

Impact case study (REF3)

Institution: University of Leeds		
Unit of Assessment: 33B		
Title of case study: Professionalising Arts Fundraising and Philanthropy		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2012-19		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
Ben Walmsley	Professor of Cultural Engagement	2012–present
Leila Jancovich	Associate Professor in Cultural Policy & Participation	2016–present
Anna Upchurch	Lecturer in Creative Industries & Cultural Policy	2009–16
Period when the claimed impact occurred: July 2014-ongoing		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N		
<p>1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)</p> <p>Arts Fundraising and Philanthropy (AFP) is a national programme funded by Arts Council England to transform the fundraising skills and success of arts and cultural organisations. Since 2014 the programme's academic strand, led by the University of Leeds, has effected a step-change in arts fundraising and leadership by applying Walmsley's, Jancovich's and Upchurch's research on arts evaluation, change management, relational leadership, arts funding and cultural policy. This research drove the development of a pioneering curriculum that to date has been delivered to 112 UK arts professionals via an annual National School and accredited Postgraduate Certificate, and to 13,116 global online learners via a Massive Open Online Course (MOOC), <i>Effective Fundraising and Leadership in Arts and Culture</i>, delivered on the FutureLearn platform. Sector and evaluation data demonstrate that this dissemination has stimulated a more highly skilled, resilient and sustainable sector, which is better applying fundraising strategies to become less reliant on diminishing public funding.</p>		
<p>2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)</p> <p>In his research on arts evaluation, Walmsley [1, 2] advocates for a holistic, creative and neo-institutionalist approach to cultural value and arts evaluation, which would reflect both intrinsic and instrumental benefits, and combine qualitative and quantitative methods. Specifically, the key implication of this reconceptualisation of value is that cultural activity should be evaluated not on return on investment but rather against a balanced range of objectives and articulated in an inclusive, authentic language that encompasses artists' and audiences' voices, and reflects artistic practice [1]. By focussing on the imperative for arts leaders to integrate artistic and creative values, objectives and operations into the organisational mission, [2] underlines the case for the exceptionalism of arts management from business/commercial management. These ideas are drawn on directly to underline the concept of creative management and strategy explored in the PG Cert topic <i>Arts Management: History, Theory and Strategy</i>. They also inform MOOC activity <i>Developing a vision and mission-based values</i>. In short, Walmsley's research shaped the emerging field of arts fundraising by placing cultural value and ethical leadership at its heart.</p> <p>Findings from Walmsley's empirical case study of managing organisational change at a major regional theatre [3] inform the <i>Cultural Leadership and Change</i> topic in the PG Cert and the MOOC activity <i>Applying Change Management – Theories and Practice</i>. Walmsley highlights how change should be incremental or evolutionary rather than revolutionary, advocating for an emergent model of change where leaders enable rather than dictate change. He concludes that leaders must distribute responsibility for change across their organisations and create a climate that enables change to occur on a daily basis.</p>		

In her historical analysis of the arts council movement, **Upchurch [4]** illustrates how traditions and mechanisms of arts funding and philanthropy were developed via collaborations between intellectuals and philanthropists, who shared the paternalistic viewpoint that they could address social problems better than 'ineffective' politicians and governments. In the early 20th Century, philanthropy was governed and guided by traditions of patriarchy and funding decisions were largely based on the artistic preferences and personal contacts of a metropolitan elite, based notably in London. **Upchurch's** insights framed the AFP curriculum, through taught sessions on the PG Cert, by providing a critical historical account of arts funding, fundraising and philanthropy by exploring the origins of the arts council movement and illustrating how some of these historical perspectives (e.g., regarding paternalism, elitism and the London/metropolitan bias) continue to influence debates about English cultural policy development today.

In their extensive critical literature review of cultural leadership, Nisbett and **Walmsley [5]** note the positive bias towards charismatic leadership and promote alternative models: relational, distributed and servant leadership. These ideas have been cited by numerous scholars and used to support research into sexual harassment in the arts and culture and into the authority of conductors in youth music. They have directly influenced UK arts fundraising and leadership via their privileged role in the curricula for the National School and particularly the PG Cert, where **[5]** forms the basis of a key assessment for the *Cultural Leadership and Change* topic.

