

Institution: University of Cumbria		
Unit of Assessment: UOA23: Education		
Title of case study: Making educational practice equitable: challenging stakeholders' attitudes towards promoting Fundamental British Values and Prevent Strategy		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2013- 2018		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
Sally Elton-Chalcraft	Professor of Social Justice in Education	2002-Present
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2016-2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N		
1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words) <p>Our collaborative research revealed the negative effects of the current UK Counter terrorism legislation on education and challenged stakeholders' understanding of how the Prevent Strategy (PS) and the promotion of Fundamental British values (FBV) in educational settings has been counterproductive – stigmatising and silencing the Muslim community and fuelling dangerous nationalistic and racist attitudes. The research influenced teacher educators, student and classroom teachers to re appraise and/or change established thought, policy and practice in regards to FBV/PS. A review commissioned by an independent government committee has utilised the research to make recommendations that FBV/PS is divisive and counter-productive and that the teaching of FBVs in school should be reviewed. Finally, community and County Council leaders have utilised the research to consider how PS and FBV might not serve the best interests of the communities they serve.</p>		
2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words) <p>Context: Fundamental British Values (FBV) were first set out in the government's Prevent Strategy (PS) in 2011, and include the rule of law, individual liberty, and mutual respect and tolerance of those with different faiths and beliefs. Between 2011 and 2014, schools were required to 'respect' these values, but, since 2014, must now have a clear strategy for embedding these values and demonstrating how their work with pupils has been effective in doing so. Furthermore, the requirement "not to undermine FBV" has become part of the Teachers' Standards (DfE, 2012) slipping silently and seemingly unchallenged from the PS.</p> <p>Research Programme: Elton-Chalcraft published R1 in 2009, an empirical, child-centred study examining children's views of cultural diversity and efforts to counter racism in schools. From 2012 to 2018 a group of five researchers from four Universities utilised this research (R1) to investigate the incorporation of FBV into educational policy and standards. Elton-Chalcraft, Lander (Leeds Beckett) and Revell (Canterbury Christ Church) invited early career researchers Warner (Cumbria) and Whitworth (Middlesex) to assist with data collection in a collaborative project designed to evaluate teacher and student teacher responses to FBV/PS (R2). Elton-Chalcraft subsequently commissioned colleagues to co-author chapters in a widely used teacher education text book (R4) and in an international handbook (R3). The research received esteem through keynotes at Limerick and Edge Hill University and a co-authored blog for British Educational Research Association (BERA).</p> <p>Findings: R1 demonstrated how nine and ten year olds have internalized the prevailing western mind-set, regardless of ethnicity, and that this can be racist in nature. R2 explored this further within policy by problematizing the Teachers' Standards (DfE, 2012) requirement to promote FBV in initial teacher education in England; interviewing 20 teachers and surveying 450 student teachers. R2 uncovered misconceptions, fear and dysconscious racism owing to a lack of nuanced training for pre-service and in-service teachers. R3 examined data from 150 students, and demonstrated that despite a normative attachment to notions of professional objectivity and political detachment in the classroom, most student teachers interpreted their new duties as legitimate and were uncritical of legislation and policy that expects them to play an overtly political role in schools.</p>		

We deduced that the concept of FBV is unchallenged and its racialising implications are unrecognized by most teachers. R2 also revealed that the government's directive to promote FBV within a statutory document that regulates the teacher education is a politicization of the profession by the State, thus implying that teachers are State instruments of surveillance. R4 analysed these findings for use by student teachers.

Ultimately, the research demonstrated how FBV/PS creates an 'us' and 'them' binary; an assertion of 'our' British values; and a need for 'them' to assimilate into British society. This consequentially silences marginalised voices, creates a fearful and intolerant (often Islamophobic) environment ultimately counter to the intended aim. This outcome is additionally enforced within the 'hidden curriculum', a side effect of schooling: "[lessons] which are learned but not openly intended" (Valence 1973/2014). This is to say that teachers, outside the formal curriculum, through their rapport with learners, displays and body language, can reinforce 'us' and 'them' binaries that promote white, Western outlooks at the expense of other perspectives.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

- R1. Elton-Chalcraft, S. (2009). *It's not just Black and White, Miss: Children's awareness of race*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books. <http://www.ucl-ioe-press.com/books/social-justice-equality-and-human-rights/its-not-just-about-black-and-white-miss/>.

R4 has been published by Trentham Books, a world-renowned publisher for race and equality.

