

Institution: University of Glasgow (UofG)		
Unit of Assessment: UoA 19 Politics and International Studies		
Title of case study: Preventing gendered violence in Central America: informing strategy,		
monitoring and evaluation through critical participatory research		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2007–2020		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by
Mo Hume	Professor of Latin American	submitting HEI:
	Politics	2005-present

Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2013–2020

Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? No

1. Summary of the impact

El Salvador has the highest homicide rates in the world and extreme rates of non-lethal violence, in particular gender-based violence. Hume has co-produced innovative 'gendered' research that: (i) underpinned the strategy, monitoring and evaluation of the Oxfam-funded Program to Prevent Gender Violence (PPGV). The PPGV worked with over 19,000 people between 2013–2015 to develop critical thinking skills in a society where violence against women and girls is the norm. Participation in the PPGV has: (ii) generated new data to advocate for more effective prevention strategies; (iii) changed attitudes towards gender-based violence in El Salvador (e.g. through enhanced social awareness and informal learning). The PPGV has: (iv) successfully been rolled out in Guatemala and adapted for use in schools in partnership with the Ministry of Education and UNICEF.

2. Underpinning research

2.1. Overview

Between 2005–2013, the number of femicides (murder of women because they are women) increased by 263%, marking El Salvador as one of the most violent places on earth to be a woman. Femicide is an extreme end point of a much bigger—and more difficult to measure—problem of violence against women and girls (VAWG). The 2014 UN Human Development Report for Central America stresses that a gendered perspective should be 'integral' in policies to promote citizen security. However, there is still a significant gap in understanding what this means in practice.

A related REF2014 Impact Case Study documented how Hume's research had contributed to new national legislation on gender violence enacted in El Salvador in 2012. However, subsequent research undertaken by Hume (some of which with Wilding, University of Leeds) developed a comparative focus [3.4, 3.5] and identified clear obstacles that prevent the effective implementation of these new laws (e.g. high levels of criminal and gang-related violence). Hume's unique contribution to this work was the research design and theoretical framing. The research built on ideas from Hume's earlier El Salvador research, supplemented with additional data from Wilding's research in Brazil [3.5]. In particular, the research demonstrates that:

2.2. VAWG remains sidelined from social and political debates on violence

In societies where levels of generalised violence and crime are extreme, VAWG stands out as an issue which, to a great degree, has become normalised within gender relations in both public and private spheres—so much so that it becomes a *non-issue*. This is borne out by the scant attention paid to issues of gender in both policy proposals and debates on violence more generally. Hume's research [3.3] pushes for a gendered examination of violence at the 'heart of everyday social relations', showing how different forms of violence are connected in everyday life. This has disrupted understandings of gendered violence as distinct from other forms of 'real' violence in both normative and policy terms (as outlined in further detail in section 4 below).

2.3. Data on violence continue to be both limited and limiting

The research exposes clear data gaps and silences in both general and policy understandings of violence. For example, there is a widespread minimisation of the effects and failure to recognise and adequately record sexual violence. Hume's research rests on detailed ethnographic research in marginal urban communities affected by extreme levels of violence, which are hard to reach in both policy and research terms. She has also accessed 'official' data, such as police

Impact case study (REF3)



records and crime statistics, and demonstrated clear knowledge gaps with regard to recording gender violence [3.1, 3.2, 3.4, 3.5]. Key to Hume's research approach is the foregrounding of marginalised voices in developing our understandings of violence. Hume argues that these 'everyday vocabularies of violence' of those who are most affected are also those who are generally left out of policy conversations [3.3]. Her approach emphasises and exposes the implications of the silences and gaps that underpin much of our knowledge about violence and calls for a more holistic understanding that demands us to go beyond quantitative data [3.2].

Hume's research draws on a series of peer-reviewed publications, which argue for the need for a gendered analysis of violence in El Salvador. Concurrently, she has co-produced research with the Oxfam-funded Program to Prevent Gender Violence (PPVG) since 2007 (e.g. Hume 2008, 2011 and 2016). Working with marginalised communities, Hume has built a critical participatory methodology to provide an evidence base to inform best practice in programmes, monitoring and evaluation to prevent gender violence.

