshop/ Culture in Conflict Symposium, Defence Academy of the UK/Cranfield University, Shrivenham.

[C4] Message (February 2016) from US Army Cultural Resources Specialist, Fort Drum, NY regarding impact of Pollard's work on CPP training activities with US forces and beyond.

[C5] E-mail to Pollard from Branch Chief JWS-2, Operational Environment Analysis Division, US Defense Intelligence Agency, (August 2012 – but with continuing impact throughout Syrian

conflict) requesting checking of draft 'no-strike' list; e-mail response by Pollard to the above noting errors and omissions in the list.

[C6] E-mail 5 January 2016 from Major [British Army Major, SO2 Defence Engagement Stabilisation, Land Warfare Development Centre] on presentation to Joint Services Command and Staff College, Shrivenham.

Informing government policies relating to CPP:

[C7] E-mail (2 February 2016), from Member of the House of Lords (former government minister) relating to Pollard and Blue Shield lobbying and this Lord's intervention in the 14 January 2016 Lords' debate on UK ratification of the 1954 Hague Convention, in which he drew extensively on briefing materials provided by UK Blue Shield.

[C8] Correspondence and feedback relating to participation in the Department of Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS) consultative process for establishment and design of the UK Cultural Protection Fund, January-February 2016, including: e-mail 2 February 2016, from Senior Policy Adviser - Cultural Protection, DCMS.

Influencing and informing wider audiences:

[C9] Feedback relating to presentations to wider audiences, including non-military practitioners and the general public.

[C10] Comment on *Good Morning Wales*, BBC Radio Wales, 9 March 2015 by Gary Brace (<http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b05n8q54> at 01:53:30), UNESCO representative and former Chief Executive of the General Teaching Council for Wales, showing his views on UN ban on trade in Syrian antiquities had been influenced by Pollard's *Western Mail* article.