

Institution: University of Oxford

Unit of Assessment: 22B Development Studies

Title of case study: Banning corporal punishment in Peru and reducing childhood violence

internationally

Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2002-31 Dec 2020

Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:

betains of stair conducting the underprinning research from the submitting unit.		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by
		submitting HEI:
Jo Boyden	Director, Young Lives	24/05/1999-30/06/2019
Virginia Morrow	Deputy Director, Young Lives	01/01/2011-30/03/2017
Patricia Espinoza Revello	Senior Education Research	01/10/2010-30/09/2018
	Officer	
Kirrily Pells	Policy Officer	30/09/2010-04/12/2015
Paul Dornan	Senior Policy Officer	05/10/2009-30/09/2018
Maria Jose Ogando Portela	Research Assistant (full-time)	14/09/2011-30/09/2015

Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2014- 31 Dec 2020

Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N

1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)

Young Lives was established as an international study of childhood poverty in 2002 to follow the lives of children in Ethiopia, India, Peru and Vietnam. This longitudinal data analysis at Oxford revealed the extent of violence against children and the educational consequences. UNICEF and its local partners in Peru then used this research evidence in their lobbying for legislative change. Peruvian Law 30403, banning corporal punishment in all settings, came into effect in 2015. Subsequently, violence against school pupils fell by one-fifth in Peru, and some 700,000 schoolchildren potentially benefited. The Peruvian experience has informed National Action Plans for Children that are now being implemented by UNICEF in Italy, Vietnam and Zimbabwe as well as in Peru itself; and has influenced similar initiatives elsewhere in Latin America, notably a new law in Paraguay and the norms set by the Pan American Health Organization.

2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)

Young Lives is a major international collaborative research programme on childhood poverty, coordinated by the Oxford Department of International Development (ODID) and core funded by UK DfID (now FCDO); research partners include research institutes, universities, NGOs and government statistics departments across four study countries: Ethiopia, India (Andhra Pradesh and Telangana), Vietnam and Peru. These partners are: Centre for Economic and Social Studies (Hyderabad) and Sri Padmavati Mahila Visvavidyalam Women's University (Tirupati); Centre for Analysis and Forecast, Viet Nam Academy of Social Sciences and General Statistics Office of Vietnam; the Policy Studies institute (Addis Ababa) and Pankhurst Development Research and Consulting plc (Ethiopia); and in Peru the Grupo de Análisis para el Desarollo (GRADE) and the Instituto de Investigación Nutricional.

Young Lives has followed the lives of 12,000 children in Ethiopia, India, Peru and Vietnam since 2002 and continues to follow them into young adulthood. Using large-scale household surveys with children and their primary caregivers, in-depth qualitative interviews, group work and case studies, Young Lives gathers information on children and parents, teachers and community representatives (R1). The data address children's material and social circumstances and outcomes, and their perspectives and aspirations, set against their environmental and social realities (R2). It is the first longitudinal study of its kind in the developing world.

The Young Lives collaborative model involves the core academic team at ODID working closely with expert teams in partner policy research institutions in the field (listed above). The University of Oxford team coordinates the design of survey questionnaires to address emerging policy needs and data collection between the four case study countries in order to ensure comparability and skills transference, incorporating feedback from partners. The University of Oxford team also liaises with funders (particularly DfID, now FCDO), carries out comparative analysis with country teams and disseminates the results internationally. Country teams adapt the data design and research questions to local circumstances and policy needs, plan and undertake data collection and analysis, engage with relevant country stakeholders on policy impact, and



participate in the governance of the international programme. In Peru, the University of Oxford's primary research partner is GRADE (the leading local think tank in this field, established in 1980) and the primary policy stakeholder is UNICEF-Peru. Young Lives is known as *Niños del Milenio* ("Children of the Millennium") in Latin America.

From 2014 onwards, Young Lives researchers began to see increasing references to violence against children in the qualitative data in each of its study countries, which had not received much attention either in academic literature or in policy-oriented research outputs. Young Lives approached the head of Child Protection in the UNICEF Innocenti Research Office (IRO) in Florence, and together they wrote a concept note about research exploring children's experiences of violence and the impact of violence on children. As a result, UNICEF IRO established a new research workstream on this topic, including analytical work on two of the Young Lives study countries: Peru and Vietnam (R3, R4 & R5, the latter published jointly with UNICEF IRO). A partnership was launched between UNICEF, Young Lives and Edinburgh University for "The Multi-Country Study on the Drivers of Violence Affecting Children", exploring how structural, institutional, community, interpersonal and individual factors interact to affect children's experiences of violence. In collaboration with government departments of health, education and social services engaged in child protection and with local research partners, the study aimed to inform national strategies and policies for violence prevention in Peru, Vietnam, Ethiopia, India, Zimbabwe and Italy. The first four of these countries were those in which Young Lives had followed cohorts of young people since 2002.

