

Institution: Royal Conservatoire of Scotland		
Unit of Assessment: 33		
Title of case study: <i>What's Going On?</i> and the Youth Music Initiative		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: June 2002 - present		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s): Professor Stephen Broad	Role(s) (e.g. job title): Director of Research and Knowledge Exchange	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI: June 2002 - present
Period when the claimed impact occurred: Jan 2014 – Dec 2021		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? Y		
<p>1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)</p> <p>In 2019, A-level music was 26th in a ranking of subjects by numbers of entries in England; in Scotland, the equivalent examination (Advanced Higher music) was ranked 5th - behind only Maths, English, Chemistry and Biology. So, what's different in Scotland?</p> <p>One thing that's different is the Youth Music Initiative (YMI), established in 2003 in response to <i>What's Going On? (WGO)</i> - a detailed study of youth music in Scotland undertaken by the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland. The YMI is a national funding and development programme for young people's music in Scotland, managed by Creative Scotland. Since its inception, it has supported Scottish local authorities to provide universal initial music-making experiences in schools and funded local and national music initiatives in the informal and nonformal sectors, allowing countless young people to make music who would not otherwise have done so. Over 18 years, successive Scottish Governments have invested £164.5m in the YMI, and it is distinctive, and possibly unique, internationally.</p> <p>It is perhaps not surprising, therefore, that music remains a popular subject in Scottish schools.</p>		
<p>2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)</p> <p><i>WGO</i> (Scottish Arts Council, 2003) offered new and substantially improved insights into young people's music making in Scotland, based on original research. It was commissioned by the Scottish Arts Council, Youth Music UK and the Musicians' Union and was coauthored by Broad (researcher in the present submission), Professor Celia Duffy and David Price OBE. Research was conducted between June 2002 and January 2003 and comprised a systematic investigation of young people's music making in Scotland, taking in all genres of music and a wide range of contexts for playing (excluding the school classroom).</p> <p>The report's commissioners required an evidence base upon which to develop future Scottish policy on music provision for young people and the report made a series of recommendations based on both qualitative and quantitative data drawn from a wide range of stakeholders, including young people themselves. Data collection methods included a range of questionnaires targeted at different stakeholders (n=543), focus groups throughout Scotland (n=40), and 50 key informant interviews. In addition, over 230 youth music groups provided quantitative data on their activities.</p>		

The research identified inconsistencies of provision, particularly of access to music making experiences, and the social and cultural barriers that made it more difficult for some young people to take part in music. It identified a lack of coherence across the sector, a need to support the informal sector especially, and an analysis of funding data showed the dominance of Western Classical music in funding streams, and the lack of support faced by youth music organisations working in Traditional music and Rock, Pop and Dance music. The continuous training needs of music leaders were highlighted, and these conclusions were set in the context of a growing body of evidence about the value of participation in music.

Following publication of the report, and the launching of the YMI, the researchers continued to work in partnership with the Scottish Arts Council, for example, designing the formula for distributing money to Local Authorities.

Subsequent commissions from the Scottish Arts Council (SAC) included research and production of the National Youth Music Strategy (2006), and a further report on the professional development and training of those who work with young people through music *A Sound Investment: Workforce Development in Music Education* (2008). A detailed analysis of sectoral data and stakeholder perceptions resulted in recommendations that included embedding funding for CPD within all awards, and a specific strategic fund that practitioners could access directly.

This research partnership continued with Broad's secondment in 2012 to Creative Scotland (the successor organisation to the SAC) as lead researcher in the development of *Time To Shine: Scotland's Youth Arts Strategy*; it was extended by a series of reports for Creative Scotland and the Scottish Government, including both original research and research syntheses such as *The Wider Benefits of Instrumental Music Learning in Childhood* (Drury), and by contributions to policy developments such as *A Culture Strategy for Scotland* (Broad, member of 6-person academic reference group).

In 2018, Creative Scotland worked with the Music Education Partnership Group (MEPG), a partnership of around 60 organisations working in music education in Scotland, to commission a follow up to *WGO*. Following a competitive tender process, the contract was again won by the Conservatoire in partnership with the University of Strathclyde, leading to a fully updated study with a remit extending to classroom music and national qualifications, led by Broad, with Dr Lio Moscardini, Andrew Rae, Katie Hunter, Alasdair Wilson and Graeme Smillie, published in February 2019.

The follow up study was published as *What's Going On Now? (WGON)* and examined data on music education and participation in conjunction with stakeholder surveys (n=1391) and detailed case studies of music making in contrasting locations based on key informant interviews.