- R2. Elton-Chalcraft, S., Lander V., Revell, L., Warner, D. & Whitworth, L. (2017). To promote, or not to promote Fundamental British values? Teachers' standards, diversity and teacher education. *British Educational Research Journal*, 43 (1) p.p 29-48. doi.org/10.1002/berj.3253.

Published in a journal linked to the British Educational Research Association (BERA) – one of the principal associations for educational research in the UK with international reach. R1 was also cited in the BERA keynote given by Professor Carol Vincent (UCL).

- R3. Revell L., Bryan H., Elton-Chalcraft S. (2018). Counter Terrorism Law and Education: Student Teachers' Induction into UK Prevent Duty Through the Lens of Bauman's Liquid Modernity. In: Trimmer K., Dixon R., S. Findlay Y (Eds.) *The Palgrave Handbook of Education Law for Schools*. (p.p 553-565). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham. doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-77751-1_27.

R2 has been through a rigorous peer-review process and has been published in an international handbook.

- R4. Elton-Chalcraft, S, Revell, L. & Lander, V. (2018). Fundamental British Values: your responsibilities, to promote or not to promote? In Cooper, H. and Elton-Chalcraft (Eds.) *Professional Studies in Primary Education*. (Chapter 15). London: Sage. <https://uk.sagepub.com/en-gb/eur/professional-studies-in-primary-education/book254478>.

R4 (now in its third edition) is a widely used resource in teacher education and is used as a reference point for institutions in the UK.

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Impact 1: Challenging established norms and modes of thought for teacher educators

Our research has provided evidence to empower and enable teacher educators to more effectively instruct trainee teachers to navigate FBV within a regulatory environment whilst maintaining independence and debate. We have generated attitudinal change in educational professionals, some of whom initially welcomed the Prevent Strategy (PS) and uncritically promoted Fundamental British Values (FBV). Educational professionals have had their 'eyes opened' (S1) to discriminatory practice and, as a result, changed their practice.

Through engagement with the FBV research, Professor Putwain (Liverpool John Moores) invited Elton-Chalcraft to present research at a workshop for schoolteachers, academics and teacher educators (S1). The twelve attending teacher educators expressed how our research provided evidence to support the stance they wanted to take in their Initial Teacher Education (ITE) sessions (S2). Formerly, they were hesitant about communicating contradictory messages to students when attempting to adhere to PS duty and 2012 Teaching Standards requirements. However, the research benefited these teacher educators by giving them the confidence to voice their mistrust in the Prevent policy, whilst not undermining their university's compliance to governmental directives. One teacher educator (S3) utilised the research as a key reference point for dialogue on best practice and policy at professional bodies including the British Educational Research Association, Universities Council for the Education of Teachers, and American Educational Research Association. Thus our research has challenged conventional wisdom of uncritical adherence to governmental policy in ITE practice, in the context of FBV.

Presentation of the research at this workshop stimulated a change in mindset, leading delegates to question their assumptions and approach to professional practice. For example: “[the research] prompted a renewed understanding of the critical multiculturalist stance” (S2); and “has challenged me to separate out the attitudes people have towards FBV... I will encourage students to engage in deeper thinking” (S2). The research challenged teacher educators to engage with students differently, and to see the need to create critical spaces and identify experts to critique the blanket promotion of FBVs, supporting teachers to adapt to these cultural values.

A Teacher Educator (S3) said that his teaching had been impacted by R2, creating space for consciously opening up and improving discussions and debate on sensitive areas. A Dean of Education (S4) further stated that “[the] research has influenced student teachers by altering their views and informing their practice as professional educators, and prompting them to consider delivery of the curriculum in relation to Fundamental British Values and the Prevent Strategy...[the] research is enormously important in terms of raising (student) teacher's awareness of the complexities of radicalisation and extremism as it is too often simplified”. These teacher education comments demonstrate how the research has altered their views and informed their practice in their professional educational contexts. Teacher educators also believed Prevent to cause instances of Islamophobia (suggested in our research findings)

Impact 2: Improving awareness of FBV and more inclusive practices amongst school teachers and school pupils

Our research has changed perceptions about the extent to which FBV is effective in realising the intended aims of PS; and provided teachers with new perspectives on how to implement PS more effectively. For example, one teacher stated: “I now have a clearer understanding of the ‘far right’ and also how FBV’s are closely linked to Prevent, so the seminar discussing the research has deepened my understanding and informed my professional practice” (S2). Three teachers felt that they did not have the confidence to embed this in the curriculum because of uncertainty around the suitability of FBV, and felt emboldened after the workshop, saying the research had “altered their perception of what effective multicultural education should look like”. Teachers felt the implications of the research upskilled them to consider more carefully their own professional response to promoting FBV’s; challenging them to be inclusive when promoting British values with children from different countries, races and religions.

