

Section A		
The fields in this section are mandatory.		
Institution: Leeds Arts University		
Unit of Assessment: 32 Art and Design: History, Practice and Theory		
Title of case study: Mature students matter: Accessing art and design higher education.		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2011-2019		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s): Dr Samantha Broadhead Martell Baines	Role(s) (e.g. job title): Head of Research Progression Manager	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI: January 2000 - Current date 2013 - Current date
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2016-2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N		
Section B		
1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)		
<p><i>Mature students matter</i>, describes the impact of research on mature students, communities of creative educators, policy makers and a learned society.</p> <p>The awareness of capacities, such as phronesis, has shaped attitudes towards learning in later life, enabling people to make better-informed decisions about studying as noted in AccessHE – UKADIA Creative HE Apply Guide 2020.</p> <p>The APPG (Art, Craft and Design in Education) are aware of the valuable contribution mature students make to learning as they lobby for arts education.</p> <p>Insights have informed Certa/Access's (validated by the QAA) art and design modules.</p> <p>National Society for Education in Art and Design (NSEAD) has been motivated to include Access to HE teachers and mature students in its community.</p>		
2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words) See paragraphs		
The nature of the research insights or findings, which relate to the impact claimed in the case study.		
<p>It was seen that mature students come to art and design education for many reasons, often from feelings of regret and frustration that they did not pursue a creative career earlier in life (Broadhead and Gregson, 2018; Broadhead et al., 2019).</p> <p>The 'signature pedagogies' of art and design when subjected to an analysis informed by Basil Bernstein's visible and invisible pedagogies could be seen to disadvantage some mature students (Broadhead and Gregson, 2018; Broadhead, 2015; Broadhead, 2014).</p> <p>Practical wisdom or phronesis (the ability to deliberate well drawing on life experience) was a capacity that mature students could use to navigate their learning journeys through higher education (Broadhead and Gregson, 2018; Broadhead, 2016).</p>		

Intergenerational friendships were found to be an important part of the student experience in art and design higher education, and contributed towards a democratic education where mature students could draw upon their practical wisdom to help others (Broadhead and Gregson, 2018; Broadhead, 2016).

The stories from mature students did not often refer to the practical wisdom of their teachers. (Broadhead and Gregson, 2018).

The research also found that a model of a 'democratic education' derived from Bernstein based on enhancement, inclusion and participation had the potential to enhance a student's capacity to draw upon their practical wisdom (Broadhead and Gregson, 2018).

A 'student life cycle approach' to supporting mature students was identified as one way of improving the experiences of mature students in art and design higher education (Baines, 2016).

An outline of what the underpinning research produced by the submitted unit.

This research began with a pilot study in 2010-2011 that asked if mature students were well-prepared to study in art and design higher education. The participants in this research had previously studied an Access to HE course, which was defined as a non-traditional route into higher education (Broadhead, 2014; Broadhead and Gregson, 2018).

A longitudinal study (2011-2014) was then developed from the initial project. The research explored experience of mature students studying for degrees in art and design through narrative inquiry. The analysis was informed by the ideas of Bernstein (democratic education) and Aristotle (practical wisdom or phronesis).

Any relevant key contextual information about this area of research.

Although there have been a couple of applications of Bernstein's work to an art and design context (Daniels, 2000; Gamble, 2004) - these have not addressed art and design pedagogy in particular, nor have they addressed higher education and the experiences of mature students.

Narrative inquiry has become well-established as a means of researching education. Consequently, the narrative inquiry took place over three years so that participants' stories at various points in time. This work was innovative because of narratives are conventionally collected at one moment in time.

The Office for Students (OfS) has identified mature students as a group with declining participation within higher education and research continues to be important (OfS, 2018).

