

Institution: Bournemouth University		
Unit of Assessment: 34		
Title of case study: Changing the global understanding of police use of less lethal weapons against peaceful protesters		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2013-2020		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s): Dr Anna Feigenbaum	Role(s) (e.g. job title): Associate Professor in Communication and Digital Media	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI: 2012-current
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2015-2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N		
1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words) <p>In many places, peaceful protesters are met with tear gas and other so-called less lethal weapons, intended to control crowds without taking lives. Since 2013, Bournemouth University (BU) researchers have investigated historical use of less lethal weapons, mapped their use, examined less lethal weapon markets and generated data on related deaths and injuries. This research has been used by; policymakers, non-governmental organisations, journalists, human rights advocates and campaigners to shape policy, improve practice and successfully campaign against the misuse of less lethal weapons.</p>		
2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words) <p>Tear gas was first used in World War One, and quickly became the weapon of choice for security forces across the globe. One hundred years later, tear gas and other weapons, now referred to as less lethal weapons (LLW) are seeing rapid growth.</p> <p><i>Lack of monitoring and little public information on LLW markets</i></p> <p>There are currently no national or international systems in place to publicly monitor and record the sale, trade and use of the deployment of LLWs by police against civilians. These systems are needed for journalists, campaigners and policymakers to understand the use, misuse and real-world effects of LLWs.</p> <p>Feigenbaum's research provides the first sustained inquiry into financial motivations that animate the production of LLWs, as well as the corporations that sell these weapons to countries with records of sustained LLW misuse, such as: Venezuela, Israel, France, Turkey, Hong Kong and Bahrain [R1, R2, R3].</p> <p><i>Data deficit on deaths and injuries</i></p> <p>At present, it is extremely difficult to understand the scale, scope and resulting serious injuries from police use of force against peaceful protesters as data is dispersed and not systematically reported or collected. Medical journal articles tend to be small-scale, localised studies on specific weapons and injuries. Humanitarian organisations focus their studies on specific medical or legal investigations (such as Physicians for Human Rights, National Institute of Justice, Inquest) or they focus on individual events or regions (such as Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch). In addition, journalistic reporting on these events is often inaccurate and inconsistent in how it understands the weapons used and their effects.</p>		

Feigenbaum's team produced datasets on police use of LLWs on civilians. In particular, they mapped news reports of mass tear gassing in 2013 and 2015, compiled existing aggregated reports and argued for a shift from analogue forms of police monitoring to data-driven methods for the aggregation and synthesis of police monitoring initiatives [R1, R4, R5]. Together, these findings evidence the need for more systematic approaches to the recording and monitoring of data on deaths and injuries due to the use of LLWs on protesters. This also demands more accurate recording by human rights monitors, medics and journalists of the weapons used by law enforcement and the associated injuries they cause.

Lack of understanding of police force against protesters and the rise of LLWs

Public understanding of the appropriate use of force and deployment of LLWs at both the national and international level remains poor. There is a need for clearer knowledge exchange on the UN Basic Principles of Force, and for improved public discourse and historical understanding of the rise and use of protest policing methods for journalists, campaigners and policymakers.

Feigenbaum's research used original archival materials and digital methods to investigate the history of use of force regulation and the rise of LLWs. This research identified a history of contestation over the permissibility of LLWs and their direct association with the challenges faced by peaceful protest [R1]. In addition, through collaboration with Dr Kanngieser (University of Wollongong, Australia), Feigenbaum developed a conceptual framework for understanding LLWs as a form of 'atmospheric governance', arguing that we must consider LLWs as atmospheric governance that seeks not only to control bodies, but architectural and territorial space through their attempt to control the air [R6].

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

R1 is a monograph; R2-R6 were all subject to rigorous peer review.

R1: Feigenbaum, A. (2017). *Tear Gas: From the Battlefields of World War I to the Streets of Today*. Verso Books.