Our research on the PS and how to interpret and apply this differently to reflect different cultures, helped teachers to realise they were “not doing enough multicultural work, always doing Roald Dahl”, rather than including examples from a range of authors outside the traditional canon. They said they had learnt from the workshop not to compare cultures or make one culture superior (S2). This is particularly significant in the context of the ‘hidden curriculum’ whereby teachers ‘choices’ about the language and resources they use, or the stance and approach they take, can have a significant effect on children’s perceptions of FBV/PS.

The research has therefore increased teacher’s understanding of how FBV/PS, can engender an ‘us’ and ‘them’ binary or ‘insider’ / ‘outsider’ stance. This has subsequently informed their ability to make informed decisions on their professional practice for developing inclusionary practices and understanding of different cultures within an inherently white, Western, patriarchal school

system and culture. Regarding changed policy or classroom practice, teachers (S2) expressed their intentions to adapt school policy and curriculum and to *“think more deeply about how to follow governmental directives in a more critically aware way.”*

Elton-Chalcraft additionally consulted with two teachers in Greece during a study visit in April 2019. One (S5) described how the research had impacted on her mind-set; making her more aware of how the PS in Britain was similar to the Greek context where Syrian Muslim children were being victimised and silenced by the majority of Greek teachers. This teacher felt more empowered to speak to others about her work with refugees as a result of our discussions: *“Sally’s research helped me understand how the dominant group can leave out the minority group..... A part of the teaching body, either agrees with this political directive or disagrees and tries its best without a great deal of the state’s support. A significant number of teachers, however, adopt these practices without realising it.”*

The link between Prevent and Islamophobia was also raised at the 2019 ‘Today’s Youth, Tomorrow’s Future’ Conference’ (Chaired by the Archbishop of York), where Elton-Chalcraft was an invited panel member working alongside pupils from local schools. The link between Prevent and faith discrimination was confirmed by the views of teenagers, including one delegate (a migrated Indian Sikh) who came to realise that teachers may inadvertently silence the voices of Muslim children, resulting in their prejudicial treatment (S6). The individual felt empowered and reassured that academics were unveiling and challenging racism (an aim of R2) stating that the research *“has helped me as a migrated Indian Sikh to think about my place in British society”*, and to *“realise how teachers are motivated to become agents of surveillance which in turn result in muting the voices of Muslim children.”*

Impact 3: Informing public and political debate on the effectiveness of FBV/PS as a strategy for countering extremism

A July 2019 review titled ‘Critiquing Approaches to Countering Extremism’ was commissioned for the UK Government’s ‘Commission for Countering Extremism’ (conducted by Dr Struthers (Warwick) and Dr Webber (Georgetown University)) and cites R2 as part of an academic analysis on the negative discourse around FBVs. The review’s conclusions state that *“the teaching of FBVs is fraught with problems and is divisive and counter-productive. It is not doing the job that needs to be done,”* and that *“the Government is urged to abandon the obligation on schools to promote FBVs, and review this aspect of the Prevent strategy”* (S7).

More recently, we have seen members of the Labour party consider scrapping the PS, including Rebecca Long-Bailey MP who proposed as part of her leadership campaign (February 2020) that: *“The Prevent programme has alienated the Muslim community, set back our freedoms and not made us safer. The evidence is clear: it’s got to go”* (S8).

The research has benefitted local authority school training and equality policies. The Strategic Policy and Scrutiny Adviser for Cumbria County Council (S10) has utilised the research to work with schools on dismantling inequality: *“[the] research has been influential on informing my attitude towards Prevent and my practice”*. Specifically, the research has been used as an evidence base to advise school leaders (359 in Cumbria) on discussions about British Values in the context of Black Lives Matter, and to help understanding about the processes of structural discrimination. This has ensured teachers appreciate how uncritical adherence to FBV can be counter-productive by silencing certain groups and creating in/out groups; thus helping children to be treated equitably. More broadly the research has provided an evidence base for Cumbria County Councils 2020-24 Equality Objectives and the mandatory e-learning for all staff and elected members (S10).