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

- 1) Broadhead, S. Inclusion, democracy and the pedagogised other in art and design Higher Education. 2014. Article. Enhancing Learning in the Social Sciences. Vol 6, issue 1, April 2014, pp. 42-55. DOI: 10.11120/elss.2014.00020
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.11120/elss.2014.00020>
- 2) Broadhead, S. Inclusion in the art and design curriculum: Revisiting Bernstein and 'class' issues. 2015. Book Chapter. Hatton, K. (ed) Towards an Inclusive Arts Education. London, Trentham Books @IOE Press. pp. 138-152. ISBN-10: 1858566541
<http://lau.collections.crest.ac.uk/17356/>
- 3) Broadhead, S. Designing experiences: friendship and practical wisdom in the art and design higher education. 2016. Book Chapter. Closing the Gap: Bridges for Access and

Lifelong Learning. Forum for Adult and Continuing Education. pp. 85-103. ISBN-10: 0995492204 <http://lau.collections.crest.ac.uk/17515/>

4) Broadhead, S. & Gregson, M. *Practical Wisdom and Democratic Education - Phronesis, Art and Non-traditional Students*. 2018. Book. London, Palgrave Macmillan. ISBN-10: 3319733109 ISBN-13: 978-3319733104. Supplied by the HEI on request.

5) Broadhead, S., Davies, R. & Hudson, A. 2019. *Perspectives on Access: Practice and Research*. Bingley, Emerald Publishing. ISBN: 9781787569942. Supplied by the HEI on request.

6) Baines, M. 2016. An insight into the challenges that mature learners encounter across the student lifecycle in Art & Design Higher Education. Conference item. Open University Widening Participation Conference 2016 HE: Transforming Lives Through Life-wide Learning? Milton Keynes, 27-28 April, 2016.

<http://lau.collections.crest.ac.uk/17514/>

Evidence of the quality of the research must also be provided in this section.

- All of the research outputs have been through a rigorous peer-review process before publication or presentation.
- The project did receive peer-reviewed funding from the Learning and Skills Improvement Service (LSIS), which was managed by SUNCETT (Sunderland University Centre of Excellence in Teacher Training).
- The book *Practical Wisdom and Democratic Education - Phronesis, Art and Non-traditional Students, 2018*, was reviewed by Professor Frank Coffield on behalf of the University of Sunderland as a 4* output.
- M Davies has also externally reviewed *Practical Wisdom and Democratic Education - Phronesis, Art and Non-traditional Students* for the Journal of Widening Participation and Lifelong Learning, 21 (1) March 2019 - Open University pp. 145-151.
- The research output *Inclusion, democracy and the pedagogised other in art and design Higher Education* (2014) has been cited in other research, by M. Banks *Creative Justice* (2017) from University of Leicester.
- The research output *Inclusion in the art and design curriculum: Revisiting Bernstein and 'class' issues*, has been cited in the work of Marco Benoit Carbone (2019), Jasmine Holland-Gilbert (2019), Chris Koning and Ilga Leimanis (2019) from University of the Arts, London.

Who the grant was awarded to - S. Broadhead.

The grant title - LSIS-IfL Research Development Fellowship Bursary

Sponsor - Learning and Skills Improvement Service (LSIS)

Period of the grant: 2010-2011

Award: £6500.

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words).

Beneficiaries are Certa/Access practitioners and Access to HE Diploma (Art and Design) students. Research on mature students, phronesis and democratic education was shared with the Regional Student Representative meeting at Certa House, Wakefield: (14/01/2016) (Attendees -17 student representatives and 3 members of Certa/Access team). The importance of mature students' participation in politics in order to increase a feeling of institutional belonging was discussed. Broadhead was asked to be an expert contributor at the Certa/Access validation panel reviewing new Access to HE units in art and design, 05/04/2019. Broadhead's recommendations changed the units based on their research with mature students in art and design. [1]

Broadhead and Baines presented, "Why do mature students in art and design matter?", to APPG -Art, Design, Craft Education, Westminster, (12/02/2019), chaired by the MP Washington and Sunderland West and MP Batley and Spen.