R2: Feigenbaum, A. and Weissmann, D. (2016), "Vulnerable warriors: the atmospheric marketing of military and policing equipment before and after 9/11," *Critical Studies on Terrorism*, 9(3), pp. 482-498. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17539153.2016.1197642>

R3: Feigenbaum, A. (2015), "Riot Control Agents: The Case for Regulation," *SUR-International Journal on Human Rights*, 22, pp. 101-113. http://eprints.bournemouth.ac.uk/29242/1/07_SUR-22_ENGLISH_ANNA-FEIGENBAUM.pdf

R4: Feigenbaum, A. and Weissmann, D. (2020), "What Counts as Police Violence? A Case Study of Data in the CATO Institute's Police Misconduct Reporting Project," *Canadian Journal of Communication*, 45(1). <http://dx.doi.org/10.22230/cjc.2020v45n1a3453>

R5: Feigenbaum, A. and McCurdy, P. (2018), "Nuit Debout | Activist Reflexivity and Mediated Violence: Putting the Policing of Nuit Debout in Context," *International Journal of Communication*, 12, 21, pp. 1887-1907. <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/157860273.pdf>

R6: Feigenbaum, A. and Kanngieser, A. (2015), "For a politics of atmospheric governance," *Dialogues in Human Geography*, 5(1), pp. 80-84. <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F2043820614565873>

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Informed policy change

BU researchers, with the Omega Research Foundation, produced a report based on Feigenbaum's research [R1], commissioned by the Council of Europe's (CoE) Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights on the use of tear gas by police against peaceful demonstrators in member states between 2006 and 2016 [E1a]. Recommendations 2 and 9 [E1a] were adapted for inclusion in points 7.2 and 7.3 of the Parliamentary Assembly of the CoE's Resolution 2116: Urgent need to prevent human rights violations during peaceful protests [E1b].

The report was passed to the CoE's European Committee for Democracy through Law (Venice Committee), influencing the revised Guidelines on Freedom of Peaceful Assembly (3rd ed.) 2019 [E1c]. The Committee's Co-Secretary said, *"I shared [the report] ... the colleagues from the Venice Commission were pleased to receive it as they are in the process of revising their guidelines on peaceful assembly"* [E2].

Enhanced journalistic practice

Feigenbaum has worked with journalists reporting for more than 50 different media outlets in more than 25 countries, garnering a media reach of over 2,000,000 since 2016.

In 2019, Feigenbaum produced a guide for reporting on the use of tear gas and LLWs in Hong Kong, used by over 25 journalists. The guide was repurposed in 2020 for the Black Lives Matter protests, hosted by Columbia University's Dart Center for Journalism and Trauma; a resource centre and think tank for journalists who cover violence, conflict and tragedy around the world. As of 8 December 2020, it had been viewed over 600 times.

[Text removed for publication] said, *"Anna's research has directly informed, and indeed started, stories my team has produced on the use of tear gas, less lethal munitions and anti-protest equipment. In 2019, Anna analysed video evidence we collected of police overreach in Hong Kong, which became a series of stories ... [that] drew attention to police abuses"* [E3a]. [Text removed for publication] [E3b, E3c].

Speaking more broadly, [text removed for publication] said, *"Anna's research and her commentary on the use of tear gas has educated journalists and editors who are covering instances where its use is questionable. It has created an understanding that scrutiny of police forces who use tear gas is a valid reporting target"* [E3a].

Changed organisational practice

According to Amnesty International (AI), *"the use and often misuse of law enforcement equipment in the context of policing public assembly has emerged as a key issue for Amnesty International's research and advocacy work [...] Bournemouth University's work on this area is crucial for furthering our understanding of the effects of tear gas, tracking its trade and combatting its misuse"* [E4]. In 2019 and 2020, Feigenbaum consulted with project leads to help conceptualise the scope and design for Tear Gas: An Investigation – a new AI digital storytelling platform and advocacy campaign around the use of tear gas on peaceful protesters. It has received 12,834 unique page views since its launch in June 2020 [E5].

From collaborating with Feigenbaum since 2011, [text removed for publication] has acquired skills in data visualisation and communication strategy that have improved its communications, benefitting the NGOs and practitioners they work with [E6]. *"We sent these [infographics] out to ... people defending human rights quite frequently to help them to understand the different types of projectiles that have been used"* [E6].

Improved recording and monitoring of LLWs and use of force

Beginning in 2015, Feigenbaum led the development of RiotID; a civic media project designed to help civilians and journalists in protest situations to identify LLWs, comprising infographics,

training materials, lesson plans and a board game, available in eight languages. RiotID has been used at workshops in the United Kingdom, the United States, Palestine, Brazil and South Korea by over 100 human rights monitors, field medics and journalists, who reported an increase in skills and knowledge relating to monitoring and recording [as demonstrated by E7]. The RiotID website, launched in June 2019, has seen over 10,000 visitors.