3. References to the research

- **3.1.** Hume, M. (2007) <u>Mano Dura: El Salvador responds to gangs</u>. *Development in Practice*, 17(6), pp. 739-751. (doi: <u>10.1080/09614520701628121</u>)
- **3.2.** Hume, M. (2009) Researching the gendered silences of violence in El Salvador. *IDS Bulletin*, 40(3), pp. 78-85. (doi:10.1111/j.1759-5436.2009.00042.x) (reprinted in 2018 in special archive collection of *IDS Bulletin* on showcasing seminal pieces in 40 years of research on inclusive peace).
- **3.3.** Hume, M. (2009). <u>The Politics of Violence: Gender, Conflict and Community in El Salvador.</u> Series: Bulletin of Latin American research book series. Wiley-Blackwell: Chichester. ISBN 9781405192262. [available on request from HEI]
- **3.4**. Hume, M. and Wilding, P. (2015) <u>'Es que para ellos el deporte es matar': rethinking the scripts of violent men in El Salvador and Brazil</u>. In: Auyero, J., Bourgois, P. and Scheper-Hughes, N. (eds.) *Violence at the Urban Margins*. Series: Global and comparative ethnography. Oxford University Press: Oxford. ISBN 9780190221447. [available on request from HEI]
- **3.5.** Hume, M and Wilding P. (2020) <u>Beyond agency and passivity: situating a gendered articulation of urban violence in Brazil and El Salvador</u>. *Urban Studies*, 57(2), pp. 249-266. (doi:10.1177/0042098019829391)

The underpinning research meets the 2* quality threshold because outputs [3.1, 3.2] and [3.5] are published in journals using rigorous double-blind peer-review processes. Outputs [3.3] and [3.4] are published by leading academic publishing houses.

4. Details of the impact

4.1. Pathway to impact

Hume was first approached to work with Oxfam in 2007 after a US-based staff member read the underpinning research [3.1]. Since then, Hume has conducted extensive field work with civil society groups in El Salvador to co-produce research, monitoring and evaluation to prevent gender-based violence (the results of which are presented as evidence of impact in the sections below). Those who live in the Salvadoran municipal areas involved in the PPGV face multiple challenges and are notoriously hard to reach. Previous campaigns have struggled to make an impact due to high levels of criminal and gang-related violence. Hume's research has helped to overcome these issues, benefitting NGOs, civil society groups and citizens.



4.1. Field work in El Salvador 2015



4.2. Underpinning the PPGV Strategy

Hume's research informed the design, delivery and overall campaign strategy of the PPGV between 2012–2018. The PPGV is a coalition of actors including UNESCO, UNICEF and USAID working across El Salvador and Guatemala (funded by Oxfam to approximately USD2.5m over this period). Its aims are twofold: (i) to drive societal change to prevent gender-based violence through training at community level (as outlined in section 4.3 below); (ii) to monitor and evaluate progress, as follows. Based upon Hume's initial baseline research, Oxfam made the strategic decision to adopt qualitative indicators in their monitoring and evaluation processes. These indicators were then co-produced by Hume and local civil society partners. This offered the women most affected by violence a chance to define and reconceptualise change (as confirmed by Oxfam report [5A]).

A book chapter, co-written by the former Research and Evaluation Senior Advisor at Oxfam America and the Gender Justice Coordinator for Central America, notes that, 'For the coalition itself, the most interesting parts of the research were Dr. Mo Hume's [...] The evaluation was used in concrete ways by the coalition, including to adjust the theory of change for the next period, as well as the overall contours of strategy to 2018 [...] the evaluation helped the coalition understand the importance of linking more closely with other women's organizations in the upcoming years around the application of the [gender violence] laws that had successfully passed [in 2012]' [5B]. This approach marked a significant change from previous strategies to monitor change through official data sets (e.g. such as police statistics), which Hume found were deficient (in the earlier Oxfam research reports [5C][5D]). As a result of Hume's recommendations, improving data collection in justice, health and police departments in El Salvador became an advocacy goal of the PPGV in and of itself, as outlined in section 4.3 below (confirmed by [5B]).

