

|  |  |  |
|--|--|--|
| <b>Institution:</b> 10007140 Birmingham City University  |  |  |
| <b>Unit of Assessment:</b> 17. Business and Management Studies   |  |  |
| <b>Title of case study:</b> Shaping entrepreneurial education pedagogy, practice and institutional policy in the UK, Europe, Africa and Asia   |  |  |
| <b>Period when the underpinning research was undertaken:</b> 2011-2019   |  |  |
| <b>Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:</b>   |  |  |
| <b>Name(s):</b>  | <b>Role(s) (e.g. job title):</b>                 | <b>Period(s) employed by submitting HEI:</b> |
| Charlotte Carey  | Senior Lecturer in Creative Industries Marketing | 2003-Present                                 |
| Javed Hussain  | Professor of Entrepreneurial Finance             | 1990-Present                                 |
| Inge Hill  | Senior Lecturer in Strategy and Entrepreneurship | 2013-2018                                    |
| <b>Period when the claimed impact occurred:</b> 2014-2020  |  |  |
| <b>Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014?</b> N   |  |  |
| <b>1. Summary of the impact</b><br><br><p>BCU's Entrepreneurship Education research focuses on customisation to 'context'. Contexts considered include discipline, space and culture, and setting. Our research has shaped institutional policies, practice and pedagogy. Its beneficiaries include: (i) social entrepreneurship educators who adopted a BCU framework across Europe, establishing new communities of practice; (ii) entrepreneurs (particularly women) and lending-institutions in the UK, Ghana and Pakistan, who benefitted from enhanced financial literacy; (iii) 1260 new start-up businesses in Africa, whose educators had adopted our approach; (iv) long-term unemployed women tenants, whose national housing association had transformed their approach to employability support to include entrepreneurial self-employment.</p>   |  |  |
| <b>2. Underpinning research</b><br><br><p>The Business School has longstanding expertise in Entrepreneurship Education (EE), with original research highlighting a range of opportunities for contextualised and experiential education (<b>R1</b>). In particular, our contributions have demonstrated the need to adapt EE to the contexts of 'subject discipline', 'space and culture' and 'setting'.</p> <p>Researchers deployed a mixed-methods approach, involving comparative analysis of academic job adverts (across disciplines), educator surveys and entrepreneur interviews, to identify the perception of EE needs in different subject 'disciplines'. EE must be tailored to industry-specific, entrepreneurial needs, in order to generate value for beneficiaries (<b>R1</b>, <b>R2</b>). Our results confirmed the locus of practice in EE, particularly: (i) the importance of entrepreneurial role models; (ii) the benefits of recent industry-specific entrepreneurial experiences of educators; and, (iii) the benefits of live projects, e.g. working on assessments and scenarios set by real companies, reflecting genuine business problems. This research identified the advantages of adopting existing pedagogies from disciplines other than business, particularly art and design-based teaching practices, to support experiential learning and assessment (<b>R1</b>). Through an exploration of the careers of a cohort of creative graduates, <b>R2</b> corroborated this. It highlighted a deficiency in explicit entrepreneurship education (e.g. entrepreneurship modules) but found that creative discipline pedagogies "led to implicit enterprise education and to the development of entrepreneurial traits" (e.g. opportunity-spotting and networking), due to the experiential nature of creative pedagogies.</p> |  |  |

Further BCU research identified the importance of incorporating motivations and strategies of prospective social entrepreneurs in the co-design of curricula (**R3**). Carey and Hill led the EE pathway for the Erasmus+ Business Education for Sustainability project (see below). This work demonstrated the need for contextualised EE in the 'discipline' of social enterprise. This was particularly so for EE that acknowledged the motivation/orientation of nascent social entrepreneurs and specifically the challenges faced by social enterprises, e.g. when working with volunteers, including issues related to HRM, governance and accounting.

Our research has also included analysis of business support intermediaries in the UK, Ghana and Pakistan. We identified the EE needs of entrepreneurs within specific 'space and cultural' contexts. For example, **R4** demonstrated the link between financial literacy and access to finance. Using a mixed-methods approach, researchers found that financial literacy is an interconnecting resource that mitigates information asymmetry and collateral deficit when evaluating loan applications. This was applied to the specific experience of women entrepreneurs, focussing on microfinance in the UK, Ghana and Pakistan. BCU researchers found contradictory impacts for women entrepreneurs accessing microfinance in Ghana. While access to microfinance was empowering, it frequently destabilised family dynamics, with repercussions for loan default. Researchers recommended that the family as a whole should be mentored to take collective ownership and joint decisions in the business, before the credit facility is approved (**R5**).

