

Institution: University of Derby

**Unit of Assessment: 20** 

Title of case study: Changing police and investigative practice through the 'PEACE' method of investigative interviewing.

Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: November 2012–December 2020.

Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
Professor Ray Bull	Professor of Criminal Investigation	01 November 2012–present
Dr David Walsh	Reader in Investigation	01 Sept' 2006–28 Feb' 2018

Period when the claimed impact occurred: August 2013-July 2020

Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? No

# **1. Summary of the impact** (indicative maximum 100 words)

Poor quality police interviews, including those involving coercion or intimidation, lead to miscarriages of justice and reduced conviction rates. Bull's work underpinned the design, development, and now global spread of the 'PEACE' method of investigative interviewing. It is the basis of the forthcoming United Nations (UN) Universal Protocol. This method replaces 'interrogation' that can often be coercive and result in false confessions. In 2018, Bull accepted an invitation to be directly involved in the drafting of the 'Universal Protocol' for the UN which will be published in 2021 (delayed from late 2020 due to COVID-19). The ultimate impact is to reduce coercion and torture, to improve the rate and integrity of convictions and to minimise miscarriages of justice.

#### **2. Underpinning research** (indicative maximum 500 words)

Torture and miscarriages of justice remain an important global problem. The United Nations (UN) Special Rapporteur on Torture, Juan E. Méndez, has argued in favour of stronger universal standards of investigative interviewing to combat this. Bull and colleagues (including Walsh [at University of Derby between 2006 and 2018], Dando [Westminster], Cleary [Virginia Commonwealth], Snook [Memorial, Newfoundland] and Albuquerque [Braga]) investigated three inter-related topics: (1) the actual effectiveness of the 'PEACE' (Planning, Engage, Account, Closure, Evaluation) method of investigative interviewing (which is based on Bull's work), and its improvement; (2) the views of suspects/offenders about investigative interviewing/interrogating; and (3) how to interview suspects to best detect truth/lies. The underpinning research is in over 100 outputs between 1991 and the present, which include 41 outputs since November 2012 when Bull joined the University of Derby (UoD).

#### 1. The effectiveness of the 'PEACE' method

3.1 analysed over 50 police interviews with suspected murderers/rapists, finding that rapport/empathy and open-type questions were associated with an increased likelihood of suspects admitting the offence; and that some techniques traditionally taught in the USA were counterproductive. 3.2 examined over 100 interviews with suspected fraudsters, finding that: (i) better 'PEACE' skills were associated with gaining more, and more relevant, information/confessions; and (ii) that some skills needed to be strengthened and training

# Impact case study (REF3)



reformed. 3.3 found that Bull *et al.*'s new idea of 'category clustering' enhanced interviewees' recall; this technique is now being taught to investigators.

### 2. The views of suspects/offenders about investigative interviewing/interrogating

3.4 found that among 400 jail inmates, most strongly agreed with the notions that 'A police interviewer should give suspects a chance to tell their side of the story', 'interviewers should favour fact-finding over obtaining confessions' and 'treating suspects with respect'; and strongly disapproved of police using false evidence (still permitted in the USA). 3.5 found that 100 Canadian jail inmates indicated that they were more likely to cooperate and confess when evidence was strong and when interviews were conducted in a humanitarian fashion. These findings are contributing to the development of the UN's extensive 'Universal Protocol' on non-coercive interviewing, which Bull is directly involved in drafting (see section 4).

# 3. How best to interview suspects to detect truth/lies

3.2 and 3.6 focus on revealing evidence to suspects, comparing early with late and gradual disclosure (found effective in earlier work by Bull dating to 2003). In 3.6 the interviews were conducted by experienced police officers and in 3.2 by investigators working for a government agency. The two studies suggested that gradual disclosure led to substantially better truth/lies detection and this has become part of training in the UK and elsewhere. In 3.2, gradual disclosure was associated with more skilled interviewing using the 'PEACE' method. This research substantiates one of the key principles of the 'PEACE' method; namely, that 'what an interviewee says should be compared with what the interviewer knows in a strategic manner'.

