

Impact case study (REF3)

Institution: University of Nottingham		
Unit of Assessment: 30 Philosophy		
Title of case study: Using trust to enable local voluntary, healthcare and business sectors to implement the 2019 NHS Long Term Plan		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2015-20		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s): Jonathan Tallant	Role(s) (e.g. job title): Professor in Philosophy	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI: 2007-present
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2018-January 2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N		

1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)

Under the 2019 NHS Long Term Plan, personalised care is the driving force behind seeking more effective partnerships between local voluntary and healthcare sectors, with further recommendations for the private sector around employment and well-being. Tallant's research on the nature of trust has enabled these sectors in Nottingham and Nottinghamshire to strengthen their ability to deliver joined-up, community-based services that meet the increasingly complex holistic needs of local residents and business communities. Specifically:

1. Nottingham Community and Voluntary Service has used Tallant's research to build trust internally and to make wise financial decisions that communicate trust to outsiders, at the same time freeing-up funds to improve its community-based services;
2. Nottingham's Renewal Trust has enhanced its training for its staff by integrating Tallant's philosophical approach to trust;
3. Nottingham and Nottinghamshire's Integrated Care System has benefited from Tallant's research on trust to inform its public consultation as it seeks to implement the NHS Long Term Plan at the local level. Its programme of public consultation has been held up as an exemplar around the country for other regions in their attempts to build public trust and engagement to successfully deliver personalised care;
4. Tallant's research has improved understanding of the nature of trust among local businesses, the Confederation of British Industry (CBI), and the national and international business community fora.

2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)

Since 2015 Tallant has been engaged in research on the philosophy of trust. This has led to the publication of four papers, each making a distinctive contribution to the philosophical literature. Each output focuses on improving our understanding of trust and/or exploring the ways in which the concept can and needs to be used outside of academia to drive an improvement in social, legal or commercial interactions.

Tallant [1] argues that leading explanations of trust and distrust only account for trust that is directly acted upon. However, one person may trust another to complete a task even if the trustor does not actually rely on the trustee. Similarly, distrust can be present even if one person does not rely on another to complete a task because they distrust them. Existing models of trust fail to accommodate this important fact. Tallant argues that for one person to trust another to perform some task the trustor is required to believe that the trustee has a commitment to carrying it out, and either rely upon the trustee to carry it out or believe that they could be relied on to do so if called upon. Similarly, one person's distrust of another would require that, if one withholds from asking another to complete a task, this withholding occurs because one does not believe the other is committed to carry out the act. Thus, trust and distrust are a product, not just of our specific engagements with another party, but of our beliefs about what would happen were we to engage with them. In developing this argument, Tallant focuses on showing how the

Impact case study (REF3)

counterexamples that he develops pose a significant problem for the account developed and defended by Katherine Hawley, explaining how his own model can handle them very straightforwardly.

Tallant [2] demonstrates that philosophical models of trust share a false presumption: that trust is an interpersonal relation - a relation that links one person to another (or to some others). To develop this point, Tallant considers a range of philosophical accounts of trust, drawn from across the literature. He shows how each of them assumes trust is an interpersonal relation and that the accounts in question would not give us an adequate analysis of trust in inanimate objects. Tallant then proceeds to provide a range of cases to show that people do in fact put their trust in inanimate objects. This facet of trust is of obvious importance in any scenario where we trust a system (for instance, a healthcare system) or technology (for instance, automated vehicles). Based upon Tallant's comprehensive survey of existing views and the novel examples discussed in his paper, he suggests that the leading accounts of trust are in need of revision and must be developed in such a way as to accommodate cases of trust in inanimate objects.

Tallant and Donati [3] demonstrate that philosophical analyses of trust ought to be preferred to those provided in business and make the case for the adoption of philosophical methodologies and analyses of trust within the business sector and in management settings. They also argue that these philosophical analyses and methods ought to be adopted as a tool for guiding how we build and develop trust. To deliver this result, Donati and Tallant [3] show there are cases of trust that business analyses misclassify as not being instances of trust, and cases that are not examples of trust that business analyses misclassify as instances of trust. They argue that this is striking and important given the ways in which the business literature supports empirical studies and management practice purporting to show how we can develop trust in companies, leadership, and a range of other business-critical functions.