The research contributed to changing awareness of 42 attendees from a wide range of arts organisations. Mature students were considered in an arena that usually lobbies for creative education in schools. Awareness and understanding were increased about the valuable contribution mature students make to their communities and institutions because they bring capacities such as 'phronesis'. [2]

On Twitter attendees noted that phronesis was new to them, but a useful concept. One respondent later tweeted that, "*The word of the day: Phronesis is an Ancient Greek word for a type of wisdom or intelligence. It is more specifically a type of wisdom relevant to practical action, implying both good judgment and excellence of character and habits, or practical virtue accrued over time.*" And later that, "*Many older people have fantastic wisdom that is essential.*" [2]

Research about the capacities of mature students and related framework for supporting mature students was disseminated to the NEON Mature Learner Working Group (30/10/2019). The beneficiaries of the research were widening participation practitioners and representation from the OfS. The research changed awareness about mature students in art, craft and design, and it promoted a new resource based on the research (the framework). It was noted in the minutes that: "*The art of 'surviving and thriving': A framework for mature students' is a good resource for basic provisions on how to support mature students through their university experience.*" [3]

Broadhead (21/09/2019) organised a Mature Students Matter (MSM) an event at Batley Community Centre. The local press published two articles and one quarter page advertisement to disseminate the research. [4] Broadhead gave also a short talk about mature students. The beneficiaries were 23 people residing in the Batley area including 3 with small businesses. 18/23 people said the research made them think differently about mature students in the arts. After the event the feedback included, "*Mature students bring a different, vital perspective of life experience to arts education*" and "*They have a mature approach to learning with life experience and clearer perspective*".[5]

Broadhead and Baines hosted a second MSM event (20/11/2019); presenting their research to 17 Access educators and mature students. The beneficiaries (people who had been mature students) talked about the impact Broadhead's research had on their own projects (Sew for Change, Art School/Ilkley, TCL collective). They were filmed and comments made include: "*The confidence I gained I have been able to pass onto other people, I am able to use research to underpin my practice*" [6], "*The research sits with me every day as an artist and educator,*" Other quotes include, "*I have given someone else some confidence and able to break down barriers and fears*". "*Research has had a massive impact on my practice.*" "*Leeds Arts University's research has had a huge impact; I would not be here as an environmental artist if it was not for the research.*" [7]

Further impact was created when the General Secretary of NSEAD saw the films and requested that a session on mature students start the 2020 conference for the first time. [8] There were 103 attendees and, "*The LAU Access group session was so well received, the feedback during the session, and on social media was tremendous ...I'd very much like to talk more about how we connect Access to HE with the NSEAD community – I think there is an enormous amount of interest*". [9]

The research has contributed to the AccessHE – UKADIA Creative HE Apply Guide 2020 (page 8). In the 2018 edition, mature students were not referred to in detail. The 2020

version acknowledges the research and includes a paragraph aimed at encouraging mature students to apply for creative subjects. [10]

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of ten references)

[1] Correspondence from CERTA and minutes from validation panel Jan 2016-March 2019.

[2] Minutes, The All-Party Parliamentary Group for Art, Craft and Design in Education, Tuesday 12th February 3-5pm, Room C, 1 Parliament Street SW1A 2BQ and screen shot of twitter feedback

<https://twitter.com/artteachjess/status/1095364249990385666>

[3] Correspondence and minutes from NEON mature learners working group 30 October 2019.

[4] The Press,

https://issuu.com/thepressnews10/docs/the_press_friday_september_6_2019 page 10.

[5] Tally chart and feedback sheets from delegates to Mature Students Matters events in Batley Community Centre 21 September

[6] Feedback from Art School/Ilkley. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mKXPeiBSigE>

[7] Feedback from TCL Arts Collective. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5KVO2i9J9MM>

[8] NSEAD online event capture. <https://youtu.be/24UGI-TH0v8>

[9] Correspondence and feedback from NSEAD about mature students event

[10] *AccessHE – UKADIA Creative HE Apply Guide 2020* (page 8),

<https://www.accesshe.ac.uk/yYdlx0u7/CreativeApplyGuide2020.pdf> .