

Section A		
Institution: University of Manchester		
Unit of Assessment: 19 (Politics and International Studies)		
Title of case study: Jam and Justice: shaping policy through co-production		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2016 – 2020		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s): Liz Richardson	Role(s) (e.g. job title): Professor of Public Administration	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI: 2006 – present
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2016 – 2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? No		
Section B		
1. Summary of the impact		
<p>Professor Liz Richardson's research on bottom-up ways to govern towns and cities has directly influenced public policy and individual organisations in Greater Manchester (GM). The research has:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Directly contributed to the adoption of the principle of 'co-production' as a policy across the work of the Greater Manchester Combined Authority (GMCA). 2. Embedded 'social value' in procurement policy in Greater Manchester. 3. Assisted in developing a local energy market in the city region to reduce carbon emissions. 4. Led to the adoption of co-production by a local charity. 		
2. Underpinning research		
<p>The impact is underpinned by research conducted in <i>Jam and Justice: Co-producing Urban Governance for Social Innovation</i> (2016-2019) delivered jointly by the Universities of Birmingham, Manchester, and Sheffield (PI) and the Greater Manchester Centre for Voluntary Organisation (GMCVO). Liz Richardson was the Manchester lead, as Co-I on the underpinning ESRC grants (ES/N005945/2; ES/N005945/1), lead author for three of the five academic outputs, and joint co-author on the other two.</p> <p>Jam and Justice comprised participatory 'action research projects' with a total of 22 partner organisations. Partners included practitioners in charities and local government, citizens, and political leaders. The aim was to test ways to connect decision makers, civil society, and citizens, involving those usually excluded from decision-making processes, to address complex social issues. The project strongly emphasised developing ideas of co-production as a means to influence how cities are governed, how policy decisions are made, and what can be done collectively to tackle urban issues.</p> <p>The Jam and Justice research by Richardson and her colleagues finds that:</p>		
<p>a) Finding more effective, inclusive, and equitable ways to govern cities is required whenever there are complex and often seemingly intractable social issues [1]. A key way to achieve this is through 'co-production'. Co-production entails bringing together a variety of actors with diverse interests and sets of expertise – technical, scientific, and direct experience – to engage in collective problem-solving, with the objective of developing and testing different solutions. Co-production involves embracing more equal power relations between stakeholders who enjoy formal power and stakeholders who are traditionally seen as marginalised [1,2].</p>		
<p>b) In policy-making, co-production involves citizens and civil society groups working with scientists and researchers, together with city and city-regional governments, to develop creative solutions to 'wicked' problems. Generating such solutions requires</p>		

the combined efforts of professional and technical experts working with people with alternative forms of expertise [2].

- c) There are many **challenges with coproduction**, both in incentivising groups to carry out coproduction in the first place [3] and then in doing it well. Effective coproduction in governance requires including more diverse voices in decision-making and policy formulation, but it is incredibly complex to work out which particular voices should be incorporated and heard [4].
- d) Decentralisation risks perpetuating pathologies identified with **top-down governance** [5]; co-production offers an innovative framework for **bottom-up local governance**.
- e) Co-production should not involve fixed models for governance, but instead a series of **principles and frameworks** [1].

3. References to the research

Research quality: outputs were published in peer-reviewed journals, including *Nature*, and by a University press.

Outputs:

1. Durose, C. and **Richardson, L.** (2016) *Designing Public Policy for Co-production*, Bristol/Chicago: Policy Press/University of Chicago Press. Reviewed in *Political Studies*: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1478929917716890> and *Political Studies Review*: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1478929917716890>
2. **Richardson, L.**, Durose, C. and Perry, B. (2019) 'Moving Towards Hybridity in Causal Explanation: The Example of Citizen Participation', *Social Policy and Administration*, 53(2): 265-278. <https://doi.org/10.1111/spol.12481>
3. Durose, C., **Richardson, L.** and Perry, B. (2018) 'Craft Metrics to Value Co-production', *Nature*, 562: 32-33. <https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-018-06860-w>
4. **Richardson, L.**, Durose, C. and Perry, B. (2019) 'Three Tyrannies of Participatory Governance', *Journal of Chinese Governance*, 4(2): 123-143. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23812346.2019.1595912>
5. **Richardson, L.**, Durose, C. and Dean, R.J. (2018) 'Why Decentralize Decision-making? English Local Actors' Viewpoints', *Governance*, 32(1): 159-176. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gove.12365>

Grants:

Jam and Justice: Co-Producing Urban Governance for Social Innovation was funded by ESRC Research Grants ES/N005945/2 (Sheffield, Sep 2016–Dec 2019, GBP659,794) and ES/N005945/1 (Salford, Jan–Aug 2016, GBP801,488). It also received match-funding from Mistra Urban Futures to support participation and public engagement activities.