# 3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

All underpinning research outputs are in recognised peer reviewed journals.

UoD researchers are indicated by black, underlined text:

- **3.1** Leahy-Harland, S. and <u>Bull, R.</u> (2017), 'Police strategies and suspect responses in real-life serious crime interviews', *Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology*, 32, 138-151. DOI: doi.org/10.1007/s11896-016-9207-8.
- **3.2** Walsh, D. and Bull, R. (2015), 'Interviewing suspects: examining the association between skills, questioning, evidence disclosure, and interview outcomes', *Psychology, Crime and Law*, 21, 661-680. DOI: doi.org/10.1080/1068316X.2015.1028544.
- **3.3** Paulo, R., Albuquerque, P. B. and <u>Bull, R.</u> (2016), 'Improving the enhanced cognitive interview with a new interview strategy: category clustering recall', *Applied Cognitive Psychology*, 30, 775–784. DOI: <u>doi.org/10.1002/acp.3253</u>.
- **3.4** Cleary, H. and <u>Bull, R.</u> (2019), 'Jail inmates' perspectives on police interrogation', *Psychology, Crime and Law*, 25, 157-170. DOI: doi.org/10.1080/1068316X.2018.1503667.
- **3.5** Snook, B., Brooks, D. and <u>Bull, R.</u> (2015), 'A lesson on interrogations from detainees: predicting self-reported confessions and cooperation', *Criminal Justice and Behaviour*, 42, 1243-1260. DOI: <u>doi.org/10.1177/0093854815604179</u>.
- **3.6** Dando, C., <u>Bull, R.</u>, Ormerod, T. and Sandham, A. (2015), 'Helping to sort the liars from the truth-tellers: The gradual revelation of information during investigative interviews', *Legal and Criminological Psychology*, 20, 114-128. DOI: <u>doi.org/10.1111/lcrp.12016.</u>



### **4. Details of the impact** (indicative maximum 750 words)

The impact of Bull's work is on: (1) international standards; (2) professional training; (3) police practice internationally and, through this, on (4) reducing harm and improving the quality of justice.

#### International standards

Bull's research has been influential in the UN's decision to develop a 'Universal Protocol' on the PEACE Method. The UN's Special Rapporteur reviewed all available research and drew heavily on Bull's work stating, "the work of Professor Bull has already influenced international standards with regard to investigative interviewing" [5.1.1]. Bull subsequently (in 2018) accepted an invitation to join a small 'Steering Committee' formed to draft the Universal Protocol [5.2], which is now close to completion.

### International training and professional development

Wicklander-Zulawski undertakes 450 training seminars globally each year with professional investigators. Under the influence of Bull's work (including 3.1 to 3.6), they changed their practice in March 2017. Wicklander-Zulawski's founding partner says, "Bull's research... played a part in our recent decision to no longer teach the confrontational Reid Nine Steps Interrogation Method...helped change our interview style to include the Cognitive Interview..." [5.1.4], which is based on the PEACE Method as developed and modified by Bull.

#### Domestic police and investigative training and practice in 18 plus countries

Bull's work has been influential in shaping police training and practice in multiple countries. The Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMT) attribute changes in practice (affecting all 33,000 officers) to Bull's work, including the adoption of 'tactical use of evidence' and a Phased Interview Model from 2014. A Detective of the RCMP said, "Bull's research ... cannot be overstated... has been instrumental in supporting our argument for transformation ... to a new more effective approach" [5.1.3]. In the US, a major change, "within the US government to stop the spread of brutal interrogation...directly relates to the global impact ... Bull is having today' [5.1.8], according to the former Director of the Naval Criminal Investigative Service and Assistant Director of Training at the Federal Law Enforcement Training Center. In the UK, Bull's research has led to changes in the way that police officers are trained. As the National Police Advisor on Interviewing notes: "it is not an overstatement to say that the training developed as a result of [Bull's] research has affected the working practices of every one of the over 100,000 police officers in England and Wales" [5.1.5]. Bull's research has had similar impacts on the training of thousands of police officers in Norway [5.1.2], Sweden ("20,000 officers") [5.1.7], Japan [5.1.9] and a range of other countries and organisations (including the US, New Zealand and the UN) where training is provided by Forensic Interview Solutions [5.1.7].

