

Institution: University of Hull

Unit of Assessment: UoA20 Social Work & Social Policy

Title of case study: Evaluating and influencing multi-agency collaboration to improve violence

prevention

Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: September 2010 to September 2020

Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:

Name(s):	Role(s) (e.g. job title):	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:
Professor lain Brennan	Professor of Criminology	September 2010 to present date

Period when the claimed impact occurred: January 2014 to present date

Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? Y/N

1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)

Research at the University of Hull (UoH) has changed violence prevention practices, fostering multi-agency partnerships and reducing the health, economic and social burden of violence. Working with police forces, health services, NGOs and policy-makers at local and national levels, Hull research has provided new knowledge about what works to prevent violence and demonstrated how agencies can collaborate to improve outcomes for victims and to prevent violent offending. This impact is demonstrated in widespread changes to practice in emergency departments and policing, in data-sharing between agencies, and in the emergence of a whole-system approach to preventing violence.

2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)

Globally, interpersonal violence is one of the leading sources of health burden and social harm, resulting in almost half a million deaths per year. In reponse to this criminal and health challenge, University of Hull appointed Brennan in 2010 and has invested in this area of research through the development of a collaborative, interdisciplinary partnership with Humberside Police and a cluster of PhD scholarships. Accordingly, this research has identified:

- 1. Patterns in the reporting of violence to the police and the need for alternative sources of information about the distribution of violence;
- 2. Patterns in the perpetration of violence and weapon-carrying: who, when and where;
- 3. How a system of agencies, including police, health, education and community/voluntary sector services, can best measure, understand and respond to violence in their areas through information-sharing, collaboration and knowledge exchange.

1. Effectiveness of police-health data-sharing to inform violence prevention

Research at University of Hull led by Brennan has contributed evidence that a large proportion of serious violence in the UK does not come to the attention of police and that the likelihood of violence being regarded as a crime by victims and subsequently reported to the police is affected by location and context, such as night-time economies and weapon use [1]. This patterned reporting and non-reporting of crime emphasises the importance of using alternative sources of data on violence to understand its spatio-temporal distribution and to allocate preventive resources efficiently. With Shepherd (Cardiff University) and Florence and Simon (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), USA), Brennan's work demonstrated the value of combining police data with data on violent injury collected in hospital emergency departments to triangulate and better describe the prevalence, timing, location and context of violence, an approach commonly known as the Cardiff Model. A quasi-experimental study demonstrated that this approach leads to more effective violence reduction than using police data alone [2] and that the health and social



benefits of this approach dramatically outweigh the costs [3]. This research has been replicated in the UK and the US and has a strong supporting independently-provided evidence base.

2. Multi-levelled patterns in weapon-carrying

Brennan's work to explain weapon-related violence is the only study to explain patterns in weapon-carrying by young people using national samples [4]. The research has shown that young people who carry weapons are surprisingly homogeneous and that, in general, the key drivers of weapon-carrying are criminogenic rather than this behaviour being the direct result of fear or concerns about safety. The research demonstrated the importance of understanding weapon-carrying as a behaviour undertaken by individuals but influenced by peers, communities and society in a complex social ecology.

3. Violence Reduction Units and the 'whole systems approach'

Brennan's work in evaluating the work of all 18 government-funded Violence Reduction Units (VRUs) [5] has provided early insight into the feasibility of 'whole-system' (i.e. multi-agency) and public health approaches to violence prevention. The research, funded by the Home Office and conducted in collaboration with Ecorys, has generated a theory of change that has guided how VRUs work to deliver collaborative violence prevention activity across England and Wales.

4. Gender-informed police training on domestic abuse

Finally, a team led by Brennan (with collaborators Tapley (University of Portsmouth), Myhill (College of Policing) and Tagliaferri (Behavioural Insights)) was the first in the world to produce a national-level data set of arrests for controlling or coercive behaviour. This open access dataset has provided unique insight into police use of powers relating to this newly criminalised form of domestic abuse [6]. Specifically, using a pre-registered study design [6], they demonstrated the effectiveness of training police officers to understand gendered power dynamics in abusive relationships and to see domestic abuse not as a single incident of violence, but part of an ongoing pattern of abuse. The evaluation demonstrated that this training was associated in a 41% increase in arrests for controlling or coercive behaviour, but that the effect was limited to approximately nine months.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