[Text removed for publication] describes how RiotID “*has been a really useful project in terms of communicating information and building relationships with people who are involved in protests in various countries ... [RiotID has] encouraged us to record information more accurately and safely*” [E6].

Shaped artist-led campaigns leading to the resignation of an LLW dealer from the board of the Whitney Museum of American Art

In a 2015 article titled The Unlikely Connection Between the Whitney Museum and Riot Gear [E8a], arts magazine Hyperallergic cited Feigenbaum’s arguments that the corporate producers of these weapons must be exposed and held accountable for their misuse [first published in E9, then R1]. A resulting public campaign in 2018 led to the resignation of Warren B. Kanders, CEO of LLW supplier Safariland, from the Whitney Museum board in July 2019 [E8b, E8c]. The campaign involved over 1,000 participants and included direct action protests in the museum and outside Kanders’ home.

Also involved in this campaign was Forensic Architecture, a research agency based at Goldsmiths, University of London, who responded to an invitation to participate in the 2019 Whitney Biennale with the research project Triple-Chaser - a statement on Kanders’ involvement in the tear gas industry [E10a].

On Feigenbaum’s book [R1], Forensic Architecture says: “*[it] was foundational to our thinking on the [Triple-Chaser] project in those early stages, as were the calls and discussions that we had with Anna during the early stages of our research, around January 2019. [...] her research did not only inform further academic work, but also action in the world, which ultimately led to the resignation of Warren B. Kanders from his position at the Whitney Museum of American Art*” [E10b].

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

E1:

E1a: Bournemouth University and Omega Research Foundation. (2016). *Use of tear gas on peaceful protestors by Council of Europe member states*. [online]. Available at: http://www.civicmedia.io/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/USE-OF-TEAR-GAS-ON-PEACEFUL-PROTESTERS-BY-COUNCIL-OF-EUROPE-MEMBER-STATES_final.pdf [Accessed 23 February 2021].

E1b: Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly, Resolution 2116 on Urgent need to prevent human rights violations during peaceful protests. (Adopted by the Parliamentary Assembly Members on 27 May 2016 at the May Standing Committee.) Available at: <https://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML2HTML-EN.asp?fileid=22802&lang=en>

E1c: European Commission for Democracy through Law. (2019). *Guidelines on Freedom of Peaceful Assembly (3rd edition)*. [online] European Commission. Available at: [https://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/default.aspx?pdffile=CDL-AD\(2019\)017-e](https://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/default.aspx?pdffile=CDL-AD(2019)017-e) [Accessed 23 February 2021].

E2: Council of Europe Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights. (2016). Testimonial letter, 11 March.

E3:

E3a: [Text removed for publication]

E3b: [Text removed for publication]

E3c: [Text removed for publication]

E4: Amnesty International. (2015). Testimonial letter, 21 July.

E5: Amnesty International. (2020). Email, 7 December.

E6: [Text removed for publication]. (2019). Interview with Billur Ozgul, 14 February.

E7: [Text removed for publication]. (2018). Testimonial letter, 5 July 2018.

E8:

E8a: Steinhauer, J. (2015). *The Unlikely Connection Between the Whitney Museum and Riot Gear*. [online] Hyperallergic. Available at: <https://hyperallergic.com/219311/the-unlikely-connection-between-the-whitney-museum-and-riot-gear/> [Accessed 23 February 2021].

E8b: Weber, J. (2018). *A Whitney Museum Vice Chairman Owns a Manufacturer Supplying Tear Gas at the Border*. [online] Hyperallergic. Available at: <https://hyperallergic.com/472964/a-whitney-museum-vice-chairman-owns-a-manufacturer-supplying-tear-gas-at-the-border/> [Accessed 23 February 2021].

E8c: Vartanian, H. (2019). *After Kanders: Reflecting on the 2019 Whitney Tear Gas Biennial*. [online] Hyperallergic. Available at: <https://hyperallergic.com/521412/after-kanders-podcast/> [Accessed 23 February 2021].

E9: Feigenbaum, A. (2015). *OPINION: The profitable theatrics of riot control*. [online] America.aljazeera.com. Available at: <http://america.aljazeera.com/opinions/2015/5/the-profitable-theatrics-of-riot-control.html> [Accessed 23 February 2021].

E10:

E10a: Forensic Architecture. (2019). *Forensic Architecture*. [online] Available at: <https://forensic-architecture.org/investigation/cv-in-triple-chaser> [Accessed 23 February 2021].

E10b: Forensic Architecture. (2020). Testimonial, 11 March.