Further pathways to impact are through Bull being invited to provide direct input to policy and practice through invited presentations of his research to policymakers and police practitioners (since 2012): in Brazil (April 2014, to parts of the national government); Canada (February 2016, at the HQ of the Quebec Province Police); China (October 2018, at the Beijing Police Academy and at the Senior Officers University); Jamaica (June 2018, to police, organised by the British Foreign and Commonwealth Office); Malaysia (April 2014, at the National Police Academy); Mexico (October 2018 and April 2016, to over 100 investigators); Pakistan (December 2014, to terrorism investigators); Poland (September 2015, at the National Academy for Border Guards); Russia (November 2017, to child abuse investigators); South Africa (February 2015, to the Police Behavioural Science Branch); Taiwan (April 2017, at the National Police University); Thailand (May 2016, to the Royal Thai Police); USA (April 2015, to over 100 'interrogators').



# Harm reduction and improving the quality of justice

There are two ultimate beneficiaries of this research impact. The first are those who may have been subjected to coercive interrogation or torture without the PEACE method being applied. The second ultimate beneficiary is the general public interest in justice. This is because Bull's research also shows that the PEACE method produces more reliable evidence and better quality convictions. It is impossible to quantify the scale of these benefits credibly. However, the international reach of the adoption and shaping of practice noted here suggests that both are very widespread and substantial. As an indication of this, the former UN Special Rapporteur notes that Bull's research and the changes in practice it has brought about, "will have a profound impact on hundreds of thousands (if not millions) of individuals across the globe..." [5.1.1].

**5. Sources to corroborate the impact** (indicative maximum of 10 references)

#### 5.1 Group of statements from individuals and organisations

- **5.1.1** Regarding impact on the United Nations' 'Universal Protocol' Former UN Special Rapporteur on Torture (2010-2016). Testimonial date: 7 December 2018.
- **5.1.2** Regarding impact in Norway and beyond Detective Superintendent of the Oslo Police District, Norway. Testimonial date: 3 December 2018.
- **5.1.3** Regarding impact in Canada Detective Sergeant of the RCMP. Testimonial date: 28 November 2018.
- **5.1.4** Regarding impact in the USA and beyond Founding partner of Wicklander-Zulawski.
- **5.1.5** Statement regarding impact in the UK National Vulnerable Witness Advisor, National Crime Agency. Testimonial date: 30 November 2018.
- **5.1.6** Statement from CEO, Forensic Interview Solutions FIS, Washington, DC, US.
- **5.1.7** Statement from Senior Lecturer in Forensic Psychology, Kristianstad University, Sweden and former Detective Sergeant, Swedish Police. Testimonial date: 22 November 2018.
- **5.1.8** Statement from Director, ClubFed LLC.
- **5.1.9** Statement from Professor in the Department of Comparative Psychology, Ritsumeikan University, Osaka, Japan. Testimonial date: 20 December 2018.

# 5.2 United Nations report recommending the global adoption of the PEACE method

Evidence of impact is available in a United Nations report (2016) that recommends world-wide adoption of the 'PEACE' method (in paragraphs 47 to 55 and especially in paragraph 48 that describes essential aspects of the 'PEACE' method).

Available at: <a href="https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/839995/files/A">https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/839995/files/A</a> 71 298-EN.pdf (Accessed: 6 January 2021).