4. Details of the impact

The research directly influenced public policy on co-production in Greater Manchester. Greater Manchester (GM) was chosen because of the devolution to the city-region and the Greater Manchester Combined Authority (GMCA), which is a blueprint for devolution in other regions in England.

Pathways to Impact:

Impact was achieved via three key pathways:

1. Over 100 research sessions held as part of the 12 '**action research projects**', with citizens and professionals in GM, including 98 non-academic co-researchers.
2. Jam and Justice organised 237 activities, including 29 briefings and invited guest talks, 24 dissemination events, five social events, and four international knowledge and policy exchange visits to Glasgow, Cape Town, Barcelona, and Gothenburg,

each with 15-20 non-academics including senior GM policy actors. In total, 700 individuals and 200 organisations were reached through the project activities.

3. A targeted policy exchange programme was developed with GMCA (the 'Developing Co-Productive Capacities' programme). This forged a city-regional coalition for change, working with strategic leaders in the GMCA to change cultures and ways of doing things away from a top-down to a more bottom-up approach.

Impact:

Through these activities, Richardson's research with Jam and Justice has directly influenced public policy and individual organisations in Greater Manchester in the following ways:

1. Adoption of the principle of co-production as a policy across the work of the Greater Manchester Combined Authority

Richardson's research with Jam and Justice led to a major change **towards more bottom-up policy-making and co-production**, including a GBP150,000 investment in co-production by the GMCA.

In 2017, representatives of the GMCA and Greater Manchester's VCSE (voluntary organisations, community groups, and social enterprises) sector signed an 'Accord' (written agreement) to work together toward better services and increased community involvement. The Greater Manchester Centre for Voluntary Organisation, which had a leading role in these agreements, **cites Richardson et al.'s findings with the Jam and Justice project on "inclusive governance within devolution" as a key driver** [A].

Jam and Justice worked with Anne Lythgoe, Principal Officer for VCSE Accord Implementation at the GMCA, to engage with the VCSE sector. Lythgoe states that she was able **"to implement changes informed by the Jam and Justice research.... The research not only empowers officers and politicians to be brave and say 'we know what the problem is, but we don't know all the answers, so we must involve different people' but gives us parameters and principles to do this well"**. She continues: **"I cannot commend Jam and Justice highly enough for the work, and its impact: strengthening Greater Manchester's capability for and meaningful commitment to coproduction"** [B].

Richardson's research with Jam and Justice has also shaped the *Age Friendly Greater Manchester and Equalities* portfolio and the establishment of the GM Independent Inequalities Commission (inequalities caused by Covid-19), where local people **"will be actively involved in the process, helping to shape the Commission's conclusions and recommendations"** [B,C]. This cites Jam and Justice as a major influence for co-production [C].

In January 2019, the Mayor of GM, Andy Burnham, affirmed the significance of the collaboration between the GMCA and the VCSE sector through both **a commitment to GBP150,000 to a co-production project and a request to the 10 member Local Authorities to participate** in a **"genuine opportunity to develop a community of practice around co-production . . . through the unique access to practice-led and international research provided by our involvement in ... Jam and Justice"** [D]. From this directly flowed a **commitment to 'support and enable citizen involvement in how services for people are designed, delivered, and evaluated. This particularly holds true for co-production involving those who have experienced severe and multiple disadvantage. We will use the emergent public / VCSE [sector] community of practice, Jam & Justice work, citizen-led movements focused on devolution...to better embed citizen-led activity and create 'services for people' or 'services with people' rather than 'public service'** [E].

2. Procurement in the public sector – embedding social value in procurement policy in Greater Manchester

Richardson and others' work with Jam and Justice on co-production led to a **major shift in procurement in GM**, where GBP7,000,000,000 in public money is spent annually. The research developed a policy framework to accelerate the **implementation of 'social value' in procurement**. Social value concerns the social and ethical practices of the firms being considered as suppliers (e.g. their environmental practices, social responsibility to the local community, and working conditions for their employees). There was already a commitment in principle to consider social value when spending public money in GM, alongside traditional procurement criteria of cost and quality. However, there was a gap in persuading organisations across the city-region to apply these ideas in practice; as Lythgoe testifies, Jam and Justice research showed that existing processes were *"unlikely to be delivering meaningful social value"* [B]. This is because *"[i]t was impossible for the desk-based analyst to judge"* this and the VSCE sector was *"struggling to make sense"* of the process. Jam and Justice *"demonstrated that we needed to affect 'deeper change': Greater Manchester needed a framework so Social Value could become everyone's business"* [B].