Further research, using a longitudinal and participatory approach, focussed on the context of teaching entrepreneurship outside of formal, institutionalised education 'settings'. This work was carried out in the UK, in collaboration with ASHRAM Accord, a national housing association. The work centred on developing entrepreneurial capacity amongst long-term, unemployed, female housing tenants. We found that while entrepreneurial intent was strong (particularly for lifestyle and micro-business orientation), there were practical barriers in terms of self-efficacy/confidence, issues of intersectionality in terms of the participants experiencing multiple forms of discrimination, and reliance on (and fear associated with) the benefits system. These represented blocks to participation. The research developed a roadmap for a "pre-entrepreneurship education" phase for tenants to be EE ready (**R6**).

Regarding the quality of this body of work, **R1** has been cited 83 times, including by notable international scholars within the EE field. Papers **R2**, **R4**, and **R5** are in journals which are internationally recognised by the Chartered Association of Business School's Academic Journal Guide (2018). Dr Simon Brown (Head of Enterprise Development at the National Centre for Entrepreneurship in Education, 2011-2017) described **R3** as "an indispensable addition to anybody's library that is involved with enterprise or enterprise education" (see back cover). Finally, **R6** was 'highly commended' at the Institute for Small Business and Entrepreneurship Conference (2019), in both the Gender and Enterprise track, and the conference-wide 'Knowledge Transfer' category.

### 3. References to the research

**R1.** Carey, C. and Matlay, H. (2010) Creative disciplines education: a model for assessing ideas in entrepreneurship education? *Education + Training*, Vol. 52 No. 8/9, pp. 694-709 <https://doi.org/10.1108/00400911011088999>

**R2.** Carey, C. 2015. The careers of fine artists and the embedded creative. *Journal of Education and Work*, 28:4, pp 407-421, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639080.2014.997686>

**R3.** Hill, I. 2015. *Start-Up: A Practice Based Guide For New Venture Creation*. London: MacMillan. ISBN: 9781137425836. <https://www.macmillanihe.com/page/detail/?k=9781137425836>

**R4.** Hussain, J., Salia, S. and Karim, A. 2018. Is knowledge that powerful? Financial literacy and access to finance: An analysis of enterprises in the UK. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development* 25 (6), pp. 985-1003. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSBED-01-2018-0021>

**R5.** Salia, S., Hussain, J., Tingbani, I. and Kolade, O. 2018. Is women empowerment a zero sum game? Unintended consequences of microfinance for women's empowerment in Ghana. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research* 24 (1), pp. 273-289. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEBr-04-2017-0114>

**R6.** Hussain, S. and Carey, C. 2019. Lived experiences of female social-housing residents: Stories examining entrepreneurship support needs, *ISBE Conference Proceedings*, Newcastle, UK. <http://www.open-access.bcu.ac.uk/8608/>

The research in this case study was supported by two Erasmus+ awards, and Carey was the Business School's lead:

- The African Higher Education Leadership in Advancing Inclusive Innovation project (AHEAD). The School received £52,735 and the total project value was €706,326.
- The Business Education for Sustainability project (BEST). The School received £32,361 and the total project value was €375,202.

These projects were run in collaboration with a total of 14 countries, and over 20 partner institutions across Europe and Africa (for collaborators, see Section 4 of the REF5B).

#### 4. Details of the impact

##### a. Enhancing international entrepreneurship education

BCU participated in the AHEAD project, 2017-2021. Our research changed the pedagogical approach to teaching entrepreneurship and social enterprise in 10 higher education institutions (HEIs) in Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania. Based on our research, we co-created entrepreneurship education teaching materials, which are accessible for all educators, and included: (i) case studies of good practice (available in English and Swahili); and, (ii) an extensive body of teaching materials (available in English and Swahili). This work and materials were disseminated at a conference and at a transnational 'training the educator' workshop, hosted by BCU, to 40 senior staff from these institutions. A follow-up survey (**S01**) asked participants to: "think about the time since that workshop ... [and] indicate how your entrepreneurship education provision has developed as a consequence". Responses were gathered 12 months after the dissemination event, and found that:

- 96% of workshop participants had adopted Design Thinking or Human-Centred Design approaches;
- 75% had adapted provision to suit their local context;
- 92% said that "opportunities to teach experientially had increased".

In addition, following their lecturers' participation in the Birmingham workshop, survey participants indicated that this had shaped EE which supported over 1260 new student/graduate business start-ups (**S01**). Our research helped shape the institutional policy of all of the participating institutions. For example, one respondent stated:

"The workshop has been very useful in the review of the curriculum at the institution. Entrepreneurship training is now part of every curriculum in the School of Business, where I am the Dean" (**S01**).