Jancovich's study of the national Creative People and Places programme **[6]** advocates an asset-based approach to place-based funding and calls for increased accountability of the cultural sector through participatory governance at a local level. **Jancovich's** research informed the culture and regeneration aspect of the National School and particularly MOOC activity *Cultural Leadership in Practice: Exploring the Role of Leaders*, where the theory was illustrated via specialist interviews with Chenine Batheana, Creative Director for Coventry 2021 and Jim Beirne, Chief Executive of Live Theatre Newcastle.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

1. Walmsley, B. 2012. Towards a balanced scorecard: a critical analysis of the Culture and Sport Evidence (CASE) programme. *Cultural Trends*. **21**(4), pp.325–334.
2. Walmsley B. 2013. Whose value is it anyway? A neo-institutionalist approach to articulating and evaluating artistic value. *Journal of Arts & Communities*. **4**(3), pp.199–215.
3. Walmsley, B. 2019. Managing change and the implications for leadership. In: Byrnes, W. and Brkić, A. eds. *The Routledge Companion to Arts Management*. London: Routledge, pp.121–137.
4. Upchurch, A. 2016. *The Origins of the Arts Council Movement: Philanthropy and Policy*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
5. Nisbett, M. and Walmsley, B. 2016. The romanticization of charismatic leadership in the arts. *Journal of Arts Management, Law, and Society*. **46**(1), pp.2–12.
6. Jancovich, L. 2017. Creative People and Places: An experiment in place-based funding. *Journal of Arts and Communities*. **9**(2), pp.129-147.

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Context and summary overview

In January 2013, Arts Council England (ACE) awarded the newly created Arts Fundraising and Philanthropy consortium a major Strategic Fund award (GBP2,000,000) via a Transforming Arts Fundraising grant. The fund addressed significant skills gaps in the arts and cultural sector by supporting activity to professionalise fundraising across England, while improving perceptions of the arts as a charitable cause **[A]**. The AFP consortium comprises: Cause4, a social enterprise company supporting charitable organisations to change and grow, the Arts Marketing Association, and the University of Leeds – the latter bearing responsibility for the academic elements of the programme. Design of the entire England-wide programme of mentoring, action learning and digital skills development to promote innovative and effective practice in arts fundraising began in April 2013, and delivery of the first academic course launched at Leeds in July 2014. The consortium was awarded a further GBP2,000,000 (National Portfolio/Sector Support funding) for the period 2018–2022. Through an intensive iterative process of collaborative curriculum development between the core partners, research by **Walmsley, Jancovich** and **Upchurch** directly established the first ever accredited programme for arts fundraising and philanthropy in Europe.

The core beneficiaries of this research are UK arts and cultural practitioners and organisations. To date the AFP has created a cohort of 112 fundraisers and leaders through the National School and the PG Cert, and an additional global learning community of 13,116 via the MOOC. Through these initiatives, best practice in arts fundraising and leadership, based on rigorous underpinning research, has been disseminated across and beyond England's arts and cultural sector. This activity has effected positive change across the sector, which can be evidenced by tracking ACE's Annual Data Surveys over the past 5 years [B]. These demonstrate a rise in contributed income (from sponsorship, trusts and donations) across the National Portfolio of GBP82,000,000, or 46%, from GBP180,000,000 in 2013/14 to GBP262,000,000 in 2018/19. Across a constant sample of regularly funded organisations this constitutes a rise of 9.6% over the past 3 years. Successive Private Investment in Culture Surveys have demonstrated that private investment in arts and culture grew from GBP397,000,000 in 2013/14 to GBP545,000,000 in 2017/18, a rise of GBP148,000,000 (+37%) [C]. Correspondingly, a formal survey of the first three AFP cohorts (2014–16) found that 55 Fellows had directly raised or helped to raise an additional GBP1,600,000 of income and had tangibly influenced more confident, innovative and effective ways of fundraising in their host organisations [D]. As one Fellowship host commented: 'It is really refreshing to find individuals who are passionate about good fundraising, and best practice in fundraising, and about the art. And if that's the starting point, then thank you AFP, because you've instilled that.' [D]. The AFP programme has effected a step-change in professional practice in arts fundraising and leadership – notably in England and increasingly on a global level. The detailed, tangible ways in which the underpinning research has influenced change via the programme are encapsulated in the following summaries of impact:

1. The research activity framed key aspects of the curricula.

The curricula for the National School and the PG Cert [E] were developed by a dedicated working group led by **Walmsley** as Programme Director and approved by the Faculty's Taught Student Education Committee. The working group, comprising representatives from Leeds University Business School, the University's Cultural Institute and its key cultural industry partner, Opera North, established a set of learning outcomes based on the underpinning research and on acknowledged skills gaps in the sector. Following the first delivery and evaluation in 2014, the curricula were refined to incorporate more focus on fundraising ethics and leadership theory. The PG Cert curriculum design was highly commended by the External Examiner, who acknowledged that it 'meets extremely high standards and is well designed and led. The programme leaders are active in their respective research areas, and this informs content design and valuable insight into contemporary professional practices [...] in management and leadership skills. [It] is clearly an extremely important investment for individuals, arts organisations and the sector in general, and I am sure that longer term value and impacts will be recognised' [F]. AFP also highlighted the need for increased professional development and competency in the sector, developing new National Occupational Standards for Arts Fundraising, the first of their kind [A]. Signed off by Cause4, **Walmsley's** contributions were integral to the development of these standards, which have exposed skills gaps and helped introduce and cement professionalised arts fundraising across the sector.