Jam and Justice research showed that *"we could not rewrite policy without first overhauling the Combined Authority's understanding of social value and its place in our wider strategy"* [B]. Jam and Justice then helped to develop a **much-improved understanding of social value** – the 'Social Value Framework' [B]. The Framework was **approved by the GMCA** in September 2020 and is now used to shape public sector spending across GM. As Lythgoe notes, this redefines the understanding of 'social value' more inclusively and with clearer priorities, making it much easier to use, enabling businesses and organisations to fully understand social value and, as a result, *"places social value at the centre of everything we do"* [B]. This has, according to Lythgoe, **significantly changed "procurement decisions at the Combined Authority, the Health and Social Care Partnership, Transport for GM and Greater Manchester Police (a combined annual budget in excess of GBP7,000,000,000)"**, ensuring a clear and meaningful account of social value **that is in reality taken into account** (rather than solely on paper) [B].

Jam and Justice's Social Value Framework has also **influenced procurement beyond Greater Manchester**. A central part of this framework is the 'Good Employment Charter' – which, for instance, requires a commitment to good-quality working conditions for staff – which has informed the City of Liverpool's understanding of social value [B].

3. Reducing domestic carbon emissions – developing a local energy market in the Greater Manchester city region

One of Jam and Justice's action research projects investigated different models for increasing citizen control over the governance of the energy system in Greater Manchester. The work resulted in a set of proposals for greater municipal energy ownership in Greater Manchester, *GM Energy Futures* [F]. As Jonathan Atkinson, co-founder of Carbon Co-op (a project partner) states, *"Local ownership of our energy system is an obvious lever in creating citizen-led change in the clean energy transition"* [F]. Atkinson reports that **the collaboration "helped me create a real-world research framework to inform Carbon Co-op's work, adding structure and rigour to my practice.... The collaborative work has raised our profile, helped position the organisation as a serious player in the municipal energy sector and helped cement our role as an advocate for a citizen-led energy transition."**

Beyond Greater Manchester, Carbon Co-op drew on Jam and Justice research to share best practice on municipal energy in response to climate change **with local authorities**

across Europe [F]. This was through the Horizon 2020-funded mPOWER project, which fosters peer-to-peer networks enabling cities to explore fair, clean, and democratic energy options based on participatory methods. This work also delivered the successful award of GBP6,200,000 to GMCA from Innovate UK's 'Prospering from the Energy Revolution' programme [F].

4. The adoption of co-production practices by a local charity

Manchester Settlement is a North Manchester charity providing services to one of the most deprived communities in England. Its Chief Executive worked with Jam and Justice for three years to **reconceive the charity's work "through the lens of co-production"** [G]. It led to a distinct shift from a paternalistic model of providing services to a holistic and collaborative person-centred model. The charity has since successfully applied for funding for several projects, including a three-year project to co-design and deliver a community health and wellbeing service, and a project to improve the quality of relationships between parents and their children in their first 1,000 days of parenthood. Its Chief Executive states that Richardson and colleagues' findings through Jam and Justice projects have created "*space for genuine co production, rather than offering off-the-shelf solutions to aid easy commissioning*" [G]. He also notes that "*projects had appeared in spaces that were not defined by anybody else. That was significant to me, because so much of my work had been defined by objectives, statutory requirements, outcomes, that someone else wants me to achieve. In Jam and Justice, I found all the experiences I have had and am having valued*" [G]. He adds that "*the impact of my engagement with Liz and the Jam and Justice project... upon... my organisation, my beneficiaries, and other organisations... has been quite **transformative***" [G].

5. Sources to corroborate the impact

- A. Memorandum of Understanding with the GM HSC Partnership (section 11.1.2). 12 May 2017.
- B. Testimonial from Principal Officer for VCSE Accord Implementation at the GMCA. Received 21 September 2020.
- C. Update on GM Independent Inequalities Commission (November 2020)
- D. Record of decisions taken at 25 January 2019 GMCA meeting
- E. VCSE Reference Group policy paper – The Next 10 Years. A Greater Manchester VCSE Policy Position Paper (January 2020)
- F. Testimonial from the founder of Carbon Co-op. Received 30 October 2020.
- G. Testimonial from Chief Executive Officer of Manchester Settlement. Received 21 October 2020.