- Brennan, I.R. (2011). In vino silentium? Individual, situational and alcohol-related factors in reporting violence to the police. Violence and Victims, 26(2), 191–207. https://doi.org/10.1891/0886-6708.26.2.191.
 Winner of British Society of Criminology Brian Williams Prize, 2012.
- 2. Florence, C., Shepherd, J., **Brennan, I**. & Simon, T. (2011). Effectiveness of anonymised information sharing and use in health service, police, and local government partnership for preventing violence related injury: Experimental study and time-series analysis. British Medical Journal, 343:d3313. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.d3313
- 3. Florence, C., Shepherd, J., **Brennan, I**. & Simon, T. (2014). An economic evaluation of anonymised information sharing in a partnership between health services, police and local government for preventing violence-related injury. Injury Prevention, 20(2), 108–114. http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/injuryprev-2012-040622
- Brennan, I. (2017). Predictors of illegal weapon-carrying in England and Wales: A social-ecological analysis of risk factors. Pre-peer review summary cited in HM Government Serious Violence Strategy. Later published as: Brennan, I.R. (2018). Weapon-carrying and the reduction of violent harm. British Journal of Criminology, 59(3), 571–593. https://doi.org/10.1093/bjc/azy032



- Brennan, I with Ecorys and Ipsos MORI (2020). Evaluation of the Violence Reduction Units: Feasibility report.; Brennan, I. with Ecorys and Ipsos MORI (2020). Process evaluation of the Violence Reduction Units. Two reports commissioned by and submitted to the Home Office, Spring 2020.
- 6. Brennan, I., Myhill, A., Tagliaferri, G. & Tapley, J. (2020). Policing a new domestic abuse crime: Effects of force-wide training on arrests for coercive control. https://osf.io/egzjt/. Published as a pre-print, July 2020. Supporting pre-registration documents and open access data set on police arrests for controlling or coercive behaviour: https://osf.io/vx789/. Later published as Brennan, I., Myhill, A., Tagliaferri, G. & Tapley, J. (2021). Policing a new domestic abuse crime: Effects of force-wide training on arrests for coercive control Policing & Society: https://doi.org/10.1080/10439463.2020.1862838.

Supporting funding

Brennan, I.R with Ecorys, Ipsos/MORI (2019). Feasibility of an impact evaluation of the Violence Reduction Units. Home Office. PI at Hull, Professor Iain Brennan. Amount: £227,134. Output emerging from this funding: [5].

Evaluation of Hampshire Constabulary Domestic Abuse Matters programme. Hampshire Constabulary. PI at Hull, Professor Iain Brennan. Amount: £9,800. Output emerging from this funding: [6].

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Statutory and community/voluntary sector organisations each bring with them specialist knowledge, expertise and capacity to reduce violence, but no organisation can achieve this alone. Brennan's research has been effective in demonstrating how organisations can work together to provide the best outcomes for violence prevention. This has resulted in policing and health services adopting new collaborative techniques to measure and respond to violence. The reach of this research impact has expanded considerably within the current REF period and the Cardiff Model approach to measuring and preventing violence is now embedded in health-police partnerships across the UK and underpins the impact assessment for new legislation on serious violence in England and Wales. Brennan's more recent work – informing the direction of Violence Reduction Units, HM Government's Serious Violence Strategy and gender-informed domestic abuse training for police – continues the theme of multi-agency collaboration to prevent and reduce the harm of violence.

Best practice in the prevention of violence worldwide

Research showing the effectiveness and economic benefits of using hospital data to model the temporal and geographical location of violence has added a new dimension to how patterns in violence are understood and has changed how police forces allocate resources for violence prevention [A]. It serves as a model for how police forces and health services can work together and has emphasised the public health costs of – and solutions to – violence.

A letter from the Head of Serious Violence Analysis at the Home Office [B] states: "Research demonstrating the need for and value of using hospital attendance data to inform violence prevention has been highly influential both as an effective intervention and as a model of multi-agency cooperation".

The Cardiff Model approach to preventing violence in a city has been **cited as good practice by Public Health England [C], Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) [D] and the INSPIRE partnership** (a consortium of ten global organisations including the World Health Organisation, UNICEF and the World Bank) which supports governments, international agencies and non-government organisations to prevent and respond to violence against children [E].



"in 2014 [the UK Government] introduced a Standard on Information Sharing to Tackle Violence as part of their commitment to reduce knife and gun crime. Information sharing was also promoted in the 2016 Modern Crime Prevention Strategy. Most recently the Cardiff Model dataset has been incorporated into the new Emergency Care Data Set...so all emergency departments have the tools to collect and process anonymised assault data." (Public Health England, [C])

"[it] provides a straightforward framework for hospitals, law enforcement agencies, public health agencies, community groups, and others interested in violence prevention to work together and develop collaborative violence prevention strategies." (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, [D])

Informed by our research, the collection and sharing of anonymised hospital data about violent injury has become embedded in 26 of the 29 emergency departments in London [G]. Outside London, over 120 of the 174 emergency departments across England and Wales have implemented violence attendance data collection [A], **providing one of the most comprehensive systems of violent injury surveillance in the world.** In 2018, the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention published a toolkit [D] to support the implementation of this data collection in emergency departments and the use of the data in hospital-police partnerships across the US. In the same year INSPIRE included the Cardiff Model approach in its handbook for state- and community-level violence prevention initiatives, 'INSPIRE: Seven strategies for ending violence against children' [E].