Violence against children became a core research theme within Young Lives, led by Dr Kirrily Pells, which sought to explain why children who experience violence have more negative long-term outcomes than others. It explored the diverging life trajectories of children who had experienced violence in different forms (physical, psychological/emotional, abuse and exploitation) in the context of both the agency of children themselves and the country's political economy. In consequence, UNICEF commissioned Young Lives to produce a series of working papers on this topic in 2015 (eg **R3**), using the longitudinal quantitative and qualitative data produced by Young Lives and aimed at strengthening violence prevention initiatives at national, regional and international levels.

One potentially important form of violence against children is that experienced in schools, including corporal punishment. Young Lives used its existing database on Peruvian children's life experiences and its own analytical methods to work with the Young Lives local partner team and UNICEF to conduct survey analysis on the impact of corporal punishment and bullying on children, contextualised with existing qualitative data on the same themes (R6). The Peruvian Young Lives team commissioned a series of research activities which fed into the UNICEF Multi-Country Study. This included a systematic review of Peru's existing data and literature on violence prevention conducted with the Pontifical Catholic University of Peru; and secondary analyses of two existing data sets exploring issues connected to violence, in partnership with the Peruvian National Institute of Statistics and Informatics. The quantitative analysis relied on Young Lives longitudinal data to examine the impact of corporal punishment on children over time, providing evidence that this was a key reason why children stopped going to school (R2).

- 3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)
- **R1** Jo Boyden, Andrew Dawes, Paul Dornan and Colin Tredoux (2019) *Tracing the Consequences of Child Poverty: Evidence from the Young Lives Study in Ethiopia, India, Peru and Vietnam,* Policy Press. http://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctvkjb390 [output type: A]
- **R2**. Jo Boyden, Tassew Woldehanna, S Galab, Alan Sanchez, Mary Penny and Le Thuc Duc (2018). *Young Lives: an International Study of Childhood Poverty: Round 5, 2016.* [data collection]. UK Data Service. SN: 8357, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-8357-1 All the Young Lives quantitative data is available through the *UK Data Service*

https://www.younglives.org.uk/content/use-our-data [output type: S]

R3. Maria Jose Ogando Portela and Kirrily Pells (2015) 'Corporal punishment in schools: longitudinal evidence from Ethiopia, India, Peru and Viet Nam', *Innocenti Discussion Paper 2015-02*. Florence: UNICEF Office of Research. https://www.unicef-irc.org/publications/788-corporal-punishment-in-schools-longitudinal-evidence-from-ethiopia-india-peru-and.html



[output type: U]

R4. Kirrily Pells, Maria Jose Ogando Portela and Patricia Espinoza Revello (2016) 'Experiences of peer bullying among adolescents and associated effects on young adult outcomes: longitudinal evidence from Ethiopia, India, Peru and Viet Nam', *Innocenti Discussion Paper 2016-03*. Florence: UNICEF Office of Research. https://www.unicef-irc.org/publications/863-experiences-of-peer-bullying-among-adolescents-and-associated-effects-on-young-adult.html [output type: U]

R5. Kirrily Pells, Virginia Morrow, M Catherine Maternowska and Alina Potts (2018) 'A sociological approach to children's experiences of violence: Evidence from Young Lives'. *Vulnerable Children and Youth Studies* 13 (1): 26-35,

https://doi.org/10.1080/17450128.2018.1476746 [output type: D]

R6. Gabriela Guerrero and Vanessa Rojas (2016) 'Understanding children's experiences of violence in Peru: evidence from Young Lives', *Innocenti Working Paper IWP_2016_17*. Florence: UNICEF Office of Research. https://www.unicef-irc.org/publications/865-understanding-childrens-experiences-of-violence-in-peru-evidence-from-young-lives.html [output type: U]

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

The underpinning University of Oxford-led research provided a robust data platform for policy advocacy and design in Peru. In 2014, UNICEF asked Young Lives to synthesise the evidence in order to support an official legislative initiative on corporal punishment in schools that had encountered parliamentary resistance. This research evidence was used by UNICEF and local NGOs to lobby the Peruvian parliament with eventual success. The new law, passed in 2015, caused a significant reduction in violence experienced by children at school. This experience then generated a new UNICEF strategy to counter child violence in Italy, Vietnam and Zimbabwe as well as Peru itself; and important initiatives elsewhere in Latin America.