4.3. PPGV training: a co-production model

Between 2013–2015, the PPGV worked directly with over 19,000 people across seven Salvadoran municipal areas (as confirmed by Oxfam report [5E]). Drawing upon Hume's research, PPVG partners developed local capacity in the field of gender justice. This included enhancing community leaders' critical thinking skills in a society where violence against women and girls is the norm. More broadly, the PPGV supported 39 events, ranging from sessions in schools with parents, teachers and students, to intensive *diplomados*—certificate courses that span months, and in which a range of government entities and community activists participated. One trained researcher commented: "What we saw, was that with people with less than ninth grade education, we had to explain word-for-word what sexual violence...sexualized abuse...the 'special law' are—so it was hard work because we had to go step-by-step with these explanations." (confirmed by Oxfam report [5A])

Through the PPGV, community leaders were also trained in data collection methods. The process of documenting women's lived experience has thus generated new data to advocate at local and national level for more effective prevention of gender violence strategies (as confirmed in an email from the Gender Justice Coordinator, Oxfam Central America [5F]). Participant A, referring to the fact that some women now dare to speak out against abuses, said: "Now [the authorities] even call us rude because we no longer stay silent". A representative of the Supreme Court added: "The contribution of the Campaign [PPGV] in our work has served to strengthen [the work of] our unit into significant processes such as creating gender policies and institutional plans, as well as in many institutional training processes aimed at the prevention and awareness of gender violence. It has given us international experts to support us in creating internal protocols as well as training." (quotes from collated interviews and focus groups [5G]).

4.4. A change in public attitudes through participation in the PPGV

At community level in El Salvador, women testify to the importance of telling their stories, forging spaces to support others, and generating awareness of gender-based violence among children. They argue that, despite considerable risk, they have an obligation to use their experiences productively. Participant B said: "We have to be a good example for other women so they can get through it [...] A personal transformation is achieved through this campaign and we want to continue to learn, continue to share all this knowledge." [5G]. Through the PPGV, local women's groups have achieved greater organisation and infrastructure to reach even more women with

Impact case study (REF3)



their knowledge and experiences. Women's advocacy has also led to formal institutional recognition for gender violence prevention groups at a municipal level, providing them with a formal space to offer advice to other women (confirmed by Oxfam report [5E]). The work of the PPVG has been replicated across 10 different municipalities in El Salvador (confirmed by email [5F]).

4.5. The roll out and expansion of the PPGV

In Guatemala, the same approach has been pursued on a much smaller scale due to resource constraints. Over the same timeframe as the project in El Salvador, it is estimated that the PPGV has worked with over 1,000 people and supported 15 training events in Guatemala. The Program utilises the same mechanisms as its Salvadoran counterpart, but has adapted these to work with indigenous women. It works to build the capacity of key influencers in target institutions in order to support citizens' ability to hold government officials accountable. In Guatemala, the PPGV has predominantly reached municipalities through the training of workers from state institutions. For example, this has included masculinity and gender-based violence training for the National Civil Police, which educated 120 first responders from the emergency '110' telephone number in appropriate responses to calls that may involve gender violence (confirmed by Oxfam report [5E]).

Hume's research has demonstrated that the impact of gender-based violence on women and girls is only one side of this issue; men and boys in Central America are also subject to rigid notions of masculinity. These norms of manhood are deeply associated with violence (particularly gang-related violence). Consequently, in order to break the link between masculinity and violence (of all kinds), it has become increasingly important to understand gang-related violence as gender violence. The underpinning research [3.4] has played a pivotal role in stimulating debate among NGOs operating in the area around this novel approach (confirmed by USAID report [5H]). The Director of the Gender and Justice Foundation confirms that the research, 'has significantly informed current thinking around the relationship between notions of masculinity, gang-related violence and gender-based violence.' (statement [5I]).

Hume's research-based recommendations around the importance of the prevention of gender-based violence at an early age have also invigorated the focus of the PPGV on schools. In 2017, a partnership between the PPVG and UNICEF extended the reach of work with adolescents to ensure that these prevailing attitudes are passed on to future generations. This strategy was implemented in 28 Salvadoran schools. As a result, some 617 children were trained in 'new femininities', 'new masculinities', early pregnancy and responsible parenthood. These skills were replicated and passed on to another 2,100 children. Additional mechanisms to identify, report and monitor gender-based violence were created and 73 victims of sexual abuse received psychosocial support (confirmed by UNICEF report [5J] and corroborated by email [5F]).