Impact 4: Contributing to community programmes on equality, diversity and inclusion

In the context of the pandemic (and resultant inequalities), as well as events such as Black Lives Matter, Elton-Chalcraft has utilised her research to engage with stakeholders across the region on issues around equality and diversity. This has led to the research influencing the thinking and practice of community leaders.

For example the High Sherriff (S9) of Carlisle stated: *"Your research has been influential on my thinking and practice as I conducted my role as High Sheriff of Cumbria 2019/20. That is in addition to my (many years of) work as a Magistrate. I am also active on numerous Boards and Councils where I often mention specific bits of your work. Most recently, I have drawn on the research in my equality, diversity and inclusion work across the county."* S9 also stated: *"I've spoken about you to other professionals and non-professionals alike because I think there is a real place for your knowledgeable voice in our really confused, sometimes dysfunctional society"*.

This led to Elton-Chalcraft providing a keynote at the Race2B BAME Conference (funded by the Cumbria Community Foundation), which *"resulted in the development of a wide ranging group involving the Police, Anti-Racist Groups, and both Carlisle and Cumbria County Council's actively investigating structural reform and activities to make Cumbria more inclusive"* (S9). Subsequently, Elton-Chalcraft co-founded the Cumbria Race Equality Network with the former High Sherriff (S9), Chair of Cumbria Multicultural Society, Chair of Anti-Racist Cumbria, Strategic Policy and Scrutiny Advisor for Cumbria County Council (S10), and representatives from the Police. The networks mission is to work collaboratively towards eliminating racism.

Finally, Elton-Chalcraft jointly facilitated Carlisle's first Culture Bazaar which saw 100 pupils from 4 primary schools take part in arts and crafts, food tasting, dancing and story-telling (S11). Organised with Multicultural Cumbria (MCC) on the Carlisle campus, the Bazaar promoted equality and respect. MCC's Chief Officer said: *"I wasn't sure how the mini Culture Bazaar would be in this new environment but, as the schools came in, any anxiety disappeared with their smiley excited faces – and that was just the teachers and university student volunteers. There was such a positive vibe and that came from everyone involved. We hope to do more of this in the future with the University of Cumbria. The start of something big, determined and focussed. It was an all-round wonderful experience."* (S11). Engagement with the event and the research also raised awareness about diversity in Cumbria amongst around 25 first-year student teachers and a cohort in the final year of their Education Studies.

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

- S1. Putwain, D. (11 March 2020). Centre for Educational Research Seminar Series 2019-2020. Liverpool John Moores University. <https://www.ljmu.ac.uk/research/centres-and-institutes/centre-for-educational-research/seminar-series>.
- S2. Elton-Chalcraft. S., (2020) *Evaluation Report: Workshop Attended by Teacher Educators and Teachers* (Liverpool John Moores). UoC Institute of Education. Provided as PDF.
- S3. Testimonial correspondence from Associate Professor of Education, Middlesex University, corroborating impact claims on professional bodies & facilitating debate. [Corroborator 1].
- S4. Testimonial correspondence from Dean of Education, Huddersfield University, corroborating claims on student teacher influence. [Corroborator 2].
- S5. Testimonial correspondence from Primary School Teacher, Argalasti, Greece corroborating claims on empowering teachers to be inclusive with refugees.
- S6. Testimonial correspondence from Sixth Former, Workington Academy, corroborating claims on raising awareness of PS and faith discrimination. [Corroborator 3].
- S7. D. Webber, A. Struthers. (July 2019) *Critiquing Approaches to Countering Extremism: The Fundamental British Values Problem in English Formal Schooling* Commission for Countering Extremism. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/critiquing-approaches-to-countering-extremism-the-fundamental-british-values-problem-in-english-formal-schooling>. Published as evidence in the lead up to a report making recommendations on extremism to the Home Office. See p6.
- S8. K. Proctor. (20 February 2020). *'Rebecca Long-Bailey vows to make it Labour policy to scrap Prevent'*. The Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/politics/2020/feb/20/rebecca-long-bailey-vows-labour-policy-scrap-prevent-scheme?CMP=Share_AndroidApp_Gmail
- S9. Testimonial letter of support from High Sheriff of Cumbria 2019 corroborating claims on community impact. [Corroborator 4].
- S10. Testimonial letter of support from Strategic Policy and Scrutiny Advisor, Cumbria County Council corroborating claims on policy initiatives and work with schools. [Corroborator 5].
- S11. S. Smedly. (8 February 2020). *Together we can build stronger links*. Whitehaven News. <https://www.whitehavennews.co.uk/news/18216506.together-can-build-stronger-links/>.