2. Impact on arts and cultural practitioners.

Since July 2014, 112 delegates from UK arts and cultural organisations have participated in the National School, taking their learning back into their workplaces to support and implement change. As one reported: 'I wouldn't be where I am without it, I consider myself so lucky to have had access to fundraising training, as most fundraisers don't get that. I deliver training and consultancy on fundraising now and use the learning a lot' [H]. To date, 69 of these have progressed onto the PG Cert in Arts Fundraising and Philanthropy, where 53 (77%) have graduated with a Merit or Distinction. Up to October 2020, the Fellowship programme has developed a cohort of 85 Fellows. 100% of its alumni now perceive themselves as future leaders [G] and 41 (55%) have taken up leadership roles, including 15 directors, 26 managers and 4 consultants [G], in this way directly influencing cultural management, policy and strategy. Described by one Fellow as 'life changing [with opportunities] second to none' [G], further evaluation from the first four cohorts nuances the transformational impact of AFP on their careers, including, 'The whole Fellowship has set me up for where I am now [...] I really

benefitted from the professional training and resources', while another claimed that 'The Fellowship has made my career. The opportunities I've had would never have been possible without it' [G]. A 2020 survey measuring the benefits of the AFP revealed that Fellows valued its status within the industry: 'The AFP was very well recognised and it was a great talking point at interview. It directly resulted in faster progression for me'; 'I think I am viewed more positively. It [AFP]'s almost like a mark of recognition'; and 'Applying for jobs where you can list all the training completed during AFP, along with a professional qualification, made a big difference. So far, I have been offered every arts fundraising job that I have had an interview for. I think I can attribute a lot of that to the skills, knowledge and confidence that the AFP programme gave me.' [H]. Additionally, the AFP was perceived by Fellows as having helped develop essential professional qualities that contributed significantly to career progression, with one observing that 'Arts fundraisers who took part in the AFP programme are 'ambitious' [...]. Many of the AFP graduates are now consultants, Heads /Directors of Development at a younger age'. Another noted improvements in their own career development, 'Having the qualification helped me interview and secure a manager role one year after beginning as a fundraiser', and still another observed, 'I've had a number of roles in arts fundraising and am now leading a small team raising £450k a year across three charities. The AFP gave me the confidence, as well as the skills, to be ambitious and aim high with my career' [H].

Fellows identified numerous ways in which they continue to apply learning from the programme's academic strand to their workplace settings. One noted how they have 'tried to bring my team more into the discussion and plant the seed of change with trustees rather than just report to them', while another highlighted 'how the content of the course and the assignments were very influential on my practice, but I attribute the biggest impact as being from the tutors, speakers and fellows. Their insight into that content in relation to their real-life experiences were immensely helpful' [H]. Finally, emphasising the value of the programme to their own personal and professional development, one summarised the Fellowship's overall impact as being 'skills and knowledge I use on a daily basis [...]. The mindset of keeping up to date with the [...] charity & arts sectors [...] is something that I began on the fellowship and continue to do on a daily basis. The Fellowship was definitely a challenging experience – I was 21 and a recent graduate when I started the programme [...] I can now reflect and see that being 'thrown in at the deep end' has shaped how I am professionally now – I am resilient and can cope with difficult situations!' [H].

As a consortium, AFP has produced and successfully delivered the largest suite of online learning resources for arts and cultural management in the world. The MOOC has exerted a significant influence on the next generation of arts fundraisers, managers, practitioners and policymakers, to date attracting 13,116 learners from 167 countries over 8 runs between March 2018 and June 2020 [I]. Quantitative evaluation demonstrates 91% satisfaction with the course content, teaching style and learning activities. The course engaged significantly more 'active' (56%) and 'social' (20%) learners than the average FutureLearn course (45% and 17% respectively) and enjoyed higher completion rates. 92% of participants stated they had learnt new skills and 47% said they had already applied these in their jobs [I].