Reflecting upon the impact of Hume's research on the region, the Director of the Gender and Justice Foundation said: 'Professor Hume's research has directly supported a more holistic approach to tackling gender-based violence in the region by offering those most affected an opportunity to define and deliver change. Although gender-based violence is a deep-rooted societal issue, Professor Hume's research has supported citizens' ability to affect change in the long term through contributions to the training of workers in state institutions and through school programmes—so that prevailing attitudes are passed on to future generations [...] we are very grateful to have benefited from Professor Hume's research and expect this work to have impact in the region for years to come.' (confirmed by statement [51])

5. Sources to corroborate the impact

[5A] Hume, M and Kane, L (2016) Ahora hasta nos dicen que somos malcriadas porque no nos quedamos calladas': A study of the programme to prevent gender violence in El Salvador and Guatemala. Oxfam Research Report: San Salvador, Guatemala City and Boston (confirms that based upon Hume's initial baseline research, Oxfam made the strategic decision to adopt qualitative indicators in their monitoring and evaluation processes. These indicators were then co-produced by Hume and local civil society partners; the quote from section 4.3 is on p.37) [PDF available].

[5B] Davis, A and Guevara, M (2016) 'A case study in complexity: evaluating a long term effort

Impact case study (REF3)



to prevent gender violence in El Salvador'. In Michael Bamberger, Jos Vaessen, Estelle Raimondo (eds) *Dealing With Complexity in Development Evaluation: A Practical Approach* Thousand Oaks: Sage. (Hume's research is cited on 7 occasions; the quote used is from p.16) *[PDF available]*.

[5C] Collated evidence: (i) <u>Hume, M. (2008) 'Yo sí tengo una vida diferente'</u>: Women's changing perceptions of gender based violence in Ahuachapan and San Marcos. Oxfam Research Report. Oxfam America, Boston and San Salvador *[In Spanish and English]* (this work informed part of a wider evaluation/baseline to develop new indicators), as outlined in; (ii) Investigación Evaluativa del Programa de Prevención de la Violencia de Género en El Salvador Línea de base del programa para el periodo 2007/2008 (Hume's contribution is listed on the title page, and the research cited e.g. on p.28) this work was then further developed in output [5D] below) *[In Spanish] [PDFs available]*.

[5D] <u>Hume, M. (2011) Salí de esa cueva donde yo estaba, he salido a la claridad y a la realidad</u>: a qualitative assessment of the Campaign to Prevent Gender Violence (this earlier work [5C] and [5D] highlights the *significance* of Hume's impact through the PPGV within the REF 2021 period) [PDF available].

[5E] Oxfam Public Report (2015) Summary of Hume and another researcher's work on PPVG (confirms funding of USD2.5m on p.27; involvement of 19,000 people on p.34; figures for PPGV events in Guatemala on p.34) **[PDF available]**.

[5F] Email from the Gender Justice Coordinator, Oxfam Central America (April 2017) (confirms that the process of documenting women's lived experience has generated new data to advocate at local and national level for more effective prevention of gender violence strategies; confirms the work of the PPVG has been replicated across ten different departments in El Salvador; confirms the link between Hume's research and subsequent UNICEF initiatives in schools) [In Spanish] [PDF available].

[5G] Selected PPGV statistics and quotes from focus groups from publication [5A] *[translated from Spanish] [PDF available]*.

[5H] <u>USAID Report</u> on developing prevention of violence in El Salvador (November 2017) (Hume and Wilding's research [3.4] is cited extensively on p.116) [PDF available].

[5I] Statement from the Director of the Gender and Justice Foundation (confirms the influence of Hume's research at multiple levels across the region) (14 November 2020) **[PDF available]**.

[5J] <u>UNICEF 2017 Annual Report – El Salvador</u> (figures confirmed on p.7) **[PDF available]**.