Work in the philosophy of education, and in educational theory, blurs the distinction between trust and its preconditions. Tallant's work with Fisher [4] offers a critique of pre-existing work in the philosophy of education that has considered the role of trust. A primary focus of the paper is a careful discussion of the pre-existing literature, showing that it does not give an analysis of trust that is sufficiently rigorous to classify correctly all and only cases of trust as cases of trust, in particular noting that the distinction between trust and the preconditions for trust are not clearly distinguished from one another. One key claim defended in the paper is that in looking to explore and realise the benefits of trust, it is crucial to both our planning and research within an educational context that we hold apart the pre-conditions for trust and trust itself. In developing this line, Tallant and Fisher make the case for the importance of deploying philosophical analyses of trust when developing strategy and avenues for further research.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

- [1]. Tallant, J. 2017. 'Commitment in cases of trust and distrust', *Thought*, 6, 261-7. <https://doi.org.ezproxy.nottingham.ac.uk/10.1002/tht3.259>
- [2]. Tallant, J. 2019. You Can Trust the Ladder, But You Shouldn't. *Theoria*, 85: 102-118. <https://doi.org/10.1111/theo.12177>
- [3]. Tallant, J. & Donati, D. 2020a. 'Trust: from the philosophical to the commercial', *Philosophy and Management*, 19, 3-19. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40926-019-00107-y>
- [4]. Tallant, J. & Fisher, A. 2020b. "Trust in Education", *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 52, 780-90. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2019.1692304>

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Trust is a prerequisite of all societal transactions, particularly those between institutions and individuals; the customers, clients, or community members these institutions serve. Starting in April 2016, as part of a University-led *Enabling Innovation* programme funded by European Regional Development Funding (2016-19), Tallant engaged with a network of around 80 small and medium enterprises (SMEs) during the early stages of his research. This engagement enabled him to develop key collaborations with the local voluntary sector, charitable bodies, the NHS and the business community, aligning his interactions to help deliver the NHS England Long Term Plan (2019).

The NHS England Long Term Plan is intended to make personalised care 'business as usual' across the healthcare system, benefiting up to 2.5 million people by

Impact case study (REF3)

2023/24 (<https://www.england.nhs.uk/personalisedcare/upc/>). Universal Personalised Care (UPC) is partly driven by a new practice called Social Prescribing, whereby Link Workers liaise with patients to develop a more holistic plan of care than can be offered by GPs alone at the clinical level. Mental health, employment, housing needs, and fulfilling leisure are now linked together, along with more traditional clinical needs that can be met by GPs. However, effective linking of these care avenues requires careful new approaches to joining up local services. Universal Personalised Care relies upon strong relationships and levels of trust at the local level, where care for people with complex needs is most effectively planned and delivered. In Nottingham and Nottinghamshire this is achieved by an innovative working partnership (since 2019) between the NHS's Integrated Care System (ICS) working effectively with Clinical Commissioning Groups and the Voluntary, Community and Social Enterprise (VCSE) sector. Tallant's research on trust has enabled two of these partnerships – Nottingham's Community and Voluntary Service (NCVS) and its Integrated Care System – to make interventions in their plans to transform the delivery of personalised care, and has also helped improve business understanding of trust, in effort to drive up well-being in the service of realising the aims of the NHS Plan.

Enabling NCVS to deliver community-based services

After presenting on the nature of trust at the initial 2015 *Enabling Innovation* event for SMEs, Tallant was invited to join Nottingham Community and Voluntary Service (NCVS) in 2018 as a Trustee and became Chair in 2019 [A]. Among other initiatives, NCVS supports the voluntary sector by improving the quality of volunteering opportunities across the city, strengthening the sector's capacity to help its clients through promoting best practice, and speaking up for the voluntary sector on issues crucial to its future. As the Chief Executive remarks, *'given his areas of research and the challenges we faced, the Board of Trustees took the decision to co-opt Professor Tallant onto the Board of Trustees'* [A]. Since then, Tallant has implemented changes to the strategy and vision of the organisation, putting trust at the centre of these transformations: *'Drawing on his research on the nature of trust and distrust, as well as his work on the way that we treat trust in a management setting, we have been able to make significant progress'* [A]. This has included overcoming challenges regarding lack of trust between different members of staff and the reputation of the organisation within the sector [A]. According to the NCVS's Consultant Chief Executive, Tallant's understanding of effective trust in management settings has *'significantly improve[d] staff relationships and communications between various groups,'* and provided reputational benefits to the organisation through improving the *'external perception of NCVS'* [A], which was the first step towards increasing the effectiveness of NCVS as a crucial broker of community-based services [A].