A model for serious violence legislation

A Home Office impact assessment [F] in 2019 used our research to estimate that the development of multi-agency partnerships based on those described in our research would facilitate the sharing of data, intelligence and knowledge to generate evidence-based solutions to violence. The impact assessment estimated that this would save approximately £657m over ten years and recommended that primary legislation be enacted to place a statutory duty on agencies to share data and collaborate on violence prevention. That legislation – the Serious Violence Bill, 2019-20 – was named in the Queen's Speech 2019 and is in preparation. A letter from the Head of Serious Violence Analysis at the Home Office [B] states: "[two papers co-authored by Brennan, 2, 3] were vital documents in the development of the 'Introducing Public Health Measures' impact assessment published by the Home Office in 2019. The impact assessment recommended the enactment of primary legislation to place a statutory duty on specified statutory agencies to collaborate and communicate to take effective coordinated action to prevent serious violence".

Informing and evaluating a national, multi-agency violence prevention strategy

In 2018, Brennan's research on the drivers of weapon-carrying and on the use of hospital data to inform prevention of violence was included in HM Government's national strategy to reduce violent crime, the Serious Violence Strategy [G] and a substantial part of the College of Policing's guidance for the policing of knife crime is also based on his research [H].

As a member of the National Police Chiefs' Council (NPCC) Vulnerability and Violent Crime Panel, the Youth Endownment Fund Expert Panel and evaluator of the Early Intervention Youth Fund scheme and the Violence Reduction Units programme, Brennan has been central to improving the evidence base around violence prevention in England and Wales. Since 2019, in collaboration with Ecorys, Brennan has supported the emerging activities of the 18 Violence Reduction Units in England and Wales. A theory of change developed to reflect on the first 12 months of the programme has been used to **shape the identity and mission of the Violence Reduction Units** and ongoing impact evaluation work will inform their future. A letter from the Head of Serious Violence Evaluation at the Home Office [B] states: "In the first year of the [Violence Reduction Unit programme], [Brennan and team] produced a 'theory of change' [that] guided strategy and activity at national and local levels. They also established the feasibility of evaluating the impact of these complex interventions [to] provide world first insights into the effectiveness of Violence Reduction Units. A policy that the government has invested over £70 million to date."



Supporting community/voluntary and police collaboration to prevention domestic abuse Further reflecting Brennan's commitment to finding multi-agency solutions to violence prevention, his evaluation of the Domestic Abuse Matters programme - delivered by SafeLives and Women's Aid to police forces across the UK - has provided valuable supporting evidence for the efficacy of whole-force gender-informed police training around domestic abuse and was presented to policymakers, including Minister for Safeguarding, Victoria Atkins, in September 2020. The training has been implemented across England and Wales, Scotland and Gibraltar and, informed by Brennan's research, is being adapted to include intensive follow-up meetings to ensure the longevity of training impacts. A letter from the CEO of SafeLives [I] states: "[Brennan's work has] affirmed our belief in the value of this training and in our whole-force training approach. As a consequence, we have expanded the reach of this type of whole organisation training to offer new products to non-police agencies such as social workers through our 'Responding Well' programme. Secondly, the research has been valuable to share with forces as part of our procurement process: having a quantitative indicator of the training effect gives potential partners confidence that they are procuring training that will help their officers and their communities. Thirdly, the finding that the effects of the training dissipate after nine months has led to our developing a new 'Revisit and Review' product to complement the programme for SafeLives' adopter forces. We now undertake follow-up with forces we have trained at between 12 and 18 months to assess follow-up needs. Without the information from the research, we would not have developed this component."

- **5. Sources to corroborate the impact** (indicative maximum of 10 references)
- A. Department of Health (2015). Information Sharing to Tackle Violence. London: Department of Health (audit describing the reach of emergency department data collection about violent injury and the extent to which this information is shared with multi-agency partners)
- B. Letter of support from Head of Serious Violence Analysis (Home Office) and Head of Serious Violence Evaluation (Home Office)
- C. Public Health England (2019). A whole-system multi-agency approach to serious violence prevention: A resource for local system leaders for England. London: Public Health England
- D. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2018). Cardiff Model Toolkit: Community Guidance for Violence Prevention. Atlanta, GA: Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
- E. World Health Organization (2018). INSPIRE Handbook: action for implementing the seven strategies. Geneva: World Health Organization
- F. Introducing Public Health Measures Impact Assessment 2019: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/816905/20190715 PH Impact Assessment.pdf
- G. HM Government (2018). Serious Violence Strategy. London: Home Office
- H. College of Policing (2019). Knife Crime: Evidence Briefing https://whatworks.college.police.uk/Research/Documents/Knife Crime Evidence Briefing.pdf
- I. Letter of support from Chief Executive, SafeLives