The analysis in *WGON* suggested a range of significant issues facing music education in Scotland – including inequalities of opportunity, a supply-led system that inhibits demand, weaknesses in progression, and poor understanding of the value of music. At the same time, though, it revealed (in the words of John Wallace, then chair of MEPG) a 'buoyant' sector 'overwhelming in its sheer vibrancy'. Though music education in Scotland is a fragile ecology, the YMI is a vital part of the ecosystem.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

The key output of this research is:

- Broad, S., Duffy, C., and Price, D., *What's Going On? A National Audit of Youth Music in Scotland* (Edinburgh: Scottish Arts Council, 2003).
https://pure.rcs.ac.uk/portal/files/11342739/2003_with_Celia_Duffy_and_David_Price_W2.pdf

Additional outputs of the research are:

- Broad, S., Duffy, C., and Gardner, R., *A Sound Investment: Workforce Development in Music Education* (Edinburgh: Scottish Arts Council, 2007).
https://pure.rcs.ac.uk/portal/files/11342762/2007_with_Celia_Duffy_and_Rachel_Gardin.pdf

- [no authors given], *National Youth Music Strategy 2006-2008* (Edinburgh: Scottish Arts Council, 2006). Available on request
- [no authors given], *Time To Shine: Scotland's National Youth Arts Strategy* (Edinburgh: Creative Scotland, 2013).
[https://pure.rcs.ac.uk/portal/files/11342798/Time To Shine Scotlands Youth Arts Strategy.pdf](https://pure.rcs.ac.uk/portal/files/11342798/Time_To_Shine_Scotlands_Youth_Arts_Strategy.pdf)
- Broad, S., Moscardini, L., Rae, A., et al., *What's Going On Now? A Study of Young People Making Music in Scotland* (Glasgow: Music Education Partnership Group, 2019).
https://pure.rcs.ac.uk/portal/files/11342881/Whats_Going_On_Now_A_study_of_young_peop.pdf
- Broad, S., [Written briefing for John Swinney, Cabinet Secretary for Education and Deputy First Minister, 2019]. Available on request.
- Broad, S., Moscardini, L., Rae, A., *Youth Music Initiative (YMI) Impact Evaluation Report 2018-19* (Edinburgh: Creative Scotland, 2020). [2018/19 YMI Impact evaluation by Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, awarded following competitive tender]
https://pure.rcs.ac.uk/portal/files/11343061/YMI_Impact_Report_2018_19_FINAL.pdf

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

WGO has been influential in shaping successive Scottish governments' policies towards to youth music and, together with a continuing body of research undertaken by the Conservatoire, remains a foundation for policy, planning and funding of youth music across Scotland.

In the REF Assessment Period (AP) £75.1m has been disbursed by the YMI, £60.6m to Scottish local authorities by means of the formula designed by the research team of WGO, and a further £14.5m through individual awards made by Creative Scotland.

A key recommendation of WGO was that there should be advocacy for **'youth music opportunities, as an entitlement, for all young people in Scotland'** and that **'ways of targeting support to Primary schools'** should be sought. The YMI took this up, with an initial target that every child in Scotland would receive a year's free music tuition by the end of Primary 6 (later generalised to a year's free tuition before the end of Primary school). According to Creative Scotland's data, this was achieved in 2006 and around £7.2m per annum is now spent to sustain this target year on year through initiatives that complement, but are distinct from, local authorities' music tuition services.

WGO recommended the foundation of funding schemes **'to support strategic priorities within the informal sectors'**. Those strategic priorities included new access opportunities and actions to offer the informal sector **'greater support and advocacy'**. WGO also argued for the establishment of **'different levels of funding schemes including easy-to-access awards schemes for smaller projects and longer-term schemes for sustaining successful existing projects'**. These recommendations informed the YMI approach to supporting the informal and nonformal sectors. Creative Scotland disburses around £1.5m per annum through two complementary schemes: the 'Access to Music Making' (AMM) and 'Strengthening Youth Music' (SYM) schemes. Between 2014 and 2019, nearly £10.25m was invested through the AMM scheme, and a further £667k through the SYM initiative.

The effect on the employment context for music leaders has been significant, with (for example) 1582 jobs supported by YMI funding in 2017-18.

WGO recommended that **'both formal and informal sectors [should] work together and co-ordinate activities ... to achieve coherence and complementarity'**. The 'Formula Fund' enabled local authorities to employ a much wider range of artists and musicians and work in partnership with organisations in the informal sector, often for the first time. Similarly, in configuring the AMM and SYM schemes, Creative Scotland established an expectation for partnership working in the scheme guidance ('Who are you working with?' etc.).

Analysis of funding data in 2002 showed a **deep divide in the funding experiences of organisations working in different genres** of music – with those offering young people tuition in Western Classical music very much better funded than any other genre. Allied to this was an issue that the researchers called ‘cultural approval’ - broadly, the perception held by practitioners working in Traditional music and Rock, Pop and Dance that they were ‘second class citizens’ of the musical world. In funding more diverse musical opportunities, the YMI has been in the vanguard of sea change at Creative Scotland that can be observed in the stylistic diversity of their current Regularly Funded Organisations.