Subsequently, by advising NCVS on *'judicious use of its finances'* in ways that communicate trust internally and externally, Tallant has enabled NCVS to generate £3m of funds by selling some of its assets (in progress). This was a critical achievement made possible through in-depth changes in relationship networks and the culture of the organisation, with the funds enabling NCVS to *'ensure the future of the organisation and its benefits to the voluntary organisations of the City of Nottingham'* in a way that *'takes into account the needs of our various stakeholders'* [A]. This sale means that NCVS can now be *'increasingly community based [...] we shall be developing meaningful partnerships that will ensure communities thrive and prosper and where volunteers are valued and recognised'* [C]. Galvanising a strategy and a sense of trust among the NCVS members, which was needed to achieve the sale, has increased the organisation's capacity and enabled it to be in the position to plan a more robust suite of community support programmes.

By January 2020, NCVS was working with the NHS and Nottingham's Clinical Commissioning Groups to help roll out Social Prescribing in Nottingham's eight local Primary Care Networks [B]. This work puts trust at its core, in order to work co-productively *'across Nottingham's [...] VCSE sector, building multi-agency partnerships, raising awareness of Social Prescribing, sharing learning and good practice, mapping the gaps of VCSE provision and supporting and strengthening the development of VCSE provision'* [B]. In particular, NCVS has successfully aided the induction process of the eight Link Workers *'who will enable patients to access appropriate support in the community, in order to improve their health and wellbeing'* [B].

Impact case study (REF3)

Enhancing staff training at Renewal Trust charity, Nottingham

The Renewal Trust is one such place of health and wellbeing support in Nottingham, a nationally recognised charity, which supports children, young adults and adults. The Trust is a community-based regeneration organisation that Tallant has worked with to help its staff explore different kinds of trust and how they help develop the charity in sustainable ways [1]. Following a day-long workshop with Renewal, participants committed to a sustainable policy change, to *'[r]ethink how we present our mission, ethics and culture strategy'*, with all members of the management team who attended noting that they had a better understanding of the kinds of trust and how they impact who trusts their charity [D]. As attendees state, other areas of influence included *'marketing and PR to communicate more the impact of our work to increase trust within the community'* [D]. Subsequent feedback from the CEO reported that, *'trust is particularly important in our sector as it underpins much of what we do, for this reason working on how to communicate it better with Jonathan was particularly welcome'*, also noting that the *'workshop has helped us to understand better the significance of trust in the context of how we operate as a charity and its value in terms of pursuing our goal of providing better support for community care and regeneration'*. [D]

Supporting Nottingham and Nottinghamshire's Integrated Care System (ICS) to implement the NHS Long Term Plan

Following an introduction to the Director of Communications and Engagement at the ICS by the CEO of NCVS, Tallant undertook a range of activities to support the ICS in the delivery of the NHS Long Term Plan. To implement the Plan, which puts personalised care at its heart, local areas in England were tasked with engaging closely with local populations *'to understand what matters to local people in their health services and to inform the development of a local system plan'* [F]. Working with Healthwatch Nottingham and Nottinghamshire, the ICS drew on Tallant's research (via two meetings) to pay attention to how people can put their trust in systems such as the ICS [1, 2]. The Director of Communications and Engagement at the ICS has explained that Tallant [1] *'influenced the design of the survey questions that were used with local residents, including the choice of wording'* and [2] helped make the case for, and articulated the content of, the materials used for communicating with these residents [E]. This influence on survey design was particularly important as it enabled the ICS to *'determine which areas within Nottingham to prioritise in the local strategy'* [E], influencing the roll out plans for the programme. Crucially, Tallant advised the ICS to provide information materials *'upfront to promote a sense of shared purpose and involvement'*, thereby strengthening levels of trust between stakeholders and the ICS [E].

As the Director of Communications and Engagement remarks: *'Tallant's input has led to a material improvement in our survey design and contributed to the significant level of success seen in the delivery of the engagement work'* [E]. During 2019, 1,000 local people took part in Integrated Care System's survey. As ICS remarks, with a very high, 85% completion rate for the survey, this was *'ahead of usual experiences, potentially as a result of the recommendation from Professor Tallant'* [E]. This led to invaluable new insights into how the ICS can implement the NHS Long Term Plan around areas such as *'mental health, urgent care, health prevention and more. These conversations with local people have given us a wealth of insight that will help us improve local services and deliver the NHS Long Term Plan in a way that reflects what matters to people'* [F]. Nottingham and Nottinghamshire's ICS has since been held up as an exemplar around the country for the way it has sought to implement the NHS Long Term Plan, influencing the guidance and practices in other regions [E].