Meanwhile, qualitative feedback from the MOOC highlights how learners were encouraged to think about and implement fundraising and leadership in a more critical, strategic, humanistic and relational way. For example, one participant commented: 'The course has broadened my understanding of fundraising. I used to think fundraising was all about money. I liked the way the various components such as the leadership style, mission, vision, and values complement each other in the fundraising process' [I]. MOOC end of course evaluation revealed participants' clear views of the ways in which their learning translates into increased workplace knowledge and understanding: 'The course was fantastic, especially the in-depth, practical, concrete examples provided by the various arts and cultural workers [...] I am a translator working in the arts and cultural sectors, and often translate documents related to funding and impact, so this course gave me some really useful background knowledge on the world of ACOs [arts and cultural organisations] and the challenges they face', and, 'I hope you realise how important and insightful this course has been. The information you have provided is extremely important. Non-profits and cultural institutions are under tremendous stress and you have provided help to the many that need help!' [I]. Evidencing the global reach of the course and its capacity to facilitate real-world learning one participant said, 'Great course! Really helpful, especially for someone

like me running a small museum in Myanmar to gain insights about similar issues faced by ACOs [arts/cultural organisations] in other parts of the world and how they have tackled those issues' [I].

3. Impact on the arts and cultural sector

The dissemination of **Walmsley's**, **Jancovich's** and **Upchurch's** research has been influential across the sector. For example, 72% of the cultural organisations who hosted Fellows reported that the AFP had effected positive change [G]. ACE's Director of Philanthropy credits AFP with bringing about a 'significant rise in the number of new fundraisers and a step change in their professional and career development', noting that it has also 'enriched fundraising policy and practice - for example by highlighting how fundraising activity can benefit from a more relational and distributed leadership model and by investigating trends such as charitable giving post-Brexit' [A]. In these ways, the combined research has shaped and exerted a lasting impact on the development and future practice of the next generation of arts fundraisers, managers and leaders. By maintaining regular discussions with ACE's Director of Philanthropy, **Walmsley** was instrumental in persuading ACE to invest in its biggest ever provision of free digital learning [A]. Recognising the intrinsic value of digital learning ACE noted how the 'AFP has demonstrated that it encourages time- and cash-poor cultural practitioners to engage with their own professional learning and exchange strategies and share their professional challenges with peers across the globe' [A].

4. Legacy: Impact on ongoing initiatives

In 2018 AFP consortium members, including **Walmsley**, were one of only 20 expert groups interviewed by BOP Consulting for the Cultural Cities Enquiry exploring how cities can raise money more effectively. This interview influenced the report's recommendation to establish a Corporate Social Venture Fund to provide a platform for place-based philanthropy into culture. Endorsing **Walmsley's** and the AFP's specific contribution, BOP's Chief Economist confirmed that 'the report cited Leeds as an exemplar of this, highlighting how putting culture at the heart of a city's strategy can generate inclusive growth. AFP's focus on relational leadership and civic philanthropy influenced the report's concept of the Cultural Compact. Compacts are intended to bring together local partners with a shared interest in maximising the civic role of culture to maximise the social and economic benefits of a thriving cultural ecosystem' [J].

Separately, established in 2019, the Centre for Cultural Value is a Leeds-based national research centre funded by AHRC, Arts Council England and Paul Hamlyn Foundation (GBP2,000,000) and led by **Walmsley**. Highly influenced by the AFP model, the Centre develops a shared evidence-based understanding of the differences arts, culture and heritage make to people's lives, and to society.

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

- A. Letter from Director of Philanthropy, Arts Council England (1.7.20).
- B. Arts Council England's Annual Data Surveys (2014–2019) see Table 1.1 in 2013/14 and Table 1 in 2018/19.
- C. Private Investment in Culture Surveys (2014–2019).
- D. AFP evaluation reports, which include: SEQ feedback, case studies & surveys with Fellows and National School participants (2014–19).
- E. Academic programme documentation.
- F. PG Cert External Examiner's Report (2015/16) by Senior Lecturer, Arts Management Politics, University of Manchester.
- G. Where Are They Now? Arts Fundraising Fellows alumni brochure (2014-18) [pdf]
- H. Full set of survey responses from AFP Fellows (2014–19) conducted anonymously online March-May 2020.
- I. Portfolio of participant data from 8 MOOC runs (March 2018-June 2020): registration/engagement figures, location, evaluation, supplied by UoL Digital Education Service.
- J. *Cultural Cities Enquiry* report 2019 & letter from Chief Economist at BOP Consulting (13.11.20).