In particular, *WGO* highlighted the **lack of developmental opportunities for young rock and pop musicians** in 2002. The YMI responded to this by developing and supporting initiatives for burgeoning stars: during the AP, the YMI-supported Hit the Road programme, for example, has supported 45 young emerging artists to tour Scotland. Lewis Capaldi (Brit Awards 2020 Winner Best New Artist and Song of the Year) has highlighted Hit the Road and the YMI as pivotal in the development of his career.

WGO also noted that **‘singing ... was seen as the most obvious weakness’ of the Scottish scene** in 2002, and the YMI has strongly supported the National Youth Choir of Scotland to broaden its developmental role and significantly increase its reach across Scotland and beyond, such that during the AP it has hosted the Symposium of the International Kodaly Society (2015), and given performances of Berlioz’s *Lalio* at Carnegie Hall (2018) and the Philharmonie de Paris (2019).

WGO highlighted that **early years music was a major gap in provision** in 2002. The YMI’s response to this finding in funding the Scottish Book Trust’s Bookbug initiative is a good illustration of the reach and significance of the impact of the YMI, which has supported these music and language sessions for the very young (usually held in local libraries) since 2007; in the AP, the YMI has supported the training of 2534 Bookbug Session Leaders and a further 139 local trainers, resulting in around 1.8m attendances by young children at Bookbug sessions.

WGO highlighted an **‘urgent need for a framework of opportunities for practitioners to gain initial training, to update existing skills’**. This need was unpacked in more detail in *A Sound Investment* (2007). In response to this, Creative Scotland built in to all YMI funding schemes expectations for training and a CPD budget. In total, for example, 5,826 youth music practitioners benefitted from YMI funded training 2017-18. In addition, Creative Scotland has devolved to the Scottish Music Centre a sum from the SYM budget to which individuals can apply; this has disbursed a total of £390k in the AP directly to practitioners.

As noted above, the Conservatoire was contracted to update *WGO* in 2018, in a study that was published in 2019 as *What’s Going On Now? (WGON)*. The Scottish Government undertook to respond to the findings of the research in its Programme for Government 2018-19, and invited a briefing to inform the thinking of the Deputy First Minister John Swinney. Following an extended campaign by MEPG and a senior team at the Conservatoire, all major parties contending the 2021 Scottish Parliamentary Elections have incorporated key recommendations from *WGON* in their manifestos, including a commitment to make music tuition in schools free; the Scottish National Party manifesto specifically namechecks the YMI. Parallel to this, the Music Education Partnership Group - co-commissioners of *WGON* - has pursued its developmental recommendations through its We Make Music programme (www.wemakemusicscotland.org).

The number of young people on whom the YMI has had an impact over its 18-year history is very large, and successive impact evaluations commissioned by Creative Scotland indicate the reach of the initiative: based on these evaluations, we estimate that in the assessment period alone, around 1.5 million young people have had an initial experience of music at school through the YMI, and at least 500,000 had participated in out of school activities.

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

- Summary of the YMI, linked to the launch of *WGON* in February 2019.

<https://www.creativescotland.com/explore/read/stories/youth-arts/2019/ten-things-you-need-to-know-about-the-youth-music-initiative-yimi>

- Official Report of the Scottish Parliament: Meeting of the Parliament 14 May 2014 [Parliamentary Discussion around *Time to Shine*, at its launch].
- <https://archive2021.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/report.aspx?r=9178&i=91283#ScotParlOR>
- 2014/15 Impact evaluation of the YMI, by ODA Consulting, with a retrospective of previous years.
https://www.creativescotland.com/data/assets/pdf_file/0020/32753/YMI-Evaluation-Full-Report.pdf
- Official Report of the Scottish Parliament: Culture, Tourism, Europe and External Relations Committee 22 December 2016 [discussion of impact of the YMI, drawing on 2014/15 Impact evaluation by ODA Consulting].
- <https://archive2021.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/report.aspx?r=10716&i=98360&c=1962600&s=Youth%2520Music%2520Initiative>
- 2015/16 Impact evaluation of the YMI, by Research Scotland.
https://www.creativescotland.com/data/assets/pdf_file/0005/36878/YMI-2015-16-Impact-Report.pdf
- 2016/17 Impact evaluation, by Research Scotland
https://www.creativescotland.com/data/assets/word_doc/0009/49383/2016-17-YMI-Impact-Report-Full-Version.doc
- 2017/18 Impact evaluation, by Research Scotland
https://www.creativescotland.com/data/assets/pdf_file/0016/82060/YMI-Impact-Report-2017.18.pdf
- Interview with Lewis Capaldi, highlighting the importance of the YMI to his career (c.24mins in – strong language)
[023. Lewis Capaldi · George Ezra & Friends \(spotify.com\)](https://www.spotify.com/023.Lewis%20Capaldi%20-%20George%20Ezra%20%26amp%20Friends)
- Newspaper report in *The Herald* on the launch of WGON in February 2019.
<https://www.heraldscotland.com/news/17460872.100-000-scottish-pupils-missing-school-music-tuition/>