Providing reliable data for advocacy

The Peruvian Inter-Ministerial Committee on Child Protection (IMCCP) drove a focus on improving educational outcomes as a key priority for the Peruvian Government in 2015. Since two previous attempts to pass legislation on corporal punishment had failed, the IMCCP informed UNICEF that sound evidence that corporal punishment had a negative impact on schooling would be critically important for successful advocacy for legal change. From an interview with a local UNICEF Child Protection Specialist, the Young Lives Peru team knew that a proposal to ban corporal punishment had recently been debated in the Peruvian parliament but rejected on grounds of religious ethics and lack of evidence. The UNICEF Peru team knew the bill would soon be re-introduced for debate and approached the Peru Young Lives team to ask if there were any findings on corporal punishment that could be used for advocacy purposes [C1].

Young Lives had conducted data collection during 2007-2014 in four communities across Peru with children and their caregivers. UNICEF Peru then disseminated an advocacy document, drafted by Young Lives using this data and analysis, showing the link between corporal punishment and negative educational outcomes [C2]. The document states that it is based on "longitudinal data and analysis from the Young Lives study led by the University of Oxford".

Lobbying the Peruvian parliament

This advocacy document was used by UNICEF in parliamentary lobbying of ministers who had previously voted against the corporal punishment ban; and the data were also cited by the Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Populations (the ministry responsible for national child protection policy and a key UNICEF government partner) in parliamentary speeches, as well as in parliamentary debates on the anti-corporal punishment legislation [C1]. A Peruvian consortium of children's NGOs also used these data in their individual meetings with ministers as part of further efforts to lobby the government to support passage of the law [C1].

In December 2015 the Peruvian Congress finally passed a law to prohibit all corporal punishment of children [C3]. UNICEF is convinced that the Young Lives data were crucial because it was the only study on the impact of corporal punishment on educational outcomes, noting that the Young Lives data and the Multi-Country Study on the Drivers of Violence



Affecting Children project made a significant difference and enabled better, evidence-based drafting of the new legislation [C1]. A subsequent formal evaluation of this achievement by UNICEF recognises Niños del Milenio as a key partner [C4, p4] and the importance of the University of Oxford-led evidence in the advocacy campaign, citing statistics from R3 on the majority of children who experience corporal and other punishment at school and the educational consequences.

The impact of the legislation on child violence in Peru

An independent impact assessment of the Drivers of Violence project commissioned by the University of Edinburgh shows that the Young Lives data had made the key difference. The assessment gathered data directly through interviews and questionnaires from 33 government officials, staff from UN agencies and key stakeholders; it also collected 13 testimonials and examined 36 pieces of evidence during in-country fieldwork. This assessment states that: "There was broad agreement among interviewees that the research influenced the change in law. Some people saw [a] direct link while others felt the study sped up the process. UNICEF staff said, 'The study process empowered the political and technical [ministerial] teams to push more to make the law change the first priority'" [C5, p24].

Comparing the data collected on violence against children in Peru's National Survey on Social Relations before the law was passed in 2015 with data from the round conducted four years later shows the proportion of children aged 9-11 who had experienced physical and/or psychological violence in the school setting fell from 82% to 66% between the 2013 and 2019 surveys; the proportion of adolescents aged 12-17 experiencing such violence fell from 84% to 69% [C6]. In 2019 the first age group totalled 1.7 million and the second 3.4 million, meaning that some 700,000 children may have become beneficiaries. The Peruvian Ministries of Education, of Social Protection, and of Women and Vulnerable Populations are currently all working with UNICEF to design capacity development programmes for individuals and organisations working with families and young people, to provide them with new tools of positive discipline and nurturing care [C7, which cites R3].

As a result of the productive collaboration with Young Lives that led to this legal change, UNICEF Peru have for the first time signed an agreement to support the implementation of the next round of Young Lives data collection in Peru. UNICEF are also working with Young Lives to use existing data to review their work on violence, adolescents and community development [C5]. Having seen the importance of Young Lives data in bringing about the legal change in Peru, UNICEF are also strengthening their use of academic research through Young Lives to continue to reduce violence against children in Peru [C8].

Wider international impact

Young Lives was also tasked to write a background paper on children's experiences of violence for the Global Learning Initiative (an international NGO consortium led by UNICEF) on preventing violence against children, which was featured heavily in the flagship report [C9]. Young Lives researchers were also invited to a consultation of global experts on bullying and cyberbullying where they presented the UNICEF research. Their findings on types of bullying and who was most likely to experience it (R4) were also cited by the UN Secretary-General in paragraph 19 of his report to the General Assembly on Bullying [C10].