As a result of this success, beyond Nottingham, Tallant was invited to address 300 NHS leaders, at an Integrated Care System Leadership conference in June 2019. This included leaders from hospitals, commissioning services, local authorities, community providers, and the voluntary sector - all now key agents in implementing the NHS Long Term Plan via its emphasis on Social Prescribing. Focusing on the nature of trust and distrust, Tallant's talk *'An Issue of Trust: Building trust within systems'*, enabled participants to understand the value of philosophical models of trust in addition to existing work in business systems, precisely because philosophical models such as Tallant's highlight the potential gap between actual trust and the preconditions for trust [1, 3, 4 [G]]. Tallant has since taken up an invitation to join the Integrated Care Partnership Forum, providing governance for the future development of integrated health

Impact case study (REF3)

provision in Nottingham and thereby moving towards the successful implementation of the NHS Long Term Plan.

Understanding trust for business in the context of the NHS Long Term Plan

Alongside the NHS, care and voluntary sectors, the NHS Long Term Plan recognises the vital part that employers have to play in improving health and well-being, asking '*employers to commit to supporting their employees' social wellbeing*' [H:117]. Trust is a key driver in work-place well-being. Against that backdrop, Tallant improved private-sector understanding of trust in order to help businesses deliver this plank of the NHS Long Term Plan.

As part of the *Enabling Innovation* programme, Tallant translated his research findings at two regional business fora in Derbyshire and in Nottingham, with 56 businesses present. These knowledge exchange events guided the business community on how trust is relevant to their business and management practices. The participating businesses commented that the research '*[m]ade you think about concepts that previously you had taken for granted.*' [I] His later, 2018 version of the business engagement workshop led to 8 of 11 attending companies committing to a sustained impact through a change of approach in how the SMEs communicate and build trust with clients, with the participants commenting: '*the workshop enables you to understand the different types of trust and how these might be gained and lost*' [I] Due to the success of these talks Tallant was commissioned to publish on trust in key publications within the sector, with the Federation of Small Businesses' piece in the '*First Voice*' on how Tallant's philosophical analysis of trust can inform business owners' approach to their own activities. This was later re-printed in both *Finance Digest* and *Entrepreneur and Investor*, with a revised version published by *Management Today*. Collectively the print readership for these is at least 25,000, with online readerships topping 240,000 and international audiences consisting of Presidents, CEOs, CFOs and senior decision-makers within Fortune 500 companies [I].

This appetite from the local business and community organisation sectors led to an invitation to present to the **Confederation of Business and Industry** (CBI). The event, a CBI Future Leaders meeting in June 2019, attracted rising talent from businesses of all sizes and sectors. Tallant's presentation was timed to coincide with the CBI's publication of 'Everyone's business', which tracks the perception of business. The event organiser reports that '*it was clear from the response of the group [at Tallant's presentation] that businesses do not always have a good insight into what Business Trust is*' [J]. As a result, Tallant was able to provide '*clarity*' to CBI members' understanding of trust and his work was deemed as '*extremely valuable*' as '*the group unanimously agreed that this insight helped them better understand the importance of trust in this context in protecting their reputation and furthering their business*' [J]. The knowledge filtered down into the practice of the CBI members, with the Midlands Associate Director noting that the '*group members were able to share this with their executive teams*' [J]. She also states that her own approach and practice changed: '*as associate director for the CBI in the Midlands, I have been able to speak more confidently on this matter in my member conversations*' [J].

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

[A] NCVS testimonial

[B] NCVS Website Material

[C] NCVS Report from its Commissioning and Procurement Sub-Committee

[D] Testimonial from CEO of Renewal Trust and Feedback Summary

[E] Integrated Care System Testimonial

[F] ICS Long Term Plan Engagement Integrated Insights Report, August 2019

[G] Letter confirming session with ICS leaders

[H] The NHS Long Term Plan: www.longtermplan.nhs.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/nhs-long-term-plan-version-1.2.pdf

[I] Dossier: Feedback from *Enabling Innovation* events and statistics on publications' circulation

[J] Testimonial from Midlands Associate Director of Confederation of British Industry (CBI)