**b. Materials for social enterprise educators in 8 HEIs across 6 EU countries**

As part of the BEST project (2014-17), the School developed a novel set of learning materials that provided a framework for teaching entrepreneurship within the context of social enterprise (**S02, S03**). The project was developed in response to the problems following the economic crisis (particularly austerity), with social entrepreneurship and corporate social responsibility emerging as key policy priorities in the EU. It was recognised that “business and economics education and training does not adequately reflect this trend” (**S05**). The teaching materials developed sought to address this gap. These materials have been translated into six further languages, were available globally via the BEST project Moodle site, and adopted by HEIs in Bulgaria, Greece, Lithuania, Spain, Portugal, Turkey and the UK. Universities varied in size from 8000 to 20,000 students, and materials included:

- A series of case studies (**S04**) which are accessible and used by educators throughout the EU (available online to anyone);
- The creation of a six-chapter social enterprise curriculum (available in seven languages) focussing on entrepreneurship education within the context of social enterprise, climate change and sustainability.

**c. Improving micro-finance opportunities for entrepreneurs in Ghana and Pakistan**

Our work influenced microfinance institutions in a number of countries, leading to lending-policy change. For example, in Ghana, one SME lending institution changed as follows:

“from your findings ... we have now made a policy change ... especially, mechanisms have been put in place to involve husband and wife in the KYC [‘know your customer’ is a banking term] process ... It has enabled a better understanding ... reducing the number of delinquent loans” (**S06**).

This new policy focus on supporting and facilitating shared, household-ownership of decision making, as a result of BCU research, reduced risks associated with lending to women, while increasing their access to micro-finance. The research demonstrated the societal benefit of this in decreasing the possibility of family breakdown.

Acknowledging a similar need in Pakistan, BCU academics used research to co-design a programme of ‘train the educator’ workshops to support SMEs. Educators, in this context, are now better equipped to instruct learners and SMEs in how to gain access to finance, ensure sustainability of businesses, and maximise growth opportunities. This activity has so far resulted in the training of 87 SMEs leaders, 47% of whom reported increased turnover, with an estimated 236 jobs created as a result (**S07**).

**d. Practice and financial literacy in the UK**

Our research enabled Aston Reinvestment Trust Business Loans (ART) “to reposition our business in the light of the new Government start up loan programme ... We have revised and better prepared our literature and website” (**S08**). This has assisted in informing potential applicants as to ‘what information is important’, helping guide entrepreneurs to provide key information then enables ART to more effectively evaluate business proposals. Its Chief Executive stated:

“research carried out by academics at BCU, with ART, has informed policy and practice, specifically in relation to better preparing potential entrepreneurs at start-up and expansion stages” (**S08**).

**e. Providing a framework for social mobility through entrepreneurship education**

Working in collaboration with a UK national Housing association, our research led to a new (more nuanced) understanding and approach to supporting women who are long-term unemployed tenants, when developing their entrepreneurship training needs. In addition, it led to a greater awareness of the role of the housing association within the entrepreneurial ecosystem, supporting entrepreneurship in some of the most deprived wards of Birmingham:

“This better understanding helped inform our wider recognition of local enterprise needs and challenges facing our communities. As a result we have developed a more sensitive and tailored approach to community grant management and procurement within the New Initiatives Team, this has been particularly evident in relation to our delivery of the Hall Green Neighbourhood Network Scheme and Hall Green Families and Early Help” (S09).

**f. Inclusion of our best practice in leading EU guide for Entrepreneurship**

BCU's work is used as an exemplar in the leading EU Framework for EE. EntreComp was established to address the European Commission's policy objective to create a 'sense of initiative and entrepreneurship' as one of the key competencies for lifelong learning. Specifically, the BCU EntreComp case study used the experiential learning approach developed through BCU's research and applied teaching guidance (S10). EntreComp has been widely adopted, globally, by entrepreneurship educators. In the UK, EntreComp is recommended by leading policy makers and HEI EE support networks, including Entrepreneurship Educators UK, and the National Centre for Entrepreneurship Education.

**5. Sources to corroborate the impact** (indicative maximum of 10 references)

**S01 AHEAD Project**

AHEAD Survey Data

**S02 BEST Project Chair**

Testimonial, Chairperson, International Management Institute

**S03 BEST Compendium of good practices**

Corporate responsibility, social entrepreneurship, and social innovation

**S04 BEST Teaching Content**

Social Entrepreneurship teaching module

**S05 BEST Report**

Business Education for Sustainability

**S06 Microfinance and SAS Capital Money Lending**

Testimonial: Director of Operations, SAS Capital Money Lending, Ghana

**S07 Microfinance and IBSL**

Testimonial: Director of Institute of Business Studies and Leadership, Abdul Wali Khan University, Mardan, Pakistan **[Named Corroborator 001]**

**S08 Microfinance and ARTS**

Testimonial, Chief Executive, ARTS Business Loans, UK

**S09 ASHRAM Accord Housing Association**

Testimonial, CEO, ASHRAM Accord HA

**S10 EntreComp: European Entrepreneurship Competence Framework**

European Entrepreneurship Competence Framework user guide