Further, the UNICEF study to which Young Lives data has been integral has informed National Action Plans for Children that are now being implemented in four countries (Italy, Peru, Vietnam and Zimbabwe). A UNICEF report on the Multi-Country Study states that: "national budget allocations were shifted in the course of the project to fund violence prevention research in all four countries [including Peru]; national action plans for children were updated and revised with the findings; and over 50 national actors have received hands-on training and have increased their capacity to analyse, interpret and synthesize quantitative and qualitative data" [C11, p84].

The change of law against corporal punishment in Peru was swiftly followed by a change of law in Paraguay, prohibiting the use of corporal punishment and any kind of cruel, inhumane or



degrading treatment of children, which UNICEF believe to have been a knock-on effect of the law change in Peru: "A concrete example of how Paraguay has been influenced by the work of the Peru study is that following the corporal punishment law in Peru, Paraguay also passed a law to prohibit corporal punishment in all settings in September 2016. According to an email from the UNICEF office in Paraguay, the study assisted with the 'advocacy process'. In another email from July 2016, the UNICEF Paraguay Representative wrote that 'they look forward to re-using the Peru report (**R6**) as much as possible" [**C5**, p25].

Finally, the research has also had wider reach in Latin America as a whole, for example **R3** was cited by the Global Initiative to end corporal punishment in their Peru country report [**C12**] and by the Pan American Health Organization in a section on violence in a report on Health in the Americas [**C13**].

- 5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)
- **C1** Records of Peruvian parliamentary proceedings are not publicly available; information from an interview with a local UNICEF Child Protection Specialist [Corroboration available].
- **C2** Research to Policy Brief: the impact of corporal punishment in Peruvian schools UNICEF 2015 (advocacy document on child corporal punishment in Peru, using Young Lives data and analysis; also produced in Spanish)
- **C3** Ley No 30403: Ley que prohíbe el uso del castigo físico y humillante contra los niños, niñas y adolescentes (Law 30403 'Law which Prohibits the use of Physical or Humiliating Punishment on Boys, Girls and Adolescents') https://busquedas.elperuano.pe/normaslegales/ley-que-prohibe-el-uso-del-castigo-fisico-y-humillante-contr-ley-n-30403-1328702-1/
- **C4** Evaluation report: Entender para prevenir. Estudio Multinacional sobre los Determinantes de la Violencia que afecta a los Niños, Niñas y Adolescentes (Understand to Prevent: a multinational study of the violence that affects boys, girls and adolescents). https://www.unicef.org/peru/informes/entender-para-prevenir.
- **C5** Impact Study: Samantha Morten and Tabitha Casey (2017) 'Changing National Policy on Violence Affecting Children'. An impact assessment of UNICEF and partners' Multi-Country Study on the Drivers of Violence affecting Children in Peru. University of Edinburgh. https://era.ed.ac.uk/bitstream/handle/1842/22063/UNICEF%20impact%20assesment%20Peru.p df
- **C6** Encuesta Nacional sobre Relaciones Sociales ENARES 2019: Principales Resultados, the Peruvian Instituto Nacional de Estadistica e Informatica: (national statistical agency) https://www.inei.gob.pe/media/MenuRecursivo/boletines/presentacion enares 2019.pdf.
- **C7** Notas de Estrategia: Niñas, niños y adolescentes libres de violencia, explotación y desamparo familiar Programa de cooperación UNICEF Perú, 2017 2021(details UNICEF strategy on corporal punishment and the commitment to act by the UNICEF Country Director).
- **C8** Two videos produced by UNICEF on the impact of the law, which list Young Lives in the credits as "providing data and additional research".

https://www.unicef-irc.org/article/1377-peru-makes-strides-in-understanding-drivers-of-violence-against-children.html

- **C9** Ending Violence in Childhood: Global Report 2017, see also http://www.knowviolenceinchildhood.org/publication/papers-and-articles
- **C10** Report of the UN Secretary General on Protection Children From Bullying, July 2016 https://www.un.org/ga/search/view doc.asp?symbol=A/71/213
- **C11** Maternowska, M.C., Potts, A., Fry, D. and Casey, T (2018) Research that Drives Change: Conceptualizing and Conducting Nationally Led Violence Prevention Research: Synthesis Report of the "Multi-Country Study on the Drivers of Violence Affecting Children" in Italy, Peru, Viet Nam and Zimbabwe. Florence: UNICEF Office of Research https://www.unicef-irc.org/publications/pdf/Drivers-of-Violence Study.pdf.
- **C12** Example of impact on international civil society campaigns Peru country report of the Global Initiative to end all corporal punishment of children
- http://www.endcorporalpunishment.org/wp-content/uploads/country-reports/Peru.pdf
- C13 Example of impact on intergovernmental bodies in Latin America the Panamerican Health Organisation https://www.paho.org/salud-en-las-americas-2017/?tag=corporal-punishment